Music, Affect, Labor, and Value:

Late Capitalism and the (Mis)Productions of Indie Music in Chile and Brazil

Shannon Garland

Submited in partial fulfillment of the

requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

in the Graduate School of Arts and Sciences

COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY

2014

Abstract

Music, Affect, Labor, and Value:
Late Capitalism and the (Mis)Productions of Indie Music in Chile and Brazil

Shannon Garland

This dissertation traces the tensions surrounding indie music production in Santiago, Chile and São Paulo, Brazil. I conducted several years of ethnographic research on locally situated, yet transnationally interpolated, musical production, circulation and listening practices in Santiago and São Paulo. I open by detailing the expansion of the indie touring market from the global north into both cities, theorizing the enlistment of affect as a neoliberal technique for producing monetary value. The next chapter considers spaces for musical association as forms of infrastructure that both emerge from and themselves help constitute musical-social networks in Santiago. I follow by showing how the history of Brazilian individuals' engagement with particular sets of indie sounds from the global north bear upon the contemporary formation of infrastructures of social relations, musical aesthetics, and places for musical and social association. Finally, I detail how the tensions between the construction of audience, value, aesthetics and circulation arising from new production structures manifest in the politics of a new type of Brazilian institution called Fora do Eixo. Here, I inspect the logics of aesthetic valuation in building structures for music production within a complex state-private nexus of cultural funding in Brazil. As a whole, this dissertation explores the political struggles emerging as actors seek to establish new structures for participating in live shows and for playing music as both a creative practice and as an economic activity within emerging forms of communication and cultural circulation made possible by digital media. Each struggle is simultaneously interpolated by the messy articulation of transnationally-produced notions of aesthetics, authentic modes of engagement with music, and moral-ethical ways of organizing music production, circulation and

remuneration as a social practice. The dissertation thus highlights the way new media and economic logics build upon and clash with historical practices of production, evaluation of aesthetics, and regimes for mediating the artistic, the economic, and the social.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements

In many ways, this project has been developing since 2003, when I first went to Santiago, Chile as undergraduate student. At the Universidad de Chile, Rodrigo Torres allowed me into his graduate ethnomusicology class, and introduced me to John Blacking, Steven Feld, and Simon Frith. He helped me map musical and class divisions in Chile, lent me books on Nueva Canción, and encouraged me to keep writing out my critical observations surrounding social uses of music. In a roundabout way, Dr. Torres' help led me to the Víctor Jara foundation, and from there, to a friendship with Vicente Hernández, who introduced me to Chilean and Spanish-language punk music, to the Chilean visual art world, and then in 2006 to the emerging indie scene treated in this dissertation. In addition to Vicente, I thank Sebastián Morales for directing me to Super45 at that time, and I thank Laurel Bernstein for her friendship, interpretation of Chilean hipsterism, and laughter, even with half a cold. No one knew such experiences would turn into a dissertation, but I am thankful for the serendipity that they did.

Once in New York, Iván Daguer became my buddy for Brooklyn's DIY shows and has been an invaluable source of information about experimental, psychedelic, and rock music from around the globe. His return to Chile just before my dissertation fieldwork also provided a sense of continuity between what often feel like entirely different lives. I also thank Christián Torres-Roje, aka Nutria, for the beautiful songs, the unstructured rehearsals, the chance to reconnect with performance in a new way, and the unplanned base playing with Nutria NN in New York gave me for connecting with more musicians and others in Santiago.

I thank Todd P for his work in Brooklyn and his willingness to talk with me about it all. I thank Carmen Duarte for writing about bands in Brooklyn, which lead me to the Todd-P and Super45 band exchange that launched my Master's thesis project. From there and on out, Cristián Araya has continuously overwhelmed me with stories, information, new sounds, and even new friends, like Jose Sagredo, who helped me find housing and allowed me to glimpse more of the listening-social side of musical production in Santiago. Fernando Mujica, equally, always surprises me with his enthusiasm to discuss all of his projects and to continue developing new ones. And I thank David Ponce, for interview in 2008, and also for his crucial book chronicling the early years of Chilean rock. An ardent fan who always appears at shows, David exemplifies the art of journalism. Thank you to Hixaga Ximatik for being so supportive, even from afar and before meeting me, and for introducing me to Dënver. I thank Ervo Pérez, for keeping things weird, and Álvaro Daguer for taking me to them. Álvaro has been crucial to this project in many ways, first introducing me to Alvarito Gómez, Perrosky, The Ganjas, and the rest of the Algo Records crew, then providing housing, more connections, and a mapping of newer psychedelic bands, as well as his own sounds.

My dissertation fieldwork in Chile would not have been possible without the continued help of the aforementioned people, as well as many others. Ximena Rivas provided a lovely room, conversation and show-going partner, and Andrés Padilla let me crash whenever I came back into town, and fed me banana bread to boot. I Thank Roberto Parra and Pía Sotomayor, for indulging all my questions and letting me work for them for research and fun; Josefina Parodi for running Elefante and taking me on a nutty trip to Valpo, among other things; Goli Gaete for the friendship and wonderful music; Pablo Muñoz for the perspective and laughs; and Pamela Sepúlveda and Daniela Saldías for running Michita Rex, producing their own interesting music,

and being all-around good people. Same goes to Ariel Altamirano. I give thanks to Diego Sepúlveda for sharing his different ideas about the Chilean music industry.

Álvaro Solar, Andrés Acevedo, Francisco Marín, Andrés Nusser, Rodrigo Santis, Carla Arias, Daniel Riveros, Mariana Montenegro, Freddy Olguín, Sebastián Amado, Camilo Salas, Ed Milla, Francisco Franetovic, Alejandro Jofre, Rodrigo Hurtado, Felipe Arriagada, Ignácio Rodríguez, Enrique Elgueta, José Manuel Cerda, Andrés Zanetta, Andrés Panes, and many entire bands, including Föllakzoid, The Holydrug Couple, WatchOut!, The Ganjas, and Casino, all of these people took time out of their busy lives to talk with me at length about their projects and the music they either make, write about, produce, or all three at once. Without such conversations this text would not exist.

I feel the same gratitude for the time given by Aldo Benincasa and everyone at Loreto; by Pía Cardenas and everyone at Cellar. Marcelo Peña, Elisita Balbontín and Sebastián Román's work as Makaroni gave multi-country perspective as well as fun, and I owe Marcelo especially for the late-night bike rides and kindness. Thank you also Eduardo Streeter and Diego Hernández for talking with me and being such good people. Finally, I thank Francisca Montes and Vicente Hernández for the hospitality and stories, María Paz for being awesome, and Gabriel Pinto for saving my life with a coat.

It is a fortune for my life that my Master's fieldwork in Chile led me to São Paulo Brazil, for the first time in 2010. Within two weeks of my arrival, thanks to a combination of Garotas Suecas, Daniel Viera, MTV and Myspace, I had met Fernando Araújo, Karen Kopitar, and Rodrigo Maceira. Each of them has been vital to this project in more ways than one, Fernando and Karen especially for their knowledge of hip Brazilian music and the funding mechanisms of the foreign touring industry in Brazil, and Rodrigo for our many conversations comparing notes

on music from around Latin America, as well as his introduction to me of Latin American musicians from Argentina, Venezuela, and more.

Fernando, Karen and Rodrigo together introduced me to the Casa do Mancha, a very special place which this dissertation does not do justice in describing. Thank you foremost to Mancha Leonel for opening his house several times a week to the intrepid souls of São Paulo and beyond; thank you to Mancha, Thomás Afs, Tânia Oda, Marcelo "Samurai" Cerri, and Hugo Pupilo for keeping the house afloat and welcoming me into it as if it were also your actual home. And I thank everyone else who often made it one of their homes as well, including Diogo Valentino, Daniela Cotrim, Dago Donato, Marcelo Altenfelder, Marcelo Volegaar, Bernardo Rezende Rolla, Pedro Bruno, Arthur Britto, Veronica Vacaro, Juliana Vacaro, Bernard Barbosa, Gabriela Gonzalez; Amauri Stamboroski Jr., Stan Molina, Pedro Moreira, Taís Toti, Daniel Monteiro, DW Ribatski, Mateus Pozumati Jr., Kátia Mello, Raquel Blaque, Rodrigo Sommer, Gabriel Ares, Alexander Zhemchuzhnikov, Sérgio Ugeda, Beatriz Pascon, and Pamela Leme even though her work sometimes brought her out less often than everyone would have liked.

My experience in Brazil and my research project would not have been possible without some very special people: I owe innumerable conversations, debates, friendship, and tons of xamego to Filipe Giraknob, indie rock's real índio. Filipe, may the wind ever blow in your hair. This project also bears more than a fair share of the markings of Kátia Abreu. Kátia seems to appear only once in this dissertation, but in fact her influence is weaved throughout; she is a veritable repository of information, stories and connections, both musical and non-, from the past to the present and beyond into the future. Aside from the indescribable help in orienting me in the various Brazilian indie music worlds, I could not have continued with this project without Kátia's friendship and support, a true partner in the undertaking of trying to understand the world

and people. Finally, thank you Pedro Bonifrate for the conversations, the couch, and perhaps most importantly, the wonderful music which is profound, interesting, and not only brings a gang together, but makes me feel truly included in it.

I thank all the musicians and journalists I spoke with and especially those who took the time to talk with me on tape, including Dudu Tsuda, Lulina, Stela Campos, Jair Naves, Bárbara Eugênia, Tatá Aeroplano, Thiago França, Apanhador Só, Constantina, Wannabe Jalva, A Banda Gentileza, Garotas Suecas, Vinícius Lepore, Tigre Dente de Sabre, Macaco Bong, Aeromoças e Tenistas Russas, Vanguart, Dorgas, Chinese Cookie Poets, Renato Vanzella, Tiago Agostini, Rodrigo Lariú, Marçal Righi, Junior Passini, Bruno Natal, Alexandre Matías, Gustavo Sá, Davi Rocha, Cláudio Jorge, Edu Párez, Marcelo Costa, Nathália Birkholz, Pedro Brandt, Régis Arguelles,Yuri de Castro. Special thanks to Lúcio Ribeiro, Paola Wescher, and Fernanda Stickel for allowing me to participate in their music productions so I could better understand.

Thank you to Ricardo Noryo for challenging me to better describe my project, to Davi Boarato, Daniel Gutiérrez, and Tiago Otani for the calm and beautiful home, and to Jú Nadin and Diego Lajst for sharing it lovingly. Thank you Janderson Angelim for the songs and strange words from Ceará. Thank you to Andrea Roca for helping bridge worlds, to Ji Hye Lim for the Spanish and willingness to adventure, and to Thiago Reis for the introduction to Lotus. In Rio, thank you Sandro Rodríguez for the trippy interview over the samba school, and a million thanks to Felipe Zenícola for hosting both myself and my jacked bike, as well as for the cross-cultural and cross-gender comparisons of the most important things in life.

I also thank everyone involved in Fora do Eixo, especially at the Casa Fora do Eixo São Paulo, and at the Casas in São Carlos and São José do Rio Preto who so enthusiastically received me, fed me, and carted me around. While we might not agree on certain larger points concerning

the institution, so many people welcomed me, explained their projects and vision, and allowed me to interview them and participate minimally in the process that I without a doubt owe them thanks. While I'm not always convinced of Fora do Eixo praxis, the conversations about music, economy, and media occurring there have been extremely influential in spurring my own thinking. I especially thank Pena Schmidt for the mutually respectful dialogue around Fora do Eixo, especially given his own history of music production, which I'm grateful that he shared.

Thank you to my friends in the US for putting up with me and for understanding despite your very different career worlds, especially Adam Shackelford, Catherine Brawner, Demelza Newman, and Steve Kruger for the encouragement and the open ears. Special thanks to everyone at Raízes do Brasil Capoeira for helping me get the stress out, and to Cricket Uttech for the stable, supportive home during the final write-up year.

Thank you Danny Gough, Leo Cardoso and Jay Sosa for the support in São Paulo and the discussion across our different, though shared domains. And thank you Kriann Goldschmitt for initial São Paulo connections. I look forward to many more collaborations and conversations with you all in the future. I also thank my friends and colleagues from the Columbia University ethnomusicology program, whose feedback has been vital to the shaping of this project, and who also gave their moral support, including Simón Calle, Daphne Carr, Lauren Flood, Farzi Hemmasi, Tyler Bickford, Sara Snyder, Niko Higgins, Josh Pilzer, Anna Stirr, Elizabeth Keenan, Toby King and Anita Hoyvik. I give special thanks here to my two cohort members Nili Belkind and Marti Newland. Your feedback on drafts and proposals and your support as we moved through the program was indispensable.

The seeds of this project, planted before beginning graduate school, could not have grown into this semblance of tree without the guidance and feedback from the Columbia

University music faculty, particularly everyone in the ethnomusicology area. I can't thank Aaron Fox enough for his encouragement and critical feedback, from the time I visited campus to even after the dissertation defense. I am continually surprised by Aaron's encyclopedic knowledge and ability to make connections I never would have thought. If I can manage to read half the bibliography he has cumulatively recommended over the years perhaps I can guide my own students equally well. Ellen Gray's influence has also been crucial. She pushed me to become very critical of my own writing while leaving me space to develop my own voice, and introduced me to so many of the scholars and lineages I have brought into my work. Christopher Washburne has served as an excellent critical foil to my work, his own experience and knowledge of touring in Latin America and of the music industry always challenges me to re-think my assumptions and my framing. Kevin Fellezs, in the short time I have known him, has provided critical dialogue and feedback on thorny issues of capitalism and of small, "far away" communities, and I look forward to further dialogue. I also thank George Lewis for the enlightening and challenging introduction to New Musicology, historiography, and the formation of canons.

Other faculty have also been of tremendous influence on this project. Dave Novak's graduate seminar laid many foundational tools for thinking through music, media, and circulation. I also thank him for his comments on earlier drafts of a published article and for his efforts to keep opening institutional spaces for interdisciplinary work on sound and music. Marilyn Ivy and Harry Harootunian, gave me more language to compare modernities and to read stalwarts like Horkheimer and Adorno in a new light. Brian Larkin has influenced me deeply, through his class, his own work, and his critical feedback as a committee member for this dissertation. His enthusiasm and encouragement is both inspirational and humbling. George Yúdice's conversations about a shared field project have been vital to my understanding of it; I

thank him for his critical feedback on this dissertation and on earlier chapter drafts, and look forward to future dialogue. Eduardo Vicente's work on the Brazilian music industry has also been indispensable for my own. And I owe special thanks to Alberto Ikeda at the UNESP, who not only facilitated my visas for long-term fieldwork, but anchored me during my research and writing, and oriented me to the Brazilian ethnomusicology world. Finally, thank you José Antonio Castellanos-Pazos, you gave me a firm foundation for building my Portuguese up from an entirely different language.

One person influenced this project in monumental ways: my advisor Ana María Ochoa. At the end of my Master's thesis, Ana introduced me to Latin American Critical Theory, finally giving me the language to discuss the thorny issues of cultural transmission, technology and modernity in ways particular to Latin America. She went on over the years to suggest so many differing bodies of literature to think through my work and to train me in the many areas crucial to someone working at the intersection of economy, on labor, on popular expression. I have never quite understood how Ana already knows all that she does, being only one person, not three. So I am deeply fortunate that she not only has a vast archive of knowledge and of the work of others, but that she is generous in sharing it all with her students. Ana has all the best qualities of a mentor— she holds your feet to the fire, yet remains patient and understanding, helping you find the tools you need to put the fire out, or at least to move it to another spot for the time being. If it seems that I cannot thank Ana enough for her feedback and support, it is entirely true.

Finally, I would like to thank my parents and my sister, for supporting me throughout this long and strange graduate school journey, for not worrying too much when I went off to another country, again, and for always reminding me who I am.

To Richard Carp,

for teaching me to ask better questions.

And to Ola,

for keeping me human.

Notes on Terms, Translations, and Citations

To facilitate intelligibility, I've signaled names of bands with Calibri font; names of venues with underline, **names of music websites** with bold, and *songs* and *album names* with italics. In some cases, a performer's stage name is also his or her nickname, and the name by which he or she is known to friends and acquaintances. In these cases, I use the Calibri font when emphasizing the musical project, and regular font when emphasizing the individual. Such is the case, for example, with Fakuta and Fakuta, as with Pedro Bonifrate and Bonifrate.

Interviews with Brazilian and Chilean interlocutors were conducted in Portuguese and Spanish, respectively, and the translations are my own. This is also the case for interactions on social media, websites from Chile and Brazil, and scholarly work cited in these two other languages.

Permission to cite interviewees was given verbally on record by all those interviewed. Facebook posts are cited in full when they were posted by the authors as publically accessible; comments others made publically available as Facebook posts are also cited in full.

Introduction

> Who the hell is Arcade Fire, and why did they win a Grammy?
> -Jonathan Mann[i]

> Hipsterism becomes a global culture. And those indie bands start becoming a global culture. Such that today there can be so many niches, they're diverse niches globally connected so they get volume. A lot of those bands aren't anything in the US either.
> -Bruno Natal[ii]

> It was the internet that fucked everything up
> -Vinícius L.[iii]

It's a balmy night in São Paulo, late 2011. Two Brazilian journalists, DJs and music-lovers converse near the bar of the Casa do Mancha, a music venue, recording studio, and sometime residence of musician Mancha Leonel. The friends discuss the compiling of their best-of-2011 music lists, which lean heavily towards the nebulous music classification known as *indie*. Their lists include bands from Brazil, the US, and Europe, and cover everything from psychedelic rock to MPB (Música Popular Brasileira) to rap. Both men concede that their 2011 lists do not represent the best of all indie music put out in the year, but rather the best of what they had personally happened to come across and give some amount of attention. While this may seem obvious, considering the variety of places and styles discussed, their approach marks a break from the usual indie rock journalist and fan position, which, rhetorically at least, assumes a panoptical view of popular music. This attitude perhaps reached its peak around 2005, when the main avenues for indie band promotion seemed to definitively shift from professional print magazines to personal, semi-professional, and professional music blogs hosted online.

The ability to share, duplicate, and spread information at much greater speeds and with much less financial cost than previous modes of promotion generated, at that time, anxieties over

the internet's ability to "make" undeserving bands or "break" deserving ones, and contributed to fan desires to be the first to know "the next big thing," before internet circulation made it available to anyone and everyone. By 2008, bloggers and journalists covering rock music, especially independent rock music, were ardently debating, through articles, posts, and the comments sections of webpages, which new bands were "real," and which were pure "hype"—that is, having attained a level of popularity by becoming visible purely in online hubs of information about up-and-coming new artists. The notion of hype implied that online discussion took the form of an echo chamber with little relation to "real" interest, something that could be measured by crowds at live shows. A suspicion also arose that internet-hyped bands lacked the artistic quality that would merit their hyper-mediated internet fame. Around the turn of the century, such discussion would take the form of comparison among a (perceived) smaller cast of bands, with traceable fan bases, indicators of success like record sales, and a handful of critical media scrutinizing musical quality and curating which bands belonged to the indie canon. A decade later, as the conversation at the Casa do Mancha exemplifies, journalists and fans alike seemed to have let go of the fantasy of collecting and evaluating all music, of being able to easily and confidently ascribe and define a strict area of indie. In its stead, new anxieties about real versus fake, popular versus underground, good versus bad music, became heightened, as social networks became the primary sites for defining musical values within different social, financial, and media regimes.

This dissertation traces various ways in which these tensions manifest within Santiago, Chile and São Paulo, Brazil. I explore the political struggle that ensues as actors seek to establish new structures for participating in live shows and for playing music as both a creative practice and as an economic activity within emerging forms of communication made possible by digital

media. Owing to differing conceptual and practical histories of independent production and of engagement with *indie* music as a genre and market category, these tensions manifest in different, though related ways in the global north and in Chile and Brazil alike. Yet each manifestation is interpolated by a messy articulation of transnationally-produced notions of aesthetics, authentic modes of engagement with music, and moral-ethical ways of organizing music production, circulation and remuneration as a social practice.

Chapter 1 considers how historical relations of musical circulation and valuation have laid the foundation for the particular ways in which the touring routes of bands from the global north become extended into Chile and Brazil. This expansion occurs through the articulation of emerging structures of economic production in the indie music touring industry with the personal biographies, listening practices and media circulation habits of the people directly responsible for producing shows in Brazil and Chile. Chapters 2 and 3 consider the way the larger northern structure, both historically from the time of the physical circulation of recordings and magazines, as well as in its current, digitally-mediated manifestation, has contributed to notions about what independent production of bands from and within Santiago and São Paulo (and Chile and Brazil) *should* be like and *could* be like. While musicians, producers, bloggers and listeners in these places watch and contribute to the expansion of the northern touring routes into their cities, they struggle to create local structures for independent music circulation and finance which endure in time and space. In chapter 2, I consider spaces for musical association as forms of infrastructure that both emerge from and themselves help constitute musical-social networks. In chapter 3, I show how the history of individuals' engagement with particular sets of indie sounds from the global north bear upon the contemporary formation of infrastructures of social relations, musical aesthetics, and places for musical and social association. The fourth chapter details how the

tensions between the construction of audience, value, aesthetics and circulation arising from new production structures manifest in the politics of a new type of institution called Fora do Eixo. Developed over the last decade in Brazil, within a unique political and cultural environment characterized by an embrace of digital networking tools as a means for democratizing cultural production and political participation, Fora do Eixo reveals the way these "social infrastructures," formed heavily through social media platforms online, can be harnessed to build new institutions for the securing of resources.

The Historical Configuration of Indie

Part of what is at stake in each of these chapters is the definition and invocation of *indie* as both a musical genre and a mode of organizing musical production and circulation in a still-emerging music industry landscape. Historically, the term indie arose as a diminutive of *independent*, defined by journalist and independent publisher Kaya Oakes as "independently made postpunk music in the 90s and today" (2009:138). This notion of the term makes constant reference to particular spaces of music production—including labels, record distribution companies, radio stations and magazines—that evolved in the US and UK beginning in the late 1970s with punk and hardcore. Championing the value of DIY, "Do-It-Yourself," these entities positioned themselves as oppositional to the major record labels and mainstream commercial broadcasting. A major challenge of independent production at this time was the problem of distributing recordings and information about bands over large geographical spaces without the aid of the majors labels' distribution networks or commercial radio promotion (Fonarow 2006:34; Hesmondhalgh 1999; 1997).[1]

[1] See also Bannister (2006), Fonarow (2006), Hesmondhalgh (1999; 1997), Kruse (2003).

Digital technologies have contributed to the buckling of the multinational recording industry before a dramatic reduction in the sale of records, its principal revenue stream (Leyshon et al. 2005), and have also helped strengthen and create many different independent models of music production and distribution (Lemos and Castro 2008; Vicente 2006). They have also been celebrated for their capacity to subvert the control of multinational conglomerates and support a new mode of peer-based, sharing culture (cf Lessig 2008). Online social networking platforms have allowed musicians to present themselves to potentially any internet user, creating profiles for themselves complete with tracks for streaming and download. They have also provided fora for musicians to publically cast their connections to other musicians or persons involved in music (whether interpersonal or imagined). This can create networks of musical and social association, or assert linkages between bands and places felt to be affinitive by the social media users (including those who are musicians themselves). Such was the case for the website MySpace, which served as the main locus for the online presence of indie musicians for about five years, roughly between 2005 and 2009. Because the site allowed users to curate the display of their "top friends," bands in Chile, for example, could publically associate with other bands in the country and region, as well as with more well-known bands from the north which they admired. Curating lists of top friends thus allowed bands to discursively and representationally place themselves into the same transnational ambit of production and circulation, and thus define themselves as of the same type of sound and social practice (Feld 1984).

The particular way in which indie has expanded into its contemporary manifestation owes to the infrastructures for musical circulation already functioning before these broad, internet-mediated shifts began to unfold. Indie as generated in the north has benefitted from increasing global circulation precisely because its large infrastructure, comprised of record labels,

magazines, journalists, and touring routes, all developed over many years, could be adapted to and transformed with new media technologies. Moreover, independent production practices in Chile and Brazil have been partially articulated with those developing contemporaneously in the north for several decades, especially in relation to punk and metal.[2] Sociologist Eduardo Vicente (2006), for example, points out a tension within independent musical production in Brazil in the 1980s. Some musicians identified their practices as the only means for producing and promoting their records. This served to publish recordings or as an inroad to a contract with a multinational record company. Other independent musicians, however, adopted the stance of *indie* identified as a post-punk practice with an attendant ethos of doing-it-yourself in order to retain artistic authenticity and maintain art production as a free social practice focused on creativity and community rather than on producing commodities for profit. The latter is the identification of indie as a type of attitude, and refers to that invoked by journalists and musicians in the north who seek to continually trace contemporary independent sounds, production practices, and values to those that emerged in the north in the wake of punk.[3]

DIY practices have been transnationally linked not just through similarity in production and discourse, but also through listening, even if, as today, this exchange was lopsided and largely one-way (north to south). In the 1980s, for example, the bohemian São Paulo club Madame Satã featured local musical and avant-garde performances in the spaces where burgeoning EuroAmerican post-punk bands, like Joy Division and The Cure, formed the music for the dance floor. As one frequenter of Madame Satã related, the club brought together "on the dance floor the sounds of the groups that were rising internationally, like Bauhaus and The Cure,

[2] Escárate (1999); Andrés Padilla, field notes; Botinada, A Historia Do Punk No Brasil 2011.
[3] Prime examples are Azerrad (2001) and Oakes (2009). See also Fonarow (2006), Hesmondhalgh (1999; 1997).

and on the stage the national rock bands that were taking off in the scene" (quoted in Leite de Moraes 2006:168). Brazilian DJs at the time fought to keep up with international activity by reading the British "inkies" Melody Maker and New Musical Express, weekly magazines devoted to UK and US independent charts (Leite de Moraes 2006:168; see Fonarow 2006:26-27 for a description of these papers). Brazilian DJs and fans often obtained cassette copies of records by these northern bands through friends or even at places like the Galeria do Rock in São Paulo (Leite de Moraes 2006:167-168), a type of "alternative" shopping mall downtown which hosted independent record shops in the 80s and 90s, and which still houses the long-running shop and sometime independent label Baratos Afins.

In Chile, access to such materials was much more limited until the end of the dictatorship in 1990. Throughout the '80s and even into the '90s, alternative music was largely circulated on pirated cassette tapes, whether dubbed by friends, sent through mail by relatives living abroad, or found at the *persa*, a type of semi-formal flea market hosted regularly in working class neighborhoods, with the largest, most permanent space the *Persa Bío Bío*.[4] In both Chile and Brazil, friends with family members travelling abroad or who had enough money to mail-order records directly from labels provided a vital link into peer-based trading networks that then circulated through cassette copies (Escarate 1999; Salas 2003:168; Iván Daguer, interview March 3rd, 2008; Cristián Araya, personal communication, March 6th, 2008). This helped lay dense social associations formed around musical sharing which have constituted the social networks girding much of the contemporary independent music production in Santiago and São Paulo.

[4] Going to *persas* is still a common activity for Santiago's alternative youth, where they pick up old magazines, books, records, clothes and pirated movies and video games. It remains today an important space for the dissemination of music, especially for the working classes, with dozens of vendors selling everything from pirated commercial recordings of all genres to home-made mix MP3 CDs full of local and regional rappers.

These personal relationships were also built through the access and exchange of print publications, which disseminated sound as well as discursively bundled diverse sonic practices from varying places into the common rubric of indie culture across the globe.[5] Music from the UK and US was covered thoroughly in UK magazines like New Musical Express and Melody Maker, while in the US, Spin Magazine, the Village Voice, Maximum Rock and Roll, the "college music" trade industry publications The College Media Journal and The Gavin Report, and many local and regional fanzines played this role in the US (Kruse 2003).[6] Such practices helped frame and define emerging sounds as "alternative," "college rock," "modern rock" and "indie" throughout the 1980s and then into the 1990s (Ballance et al. 2009:20; Kruse 2003). Built through an interspersed network of personal friendships between musicians and the personnel of budding music labels, record stores, and even major recording companies, by 1990 these networks would carve out a distinct identity within the larger popular music industry for rock and pop. Indie became associated with an ethos of counterculture, DIY, respect for social relationships over profit-making and the pleasure to create and *do* over a market-driven bottom line.

The information found in the northern print publications was scattered in Chile and Brazil throughout the 1980s and '90s, periodically appearing in such magazines as El Carrete in Chile or Bizz in Brazil. Ardent indie music fans might visit the British Council in Santiago to read the UK inkies for information. This was the tactic of Cristián Araya, a Chilean journalist who had become interested in indie in the late 1980s when he was given a copy of the first album by the British band The Stone Roses, after a schoolmate accidentally received it in lieu of a punk tape

[5] Thornton (1996) and Novak (2013) both offer rich accounts of the role of the construction of "scenes" through discourse in media, tracing the relationships between sonic and discursive mediation.
[6] In the US, regional fanzines often served as primary press for such music, while college radio stations and independent record stores helped disseminate sounds and give rise to "indie scenes" (Oakes 2009; Kruse 2003).

from his cousin abroad. This helped trigger Cristián's interest in indie music and in journalism, and in 1996 he would go on to found his own indie journalism outlet, the website **Super45** (Cristián Araya, personal communication, March 6th, 2008). In the UK, the weekly publication of these indie magazines helped drive an interest in the latest new sounds, prompting readers to buy singles before they had even heard them (Fonarow 2006:25-27).[7] Chilean and Brazilian participants attending to such discourse in the 90s frequently reference the writing style of the journalists as a major factor in interesting them in such sounds. Cristián described his interest in music via print succinctly: "I liked how he wrote" (Cristián Araya, personal communication, March 6th, 2008). Filipe Giraknob and Pedro Bonifrate, two members of Brazilian "ruradelic"[8] rock band Supercordas described the importance of print magazines for their own musical exploration. "You got interested through the description of the sound," explained Filipe, while Pedro elaborated, "I read what they had to say about [Welsh band] Super Furry Animals and was like, damn. That must be great [lindo]" (Filipe Giraknob and Pedro Bonifrate, interview, August 19th, 2011). At this time, Pedro would read about bands and go on to download their songs through Napster.[9]

During the 1990s, in addition to the consumption and circulation of northern indie materials through tape, vinyl copy, magazine, and budding file-sharing services like Napster, several practices articulated explicitly as *indie* emerged in Chile and Brazil. In Santiago, the record store Background Discos served as a locus for obtaining recordings, fanzines, and information from figures with experience abroad and access to foreign records, like Background

[7] This drive to keep up with the new has continued to characterize contemporary indie practices (Garland 2009; Hibbett 2005).
[8] From "rual" and "psychedelic".
[9] The first massively-used peer-to-peer music file sharing site which operated between 1999 and 2001 (see http://iml.jou.ufl.edu/projects/spring01/burkhalter/napster%20history.html).

owner Hugo Chávez. Background also served as a space through which to meet others interested in these same kinds of sounds, and to trade locally-made print fanzines like Extravaganza! and Especial 35. Crisitán Araya, meanwhile, founded **Super45** after a long stint as an indie DJ at the University of Chile's radio station (Cristián Araya, personal communication, March 6th, 2008). While these media were dedicated largely to foreign indie and alternative music, they also included new Chilean indie bands whose members would go on to become protagonists in the organization and promulgation of independent institutions and bands that continue today. These include the record label Quemasucabeza and the record distributor Armónica, both founded by members of the'90s band Congelador, as well as contemporary bands like Makaroni and The Versions, which boast members from '90s bands Tobías Alcayota and Yajaira, respectively. The magazine Extravaganza!, after a long hiatus, returned in 2006 as a free culture and brand magazine covering contemporary indie from the north, but also featuring emerging Chilean independent artists. Moreover, the founder of Extravaganza!, Fernando Mujica, has been a radio DJ and radio show director now for several decades, and is a protagonist in articulating new forms of brand sponsorship with emerging artists in private business networking parties.

In Brazil, similarly, several types of media made this local incarnation of indie available, including foreign magazines and Brazilian magazines which occasionally covered the indie rock sector. Brazilian indie fanzines had also arisen by the late 1980s, some of which became record labels, as was the case with Rodrigo Lariú's fanzine Midsummer Madness. Lariú sent a cassette mixtape out with the magazine in 1994, the first edition of what would eventually become his label of the same name. Midsummer Madness is perhaps the most-longstanding independent and also *indie* label in Brazil, and it continues to function today. Lariú also hosted a radio show called College Rock on a now-defunct Rio de Janeiro-area station called Radio Fluminense. The

station boasted several such shows dedicated to forms of alternative rock not otherwise broadcast in Brazil. Moreover, by the mid-1990s, specialized record shops like Spider in Rio de Janeiro and Baratos Afins in São Paulo made new titles in indie and college rock available for purchase or rent. These institutions helped form the particular aesthetic parameters as well as modes of social relation amongst listeners and band members which have now carried into the current sounds bands produce, as well as the ethos for both musical and social engagement among musicians and listeners. As I argue in chapter 3, these historical media, practices, and sounds form an infrastructural element in allowing for the production of contemporary practices. Yet historically-derived practices sometimes clash with the new articulations of indie and independent music as driven both by the popular manifestation from the north and the institutionalization of "DIY" in relation to Brazilian cultural policy, as detailed in chapter 4.

Indie in the Digital Age

With the rise of peer-to-peer file sharing software, and subsequently the ease of sharing information and opining on the internet that came with blogging and social media platforms, indie participants started lamenting the diminishment of the aspect of personal connection required to obtain indie recordings and otherwise stay informed. If Cristián Araya was able to think, as a teenager in late 1980s Chile, that he "was the only person on the continent who listened to The Stone Roses" (personal communication, March 6th 2008), he would certainly not think it twenty years later, when indie had clearly emerged as a "hipster trend" the world over, helping it expand to those who had not attended to or been socialized into indie networks from the '90s or before.

The shift of music promotion and journalism from specialized print magazines to blogs and websites played a major role in provoking this expansion and diffusion. As with the case of Cristián Araya and **Super45** co-founder Boris Orellana, these sites were often founded by sole individuals or pairs of friends in the mid-to-late 1990s. Many of the sites founded in the north quickly became semi-professional and professional entities, gaining paid staff and contributors and developing relationships to PR agents for emerging and established bands and labels. Such sites include **Pitchfork**, **Stereogum**, and **Brooklyn Vegan** from the US, and the online version of the British **NME** and **Melody Maker**, among others. Websites generated from Chile and Brazil, such as **Super45**, **Disorder**, and **Pániko** (Chile), or **Trabalho Sujo**, **Scream & Yell**, and **Move That Jukebox** (Brazil) have grown in importance but have struggled to professionalize in the same manner, and are usually able to remunerate just the editor. Contributors to these sites in Brazil and Chile tend to write for their own interest in the music, though they are now increasingly able to leverage their association with the sites into social and financial benefits, as will be detailed in chapter 2.

All of these sites derive from the historical relation of magazine-driven band publicity which helped drive the desire "know the band before it gets big" (Garland 2009; Hibbett 2005). As noted at the opening of this introduction, such discourse-driven media circulation is sometimes derided as "hype" in the indie world. As I have discussed elsewhere (Garland 2009), early in the establishment of indie music sites, northern blogs often referenced each other when presenting information, feeding off each other in such a way that despite the near infinite number of new bands to cover, a type of internet-mediated, collaborative de-facto curation occurred. Enough blogs referenced the same bands and tracks to circumscribe indie such that some bands

could become sufficiently recognized in many geographical areas to embark on longer and longer tours, or to gain enough fans to fill large concert halls in many cities.[10]

Indie-centric websites from South America similarly referenced these northern sites and contributed to whittling the information stream down to a more manageable number of bands. But written in Spanish and Portuguese and without the ability to review live performances of emerging northern bands directly—which would allow them to participate in "breaking" bands—the historical relation of information transfer from north to south that has characterized EuroAmerican-Latin American relations has been reproduced (Schwarz 2004). The coverage of northern bands on all of these sites, including those generated in the north as well as those from Brazil and Chile, has been crucial for creating more listeners of indie music, laying a minimum groundwork for the extension of the tours of these same bands to cities like São Paulo, Rio de Janeiro, Porto Alegre, Buenos Aires and Santiago. As the cases of the production companies Fauna Producciones (Santiago), Squat Produções (São Paulo), and Queremos! (Rio de Janeiro) illustrate in chapter 1, many of the agencies that have come to book and produce these tours in South America grew directly out of their founders' activities first as owners and managers of blogs devoted to the indie music they were able to access, in turn, through other blogs from the north.

The layering of historically-rooted indie music industry structures upon each other and their adaptation to internet-mediated distribution mechanisms have helped make indie one of the primary youth musics in North America and Europe, where indie bands appear on major television programs and receive commissions and licensing deals from large corporations for the use of their music in advertisements. This has led to a market curiously defined, in the north, by being both mainstream and niche at the same time. One of the best examples of this situation is

[10] Publicists, of course, play a major role in informing which bands are covered by these media.

the reaction by many on the internet—on Twitter in particular—after the Canadian indie band The Arcade Fire won the Grammy for best album of the year in 2011. After a critically well-received debut album in 2004 (*Funeral*), followed by more critical acclaim in 2006 (for *Neon Bible*),[11] The Arcade Fire was popular enough to sell out the 20,000-capacity Madison Square Garden venue in New York City by their Grammy nomination. The Arcade Fire represents one of the "biggest" bands in the indie world, perhaps even a "sell-out." But upon their Grammy win, Twitter flooded with complaints, as referenced in the epigraph, that "no one" knew who The Arcade Fire was. This reaction illustrates the complete breakdown of concepts like mainstream, underground, and indie to describe broad trends in listening consumption, as well as the ability to ascribe social identifications to musical market categories.[12]

The maintenance of historical definitions of indie as a particular mode of production and cultural ethos developed primarily in the north has thus become fraught, even in the north. Writer Kaya Oakes, for example, notes that even after American college students took her 2007 class devoted to the (constructed) historical lineage of indie in the north, most continued to view it as a recent phenomenon, a culture that perhaps arose authentically in '80s and '90s but was then coopted as an underground mass culture promulgated by *hipsters*.[13] In my findings, in both north and south, the term indie is still heavily associated with rock and with the rock lineage that emerged out of the 1990s in the north. But it now encompasses a wider variety of styles that might be more dance oriented, such as *indie pop* or *electropunk*. Moreover, in Chile and Brazil,

[11] The Arcade Fire (2004; 2007).
[12] To be sure, many studies have shown correlations between music genre consumption and social identity to be highly fraught or weakly-founded, such as the early study by Ruth Finnegan (1989).
[13] Hipsters are the indie music-consuming archetype, a white, middle-class, (usually northern) youth seeking social uniqueness through consumption of the obscure, but who must discard items of consumption almost immediately as the lightning-tempo ricochet of the internet immediately renders obscurity ubiquitous.

national and regional musical styles have become incorporated into the indie realm, with *Nueva Canción* and *nueva cueca* forming a segment of indie and indie artists' styles in Chile, and in Brazil with references to *Jovem Guarda* or even MPB, the latter referred to by one journalist as *indie-sambinha* (cutesy indie samba) (Pereira Jr. 2010b).

Scholars such as Sarah Thornton (1996) have argued that notions of subculture and cultural independence arise largely as discursive constructs, existing only because they "have been labeled as such" (162) in media rather than because they are truly distinct from the "general" popular music practices from which they are distinguished. Moreover, distinctions between independence and mainstream have long been blurred in industrial organization itself: by the early 1990s, for example, many indie labels became subsidiaries of majors, or utilized the majors' retail distribution chains (Hesmondhalgh 1999). Furthermore, indie bands that had arisen through independent labels and touring networks in the 1980s gladly signed with major labels to become massively successful mainstream bands at the close of the decade, and this is the case not only in the north but with Chilean and Brazilian bands of the 1980s and '90s as well. The most iconic and successful of the northern bands, associated with the "grunge" rock sound, was Nirvana, which featured heavily on MTV video rotations and mainstream radio by 1991, and helped inaugurate the mainstream consumption of a genre termed "alternative" in the US.[14] For these reasons, the ideal of indie might be highly analogous to Marcia Tosta Dias' analysis of punk, in which "it is the segmentation of phonographic production itself which allowed punk to enjoy a differentiated promotion" (2000:86). Dias also notes that the large space punk occupied

[14] As a tween in the 90s, for example, I heard "alternative" bands like Nirvana, Stone Temple Pilots, Soundgarden and Smashing Pumpkins on the radio and MTV, followed by what was specifically marketed in both media formats as American "Alternative," featuring bands like Bush, Green Day, Offspring, and the British Britpop/indie bands like Blur, Oasis, and Elastica.

in the press allowed it take on an "important cultural and political dimension that would transform it into an ideal product of consumption for urban youth" (ibid.).

Yet one of the tensions explored in this dissertation, particularly in chapter 3, is precisely the friction generated not only by historical discourses defining independent production as indie rock, but also by historical practices of listening to and producing indie rock sounds themselves. Chilean and Brazilian practices of listening and disseminating, primarily through cassette and magazine, '80s and '90s *indie rock* generated in the north, illustrate the way historical infrastructures of music circulation become the vectors of contemporary practices of media circulation and aesthetic valuation alike. They become infrastructural bases upon which the current incarnation of indie generated in the north expands into Chile and Brazil. These produce a historical continuity of both modes of social relation and clusters of sonic parameters, such that musical sound becomes an infrastructural element in the production of social relations and the spaces where sounds are produced and experienced. At the same time, indie has expanded to its current "global niche" status precisely through internet mediation, which has allowed it to expand more widely and rapidly than intimate social networks would allow. This expansion thus comes into tension with historical practices of defining and producing indie. The tension becomes particularly clear when comparing, one the hand, the emergence of indie as a market category associated with particular northern geographical places, apparatuses of production and dissemination, and sonic qualities of music, and on the other, the independent practices occurring in Chile and Brazil which were not brought under the label of indie or alternative as defined in the north, but nevertheless emerged on the margins of the mainstream music industries, especially during periods of political dictatorship (1973-1990 in Chile; 1964-1985 in Brazil).

Alternative Histories of *Indie* in Chile

Independence was the default mode of musical production in Chile for many artists throughout the 1970s and ’80s. In the decade prior to the 1973 military coup, national cultural production was encouraged by institutional regulations on imports and subsidies to local record pressing (Fuenzalida 1985:10; Wallis and Malm 1984:100–101). After the military coup, the Chilean recording industry was dismantled through the articulation of new media technologies, the government’s neoliberal economic policies, especially the new taxes for non-state sponsored public presentations (Fuenzalida 1985:10), and cultural censorship and limits to public gathering. These factors contributed to the nearly complete cessation of artistic production in the years immediately following the coup (Fuenzalida 1985; Rivera 1984). Taking advantage of low import taxes, the transnational record labels operating in Chile imported cassette technology and ceased to press vinyl discs altogether. Yet Chilean radio stations did not adapt to cassette technology but rather continued to function with vinyl records (Fuenzalida and Scott 1987:9; Fuenzalida 1985:15). As such, Chilean artists could record on cassette, but could only be broadcast from vinyl record, making the radio broadcast of contemporary Chilean artists impossible unless a record company was willing to press records abroad and then import them, as was the case in 1985, when all three record companies sent records outside of the country for edition (Fuenzalida and Scott 1987).

In marginal neighborhoods, or *poblaciones*, however, music making continued as an aspect community-based solidarity activities that also worked to keep the taboo recent history of the country alive (Mattern 1997). The Catholic Church, beginning around 1975, was also active in organizing recitals and artistic encounters, as were student groups in the universities. In 1976 both the radio show *Nuestro Canto* (Our Song) on La Radio Chilena and the record label Sello

Alerce were created, providing institutional outlets for a growing artistic movement called *Canto Nuevo* (New Song) that "counter-arrested, in part, the tendency of forgetting or negating the cultural past of [the] nation" (Godoy 1981:12). By 1980, a precarious, yet devoted underground press had developed where *Canto Nuevo* musicians were profiled and their song scores reproduced (Godoy in Fuenzalida and Scott 1987; Salas 2003:161). In 1982, the global financial collapse lead to a devaluing of the peso, severe national debt (Harvey 2007; Lear and Collins 1995), and an increase in import taxes. In addition to businesses' desire to capture a growing youth trend, these changes help propel *Canto Nuevo* onto radio and TV (Cruz 1983:46–47). In this sense, *Canto Nuevo* represents a common narrative of independent music production during the recording label era—a movement that arose autonomously amongst youth and later came to occupy some position of national exposure by becoming mass-mediated.

In addition to *Canto Nuevo,* a few psychedelic and progressive rock bands from the Allende years (1970-1973) had maintained a small performance circuit which new groups would join (Escárate 1994:71). Activity first centered around clubs, garages and school gymnasiums in peripheral working class and poor neighborhoods (Escárate 1999; 1994:71; Galaz 2005). By the 1980s this consolidated into a circuit oriented towards "hard" rock forms such as metal, trash, and then punk (Salas 2003:155). Like many northern individuals who would later become indie musicians and industry personnel (eg Ballance et al. 2009:1), members of bands from this era typically cite Kiss, Led Zepellin, Jimi Hendrix and other '70s guitar rock bands as their influences. Despite the dominance of disco on radio broadcasting in the latter part of the decade, the aforementioned foreign rock bands were played on specialized radio programs such as *Superdiscos,* which aired on the state-run Radio Nacional in the late 1970s (Escárate 1999; 1994:71; Salas 2003). Rock became "reinstalled" on more general radio in 1980-1981 (Salas

2003:161). The activity of Chilean rock musicians became distinctly dissociated with and opposed to the *Canto Nuevo* movement, owing to the former's apolitical stance and the latter's tendency towards ideological absolutism (Escárate 1994:73; Pino-Ojeda 2004). As there were only two options for industry access—small labels committed to *Canto Nuevo* and the political left, or government-aligned transnationals— local rock remained an activity marginal to mass communication for some years (Escárate 1994:71; Salas 2003:162).

The movement started to become more popular, however, during the mass protests that occurred in 1983 and 1984, which brought both high numbers of youth to the streets and invited the wrath of military police (Escárate 1999:83; Salas 2003:161). In another classic independent production to mass-band trajectory from the era, the band Los Prisioneros arose from this gymnasium and then university circuit. They became massively popular for their "direct and honest" expression of everyday reality in their lyrics, and their critique of social circumstances couched neither in Canto-Nuevo style metaphor nor the language of institutional politics. Their independently-produced 1984 cassette recording attracted the attention of the major label EMI, which reedited the demo and re-released it in the same year. It eventually became a radio hit and, in 1986, the highest-selling record in the country (Escárate 1994:87; Salas 2003:177). It also became a popular album throughout Latin America.

Though they began in the garage scene, Los Prisioneros have come to be considered the leaders of a new rock/pop music movement, which tenuously consolidated and gained some mass diffusion around 1985-1986 (Fuenzalida and Scott 1987; Galaz 2005; Salas 2003). Often termed *Nuevo Pop Chileno* (New Chilean Pop), bands like Los Prisioneros, Aparato Raro and Electrodomésticos reflected the new wave style that grew out of the British and American punk movements in the late 1970s and early 1980s. Many of these British bands, such as The Smiths,

The Cure and Blondie, are considered to embody the ethos of indie, owing to their independent origins, despite the fact that they had signed contracts with major labels and were being played on radio stations worldwide, including those in Chile, in the early 1980s (Pizarro 2005:397-398; Salas 2003:176).[15] After their incursions into producing this type of Chilean rock-pop in the late 80s, multinational record companies sought an opportunity for major investment after the return to democracy in 1990, producing a gamut of rock bands and subsequently hip hop.

The story of Los Prisioneros and the commercial consolidation of rock in Chile corresponds to regional trends: by the mid-1980s, rock had become widespread and publicly legitimated throughout Latin America on a mass scale, and was variously deemed "rock nacional," "rock en tu idioma (rock in your language), or, in Brazil, "Brock" (Pacini Hernández, Fernandez L'hoeste, and Zolov 2004; Ulhôa 2003). Moreover, the history of Los Prisioneros and affiliated bands seems to be repeating in the 2000s in Chile: independent artists rising through peripheral circuits have eventually captured more national and international attention, and have once again been labeled by the press as "New Chilean Pop." One major difference with the contemporary cohort is that bands like Dënver, Astro, and Javiera Mena largely became successful first in Spain and México, gaining wider national recognition after their pan-Latin American successes and representation in foreign media drew the attention of national media outlets. In Chapter 2, I discuss the relationship between the representation of bands on blogs and other journalistic media to the ability of Chilean indie bands to secure profitable performance opportunities. I relate these bands' performance opportunities to the construction of musical networks based on social associations, spaces for musical performance, and urban social and institutional dynamics.

[15] The Police, in fact, included Santiago on their 1982 world tour, at which point they had been famous for some years (Salas 2003:176).

Alternative Histories of *Indie* in Brazil

The history of the recording industry in Chile contrasts starkly with that of Brazil, where music first came to play a key role in mediating national and class identities, and now figures in political struggles over the nature of democracy and the public sphere. In the early part of the 20th century, Brazilian intellectuals were concerned with the development of the nation vis-à-vis the former colonial powers. They sought to identify the unique character of Brazil as way of designing a path to modernity concurrent with Brazilian realities, rather than continuing to "fail" as an emulation of Europe (Reily 2000; Schwarz 2004). A search for national cultural identity often sought already in music, together with a heady mix of new recording and broadcast technology and a populist state regime, helped make samba the quintessential expression of the idealized, mestiço (mixed race) Brazilian citizen from the 1930s (McCann 2004; Reily 2000; Vianna 1999). This helped solidify music as the central arena for the struggle over national meaning. Debates about the relative *brasilidade (*Brazilianess) and political meaning of music genres became especially heated in the 1960s (Dunn 2001), while preference for one of a variety of transnational genres, such as rock and rap, became a significant marker of social and political identity from the 1980s (Béhague 2006). In 2011, a panel of independent musicians and producers debating the role of music in larger social and political transformation included the discussion topic, "Brazilian Popular Music, What the Hell is It?" [*Música Popular Brasileira, Que Porra é Essa?*]. The panel quickly concurred that Brazilian Popular Music (MPB) is "music made by Brazilians." Yet the posing of the question itself reveals the continuing anxiety about what constitutes "real" Brazilian music, as well as the salience of musical debate as a mode of political discussion and critique within Brazil.

Despite these vast differences from the Chilean context, several comparable historical continuities and similarities appear in Brazil. First, paralleling the position of rock in Chile in relation to Canto Nuevo, Brazilian rock and metal in the 1980s was similarly read as an escape from MPB and its overly leftist (and middle-class university student) associations (Avelar 2001; Oliveira 2002). This opposition itself can actually be read as a re-articulation of the historical confrontation between *Jovem Guarda* rock and MPB in 1960s, which pitted the former as cheap and inauthentic mimicry of US sounds and the latter as "true" expression by and of the people (Dunn 2001:58–60; de Ulhôa Carvalho 1995; Vianna 1999:97–98).[16] The 1967 TV Record music festival, in which "Tropicalist" musicians Caetano Veloso and Gilberto Gil combined electric guitars and backing rock-bands with other MPB elements, is often portrayed as the symbolic "resolution," in nationalist discourse, of the conflict between these musical styles and the binaries they incarnated: the conflict between aesthetic intelligibility and artistic experimentation, as well as that between the idea of the masses as the people (*o povo*) that had only recently been incorporated into the Brazilian state through urban migration and samba, and the idea of the masses as the public (*o público*), as constituted and defined through mass media and commodity consumption (Dunn 2001).

As Dias (2000) demonstrates, the establishment of such notions as the mass public occurred through the consolidation of the Brazilian recording industry, which saw exponential record sales growth from 1968 through 1980 (55). MPB came to dominate this growth, though Tropicalist-associated rock artists such as Os Mutantes and Rita Lee, as well as other rock outfits like Secos e Molhados and Raul Seixas, became relatively sustained commercial successes

[16] Ironically, MPB had emerged largely as a "second wave" of the Bossa Nova trend of a decade prior, which itself had been criticized for corrupting the previously "true" Brazilian music—samba-- with foreign jazz (Vianna 1999:94-95).

through the 1970s.[17] In vast contrast to Chile, the Brazilian recording industry in the 1970s was the fifth largest in the world (Dias 2000:104). Maria Tosta Dias thus observes that while censorship under the military regime (1964-1985) may have been "drastic from the point of view of artistic creation, economically, the record industry doesn't appear to have felt its effects" (2000:58).

Part of the winning strategy of the record companies at the time was to have a small cast of highly successful MPB performers, forming a very rigid industry that had become stale to many Brazilian youth by 1980. Middle and working-class youth, especially in São Paulo, were connected to the punk rock movement through burgeoning record distribution, and were, like their counterparts in the north, producing music independently of multinational record institutions (Dias 2000:83; Vaz 1988). In São Paulo, they performed in the proliferating club venues like Madame Satã, Napalm, Rose Bombom, and Ácido Plástico, where northern new wave rock was played by DJs (Dias 2000:139-140; Leite de Moraes 2006:165-170**;** Oliveira 2002). São Paulo rock musicians were also connected to other emerging alternative cultural practices, particularly those concentrated in the Pinheiros neighborhood, a district that continues as a locus of alternative artistic practices and social spaces, such as the Casa do Mancha, detailed in chapter 3. One such historical space was The Lira Paulistana, which served as gathering space for the "Vanguarda Paulistana," or São Paulo Vanguard, oriented around experimentation, instrumental music and popular Brazilian traditions, and which had strong ties to universities like nearby Universidade de São Paulo (Dias 2000:134-141; Oliveira 2002). Lira would come to edit

[17] Tropicalist refers to the artist project of incorporating various styles, including rock, into Brazilian popular music; the aforementioned symbolic "reconciliation" by Caetano Veloso and Gilberto Gil marks the opening of this project, and Os Mutantes and Rita Lee's solo career in the '70s mark the rock-aspect of its continuation. See Dunn (2001).

musicians under its own label and also distributed other independent recordings.[18] Musicians connected to what would become hugely successful rock bands by the mid-1980s, like Titãs and Ira!, also frequented Lira and the Pinheiros region (Dias 2002:139; Oliveira 2002). Unlike today, the bands from the proliferating underground rock scene in the 1980s were quickly snapped up by Warner/WEA, then the newest multinational label in Brazil, which sought to expand record consumption in the younger generation, given that most record buyers in the 1970s were more than thirty years old (Dias 2000:82). Warner/WEA's rock bands became major commercial successes through the mid-80s, playing the new wave style massively popular throughout the world.[19] As with Chile, the growth of this sector in Brazil owes partially to the explosion of this same music internationally, with many foreign bands coming to Brazil on tours (Dias 2000:86).

These same historical tensions and patterns continue to manifest and become reproduced in the vastly different recording industry, music business, and communicational environment of contemporary São Paulo. Despite its waves of mass popularity in Brazil since the 1960s, rock is often still not considered authentically Brazilian, and is certainly not associated with "the people" as with other genres such as *sertanejo*, *funk*, and *forró*. As the São Paulo culture magazine +Soma wrote in its 2011 review of a new album by the rock band Nuda, "making rock in Brazil, that dilemma. Between caricatured emulation of US or English bands, attempts to revive Brazilian rock from the '80s… a genre always saturated and which in our country has always flirted with pure acculturation" (Equipe Soma 2011). Moreover, São Paulo in particular seems to reproduce the historical pattern in which independent rock styles performed in

[18] The label became integrated with the Continental label in 1983 (Dias 2000:138).
[19] As with punks, new wave musicians sought to reject the spectacle of big-stadium art rock popular in the 1970s, as well as disco (considered hedonistic and overproduced) by returning to the simple instrumentation and direct lyrical messages of early '60s rockn'roll, yet incorporating newer styles such as reggae, ska, and a wider variety of instrumentation and arrangement than in punk (Spencer 2005:219–275).

underground venues, themselves in conversation with contemporary styles produced in the global north, are simultaneously articulated with artistic experimentalism associated with the Pinheiros region and universities, as well as "new MPB" circuits highly valued by the cosmopolitan elite and supported financially by state and state-associated cultural grants (*editais*) and performance venues like SESCs.[20] Perhaps the historical novelty in the contemporary conjuncture is the incorporation of hip-hop and rap into this mixture, as well as a new form of experimental instrumental music performed in rock formations with formal borrowings from jazz.

History, Modernity, and Aesthetics

Two interesting trends emerge from these historical antecedents to contemporary indie production in Chile and Brazil. On the one hand, these histories are rarely, if ever, cited as lineages of contemporary production of indie by most of the people participating in it in the early 21st century. Rather, indie is considered to have developed beginning in the year 2000, or the late '90s at best, and is associated with internet platforms and digital software. The journalist Lúcio Ribeiro, who covers indie in the Brazilian national periodical Folha de São Paulo and leverages his visibility to produce live music events (chapter 1), articulated this position when he described indie as having recently arrived to Brazil from EuroAmerica via the internet around the turn of the century. As a result, he said, high-profile independent Brazilian musicians making great strides in international visibility, such as Cansei de Ser Sexy (CSS) and Bonde do Rolê, had made incredible progress, given that, unlike EuroAmericans, with their overt histories of independent music institutions, Brazilians had to "start from scratch" (*partir de zero*) (Lúcio Ribeiro,

[20] SESCs are private cultural centers funded through payroll taxes in each state. They will be further discussed in chapters 3 and 4.

interview, June 10th, 2010). The perception of the internet as inherently global, giving unfettered access to all cultural expressions across time and place, the increasing presence of EuroAmerican (northern) indie bands in the region through performances, and the continuing tendency to equate the north with full modernity, all help frame the notion that indie finally "arrived" in places like Brazil and Chile because northern indie music and information finally became easily accessible through digital technologies, which thus serve as tools for modern, global inclusion and communication.

This frequent notion that indie practice began only in the 21st century in Brazil and Chile is also common in other parts of Latin America. Such a view affirms the observation of scholars of Latin America who have noted the tendency for cultural production to seem to "start from scratch with every generation" (Schwarz 2004:234), positioning local culture as "artificial, inauthentic, and imitative" (ibid.:233) of metropolitan models. Narratives of 21st-century-born Brazilian and Chilean indie production put all the historical locus of independent culture in the north, which would subsequently move to the south with the arrival of a modernizing technology: the internet. One central concern of Latin American thinkers has been precisely the reception and circulation of cultural forms from Europe and the US in Latin America, as well as the reception of Latin American forms abroad, in relation to questions of technological development and modernity. Yet, as Latin American thinkers such as Beatriz Sarlo, Roberto Schwarz and Silviano Santiago argue, the co-presence of what would be regarded from a European perspective as self (European-identified subjects) and other (indigenous inhabitants, imported slaves) is constitutive of Latin American modernity itself. Some scholars have sought to marshal Latin America's "differential modernity," moreover, as a space from which to refute the metropolitan idealized narratives of modernity, including metropolitan claims to the rights to

determine the presence or absence of modernity (Pratt 2002:35). Yet scholars such as Roberto Schwarz (2004) and Nelly Richard (1993) emphasize that the history of colonialism and capitalist advancement places the reception of metropolitan models—of government, technology, culture—as an inescapable condition of Latin American modernity (2004). Such theorists might thus consider the adoption of the northern cultural forms, technological practices, cultural narratives, and musical styles of contemporary indie as a manifestation of the inexorable encounter with the metropolitan which forms a constitutive, albeit deeply problematic, dynamic of what de-colonial theorists call the "colonial/modern" (Mignolo 2000).

Journalist Lúcio Ribeiro's position that indie arrived in Brazil in the year 2000 keeps with this long and fraught history of the relationship between metropolitan versus "backwards" models, or western versus non-western cultural practices and technological developments. This is especially so because while northern indie bands become increasingly represented online and through tours around the globe, the same cannot be said for Brazilian and Chilean indie musicians. The latter seek to enter into the already established networks of global indie media representation and touring routes, thus being able to participate equally as performing musicians in the transnational style in which they participate as listeners and show-goers. But with the proverbial locus of indie still firmly rooted in AngloAmerica, entering into these networks, even today, becomes very difficult. As detailed in Garland (2009), this structure of the circulation of information and performance has helped reinforce colonial-derived ideas of South Americans' backwardness and lateness to modernity, in the processes casting domestic indie bands as bad copies of their northern counterparts. This has been especially true in Chile, where a specific lexical item--*chaquetear* or *el chaqueteo*— describes the frequent practice of "putting down" Chilean productions, casting them as "shitty" (*penca*) copies of northern culture. These attitudes

have arisen out of a feeling of not-yet-being modern and from a sense of historical isolation from the world (Garland 2009). In Brazil, the comparative lack of an indie industry is tinged with these feelings of not-yet-modernity, but becomes cast as a problem arising from the combination of poor infrastructures and social practices of production with a general population scarcely interested in indie rock.

In both Chile and in Brazil, one of the frustrations of building an economically sustainable independent music economy thus derives from the transnational context of indie music circulation in which Chileans and Brazilians participate as listeners, social media sharers, and increasingly, as audiences at live shows (Chapter 1). When compared to the weaker domestic possibilities of music circulation, this international activity helps contribute to the "fantasy of other countries where deficiencies in infrastructure are believed to not exist" (Larkin 2008:243). Moreover, as indie has expanded into a major youth market category in the north, sliding its tentacles into the south, the historical ideological narratives of indie, as well as practices of acquiring and participating in indie music in the 1990s and early 2000s, have not carried through in their more massive, internet-mediated incarnation. This is particularly true with respect to the practice of going to see local live shows to help form networks of mutual support. Chilean music producer Josefina Parodi noted the willingness of the new swaths of Santiago indie fans to pay for expensive international shows, but their unwillingness to pay a pittance for entrance at local venues, quipping, "from $CHP15,000 ($US30) up they pay, from $CHP15,000 below they won't pay. How weird!" (Josefina Parodi, interview, May 19th, 2011). While I do not wish to paint a simple narrative of a new instance of neo-colonial cultural intervention into Brazil and Chile through the extension of northern music industry practices, the overwhelming scale of media promotion and touring ability of northern artists far outstrips the capacities of Brazilian and

Chilean musicians to disseminate their own work, both at home and abroad. In this dissertation I thus explore the ways in which Brazilian and Chilean musicians, producers and fans navigate the contemporary colonial/modern dynamics of economy, aesthetics and social connection within particular socio-musical milieus in Santiago and São Paulo, which are partially configured by transnational music industry practices.

The capacities of internet-mediated circulation far outstrip the production capacity of the musical infrastructures built historically through specific practices of listening and exchange in differential locales**.** In the 1980s and '90s the circulation of northern rock music on radios and tapes contributed to the booking of international tours by these same bands. In the 2000s the anxiety to keep up with new bands via the internet and to participate in the construction of indie both online and by attending live shows similarly has contributed to the expansion of indie touring routes around the globe. In both cases, a nexus of sociability, market logics for musical distribution and differing media of sound storage and information dissemination produced what was felt as a new scene and ethos of independent music. In each case, as well, independent production emerged in Chile and Brazil *both* as a response to particular possibilities for musical production and dissemination within these countries, *and* as a desire to participate in global trends of musical style, production, and social ethos as defined by the north through its global spread.

Affect, Late Capitalism, and Touring in Chile and Brazil

Affect has recently been theorized as key to understanding the way subjective experiences are made into an economic vehicle, in which social processes become both the basis for economic production as well as experiential products in themselves. Theories of affect have

considered affects as a mode of thought or *intensity* not defined representationally (Massumi 2002); rather "affects may be ultimately determined by the given system of ideas that one has, but they are not 'reducible to the ideas one has'" (Povinelli 2011:8–9). The musico-social affects at work in the production of live indie shows in Brazil and Chile are produced partially through the techno-socio-economic arrangements through which musical worlds come into being, and social media form a significant element of such arrangements**.** This approach counters theories by scholars like Jodi Dean (2009), who argue that internet-mediated social communication platforms are individualizing, such that the activity of online discussion and sharing becomes impotent before larger political and economic structures. Rather, such phenomena as the social media-mediated show and the (directly) social-media produced show, collude with corporate finance in the mediation of aesthetic regimes and together serve as the terrain upon which neoliberalism comes into being (Povinelli 2011).

Maurizio Lazzarato and Steven Shaviro map the way in which the process of producing a subjectivity-world is also that which produces value within neoliberal economic logic. As materials of communication, media are key to the production of subjectivity and the simultaneous production of value, working, in Shaviro's parlance, as "machines" for generating both affect and subjectivity (subjectivity is mediated by affect), from which value can be extracted and capital valorized (2010:3). The production and consumption of information, which for Lazzarato is the foundation of the social, simultaneously constructs a market. Subjectivity and value are produced at the same time because "the process of the production of communication tends to become immediately the process of valorization" (Lazzarato 1996:143). Subjectivity, affect, and experience are not superstructures here, but form the very "economic infrastructure" of capitalism. This makes "the production of subjectivity… the primary and most

important form of production, the 'commodity' that goes into the production of all other commodities" (Lazzarato 2012:34). This approach complements anthropological work on how particular public spheres and cultural worlds arise from the dynamic movement of circulating ideas, sounds, people, things (Gaonkar and Povinelli 2003; Lee and LiPuma 2002). Shaviro (2010), Lazzarato (2012; 2004; 1996) and Clough et al. (2007) similarly argue that the generation of worlds and subjectivities is one and the same.[21]

Chapter 1: The Evolution and Structure of the Foreign Touring Industry in Chile and Brazil

Chapter 1 develops this theoretical support by examining the exponential increase, over the last five years, in the presence of foreign band performances in Chile and Brazil. By "foreign" I designate bands and musicians from the global north—principally the United States and the UK, though acts from Canada, the antipodes and continental Europe are also included. Excluded from this category are bands from other areas in Latin America, for while South America, in particular, is seeing an increased regional circulation of bands—especially bands from Argentina in Brazil and vice versa—these are not typically marked with the promotional fanfare and extravagant ticket prices attached to bands that are designated "foreign" (*extranjera, estrangeira*), *gringa,* or *internacional* in both Spanish and Portuguese, or *de fora* ("from outside") in Brazil. "International" bands have a distinctly northern geographical connotation while cultural products and music from elsewhere in Latin America are placed along the lines of brotherhood or locality. I argue that historical relations of value, including that of capital investment, symbolic enactment and affective attachment that have constituted relationships between the north and south are being recast as a type of global participation mediated by a

[21] These theorists follow a Spinozan approach, in which a monad is an expression of the world which forms its essence and allows its existence, but which also, at the same time, constantly supersedes the monad (Lazzarato 2004).

newer form of finance capital which is manifested in the form of the brand and conducted through the mechanism of affect.

Chapter one details several different models of live music production to illuminate the broader mechanisms at work in the financing, promotion, and values behind the performances of foreign indie bands in Chile and Brazil. Using the performances of two northern bands, Metronomy (UK) and Warpaint (US), I compare the media and financial practices of the key production companies managing the foreign indie sector in the region: Fauna Producciones in Santiago, Squat Produções in São Paulo, and Queremos! in Rio de Janeiro. I explain their modes of production in relation to the dense local histories and social relations that enabled their coming into being, particularly the music journalism websites out of which they respectively grew: **NNM**, **Popload**, and **URBe**. I also draw together the relationships these companies maintain amongst each other and other interested media and marketing parties, such as brands and the northern booking agency Windish. Before this historical moment, all or nearly all of the individuals at the helm of this circulation—whether music journalists, venue managers, or the promoters themselves—had been working with each other in and at music events in their cities and regions when they began to produce foreign indie shows. I argue that the relations of familiarity and trust built through musico-social ludic encounters and production projects have contributed to these individuals' success as facilitators of international circulation.

As chapter 1 makes clear, there are strict correspondences (or non-distinction) between the owners of particular music-focused websites and production companies in each city (**NNM** and Fauna in Santiago; **Popload** and Squat in São Paulo; **URBe** and Queremos in Rio). These correspondences provide entry points into the individual and institutional histories of these cultural mediators, and indicate the importance of public visibility through online media to the

brand financing and other industry leverage these double-agent individuals can obtain, even if some readers of these sites disavow their importance or role as cultural brokers. I discuss how these music sites, along with other sites generated either in the north or south and in conjunction with the posting, sharing and commenting about music on social networking sites like Facebook, are important elements in the construction of the affect of participating in an indie world, and lay the groundwork for particular realizations of indie subjectivity that can occur at a live show

While the historical ties of listening and circulating indie through magazine, CD, and now new internet platforms form an enabling element in the circulation of these bands, there is a larger capital imperative at work in their ability to circulate farther and wider. On the one hand, circulation in the form of a tour has become the primary form of work for musicians, such that longer and more expansive tours to ever more cities in the world has become a strategy for survival. Moreover, as the recording business has shrunk, the business of show promotion and booking has grown. Thus, band managers and booking agencies also benefit from a larger pool of locations—and increasing competition amongst the promoters in those locations—to which to send their bands. Many foreign indie shows, particularly those of the up-and-coming or mid-level artists in which Fauna, Squat, and Queremos specialize, are sold by The Windish Agency, a US-based independent booking agency, known, according to its website, "as a tastemaker and musical curator" focused on the longevity of its artists' careers and on "brining music to previously untapped places" (Windish Agency n.d.). The working partnership between Fauna, Squat and Queremos, especially in relation to Windish, reveals itself in the high number of indie bands signed to Windish which toured Santiago, São Paulo and Rio via the corresponding production companies between early 2011 and early 2013: Warpaint (Los Angeles); Metronomy

(Brighton, UK); The Dirty Projectors (Brooklyn); Miami Horror (Melbourne, AUS); Toro y Moi (Columbia, SC); and Foster the People (Los Angeles).

The performances of the latter two bands in the region were facilitated by their participation in editions of major festivals--Lollapalooza 2012 for Foster the People, and Planeta Terra 2012 and Lollapalooza 2013 for Toro y Moi. These major festivals provide a significant financial boost that cushions non-festival performances in the same and other cities on dates surrounding the festivals dates. These individual shows, called "sideshows," have become integral items of anticipation in addition to the festivals themselves, often involving "smaller" bands than the festival headliners, and thus fit into the niche of the booking agencies discussed above. The increasing arrival of foreign-originated mega-festivals such as Lollapalooza (US) and Sónar (Spain) in several South American countries cannot be treated in this dissertation, but it is important to note them as a manifestation of the overall imperative of the northern-based market's expansion into the region. The festivals, moreover, illustrate the on-going unequal structure of recognition and circulation between north and south, as South American bands vie for a coveted space at a festival such as Lollapalooza to gain domestic recognition as worthy-enough artists to play at an international festival, which in turn can help garner them the wider local recognition they typically lack, despite years of work and often a dedicated local fan base. These bands are happy to accept extremely meager performance fees, especially when compared to the foreign bands, in exchange for this possibility of performance-cum-recognition at major foreign festival.[22]

Chapters 2 and 3: Social Infrastructures, Musical Infrastructures, and Space

[22] The logic of pay-to-play and recognition through performance will be elaborated in chapter 3.

I examine the processes of social production in relation to media, sociality, and economy in greater detail in chapters 2 and 3, which respectively hone in on Santiago and São Paulo conditions and processes of independent music production. I examine the micro processes of social production in each city, concentrating on two sets of interconnected practices. In chapter 2, I consider the dynamics behind the production and maintenance of venues for musical performance in Santiago. These are built by the practice of "managing connections," out of which rise "small alliances." Managing connections is a form of what Julia Elyachar (2010) calls "phatic labor," a practice of sociality enacted for the pleasure of social connections, which build "social infrastructures," a form of infrastructure upon which other types of networked infrastructures, such as economy or media circulation, can build or attach (see also Simone 2006; 2004). Small alliances, for their part, are nodes within social infrastructures that draw together different elements of the network, making them explicit and helping to give social infrastructures (and social practices) both form and durability in time and space. Small alliances arise out of practices of mutual social interest, but also the form of politics of drawing social associations together. They help social infrastructures endure in time, but as elements of infrastructure that make the political dimension of connection explicit, they also become targets for the accusation of *amiguismo*, or *friendism*, the notion that music circulates and resources are gained because of social politics, rather than "on their own." I consider the building of music venues and their endurance in time as outcomes of the allure of engaging in art (Ochoa 2013), and their necessary insertion into broader networks for the organization of labor and resources. In its current manifestation, the allure of artistic engagement does not itself produce economic resources, but becomes the basis upon which processes of value creation and capture linked to branding unfold.

Chapter 2 thus further elaborates the position of brands within symbolic and economic architectures for music production and the creation of various types of value.

In chapter 3, I argue that musical sounds also form an infrastructural element in the building and management of social connections and spaces for performance. The history of engagement with particular sets of musical sounds thus helps constitute an infrastructural nexus defined by musical spaces, musical sound, and social relationships. I focus on a small unit of participants in a particular band, Supercordas, and the solo project of Supercordas' leader, Pedro Bonifrate. I detail the way interest in particular qualities of musical sound helped generate the social infrastructure that gave rise to Supercordas and the Bonifrate musical project. The listening practices and aesthetic values of the musicians in these bands, in turn, arise from a history of engagement with northern indie music from the 1990s, drawing historical indie music industry structures, listening practices, and musical exchange into the present composition of Supercordas' and Bonifrate's particular sonic signature.[23] I then connect these musical infrastructures to the practices of social and musical engagement fostered by and maintained at the Casa do Mancha, a performance venue in São Paulo. Here I show how musical infrastructures and phatic labor help compose and maintain the venue and socialize listeners, such as myself, into a particular musical aesthetic and ethical social world. I thus detail on a micro level the mutual constitution of aesthetic values, social practices, media infrastructures, and spaces for musical engagement as a network of indie music.

Both chapters 2 and 3 illustrate how managing connections, building small alliances, and generating spaces based upon musical infrastructures arise from what Ana María Ochoa (2013) calls "the allure of the arts." These structures arise out of individuals' desire to engage with

[23] I owe the phrase "sonic signature" to comments made by Ana María Ochoa.

sound and the social pleasure of such engagement, that is for the interest in the pleasures of sound and social connection themselves (cf Elyachar 2010), and not for the instrumentalization of immediate and effective larger political or economic ends. But this desire leads to a tension, especially in terms of the economic maintenance of musical practices and infrastructures. Because these social connections and spaces build themselves in network form, they have trouble generating economy in and of themselves. Rather, they must articulate with other networks of social production and economy. In both Santiago and São Paulo, a tension thus arises between the need to expand social networks and connect them to outside networks for cash flow, and the desire to restrict spaces built through social infrastructures to those same networks, that is, to the "people we like."

Chapter 4: Fora do Eixo and the Performance of Infrastructure

These tensions between sociality, resource management and internet mediation are highlighted in the controversies surrounding the Brazilian music and culture network Fora do Eixo, the subject of chapter 4. Fora do Eixo is a type of networked institutional structure that grew from practices of "band exchange" in the mid-2000s to become a cultural-political behemoth in Brazil, drawing together music show and festival production with cultural policies and formal politics at city, state, and national levels. Blunlty, Fora do Eixo has sought to systematize phatic labor—the process of creating and maintaing social connections— to produce a more stable and efficient network. Comprised of collectives dotted throughout Brazil, Fora do Eixo has turned the activities of band touring and social media participation into modes of labor which not only build and maintain the entity as an infrastructure, but serve as the basis upon which Fora do Eixo makes political bids for state and private funding.

Fora do Eixo's methods for building itself as a network have been a touchy and controversial subject within the Brazilian independent music world for a number of years, and have now exploded into the national and even international spotlight as Fora do Eixo has become more visible in Brazilian political activities. One of the tensions arises from a difference between the network's rhetoric of "open access," "rhizomatic," and "horizontal" structuring, and the highly rigid and hierarchical overall functioning of the network as a political institution. Moreover, Fora do Eixo has built itself by relying on unremunerated labor, instead "paying" network members and even outside performing bands in the network's own currency, called "card." I examine the disjunctures between Fora do Eixo's rhetoric and its music production practices in relation to struggles over the processes by which music becomes valued. Fora do Eixo argues, for example, for the value of media exposure for bands, and itself embarks on strategic campaigns to raise its own visibility in social media, a tactic which relies on the affective and moral imperative felt by network members to participate in the network and defend it against outside dissidents or even critical former members.

The media visibility Fora do Eixo purports to bring bands, which moreover is connected to Fora do Eixo's structures for the building of band touring routes through the collectives, becomes the argument to justify paying the bands in cards and not *real* money,[24] another point of contention within Brazilian indie music networks. I examine Fora do Eixo's claims about band payment by drawing on the anthropology of money, particularly Horacio Ortiz's (2013) analysis of financial traders' modes of evaluating and assigning price to bundled assets; to Holbraad's (2005) analysis of currency's expediency in circulating resources owing to its nature as a partible substance; and to Joel Robbins' (2009) connection of economic exchange to social recognition. I

[24] The Brazilian currency is the "real," the same spelling and meaning as *real* in English. The dichotomy between cards and *real* money thus becomes poetically fitting.

consider Fora do Eixo's applicative, called "Quanto Vale o Show," or "How Much is the Show Worth," in light of these works. Fora do Eixo's rationale for not paying bands derives from its belief that the band does not yet have value; thus the band gains value and recognition by circulating through Fora do Eixo's band touring and media structures. However, Quanto Vale o Show is a mode by which Fora do Eixo argues that the bands' value is inherent in its sound and the recognition it has already achieved, which moreover, is given entirely by the aesthetic quality of the music.

The contradiction between Fora do Eixo's remuneration ideologies and practices and its discourse about band circulation and media visibility further highlight the fundamental tensions between musical-aesthetic infrastructures which build and are built by networked practices, and the need for an economic logic to be separate from them. Yet, just as the actors in Chapters 1 and 2, Fora do Eixo has found a way to connect its network to economy, obtaining resources through Brazil's vast cultural funding apparatus. Brazilian cultural funding is highly mediated by the state, and derives significantly from private monies managed through state bureaucracies and from semi-state owned institutions like the Petrobrás gas company and the Vale mining company. Yet Fora do Eixo operates under a different logic than the actors in chapters 1, 2, and 3, who seek to articulate the values and practices that arose from social production, or phatic labor, oriented around musical engagement to brand sponsors and onlookers (Warner 2002). Even Fauna Producciones in Santiago (chapter 1), which not only relies heavily on brand sponsorship but became a brand itself, did so precisely by being able to articulate networks of musical production built through socio-musical infrastructures and the phatic labor of participants with the realm of branded event funding sought by corporations of various sorts. Fora do Eixo, in contrast, uses the fact that social infrastructures now constitute vast amounts of

music production to argue for itself as the new cultural protagonist within Brazil. In other words, Fora do Eixo appropriates the idea of DIY and indie, translating these into a cyber-driven "do-it-together," to gain status and resources in a political and legislative environment in which ideas of networked sharing and solidarity are politically expedient. Here, culture itself is not expedient, in the mode George Yúdice (2003) has detailed. Rather, the ability to speak on behalf of culture, to argue for oneself as the builder and maintainer of social infrastructures, becomes a tool for political and financial gain.

While each of these chapters illustrates the tensions that have arisen with the breakdown of the producer-product-consumer industrial model of production, they also point to new logics of capital in relation to practices of valuation and media representation. They highlight the struggle occurring as new media and economic logics build upon and clash with historical practices of production, evaluation of aesthetics, and regimes for mediating the artistic, the economic, and the social. What seem to be emerging are new economic logics and positions for cultural intermediaries. This dissertation examines of an array of these intermediaries and their modes of operating within different spheres of articulation: the transnational (chapter 1), the national (chapter 4), the city (chapter 2), and the social group (chapter 3). Yet as this dissertation shows, the possible action within each of these spheres is simultaneously interpolated and partially constituted by all of the other spheres. By exploring particular cases within each of these spheres, while noting their articulation with others levels of operation, this dissertation illustrates the logics of economic and aesthetic valuation emerging with the forms of sociability and the practices of aesthetic construction composed through the articulation of new media capabilities with the production dynamics of late capitalism.

Chapter 1

The Transnational Indie Touring Industry, Social Production, and Branded Mediation

> I see that people are turning their eyes here. There are promoters offering their bands to Inker like they never did before… saying that the band wants to come and play in Brazil. We've been getting a lot of that lately, for the last two years. And before I don't know if there was so much of that, like 'that wants to play in Brazil', it was more Brazil wants to bring the band.
>
> -Nathália Birkholz, promoter.[iv]

> Contemporary capitalism does not first arrive with factories, these follow, if they follow at all. It arrives with words, signs, and images.
>
> -Maurízio Lazzarato, From Capital Labour to Capital Life.[v]

It's close to the end of what's so far been an intense night at the club Beco 203 in São Paulo, Brazil. The UK-based indie rock band Metronomy has been playing to a packed and extremely enthusiastic crowd. The audience's participation is all the more the salient given Metronomy's stage presence: it executes meticulous renditions of its spare and calculated synth-pop with a subdued intensity that seems to befit a particular notion of English restraint. After finishing a song, frontman Joseph Mount preemptively apologizes to the people in the front row for deviating from the written set list at his feet, indicates that they have time for just a few more, and tells the crowd "you're wonderful!" immediately before definitively launching into *The Look*. The song begins firmly but softly, with just the keyboard playing a dotted quarter-eight note figure in mid-tempo 4/4 time, backed only by the clicking of the hi-hat. Less than two seconds in, everyone in the crowd realizes which song has begun and immediately cheers, throwing their hands into the air in time. When the rest of the band joins, along with the remaining pieces of the drum kit and the vocals, it seems as if three quarters of the audience

sings along. At the chorus, of course, everyone chimes in, especially on the rhyming and repeated words "big book," "look look" and "shook shook" which punctuate the lines. People in the crowd continue to cheer, clap, and wave their arms in time throughout the song, exploding with more fervor at each chorus. Twice, during moments of the song where the main theme continues to repeat without any elaboration through the bass or keys, and similarly sans lyrics, the crowd cheers and claps wildly. Excited to the same level as during the chorus but without lyrics to double, they whistle, cheer and clap. They explode again when the song abruptly, though intentionally, stops. When they finally quiet down Mount proclaims, "If there were a competition for best Brazilian audience… you would be the winners!." The audience once again explodes.

This August 31st, 2011 show was Metronomy's second of the three it would play in South America, the first in Santiago, the last in Rio de Janeiro, and Beco 203 befit the São Paulo night. The venue was then a fairly recent addition to the spate of bars and clubs that have been sprouting up on Rua Augusta since around 2005,[25] turning a grungy area close to the old downtown into a bohemian nightlife district and, more recently, drawing the ravenous gaze of the housing bubble that moved to Brazil after its collapse in the north. Since opening in São Paulo in March, 2011, Beco 203 has become one of the primary spaces catering to the most popular iteration of indie music activity writ large. My use of "popular" here refers to its usage in the North, not *popular*, which invokes the historical masses that have rhetorically served as the foundation of the nation-state while remaining largely excluded from political and cultural participation and representation (Martín-Barbero 2001). This is because most of the music featured at Beco's DJ-only club nights is from bands that are foreign, comprising the indie

[25] This is particularly true of the subsection *Baixo Augusta*, the "lower" part, closer to downtown. Beco 203, which opened in March, 2011, is located on Baixo Augusta.

category as defined primarily in spaces located in the global north. Many of these bands are quite popular within the transnational indie world, and would require greater space than the 600-capacity Beco to perform in many other cities in the global north. Hence, although they are popular in the English sense of the term they are not for the popular classes in Brazil. In fact, the majority of Beco's clientele could be easily be placed in the middle to upper middle class range of Brazilian socioeconomic demographics, which is reflected in the cover charges for its regular events (averaging R$50, or US$25).

This chapter examines the conditions that allow for bands like Metronomy to perform at spaces like Beco 203 and analogous spaces along the foreign indie band touring route that has now been established in South America.[26] These tours require ongoing local practices of indie participation, such as those represented at Beco. The venue hosts several club nights specifically around the indie theme, such as the *Fuck Rehab* open bar night, the *Indie Rokkers* DJ'd events ("no remix, zero pop!"),[27] the *Gig Rock* and *Pulsa Nova* events which showcase two or three original Brazilian indie bands, and even indie-based karaoke nights. All of this is to say that Beco 203 attracts a significant, constant crowd devoted to rock, indie in particular. During interviews with Beco attendees at various nights, most of this attention was oriented internationally rather than domestically. It is perhaps not surprising then, that Beco 203 is a favorite site for performances of foreign indie bands like Metronomy. It served as São Paulo's foreign indie band venue almost without competition for several months in 2011, until the opening of the slightly larger-capacity Cine Jóia towards the end of the year.[28] Places like Beco

[26] This route is typically comprised of Santiago, Buenos Aires, Porto Alegre, São Paulo, Rio de Janeiro, and sometimes Bogotá.
[27] See https://www.facebook.com/events/156959977835535/
[28] A converted old movie house located in São Paulo's Japantown, Cine Joia is partially owned by Lúcio Ribeiro the journalist responsible for many foreign indie shows, via his partner booking agency Squat-Produções.

203 provide local spaces in which to engage with internet-mediated sounds within a co-present social space, helping establish the social value of attending the live performance of these same bands when touring to different cities.

Beco's promotes much of its quotidian programming under the auspices of the websites **Rocknbeats** and **Move That Jukebox**, two of the larger indie-centric websites from São Paulo.[29] These sites' contributors often serve as DJs at Beco indie nights, even when their particular site is not hosting the party. In fact, Junior Passini, one of the founders and continuing editor of **Rocknbeats**, is Beco 203's resident DJ and one of the booking managers for the club's live shows, domestic and foreign.[30] Júnior Passini's trajectory follows a pattern of show promoters which this chapter details—individuals who began writing about the foreign indie they were accessing through foreign-hosted websites on their own blogs or newspaper columns, then Becoming DJs and curators of the reproduction of this same music at clubs like Beco 203, and eventually jockeying this position into the world of transnational show booking. This is also the case with Lúcio Ribeiro, his blog **Popload**, and the booking of Popload Gig shows with Squat Produções in São Paulo, and now the opening of the Cine Jóia venue which Lúcio co-owns. The same is the case for Bruno Natal, with his **URBe** blog and the promotion company Queremos! in Rio de Janeiro,[31] as it is with Mono Parra, the website **NNM**, and the Fauna Producciones company in Santiago. Metronomy's South American tour occurred through these same production companies in their respective cities.

[29] Technically, **Rocknbeats** is from the nearby city of Campinas, but its founders and many of its contributors are currently located in São Paulo.
[30] Similarly, Alex Correa, who cofounded **Move That Jukebox** in 2009 when he was seventeen, has now also become a resident DJ at a nearby club catering to the indie crowd called Funhouse.
[31] Over the course of my fieldwork this name shifted from "O Queremos" to "Queremos!." For ease of legibility I henceforth clip the exclamation point from the name, thus: "Queremos."

The informal alliance among these last three production companies, also known as promoters, manages a significant percentage of foreign indie bands brought to Chile and Brazil. The working relationship between these companies does not monopolize circulation in Chile and Brazil, but forms its backbone. Between 2011 and early 2013, seven foreign bands played in Santiago, São Paulo, and Rio via Fauna, Squat, and Queremos, respectively. Stops in Buenos Aires, Bogotá, Mexico City, or other Brazilian cities such as Porto Alegre and Recife before, after, and occasionally during this route vary from band to band, and sometimes Santiago will be excluded from a show running through Brazil. This can also, though rarely occur, vice-versa (a show coming to Santiago but not to any city in Brazil). When the tours are not formed through these particular production companies, they are still often negotiated through the same set of performance venues these production companies typically use: in Santiago, Espacio Cultural Amanda, Industria Cultural, and Centro de Eventos Bellavista (Ex-Oz); in São Paulo, Beco 203, Cine Jóia, and occasionally Clash Club or the HSBC hall for very big events; in Rio almost exclusively Circo Voador, a venue with important indexical ties to the popularization of Brazilian rock from the 1960s, as well as to the scant but revered performances of northern indie bands in the ’90s, the attendance of which marks a long generation of *carioca*[32] musicians and independent rock industry personnel.

The recurrence of these venues implies continuous working relations (important for the building of trust within risky market conditions) between venue bookers and management in both hemispheres; indeed, bookers employed by the venues themselves, such as Fernanda Arrau at Santiago’s Amanda, or Júnior Passini at São Paulo’s Beco 203, can enter into direct negotiation with foreign booking agencies or partner with local companies in the joint production of a show. Moreover, the performances of locally-based bands at these same venues draws

[32] Carioca is the adjective used to describe a person or thing from Rio de Janeiro.

connections between the "local" and the "transnational," figuring the former into globally defined cultural parameters and figuring the latter within local constellations of sociality and cultural value.

Surprisingly, Metronomy's 2011 presence in Brazil and Chile formed a mini section of a longer transnational tour focused on their new album, *The English Riviera*, released in just March of the same year. It has been uncommon, until recently, for northern bands to tour South America during the prime of a tour for a new album. Rather, they generally make it down somewhere in the "long tail" of the tour for a project, or in other cases, in the long tail of their career after an early wave of "hype."[33] As noted in the epigraph to this section, local promoters are increasingly able to articulate tours because northern booking agencies now include South America, via the particular promoters with which they work, on the general tour possibilities for their bands. Yet tour announcements and patterns indicate that northern agents begin offering their bands to South American promoters after the major Euro-American backbone of a tour has been established or completed. Because these bands are already circulating transnationally in the north, the local promoters who bring them to the south are seen as agents of global inclusion; they allow indie fans in places like São Paulo to also participate in "what's happening" in the same manner as their global peers.

The media presence of Metronomy in Brazil was crucial to establishing this global "now" and the desire for live performance. *The English Riviera* had won a good amount of favorable attention in indie press in the north, and had been nominated for a Mercury Prize.[34] Even before the announcement of their shows in Brazil, the album had generated excitement on

[33] This seems to be changing, echoing Nathália Birkholz's view of the changing state of the touring industry. Between 2011 and early 2013, Metronomy, Yuck, Japandroids, Howler, Tune-Yards, Grizzly Bear, and The Dirty Projectors (to name a few) played in South America as part of promotional tours for new albums.

[34] Awarded by a panel of UK and Irish music industry personnel for the year's best UK or Irish album.

several Brazilian music blogs. Two of the album's singles, *The Look* and *The Bay*, had been travelling the internet in video form on sites Brazilian and non, and were otherwise in the air, being played by Brazilian DJs during their sets at clubs such as Beco 203, or as part of intermission music between bands at live events. News of Metronomy's coming made the rounds in several specialized music blogs and even in traditional media, such as the interview frontman Joseph Mount gave to the major newspaper Estadão (Fagundes 2011).

If, as Brian Larkin writes, "technology, especially media, provide the conduit for the experience of being inside or outside history" (2008:233), media attention alone to Metronomy would establish Brazilians as outside history, while the ability to attend the live show *along with* media would establish them as *in*. Tickets to the show, though pricey, sold out quickly. Early-bird tickets went for R$90 (US$45), regular tickets for R$110 (US$55), and some scalped tickets for R$150 (US$75).[35] In addition to the enthusiasm shown by this quick sell-out, the event's Facebook page registered nearly 1500 people confirming their presence, while its *wall* filled with comments either by enthusiastic fans or those complaining of lack of access to half-price student tickets, all of which were rapidly snapped up on the day of sale. As described in the chapter's opening, Metronomy's rendition of their single, *The Look*, was particularly electrifying during their São Paulo set.

I argue that the energetic response to *The Look* reflects the constitution of an explicitly indie subjectivity and indie world through affect and aesthetic engagement, that is, through a particular form participation in the constitution of a world. This indie subjectivity and the environment in which it can exist are thus produced together through the circulation of indie information in various forms: the representation of indie bands in online media; the materiality of

[35] In comparison, Metronomy played a show with three other bands in late October of the same year at the Music Hall of Williamsburg in New York, for just US$15 advance at US$17 at the door.

these bands' sounds as played through computer speakers, phones, Mp3 players; this material when manifest in the form of the live show; the show and all it implies—hearing about it (announcements in media), discussions about ticket prices and venue, the venue's relative qualities, the payment system, the fees charged, who is going, getting there, being there, for some people the local shows they might attend beforehand, going out afterwards, making it home. The live performance condenses all these myriad practices and information into a heightened moment, a kernel of the subjectivity of the indie person. And while the show is predicated on them all, particularly important are the elements that occur before the band arrives: dancing to a Metronomy song at a club, media posts about the release of its new album, the activity of watching a video of one of the singles released.

The media practices here can be considered what Maruizio Lazzarato calls "incorporeal transformations," transformations that operate affectively in the bodies of media consumer-producers. "Incorporeal transformations produce… first and foremost a change in sensibility, a change in our way to value and perceive…. Incorporeal transformations pose valuations and their object at the same time as they create them" (Lazzarato 2004:189). Affects, for their part, have been defined as force, intensity, and bodily potential which may undergird, but will always exceed, subjective experiences such as representational thought or emotional feeling (Massumi 2002; Schrimshaw 2013; Shaviro 2010). The concept of incorporeal transformations opens the possibility to synthesize an approach to music as an *affecting* material substance with work on music as a primarily "meaningful" activity that arises out of a process of symbolic interpretation carried out by an already (culturally) constituted subject (Feld 1984:79). Because incorporeal transformations need only a sign (such as an ad) to occur, they "come before and faster than corporeal transformations" (Lazzarato 2004:190). On this level, the discursive information about

bands, the mere fact of their names circulating through web pages and appearing on social media news feeds, lays some groundwork for their sounds' interpretation and reception by the individuals consuming-participating in that circulation. At the same time, because recordings of the music these bands play also appear in these pages through video or audio form, or are otherwise engaged within indie spaces, such as at a club, the emplacement of the bands as symbolic entities within a particular world (the web page and the network of sociality and communication within which it exists) can occur simultaneously with a listener's engagement with the sounds as material entities. This brings a dimension of affective impingement on the listening body which undergirds (and exceeds) the symbolic-interpretative capture of the sound as a process of listening.

The live show gathers up all of these "incorporeal" and material elements in the mobilization of activity surrounding the live show. Much of this activity is already quotidian practice—going to a show with friends, meeting for drinks beforehand, posting about the show tickets or asking who else is going in social media. The live show pulls these heterogeneous elements together, retroactively and preemptively accumulating and condensing them such that those participating in them feel the affective weight of this world as it is brought into being in present time at the show, provoking intensity in engagement, such as that demonstrated by the crowd's response to *The Look*. This activity also constantly feeds back into online spaces such that the tight correlation between communication as the production of subjectivities in what might be thought of as a strict "media" environment becomes completely blurred with co-present experience. In other words, the engagement with musical sound and practices of media engagement are recursive, converting the seeming distance between media consumption and live experience into intensity, where dimensions of time are folded into each other (Massumi

2002:15). As Massumi (2002) argues, "intensity would seem to be associated with nonlinear processes: resonation and feedback that momentarily suspend the linear progress of the narrative present from past to future" (26). Massumi's definition of resonation is apt here to describe the resonation of music within bodies: "The body doesn't just absorb pulses or discrete stimulations; it infolds *contexts*, it infolds volitions and cognitions that are nothing if not situated. Intensity is asocial, but not presocial—it includes social elements but mixes them with elements belonging to other levels of functioning and combines them according to different logic" (Massumi 2002:30).

This chapters details the differential ways the live show allows attendees to establish and reconfirm participation in a milieu of knowledge and sentiment. Musical presence draws out and heightens this sense of participation, whether individuals listen deeply or whether the music forms a background element for the creation of an affective space of social engagement *not* primarily oriented around the act of listening. I do not argue for live performance as particularly affective because it is a form of communication more direct or unmediated than the type established through media circulation. Indeed, scholars thinking through affect argue that the present form of capitalism is particularly powerful precisely for being produced through affective engagements, where digital media serve as machines for generating and extracting value from affect (Shaviro 2010:3). This owes to the way musical sound *affects* bodies that have already been primed to be affected by them, and thus to "infold" them not only as material entities but also as signs that operate at the level of meaning (Feld 1984; Turino 1999). These bodies have been primed through co-present experience with musical material and discourse about music a social practice, and through the incorporeal transformations that have taken place as individuals engage with media about the band. These elements that capacitate individuals for particular affective experiences also induce the desire to participate in the particular format of a live show,

often the most valued mode of participation in the indie world. But this desire also derives from imperatives to "keep up with": when music is performed in front of a mass of others who also "know," it validates the activity of "keeping up with" and reaffirms belonging in a world. And this world is really a "world" in the widest sense, for participation in foreign indie in Brazil and Chile is compelling precisely for the symbolic and indexical connotations—cosmopolitan, modern, good, contemporary—which it connotes. This association with the cosmopolitan modern, moreover, both derives from and drives the larger infrastructures of transnational indie music circulation.

By detailing the different show production companies at the helm of this circulation in Brazil and Chile, as well as the differential ways in which media circulation, tour financing, branding, and audience are articulated in the cases of distinct performances, I explore the different ways affects are produced and deployed as elements in the constitution of both collective sentiments and new forms of capital accumulation and control. In other words, particular capital interests direct and configure the ability to participate, and as such the ability to have certain types of aesthetic and affective experiences, even if these constantly escape the total control of capital (Lazzarato 1996:144).

This dynamic is elaborated in the historical development of Fauna Producciones out of the indie realm in Santiago. Fauna's success in promoting shows is directly tied to its ability to harness brand sponsorship. Fauna illustrates the way in which the largely autonomous, affective work of the "creative classes"[36] is appropriated by corporations seeking to merge particular brands with the subcultural capital that has been generated by these workers. As Adam

[36]Following Arvidsson (2007), I use this term in contradistinction to Florida's (2002) definition, where creative professionals are those working in marketing and advertising in large companies. Rather, the creative class consists of individuals developing or who have developed projects largely outside of corporate structures, even if they eventually find financial recourse in these structures.

Arvidsson illustrates in his (2007) study of a marketing project by the Fox car brand in Copenhagen, the corporate tactic is to enter into partnerships with cultural producers who have developed projects largely autonomously and without profit as a motivating reason for creation. Yet while brand managers seek to latch onto the underground, their support has also become vital to the continuity of any project (Arvidsson 2007).

Together with the indie-focused blog **Popload**, the case of Squat Produções in São Paulo illustrates the relationship between the creation of subjectivity through the circulation of information and the particular logics of the touring industry, in which bands are bought and sold on an international show market. In one sense, bands are treated like other commodities—entities that, through trade, can gain or lose value or on which financial profit can be lost or gained. In other ways, the ethereal logic of "knowing" the indie market illustrates the deeply socially constructed and socially sensed type of knowledge that is crucial to working as an international show promoter. In other words, the social, aesthetic and affective value of a band can only be known through participation in the larger indie world. Squat attempts to calibrate these participation-driven values with a free-market oriented logic in which a band's financial value is thought to arise cleanly through the industry negotiation of their price (see Ortiz 2013 for the relationship between "natural" price and industry trading in the financial services industry). Moreover, Squat illustrates the ways in which brands not only seek to capitalize on this participation, but are also financially crucial for generating structures of participation, thus becoming integral to participation itself.

While the cases of Squat-**Popload** and Fauna-**NNM** show the importance of cultural mediators in managing the participation-brand relation; Queremos offers an example in which the logic of participation-as-circulation-as affect manifests more purely. Queremos is a platform

through which fans can crowd-fund the booking deposit required to secure a band, and thus seems to rely purely on the support of individuals. Yet Queremos shows are only possible because of the larger structure of circulation—especially the Fauna and Squat informal partnership—that brings bands to South America. Similarly, brands are a key element of the financing of Queremos both through direct Queremos sponsorships as well as through their role in financing shows in other South American cities. The affective hook of Queremos shows, however, is that of direct participation, a notion of democratic access to cultural products and a real feeling of "doing-it-ourselves" (or doing it together). Not only does Queremos make explicit the tight relationship between the production of sociality, subjectivity, and affective experience as an economic foundation via the circulation of information, it also draws into relief the relation between risk, credit and debt that defines current capitalist structures (Graeber 2011a; Lazzarato 2012). Queremos mostly clearly highlights the logics developed throughout the chapter, in which affect-driven participation is exploited by capital, in that participation revolves around an economic risk to the participating individual. Here, risk becomes a sign of social investment, indeed, it could even be said that risk is affective. I consider the heightened aesthetic and social experience reported at Queremos shows in light of recent work on the debt economy (Graeber 2011b; Lazzarato 2012), as well as anthropological work on money, circulation, and calculation (Keane 2001; Maurer 2006; Miller 2001; Robbins 2009).

Fauna: Expanding Circulation by Branding the Underground

It's a bit of a special night here at the Centro Cultural Amanda in Santiago, Chile: Warpaint, an all-female band that plays ethereal, harmonically dense rock songs has come all the way from their hometown of Los Angeles, California to be here. The show has been produced by

Fauna Producciones, which makes it a true event by booking local up-and-coming indie rock band Protistas as the opener, followed by a DJ set by Cristián Araya, a co-founder and editor Chile's longest-running indie web zine, **Super45**. The crowd at Amanda watches the show with intense attention, prompting guitarist-vocalist Emily Kokal to describe the listeners as "sweet" amidst apologies for not speaking Spanish and amazed description of the band's trip, the previous day, to the nearby Cajón de Maipo valley, where they saw a condor.

The Centro Cultural Amanda is a venue converted from a movie theater housed by a shopping center in Vitacura, a neighborhood composed largely of old-money and upper-middle class families. Like most well-to-do neighborhoods in Santiago, Vitacura lies several miles east of downtown, just before the foothills of the giant, though perennially smog-obscured, wall of Andes mountains. Amanda's location in Vitacura is both bizarre and befitting for the type of public that usually frequents it, standing as a reminder of the typical social class and knowledge circles of most individuals who might buy a show such as Warpaints', including the knotted and often disjointed ways transnational indie band circulation and media attention connect to those occurring at the national level. This is because while most fans of transnational indie music in Santiago probably grew up in Vitacura or in similarly well-off places, those performing in Santiago's smaller clubs and writing about indie on websites tend to come from more eclectic class backgrounds.

The mix of artistic and class habitus at the Warpaint show was largely brought about by the company responsible for the show's production: Fauna Producciones. Fauna is currently the principal agent in the production of medium-sized foreign indie acts in Chile. The company is now run as a type of "collective" owned and operated by nearly twenty regular participants, yet was initially launched a as a way for its figurehead, Roberto "Mono" Parra to formalize the type

of live music and party events he had already been running for several years and promoting on his blog No Nací en Manchester (**NNM**). In this section of the chapter I discuss how Mono and other Fauna producers were able to leverage the social relationships they had built through participation in locally-articulated but transnationally interpolated music events into a successful business model which relies on brand sponsorship for the liquid capital it needs to stay afloat. I suggest that the banalization of social media played a key role in the expansion of Fauna members' music-based social networks into larger networks of relatively wealthy and eager to-be-cosmopolitan youth, the target consumer group for Fauna's sponsoring brands.[37] Fauna also leverages social media in the sense that, rather than a strict hierarchy of employees for whom the success of each production is not an immediate concern, the twenty shareholders who own Fauna can (and do) individually push for each event's success on their own social networking accounts, and have been crucial to the expansion of indie to social circuits desirable for brands.

Fauna was able to bring together a new, young, and rich audience with the smaller circle of indie fans and bloggers that had been growing and solidifying in Santiago for several years. Mono himself started as one of these same listeners around 2005, when the proverbial locus of cultural capital and taste in the northern indie market shifted towards individually-run blogs and niche online magazines. As noted in the introduction, the online location of such information, combined with the serious hits to the major labels and their modus operandi, helped greatly expand indie as market category. This helped position indie as the new "cool" amongst cosmopolitan and university students in many areas of the globe who, wanting to participate in the formation of the "new" as it took shape, contributed to the pursuit of new music as a major

[37] As outlined in the introduction, social media refer specifically to social networking sites; social network refers to the constellation of social relations that obtain both online, offline and recursively.

quotidian activity for a larger and larger amount of people.[38] "The thing ate us," Mono related, referring also to his friend José Delpiano. "It was the only thing we wanted to listen to, the only thing we wanted to be, we only wanted to see people that were interested in and listened to this same music" (interview May 19th, 2011).

Mono and José became regular attendees of an earlier incarnation of the type of Santiago music parties that they would later throw, such as the **Super45** Soundsystem parties at La Berenjena, a two-story restaurant on Augustinas street downtown, just past the Bellas Artes/Lastarria area that was then picking up speed as a hip cultural and entrepreneurial area.[39] **Super45** is web magazine devoted to indie music; from 2006-2008 **Super45** co-founder and executive editor Cristián Araya periodically rented La Berenjena to throw dance parties with invited DJs and one or two local bands on the rise within the Santiago (and sometimes nearby Valaparaíso) indie circuit. These parties, **Super45**'s coverage of foreign bands, and its contests for best new local bands, served as an important foundational layer to the mediation and expansion of indie into Chile, and connected foreign indie to the then-circumscribed cadre of underground musicians and artists launching their careers in the mid-2000s.

Mono and José developed social relationships with **Super45** participants, artists, and other likeminded individuals at these parties, and simultaneously began disseminating all the new music they were consuming through their own website, **NNM**. **NNM** dovetailed with the music typically presented on **Super45**, but was curated with a more electronic bent (even though DJs formed a major part of **Super45**'s parties at La Berenjena). As Mono related this story, he noted that the iPod (launched originally in 2001), had also become ubiquitous by this time, and as such "the consumption of music was really high, like it took up all of your time.... We were in

[38] I do not suggest that this interest was not genuine; rather, as Mono's own story shows, it was deeply important and personally engaging.
[39] This area will be detailed in chapter 2.

amorous situations that got complicated, we both broke up" (ibid.). In 2006 Mono and José began throwing their own **Super45**-style dance parties with live bands, promoted by **NNM** and DJd by one or the other, with a friend's live band booked as the show for the night.

These **NNM** parties were incorporated into Bar Constitución when it opened in 2008 on Constitución Street in the Bellavista district. The area has grown rapidly with new, hip establishments over the past decade.[40] Constitución St., in particular, has seen much of this growth, and Bar Constitución was among the early arrivals. With Pía Sotomayor, a longtime show producer as the booking manager, Constitución became the new "*the* place to be" in circles of musicians and their friends. But by July 2008, Bar Constitución was travelling well down the path of more mass popularity, if of a higher end, as evidenced by the increasing abundance of *pelolais*[41]—a somewhat derogatory term that designates upper and upper middle class young, conservative women who attend elite private schools and sport long straight hair, tan, thin bodies, and heteronormatively feminine fashion styles. Early Constitución attendees, such as my friend Jose Sagredo, lamented this transformation of a place that had been "just for us," for a relatively circumscribed social network, into a less secretive place that had become so cool even culturally aloof and typically conservative upper class youth like *pelolais* were showing up in a neighborhood where only a few years before many may had never have dreamed of setting foot. Mono saw the expansion of this crowd with his own participation as a DJ:

> You started realizing that there was starting to be a bigger public which likes indie. You hear that in the new Constitución we were already putting on indie music several days a week and everyone wanted to be there, like the coolest place. And it was kind of born from there. At that time [the indie public] kept growing and personally, I was already

[40] See chapter 2.
[41] From *pelo* (hair) + *largo* (long) + (*liso)* (straight).

really inside it, I already knew a lot of the people, I knew Pía, I worked at Constitución (interview, May 19th, 2011).

The relationships with liquor brands that the Bar Constitución staff built would prove an important link in Fauna's strategy of heavily brand-sponsored and branded events, and inaugurate a new model for the size and type of audience for the shows they produced. Fauna's strategy marks a significant shift from the prior efforts of people like Marcelo Buscaglia and Cristián Araya to bring foreign bands to Chile. Cristián, in fact, had, thrown **Super45** parties at La Berenjena partially in order to fund the production of performances by similarly on-the-rise foreign indie bands. The audience for **Super45**'s parties, however, remained rather small, comprised largely of middle and upper middle class youth who were often involved in their own artistic projects, whether musical, visual, or theatrical, and who thus performed at La Berenjena and at other "alternative" parties. Moreover, sponsorship of smaller musical events had not yet become common business practices for many brands, and those that have adopted indie music sponsorship as a major component of their image building, such as Converse, Red Bull, and Heineken, were not yet operating in Chile. Finally, having studied journalism and working in radio, Cristián had a tough time selling to brand managers; thus his efforts to bring foreign bands to the city were sporadic and usually financially fraught, and he often lost his own money on these projects.

In contrast, Mono Parra earned a degree in business management, giving him the language to sell to brand managers right at the time that international brands began adopting project sponsorship strategies in the independent music industry. But it was by presenting himself as someone from Constitución, Santiago's most *taquilla* (cool) place, that initially opened the door to negotiating with companies for the brand sponsorship deals that have made

Fauna's individual events, as well as the company as whole, financially soluble. "That helped me a little in at least that the [marketing people] would answer my e-mails" (Roberto Parra, interview, May 19th, 2011).

Roberto noted that he would have liked Fauna to continue on in the vein of the underground scene occurring at places like La Berenjena, but that economically this was not feasible:

> At one point I realized that the concept wasn't going to be fed from the underground… because those dudes don't have any money… they're not going to pay for a ticket! So my idea was, alright, we're going to have to insert it into Santiago's rich-kid (*cuico*) parties, you have to put in people who like the scene but also move in other circles which aren't alternative circles (Roberto Parra, interview, May 19th, 2011).

Mono invited certain people to become members of Fauna who had such connections, thus Fauna's reach also expanded. "The thing was a hit because it was like this new party emerged in more *cuico* circles,[42] which mixed a little with the more alternative people and it generated a landscape that was bizarre but fun" (Roberto Parra, interview, May 19th, 2011).

Mono emphasized that he would have liked to have events closer to the underground type of music parties he has been participating in and which he personally enjoys. As he noted, the atmosphere at these types of parties is "completely different" and "weird."[43] But in order for Fauna to be economically successful he needed to generate an element of trendiness. This means

[42] *Cuico* ostensibly refers to the upper classes, but in practice invokes a type of stuffiness and conservatism associated with this class. Many of the "alternative" participants, while being from well-to-do families, seek to eschew the label of being *cuico*, moving to more middle class parts of town, seeking to spend little money, and shopping at *persas*, street flea markets in popular neighborhoods. Thus, as with many bohemian manifestations, the convergence of "artist" types and the *cuico* new indie consumers owes less to a difference in class habitus than to the desire of one of these groups to actively reject the purported *cuico* worldview, being "alternative" instead.

[43] These parties will be described in chapter 2.

that economically successful events require a particular type of atmosphere conducive to engendering a particular type of sociality. "People want to see people and people they like. You have to concern yourself with the atmosphere that you're going to generate in the party… that people want to dance…. The important thing is the music but it's not everything… it's much more than the band" (Roberto Parra, interview, May 19th, 2011). Crucially, part of what seems to make the "more" here is the presence of people who have historical and deeply participatory ties to these more underground, "weird" Santiago parties. On the one hand, Mono invites them because if not they simply won't come, refusing to buy a ticket. This shows just how much the presence of these figures is necessary for engendering certain style of event that is at once trendy, but also holds the authenticity of social relations fostered in the underground parties—which ironically is what makes them trendy and attractive for people who have not already been participating and for the brands that want to capitalize on the *en vogue* atmosphere. As Mono himself noted, these invited underground figures are the people who are "important" and who "do things around [music]….

> The guys who have been there behind the thing and who are interested a bit in the music… people who are also close to the project. That's why I say that the project isn't oriented towards a certain type of public, it's oriented towards the people who like music. The [upper class] people we invited was the directive to steer the thing so it'd transform into a bit of a trend. We have to make it turn into a trend because we know it's the only way to make it into a business. Because through music you simply can't sell it (Roberto Parra, interview, May 19th, 2011).

What is Fauna selling here, and to whom? Beginning with the question of "to whom," Fauna is selling both to brands as well as to a public, which it simultaneously creates in the act of

selling, a point to which I will return. To brands, Fauna sells the affectively positive social relations that a brand needs to itself become a sign of the "affectively significant relations that a company is able to build for its stakeholders, consumers, employees, sub-contractors and the public at large" (Arvidsson 2009:17). This owes to the contemporary organization of capitalism in which "value derives from social organization" (ibid.:18), that is, the "putting to work of the social and affective potentials of public communication" (ibid.:18; Lazzarato 2004; 1996). But Fauna is itself also a brand; in the processing of selling its brand image it also creates its own affectively significant relations oriented around cool. And this cool hinges on the value of participating in a globally-constructed cool. Fauna's brand identity as facilitator of transnational cool in Santiago is crucial then, not only for securing the financially necessary brand sponsorship, but also for gathering the public for these events. In other words, the fact of a band coming to Santiago is not enough to ensure its success. Mono compared Fauna's success producing relatively small foreign indie bands to the attempts of another music producer, Leo Valéria and his company Transistor, to begin working in the indie market after years of focusing on much bigger-name acts.

> It's that Leo Valeria isn't cool. He doesn't sell that. He doesn't generate that…. That's Fauna's trick [*gracia*], it has an added value. In some ways, it doesn't matter what [band] comes. It has that added value and that's what we make the brands see and what we tell them, and that was the idea, to have a name there. Like they talk about Fauna they don't talk about [bands Fauna has brought], like that's secondary (Roberto Parra, interview, May 19th, 2011).

Fauna's brand image allows it to sell its vision of which music has aesthetic value, where the aesthetic value derives precisely from the symbolic and affective relations crystalized by the

possibility to participate in a globally-circulating cool. In addition to the necessity of this image for brand sponsorship, selling this aesthetic-social relation is fundamental to Fauna's ability to converge a large enough number of people to make the events financially viable in terms of both numbers of people buying tickets and the willingness of sponsors to be a component of those ticket-holders' overall affective experience at the musical event. Perhaps unlike previous Santiago producers' attempts to bring foreign bands to the city, Roberto and the Fauna team approached the indie public not as already extant, in which case a show would just need to be promoted to it, but rather as something that needed to be constituted through the affective and symbolic weight of the Fauna brand.

> The idea was to almost to force it on people, tell them, 'this is what you have to listen to', convince them,[44] you know? 'Look, this is what's worth it'…. It's the same thing we sell to the brands. 'This is where they're going to be, this is where the vanguard is'. Like, it's all here. And that's what you have to sell to people, you know. Because for just music itself, people who listen to such vanguard music exist, but few man (Roberto Parra, interview, May 19th, 2011).

At the same time, which particular bands Fauna books do matter to the financial possibilities and success of its events. Fauna was unsuccessful with the band Caribou, for example, brought to Chile in 2010, during the height of its attention in taste-making blogs abroad. A similar situation incurred with the performance of No Age, a band that had figured prominently in Northern indie press for several years prior and had also been treated on Chilean indie sites, but which sold just 200 tickets in Santiago in June, 2009 (Roberto Parra, interview, May 19th, 2011).

[44] In Spanish Roberto used the very Chilean idiom *venderle la pomada*; literally *sell them cream*.

This contradictory situation mirrors the strange reality in which networks of circulation are simultaneously autonomous and inseparable from larger relations of capital. In the measure in which they are autonomous, capital attempts to direct and control them such that network values and brand values end up not merely coinciding but producing each other. Arvidsson (2007) shows, for example, how advertising professionals in Copenhagen work to connect the largely autonomous, creative production of the underground—the unsalaried, "creative proletariat"—to "the value-circuits of the capitalist economy" (8). Because value in contemporary capitalism derives from social organization (Arvidsson 2009:18; Lazzarato 2006), and thus hinges on affective relations among people and things, when underground forms become pulled into capitalist circuits as extant types of social organization, their value becomes indistinguishable from the capitalist value operating in the form of a brand. That is, the social organization and the brand come to share the same affective relation. In this sense, it is not entirely fair to say that brands *only* appropriate the affectivity of these extant social relations, for once they become tightly imbricated, the brand forms part of the makeup of practices and symbols constituting sociality.

The general trajectory of Fauna illustrates Arvidsson's argument well: brands became interested in sponsoring the music Fauna wanted to produce because Mono and other Fauna-owning members made the value of the indie networks in which they had already been participating commensurate with that of brand sponsors. This required combining the indie spheres of sociality with other socio-cultural spheres comprised of individuals the brands already sought to target as consumers. But Fauna's projects to unite these spheres also coincided with the solidifcation of particular logics of capital circulation that provide the financial scaffolding of the contemporary music industry, particularly that of the indie sector. These logics are expressed in

the need for bands to circulate in the form of a tour to an increasing number of places; they are also expressed in the necessity of brand investment to make these shows financially viable in places like Santiago, São Paulo, and Rio, which have a relatively small number of fans contributing to the financial equation. The fact that there are any listeners at all in these cities owes to the affective ties of the social relations driven by interest in music and the sonic qualities of music which form socio-musical networks. At the same time, myriad interests—from record companies to professional magazines to booking agencies to bands themselves— form significant elements of this circulation, driving and directing in it particular ways.

In this manner, rather than approaching capital, in the form of the brand participation in Fauna's events, as an exterior element that came to be incorporated into an independent cultural network, it should be seen as a new articulation of a capital relation that was already present. To be fair, in some ways, this relation in Santiago was largely defined by its absence from local music productions and its presence in transnational ones in the form of the larger music industry production. The absence of capital from the local conjuncture expresses the "independent" side of the network, those whose cultural capital was later incorporated into brand thinking around indie. But the circulation of northern bands through blogs, then tours, illustrates the way in which capital delimited the very structure of circulation—from north to south—from the very start.

I further consider the imperative to see and be seen to which Mono alluded in relation to differences in the brand-audience relation between across two shows produced by Squat Produções in São Paulo, each with different forms of financing and promotion. The shows' differences illustrate Arvidsson's (2009) point that, in relation to participation-propelled economies of affect versus economies of finance (despite being articulated in the form of an

affective relation generated around a brand), "the same social process can simultaneously be part of both economies and simultaneously serve two valorization circuits" (23).

Squat Produções: The Fulcrum of Southern Cone Touring

Squat Produçoes serves as the connector node and driving motor in the circulation of foreign bands throughout Brazil, and even in other places in South America, such as Bogotá. Squat was founded and is still headed by Paola Wescher, who got her start in band booking while working at the SECULT (Municipal Culture Bureau) of Curitiba, the capital of southern Paraná state. From 2003 to 2005 she was charged with booking the Curitiba Pop Festival and Curitiba Rock Festivals, conceptualized and partially financed by the Curitiba SECULT as a medium for bringing visitors to Curitiba to celebrate the city's designation as an international "cultural capital." Armed with a large monetary advance from the SECULT, Paola secured the performances of iconic anglo indie rock and punk bands, like The Breeders, Weezer, Mercury Rev, and MC5. At this time, most foreign bands were brought to Brazil via large festivals, like TIM Festival and Planeta Terra Festival, financed by national telecommunications companies TIM and Terra. Paola's access to SECULT money allowed her to eschew the overtly commercial connotations that such festivals implied, and also helped her forge connections with the handful of other people in the country working with foreign bands outside of the large festival medium. These early shows helped bolster Paola's standing as a particular type of show promoter—one concerned with musical quality over commercial profit— both within Brazil as well as for the foreign agents from which she would increasingly come to buy bands.

Meanwhile, in São Paulo, the journalist Lúcio Ribeiro was writing about the burgeoning "new indie rock" world on a blog called **Popload** (formerly Download). Lúcio had been a music

columnist for the Ilustrada arts and culture section of the Folha de São Paulo, the country's most widely-circulated periodical, since 1996, and his column still appears there every Friday.[45] But **Popload** is now better known as the website where Lúcio serves as a type of indie gossip fairy, posting news about up and coming foreign bands or new releases from more established ones, and occasionally commenting on Brazil-based indie bands. Lúcio's distribution in Folha, especially before even the paper itself went online, earned him a reputation across Brazil as an important conduit for indie information. As the now defunct Belo Horizonte blog **Pílula Pop** described, "If you want to be cool, you have to know him. If you want to be really with it (*descolado*), you have to read him every week and download the songs he cites in the column. If you want to be indie, but really indie for sure, you have to know him, read him every week, and still put him down" (Lorentz and Ortega n.d.). Participants in indie in São Paulo around the turn of the century, at that time in their early 20s, recently recalled the importance of Lúcio's column for them at the time: "I remember back around 2001, 2002, when the indie scene was solidifying, Uncle Lúcio had a column in the Ilustrada and everyone though it was cool to put us down and make lists "of what it is to be indie" (K.M., Facebook, August 8th, 2013). Though working in faraway Curitiba, Paola rightly considered Lúcio's column as key to media promotion of her production activities. Paola became vigilant about getting her shows mentioned in the column and about taking out add space for them right next to it, even when it appeared online as **Popload**. The column "was obligatory, for people who liked music and wanted to discover new things" Paola explained. "I knew that my public was there" (Paola Wescher, interview, May 22nd, 2012).

[45]Lúcio's column was first called Pensata, but changed to **Popload** when he moved to the UOL portal and content site; all Lúcio's columns, including his blog, are now called **Popload**.

Paola's success with her festivals in Curitiba, and the professional relationships she fostered with other promoters and industry personnel, provided her the opportunity to move to São Paulo to expand her professional activity with a larger indie audience than the one in Curitiba. She developed a stable partnership in show booking with the São Paulo-based Inker Agency and moved to the megalopolis. She also met with Lúcio and suggested he partner with her in bringing bands to Brazil, as a way to boost his income and open more freedom in his career. Paola and Lúcio thus designed Popload Gig, a "pocket festival" that takes place in the format of a series of shows by either up-and-coming or older, well-respected international indie bands.[46] The explicit link between **Popload** the blog and Popload Gig had a dual purpose in measuring the relationship between Lúcio's online communication and "real" interest in the band. "We would have control over knowing who it was who was consuming [the blog]…. And so the idea was to do a festival to see if people really consumed what he talked about. To step out from the online to the practical. So Popload Gig arose because of that, as an extension of his column" (Paola Wescher, interview, May 22nd, 2012). Popload Gigs appear as the most salient public face of niche indie music in Brazil: while Lúcio discursively convokes the Brazilian indie public through his columns and blog (Warner 2002), Squat Produções brings this discursive public into being as a co-present public at live shows.[47]

Popload Gigs are just one aspect of the show buying and selling that Paola does for a living; she frequently buys and sells bands for other promoters, venues, or brands in Brazil and

[46] In Brazil, the English word "pocket" is used to describe smaller shows or festivals with an air of informality, intimacy or smallness.

[47] In Michael Warner's (2002) formulation, "discursive publics" are constituted by the circulation of discourse in media, and the self-reflexivity of individuals who recognize themselves as addressees of this discourse or as onlookers. A discursive public is thus intimately bound up with but simultaneously distinct from the type of co-present, spatially and temporarily bound public manifest as the attendees of a live concert. I elaborate the relationship between discursive publics and concerts in (Garland 2009).

on the continent.[48] While she prefers to work with bands she personally enjoys, her renown in the international indie booking circuit earns her exclusive offers to produce certain bands in South America. Paola then has the option of producing the shows herself, of selling them to other producers, or of working out some combination of these options. This work forms part of a loosely organized international market of *buying* and *selling* bands, a process that often occurs in the form of a bidding war among producers in a certain area. Larger booking agencies send out e-mails to known producers offering their products (bands) during certain periods of time. The producers then bid to secure the deal. While this strategy is convenient for the agent selling the band—the bidding war leads to higher performance fees for the band, which remits to a higher commission for the agent—Paola does not usually enter into this type of negotiation, sometimes waiting up to five years to be able to book a particular band.

The process of buying and selling shows is highly risky, owing to the economic calculation that needs to be taken into account. The costs of bringing the band include the performance fee, riders (dressing room food and drink, per diem food costs, hotel, sound equipment that may need to be rented depending on the venue), international airfare, local transportation, visas, wages for the local production crew and, very importantly in Brazil, several types of taxes. These costs need to be calculated against the estimated size and of the band's audience and the audience's presumed disposable funds. This calculation, in turn, hinges on an interpretation of the band's symbolic cachet, largely interpreted through the extent of its circulation in foreign media of various stripes, from professional music publications to YouTube hits, Facebook artist page *likes*, performances at major northern festivals, and other "metrics" of a band's market position.

[48] In fact, she and Lúcio are two of the owners Beltrano Musical, a music-based *advertainment* company associated with the Cine Jóia venue where Popload Gigs have been held since its opening in late 2011. Lúico Ribeiro is one of Cine Jóia's owners.

Sometimes a band's position in the market changes during the tour negotiation process, such that it becomes "too big" for the middle-market with which Squat works, and may be bought by a larger company. In the opposite case, a booked band that has not sold tickets, for whatever reason, needs to be sold to another project in order to complete the contract. Such was the case with the early 2012 show by American singer Tune-Yards, originally booked directly by Beco 203 as part of its goal to have an in-house booking agency instead of relying on outside companies like Squat. Beco didn't sell the show adequately so Paola bought it and sold it to the television channel Multishow, for its Mixtape series, in lieu of a different band Multishow's curator had wanted but which wasn't available. "Once in a while we get a band that comes up really quick [*tá passando na correiria*]," Paola explained. "You have to fill in the gap because something happened, like, 'damn I had to take that band. It happened. Alright let's do it, figure something out'…. Because I had to buy for another place and the other guy didn't pay or another of his bands had to come, the other one didn't, you have one left over, etc." (Paola Wescher, interview, May 22nd, 2012). Add to this the occasional cancellation owing to sickness or injury of a musician, or to an offer that may be seen as a better career or financial move for the band, and the volatility and high risk in the market becomes apparent.

Popload Gigs are structured to temper this volatility. Popload Gigs are the most "thought out" in Paola's words, by which she means it's easier to trace the relations between a band's market position, indie media, particularly Lúcio's column, the audience, the audience's class tastes and consumer habits, and the sponsoring brands who would be interested in marketing to them. Popload Gig bands are often rather well-known abroad, but visible in Brazil largely only to those who have a social stake in paying attention as participants of transnational indie culture. These individuals may also be equally invested in domestic indie bands, as musicians

themselves, as journalists, or as workers in other areas of musical and cultural production. The extent to which the cohort involved with local cultural production also turns out at the foreign show will largely depend on which band is playing—those with both an image and a sound that are too "old," or "easy," or "hype" often do not rouse the local set of producers unless they've gotten on the list through their connections in the cultural production arena.[49]

While this more engaged segment of the audience forms part of the overall **Popload** target audience, it is not necessary for Popload Gigs to be financially successful. Rather, Lúcio's blog and the type of bands he brings cater more to those who pay attention just enough to be involved, but not so much that indie forms a major aspect of their daily discussion and use of time. In other words, Lúcio only needs a public savvy enough to keep up with a particular segment of mainstream underground global cool—what has risen enough in major music and culture media abroad, but which is rarely mediated by anyone with a major outlet in Brazil other than Lúcio Ribeiro. Other Brazilian blogs dedicated to indie music also cover these bands, but when compared to their foreign counterparts, these sites have much less reach—zero internationally and only a miniscule portion domestically. Lúcio's blog, by other Brazilian music bloggers' own accounts, is the most widely circulated (Junior Passini, interview, March 21, 2012), and was often cited to me as a source for indie information by Brazilian fans in line for foreign shows. Lúcio's emergence from the major outlet of Folha de São Paulo cannot be overemphasized here. This is also true of the historical relationship between mainstream media and a miniscule, lettered elite (Ramos 1989).

This relationship is in fact fundamental to the type of bands that are produced by Paola and Lúcio as Popload Gigs. Paola explained:

[49] The delimitation of these criteria will be treated in chapter 2.

> We wanted to get a certain audience, that went independent of whether it knew the band or not. Right? Which is what ended up happening. Now you go, you see a ton of people, sometimes it's even bad, right? That there are a ton of people who don't care at all about the band, they're there more to see and be seen. But that was the idea from the beginning. Because if you have that audience, which has money to buy a ticket… and in theory you have the sponsors and it's that audience that they want to reach. So it was planned (Paola Wescher, interview, May 22, 2012).

At the same time, Popload Gigs calculate costs according to strong fan to band relationships—these are bands with small but committed audiences, meaning that Squat expects to sell fewer tickets, but can place them at a higher price. This both increases and diminishes risk: risk diminishes because fewer tickets need to be sold to cover the cost of the show, a useful tactic **Popload** owing to the relatively small number of fans that can reliably be expected to buy tickets. Yet this increases risk in that higher ticket prices might deter some people from paying. This was certainly an issue for several of my friends who worked in music, even when the band in question was a beloved band,[50] as well as for myself. However, Paola seemed confident: "Whoever is a fan, who knows [the band], is going to pay, no matter what" (ibid.).

As inducers of incorporeal transformations, online circulation of media generate a strong imperative to "be there;" in other words, to participate—participate in circulating the information and participate *as* this information in the form of a co-present body vibrating with other co-present bodies and the material of the music at the live show. But there is also an affective dimension to the activity of seeing and being seen. This is precisely why brands are so interested

[50] This was certainly the case for the Grizzly Bear show at Cine Jóia in early 2013. One friend who was a mega-fan of the band refused to pay the $US90 for the privilege; I went only because I was able to get on the list at the last minute, from knowing the sound engineer from his previous work in Brazil with another foreign band.

in live music. This dimension lies at the heart of the contradiction of risk to which Paola referred, and clarifies the relation between affect and the circulation of information. This affective dimension is integral, but for heuristic purposes will be conceptualized here in two different parts. There is the sociality of seeing and being seen—the event as social relation. But there is also the affective relation between the individual listener—the fan—and the music. As Paola herself admits, both types of relation are present at a Popload Gig, and I argue that these types of relation are in fact inseparable, are actually just one relation. But this relation manifests with different emphases. The music-listener aspect seemed to be more salient at the Metronomy show, as the example of *The Look* illustrates. The emphasis on the event as a mode of seeing and being seen is illustrated through the performance of the American band Warpaint in São Paulo.

Warpaint was originally set to perform as the second Popload Gig of the season, but Lúcio decided to drop it in favor of booking a "bigger" band (The Kills). As such, Paola sold it to Multishow for its Mixtape project; Multishow would stream the show live on its Mixtape webpage page and, of course, keep the footage for content to be broadcast on the television station. The Warpaint show was thus turned into a Multishow-sponsored "closed show" (*show fechado*). Closed shows are "closed" because tickets are invite-only, unavailable for purchase by the public. Many closed show projects do conduct a small amount of ticket giveaways in exchange for brand promotion in social media, as with the case of Multishow's Warpaint project. The "closed" in "closed shows," of course, refers primarily to the shows' lack of public access and visibility—as there are no ticket sales, closed shows are not publically promoted and thus may take place almost imperceptibly to those not involved.[51] Most invite-only attendees of this show, moreover, were not necessarily Warpaint fans but rather media and advertising personnel,

[51] Shows that are live-streamed on the internet, such as Multishow's Mixtape shows, are public in this capacity only.

along with the obligatory music industry in-crowd of journalists, photographers, and a scattering of other musicians and producers.

This crowd packs Beco's longish space to such an extent it's almost difficult to move towards the bar area for the free hors d'oeuvres and the vodka, compliments of Absolut Vodka. A large yellow and black image of a cassette tape with "Mixtape #3" and "Multishow" has been hung behind the stage. Only a small portion of the crowd seems to notice when Warpaint walks on; most continue to chit-chat throughout the show such that their not-so-low drone never quells, not even when guitarist Theresa Wayman explicitly attempts to shush the audience before "a quiet song." The band takes it in stride, having fun on stage, making comments about how drunk the crowd seems, and asking if it's open bar. It seems clear after a short while that they're onstage more as props for a party that doesn't concern them rather than as the reason for the gathering. Backstage after the show, in fact, the band seems a bit shaken, though not extremely upset. They were not expecting to have Multishow's cameramen positioned so closely, flanking each side of the stage. They forget about it and dig into their drink riders, set to make a good night of it despite the crowd. Bassist Jenny Lee even douses herself, fully-clothed, under a pull-chain shower in the second dressing room while belting a medium-high note. The band is excited to get to Rio to play their last show of the South American dates and spend a day or two on the beach.

Given these conditions, the "closed" (*fechado*) aspect of the closed show can be read in another light: *fechado* is colloquially used akin to "deal" in English— to signal the agreeable settling of an arrangement between two or more parties, from friends deciding upon dinner plans to businesses negotiating high-stakes contracts. In this second sense, the closed show is a format that benefits the band in terms of money invested for its travel to South America, but for which it

serves less as musical event that condenses and makes salient participation in a world of indie, and more a vehicle for animating the negotiation and creation of the larger interests—those in communication, advertising, and branded content production—by appropriating the value of participation in this "underground" world. The *deal* is that of interests that are able to extract the participatory, social, and affective values from interest in the band and attach them to their own imperatives of creating affective relationships between consumers and the products they sell.

A Promoter's Take on Brand Thinking

Karen Kopitar elaborated the brand thinking behind closed shows. Karen got her start working with international bands in Brazil through the blog Dominódromo, which she created and managed with two other friends. Dominódromo brought some bands from Brooklyn, through the Brooklyn Bridge project, to São Paulo in 2009. Karen's experience with these projects helped her become the booking agent for the club Estúdio M for a time, before going to work for the Brazilian edition of the New York-based Vice Magazine. With Vice, Karen handled the booking of a series of closed or mostly closed shows set up by the Puma skateboard shoe brand, which brought several foreign bands to São Paulo in 2011. These shows were semi-closed; those who participated in Puma and Vice's social-media games surrounding the shows could win tickets. In our discussion of closed shows, Karen repeated the oft-articulated problem of the high costs of bringing foreign shows to Brazil (and to the region in general). This is true for any artist going to Brazil, but becomes a bigger problem for the indie artist which is "making noise abroad" but has a small audience in Brazil. As with the previously-mentioned, closed Tune-Yards show, as well as that of Warpaint, Karen thinks that in financial terms, "it's much more advantageous to give it Multishow, since Multishow's going to pay the entire bill" (Karen Kopitar, interview, May 19th,

2012). Multishow normally hires a curator for its Mixtape project; the curator creates a list of foreign bands, then Multishow hires Paola to book them. But not all the bands a curator wants may be available for the dates desired or for the amount offered. In this way, Multishow might pick up a band, or be convinced to buy a band (via Paola) for a closed Mixtape (or other) project. This seems to have happened in the case of Warpaint, and was definitely so in the case of Tune-Yards, originally bought in-house by Beco 203, then sold to Paola, who then sold it to Multishow but ran the logistics of its production.

What does a primary sponsor get out of these closed shows, other than, in the case of Multishow, content for its website and perhaps for its TV channel? Karen insists that it's all about image within small social circles associated with cultural production, advertising and marketing.

> You've got, I don't know, 2000 people in São Paulo who are quote hipster who are always going to be invited to all the closed events, closed shows, launch of a magazine, product, something. Usually people who work in advertising, fashion, show production, something like that. It's not the band's public or the channel's public. They're people [the sponsor] thinks is cool, who are going to be in the photos the next day, in the press. They're going to say, 'ah there were a bunch of cool people at Multishow's party'…. [A sponsor] invites the public it thinks is cool, that is, a public that adds to their brand in terms of image or something like that (Karen Kopitar, interview, May 9th, 2012).

This seemed to be the case for attendees at an earlier Multishow Mixtape show in April 2011, featuring the Brazilian DJ duo The Twelves and the Australian band Miami Horror. On Facebook, a certain "Markinho" asked, "which combo did you like more, Miami and Twelves or Heineken and Temaki ha ha" (public Facebook post from April 7th, 2011). The post generated

comments from other attendees about how good the party was and who had and hadn't found each other at it. This post affirms Karen's assessment of brand thinking:

> It's really more about the image. Of the dude coming into the [ad] agency the next day and saying, 'wow, Multishow's party was really awesome [*animal*], like I drank Absolut for free, whatever, all night'. Who's going to say, 'wow, I saw a fucking great show'. Few people are going to say that, since usually if they go they don't even pay much attention [to the show] at that type of event (Karen Kopitar, interview, 05, 9th 2012).

How was the closed Warpaint show in São Paulo different from that of the Metronomy show in the same city? At the former show, affect was generated through a primarily social encounter in which the consumption of branded products played a major role. Here the musical material animates and infuses the environment with an aesthetic and affective bent, without necessarily engaging listeners. By *engaging* I refer to the qualitative transformation in which the sounds become infolded into the symbolic-iconic world of a subject. Here I follow Will Schrimshaw, who argues for an approach to sound as "ontologically equivalent of affective intensity" (Schrimshaw 2013:28), such that sound can be severed from "the necessity of its being heard" (ibid.:30). Sonic material, or "sound-affect," holds an ontological coherence outside of its "capture" by a subject, what Massumi (2002) calls the "infolding" of matter into the affirmation of individual interiority. As such, listening is the process by which sonic material becomes "infolded" into the individual, affirming subjective interiority and resounding as music. But this capture is not total, leaving affective matter to act on individual bodies without acting on individual subjects. As such, sonic matter may act on and affect bodies without them having to listen.

While I think it's a mistake to limit the definition of *hearing* per se to the qualitative transformation by which material sounds become infolded into symbolic and iconic worlds of subjects, I do take this definition as a mode of marking out opposing points on a continuum of modes by which sounds affect bodies and subjects. The example of *The Look* points to one end of a continuum in which the sonic material affects bodies which infold them into subjectivities according to the myriad symbols and indices with which they have become associated through prior media experiences and co-present audition (Turino 1999).[52] In this sense, the Metronomy show in São Paulo represents a high level of engagement with sound, where affective impingement and interpretive frames resonate with each other.

Warpaint's closed show lies at the other end of the continuum, where the sonic material largely was not *engaged* in terms of the interpretive moves (Feld 1984) that would make it resonate and be felt as an amplified manifestation of participation in global *indie*. Rather, the sonic material contributes to the affective environment designed for the consumption of branded products amidst a pleasant social encounter. The music contributes an affective, but not engaging, intensity to seeing and being seen as participants in an exclusive world. Here, as in the Metronomy show, value still derives from participation in and access to cultural forms circulating transnationally via particular routes; however the larger purpose of such shows seems to be the attachment of brand identities to the affective dimension of seeing and being seen. As described earlier in the chapter, this dimension can be a strategy for promoters like Fauna to be able to negotiate with brands in order to produce shows.

[52] Turino develops a Peircian semiotic theory for the different ways music operates as a listening experience in reference to the world. Particularly relevant for this discussion is Turino's model "indexical snowballing" whereby musical sound becomes indexically associated with multiple, discrete experiences, such that one song can come to index many experiences and their associated contexts over time. Signs in the Peircian model contain multiple types of sign-object relation at once, such that one song may index several discreet experience while also invoking outside referents through a symbolic mechanism.

Queremos: Crowd-Funding and the Aesthetics of Democracy

> It's a short term investment upfront, and you can be part of something special.
> -Marcus Daniels, Queremos participant.
> (Marcus Daniels, Queremos Participant[vi]
>
> The *vibe* at Queremos shows is always awesome. You can go by yourself no problem.
> -Eduardo, Queremos Warpaint Facebook wall.
>
> Only cool people go to Queremos shows
> -Manu, Queremos Warpaint Facebook wall.

Promotional videos of Queremos' Warpaint and Metronomy shows in Rio de Janeiro open with telling signs: fans giving their tickets to ticket-takers, then walking up to the large posters hanging near the entrance of Rio's Circo Voador and locating their own names, printed in large letters, in the list of "Cariocas Empolgados."[53] Sometimes these individuals take photos of their names with their cell phones; sometimes they pose in the frame, pointing to their names. For anyone familiar with Queremos, the significance of this activity is clear: these individuals have made this show possible, and are proud to have participated. Queremos is the world's first crowd-funded concert booking agency. Crowd-funding sites like Queremos, or Kickstarter and Indiegogo in the US, are social media-driven collective financing platforms for singular projects, such as album recordings, vinyl pressings, or video shoots. Queremos relies on the activation of social networks (in the broadest sense) through the mechanism of social media to convince individuals to financially support a particular live music project, thus harnessing the sense of collective cultural production propelled by media sharing tools and transforming it into practical economic output. In the Queremos model, individuals are asked to collectively guarantee the realization of a show by contributing to the booking deposit; if enough regular tickets sell after

[53] "Enthused Rio de Janeiroans," a term taken from "60 Cariocas Empolgados," the first name of the crowd-funding project that would later become Queremos.

the booking, individuals' investments are refunded and they attend the show for free. Queremos accepts corporate sponsorship but limits it to fifty percent of any given funding goal. In this sense, Queremos appears to be a democratic mode of bringing bands to Rio. While broader historical, financial, and cultural structures configure overall band circulation, as this chapter has already described, Queremos! shows are felt to be democratic because a mass of people, reflexively articulated through social media and manifest at the live events, appears to bring the shows into being by participating directly in the financial aspect of their production. Through examining Queremos I consider the relations between internet-mediated mass participation and the production of democratic aesthetics.

From the perspective of many audience members and many of the performing bands, Queremos-produced shows are felt to be very special events. Queremos shows generate a feeling of warmth and connectedness because the performance is felt to arise through a *direct*, non-mediated relation between the performers and the listening public. Tellingly, this feeling of "genuine" communication—an authentic musician-listener relationship—is articulated in the language of economics and ideals of democracy, where "active fans" "get" the bands "they want" by "investing" in exchange for "something special." The economic-ethical structure of Queremos produced shows appears to mirror a system of democratic choosing—the bands that perform are the bands that a mass of individuals collectively "chose" through their financial investments. Bound up in this choice is a structure in which the symbolic and artistic capital of bands is imagined as arising from the collective investment in them, such that the bands' value is not forced upon a passive audience through third party intermediaries such as booking agencies, promoters or record companies. Rather, the audience itself elevates the artist by "choosing" it, and this choice is effected by individual economic contribution.

The immediate caveat to this image may be obvious: even in "regular" shows, such as Fauna's, where the production company confirms all the details of the show and then sells tickets afterwards, the bands' value also derives from the willingness of a number of people to go see them by buying a ticket. The difference with Queremos shows is that the investor-fans exhibit a willingness not only to buy tickets, but to enter, economically at least, into the backstage process of negotiation which is normally resolved before audience members even become aware of the concert. Yet the functioning of Queremos illustrates that the biggest difference between these two models is that of the feeling of *participation* generated through individual economic support. As already elaborated through the examples of Fauna and Squat, participation in the bringing into being of indie music occurs on multiple levels, from the macro to the micro: participation in a transnationally articulated musical niche culture; participation in the manifestation of this culture in specific venues within Brazil and Chile; participation in city-wide communities of knowledge and affect. Queremos adds the ability to turn participation in online information circulation into concrete, co-present participation through social financing. What does it mean when values of both democracy and authenticity are idealized in the form of individual economic investment? And what does it mean when the ideal process of production that animates this investment does not quite reflect the reality of the production process—a reality in which the ability to "choose" a band arises from larger structures of musical promotion and the circulation of both musicians and financial capital in the form of brand sponsorship?

Queremos! History

Queremos arose in late 2010 as a project ideated by a group of five friends involved in music and other cultural industries in Rio de Janeiro. These friends were getting tired of the lack

of foreign indie shows in their city; two of the friends, Bruno Natal and Pedro Seiler had strong ties to music in Rio, with Pedro working as a show curator and as an executive producer at the Biscoito Fino record label,[54] and with Bruno as a journalist and documentarian who covered music on his blog **URBe**. Queremos arose, Bruno said, "out of necessity": the need to be able to participate in global indie culture in Rio de Janeiro in a co-present form, rather than solely through internet mediation. Bruno explained the importance of participating at live shows for the group of friends that founded Queremos, people who often traveled abroad to Europe or the US to go to festivals for "research":

> if you wait for that band that's never going to come, or which is going to take a long time to come, you're out of the loop. Here in Brazil it's funny because in music coverage you see people talking about bands they've never even seen. And they like entire blogs about bands those people never had any contact with, everything from a distance. I don't like that very much, so that's why we always went to São Paulo when the shows weren't coming to Rio (interview, February 15th, 2012).

Bruno and his friends saw an opportunity to change this dynamic when they heard, through friends who worked at Circo Voador, about the venue's bid to produce the Swedish indie pop band Miike Snow in Rio.

The band had negotiated a contract to play three shows in Brazil and wanted very badly to play in Rio (the other shows were in São Paulo as a Popload Gig and in Porto Alegre at its own Beco 203). But according to Bruno, while the Circo Voador had the financial capacity to buy the relatively cheap show, it wasn't going to be able to sell it. "No one would go, no one would know [about it], you wouldn't have a way to communicate it directly to a very specific

[54] A large independent label that houses many of Brazil's bigger-named MPB artists, including Chico Buarque and Maria Bethânia.

audience" (Bruno Natal, interview, February 15th, 2012). The friends thought it would be easy enough sell the show by dividing its R$20,000 cost into 100 pieces, since a R$200 ticket price for foreign shows in Brazil is more than common. In just two days the friends negotiated a deal with four different sponsors, which bought ten tickets each, and convinced other individuals to buy the remaining sixty R$200 tickets (Ribeiro 2010). "We sent an e-mail to a list of 120 people that we were certain would understand the importance of the mobilization beyond personal taste in relation to the band," Bruno explained (quoted in Ribeiro 2010). Perhaps the most surprising outcome of this off-the-cuff project was that the show went on to sell more than 800 regular tickets, well over the 480 needed to reimburse the sixty initial investors. This even generated enough of a profit to cover some of the operation's production costs (Ribeiro 2010). As Lúcio Ribeiro reported on the new endeavors of this group of self-denominated "60 Cariocas Empolgados" (60 Enthusiastic Rio de Janeiroans), "Rio had its show of an indie band on the rise like Miike Snow in 2010, exactly like the world's major cities" (Ribeiro 2010). This, Lúcio emphasized, even in Rio de Janeiro on a Monday.[55]

Bruno and the rest of the group perceived the real advantage for this type of show booking which had produced the great success of the Miike Snow show: communication and marketing. "Queremos, despite being seen mainly as a financing tool, the strongest part is marketing. It's promotion, because it really engages people, people repeat that message, and that helps it spread and turn into an event" (Bruno Natal, interview, February 15th, 2012). Social media, of course, are precisely the kinds of tools that foment and make possible this diffusion. Queremos asks investor-fans to create a sign-in account with them, which may be done through

[55] The relative difficulty of producing shows in Rio is often explained in terms of the city's wealth of outdoor leisure space (in contrast to São Paulo, a veritable concrete jungle), as well as its VIP culture owing the film and television industries. Early or mid- week shows are also difficult owing to the exigencies of the work week and the tendency for shows to occur very late.

users' Facebook pages. Not only then does the users' participation display on each of Queremos' campaign pages, but Queremos can promote the show on Facebook on users' behalf. Users themselves also spread their participation through Facebook and other social networks. The promotion of Queremos shows primarily through user-led social media thus also reflects the concept of collective production manifest in the initial investment structure.

Not only is the collective promotion and financing of Queremos shows the very mechanism that brings them into being as *events*, but it also contributes to the feeling that Queremos shows are "warmer" [*mais quente*] in Bruno's words, or have "only cool people," or a great "vibe," in the words of the Facebook posters quoted in the epigraphs. In 2012, Queremos conducted an online survey of more than 6,000 people, and held a small research focus group, to find out more about how to expand the company in relation to what it says was its original spirit: "to organize shows in a more just way" (Queremos 2013). Of the surveyed participants, 96.48% said that making the show happen was more important than receiving a refund on their initial investment (in cases where not enough tickets were sold to effect a refund). Moreover, during a free-association exercise in the focus group, according to Queremos, participants associated Queremos with the words "union," "collective," and "realization" (Queremos 2013). These feelings were manifest in several posts on the Facebook event page of the Warpaint show, where future attendees urged doubtful strangers that Queremos shows were perfectly fine to attend alone, given the feeling of collectivity and solidarity Queremos shows are felt to foster. "That's the most incredible part" said one attendee at the LCD Soundsystem show in February 2011. "You bring people to the event that you also like. You're the best salesperson if you're also a part of it" (Queremos! LCD Soundsystem 2011).

This feeling of solidarity and connectedness also often occurs with the performing bands in relation to the Queremos audience. Some musicians are overwhelmed at the image of a group of fans getting together to "actively" bring the band to their city, instead of merely buying a ticket because the band was around, or being a guest of a show paid for by a brand. James Murphy, of the band LCD Soundsystem, expressed this very enthusiastically:

> When I found out [about the show being crowd-funded] I was really stunned and humbled and flattered and I think all bands…bands should experience this more often. … When fans are willing to bring you themselves, it's the most rewarding possible thing in playing a show. One of the most rewarding shows I've played in my life, and everyone in the band felt the same (Queremos! LCD Soundsytem).

In the interviews Queremos always conducts with them either before or after their show, most musicians express surprise and a feeling of care upon finding out that their show has been booked through crowd-funding. Many see the show as providing an authentic type of interaction with listeners. As Metronomy's Joseph Mount noted, "in England you have these huge companies now that run a lot of concerts and venues and festivals, and it makes so much more sense that it should be this kind of, very genuine interaction between the band and the fans. It's perfect!" (Queremos! Metronomy 2011). American "neo-soul" musician Mayer Hawthorne wrote on Twitter that his Queremos-produced Rio show was the best ever, according to Bruno Natal (Crowd-funding 2011), while Kip Berman, of New York's Pains of Being Pure at Heart, admitted, "it makes us feel really warm and good that people really wanted us to be here" (Queremos! Ariel PInk's Haunted Graffiti & The Pains Of Being Pure At Heart & Dorgas 2011). But prior to saying this, Kip had pointed out the crux of the difference in perception between what Queremos does and a "normal" show: "whether people pay for a ticket or pay in advance to

set up the show, ultimately they're making a commitment to come experience our music" (Queremos! Ariel PInk's Haunted Graffiti & The Pains Of Being Pure At Heart & Dorgas 2011).

What's notable here is Kip's use of the term *commitment*. While the willingness to exchange dollars for a musical experience is present in both "normal" and "crowd-funded" cases, the sense of solidarity and warmth discussed by the other musicians and their fans seems to arise from fans' willingness to invest in the process of production. In other words, a heightened sense of sociality and social intimacy arises when the financial output contributes directly to circulation, in the form of guaranteeing the tour's occurrence, rather than contributing financially after the fact of circulation –the already booked show—has already been established. Moreover, for many, this financial participation also contributes to an affective saturation of the event—the musical aesthetics more alive owing to the greater felt connection among fans and between audience members and musicians. As the Metronomy show in São Paulo made clear, financial participation in the process of production is not necessary for the generation of such an affectively saturated event. And while some investor-fans remain unimpressed with a show despite their investment, just as musicians like Kip Berman may perceive little difference in the audience response, the financial-production relation of Queremos does seem to produce "warm fuzzy" feelings for a large number of participants. Why should financial investment in the process of production, specifically, tend to generate these feelings?

Money, Social Media, and the *Feeling* of Democracy

Daniel Miller (2001) and Webb Keane (2001) offer some clues through their analyses of gift giving and provisioning in north England, and through gifting and ceremonial money exchange in Sumba, respectively. First, Keane contributes to literature that illustrates how

money, so often considered abstract and disembedded from the personal and the social (Kean 2001; cf Holbraad 2005; Keane 2005), in fact "does not always fully possess the properties of fluidity, impersonality, or abstraction, and, like exchange valuables, it often retains some indexical links to its sources and owners" (Keane 2001:72). Second, both authors argue for the act of calculating price as a mode of mediating social relationships. Keane argues that this derives from the material qualities of currency money, making calculation "a play on the relations between the object as a sign of something other than itself and as a source of value in itself" (ibid.), while Miller illustrates the way social relationships are calculated in terms of price as a process of objectifying social relationships through material means, such as gifts (2001, especially pp 99). In relationships in which the parties are unknown to each other or socially distant, the abstract amount of money determined to be adequate to the social relationship remains more dominant than the particular aspects of the gift (ibid.). This theorization also resonates with Joel Robbins' (2009) work with the Urapmin, for whom economic transactions are techniques for recognizing others as social beings and for mediating social relationships.

Many of the individuals interested in buying Queremos tickets have significant personal investment in the bands to be booked. Thus while the bands and fans are not socially intimate on an interpersonal level, given the salience of the music in fans' lives, and often, the significant amounts of time they expend both listening to and following news from the bands, fans feel very close connections to the performers. In this sense, Queremos might be seen to make the expenditure of money on a ticket a personal act, a way of making what otherwise might be an impersonal financial transaction intimate in a way that regular shows cannot. But more importantly, Queremos fans feel themselves to participate in the act of calculating and defining the relationship between themselves and the band, as mediated by money. The calculation of a

band's financial value in a Queremos transaction does not remain behind obscure, to be presented after-the-fact as an objective statement. Rather, the very act of calculation becomes a participatory social process,[56] and a mode of objectifying the relationship not only between individual fan and the musicians, but amongst the fans themselves, who also come to recognize each other through the knowledge that they are collectively defining the relationships amongst themselves and between themselves and the bands. Thus the Queremos model offers a mechanism to ethically mediate the value of participation as manifested, on the one hand, in the "sociality" of social media, and on the other, in the "objective" form of money, the form in which the "real" value of objects or exchanges, in capitalism, is thought to reside (cf Ortiz 2013).

The feelings of intimacy and connectedness that arise at Queremos shows, activated by financial participation, also produce the image of the fan and musician in direct, unmediated contact. This also manifests as an ideal of democracy as consumer choice. Queremos' own marketing materials present a structure in which individuals suggest artists to bring, promising that once a sufficient number of people have asked for a particular artist, Queremos will begin a campaign for that artist; as their English-language promotional video proclaims, "We're fans. We don't wait. We demand" (Introducing WeDemand 2013). To be fair, Queremos does now have a section on its homepage that lists artists for which registered Queremos users can petition. This is a development that occurred after my fieldwork period, but from a presentation Bruno Natal gave at the TechCrunch conference in San Francisco in 2012, when Queremos was also launched in the US as We Demand!, I understand this function to be a result of explicit deals made between Queremos and certain booking agencies. As it stands, however, Queremos appears to allow to tell fans, in the words of musician James Murphy, "you can get the bands you

[56] The relationship between the act of calculation, performance, and price will be elaborated further in Chapter 4, especially with reference to Ortiz (2013) and Holbraad (2005).

want," and can do so with "no sponsorship" (Queremos! LCD Soundsystem 2011). But as the earlier description of the relationship between other producers like Fauna and Squat should already make clear, fans in Rio are not privy to these bands simply through the activation of their collective desire through Queremos-mediated campaigns. Even Bruno Natal explained the difference between the perception of Queremos' functioning and its actuality:

> That's the part that people think is one way and it's another. You don't choose which show is going to come. That doesn't exist. …there's an agent that manages the bands, they decide 'let's go to South America,' there's an inside market announcement, 'such and such a band has dates in February, March for South America. Who wants it'? And Chile wants it, Argentina wants it, Brazil wants it, Brazil wants three dates, it's settled like that and it comes…. You share the costs of the band's coming from abroad to South America, you share the internal costs, you share the visa costs, etc. So we have several offers, several bands are coming and we study what's viable and what's not (Bruno Natal, interview, February 15th, 2012).

In fact, when Paola buys bands for Popload Gigs in São Paulo, she also buys the bands for a date in Rio, then sells them to Queremos. "They buy it before [*eles antecipam*]. Now if the campaign fails we'll have to rethink it, say 'and now what, we're screwed, what am I going to say to the band'. You'd have to ask for the money back or sell it to another city" (Paola Wescher, interview, May 22nd 2012). So Queremos campaigns are true in the sense that if the campaign fails, the show will not occur. But they're deceptive in the sense that the campaigns function more as a pre-sales, in order to guarantee tickets sold, than as actually fundraising the booking deposit in order to secure a band.

During my interview with him, I asked Bruno Natal if Queremos had done any kind of research to find out which bands or types of bands would be in high demand and result in successful Queremos campaigns. He responded that Queremos avoided asking the public directly because they would receive "unrealistic requests" for very large name acts like Radiohead or Paul McCartney (Bruno Natal, interview, February 15th, 2012). How does Queremos decide for which bands to risk opening a campaign? "*É o* feeling," Bruno said, using the English word; "it's the *feeling*" (ibid.). Bruno had been talking about the way he keeps up with music—by following bands on Facebook, by reading foreign web magazines, by going to foreign festivals, by going to Rio shows and otherwise being involved with the people in Rio who produce shows or are musicians themselves. This *feeling*, in fact, is exactly the type of musico-informational-social intelligence that Roberto Parra, with Fauna, and Paola and Lúcio with their Popload Gigs, use to calculate the viability of a show. Participation in the various realms of indie circulation—social, sonic, discursive, imaginative—makes the feeling possible.

This wider world of indie, of course, makes Queremos shows possible in the abstract, but also in the particular way they relate to the greater touring structure formed by the cooperation between Fauna, Squat, and the myriad labels and booking agencies with a stake in profiting off South American foreign band tours. But brands also provide a significant part of the financial scaffolding of this circulation. Queremos' Warpaint show, for example, was largely paid for by Multishow—both through its closed-show party in São Paulo as well as through the twenty tickets, or R$4,000 (US$2,000), of the Queremos Warpaint campaign that Multishow bought. In Chile meanwhile, Warpaint's show was "presented" as a CAT clothing brand project and also sponsored by Heineken beer and Red Bull energy drinks. Other sponsors for the tour included Absolut Vodka at the São Paulo closed show; in Rio Wöllner clothes and Bolha Publishing also

invested in the Queremos campaign, with Wöllner buying twenty-five tickets, or R$5,000 (US$2,500), and Bolha investing as much as Multishow. Similarly, the Queremos Metronomy show in Rio was supported by Redley, a Brazilian clothing/fashion brand. In Santiago the Metronomy show was sponsored by Foster jeans, a brand with which Fauna has worked productively for the last several years.

Queremos thus offers a means by which individuals can feel themselves to be participating directly in bringing the worlds they desire into being, but this structure of participation is made possible only through larger imperatives of capital circulation: the circulation of money as finance, incarnate in the symbol of the brand, and the circulation of bands as triggers for affective experiences that are simultaneously co-produced by capital, in the form of brand participation in the overall material and symbolic environment of the event. The current manifestation of capital primarily as finance capital commands all other types of capital accumulation (Lazzarato 2012; LiPuma and Lee 2005; Lee and LiPuma 2002) and ultimately directs life, as Lazzarato puts it, defining the present of human experience by foreclosing its future through the debt-credit relationship (Lazzarato 2012). In this way, Queremos, heavily sponsored by brands, can be read as offering the both sign and practical activity of participation in the creation of a world, when in fact this participation and the affect generated by it ultimately benefit capital. This is because brands also become elements of the overall affective, sensuous, and semiotic experience of the event which likely would not have been possible without the capital investment in the form of brands. The participation here becomes just another strategic element of the process of selling unique experiences, the very stuff of contemporary capitalism (Thrift 2005).

It's important to remember however, that despite this capital-affective relation, the intense experiences of Queremos' show-goers and the musicians themselves are not false. Moreover, investor-fans have actually participated in the production of the show through their financial contribution, in addition to their contributions to the matrices of social circulation, that is, their participation the in the creation of the larger informational circuits by which the music circulates and becomes affective, aesthetic, and meaningful. Queremos, then, perhaps best illustrates the contradictory, but complementary trend of contemporary indie music production, indeed of capitalism itself: the fans don't matter and their financing doesn't matter; and the fans are principle and direct financiers.

Conclusion

The examples of Fauna, Squat, and Queremos all illustrate various ways in which a particular value form of contemporary capital, manifest as the brand, colludes, coincides with and becomes amplified by the value forms generated through "social production." Both types of value arise through circulation, the process by which cultural forms, in moving by and through the social networks of bodies and media formats which they simultaneously help create, sediment with symbolic and affective weight. In other words, value obtains as cultural forms circulate among individuals through social association, engagement with media-based discourse, and listening in various modes, thus generating and delimiting, in the very process of circulation, the worlds to which these cultural artifacts belong (Lee and LiPuma 2002). The ease with which finance capital (as brand) can come to make up the fabric of social production-based circulation owes to the need for brand value to be generated according to the same pathways as social production. Becoming imbricated in the circulation of social production is the only way brands

earn affective-symbolic purchase. At the same time, social production must increasingly rely on the insertion of brand value for financial sustenance, because brands represent the financial capital of a company. The insertions of brands is tricky here, because in this context they come loaded and are valuable for event production because of their value as money, but they also need to acquire symbolic-affective values associated with social production. This allows the parent company to recoup its initial invested value in the form of the sale of commodities, or to increase outside investment in the brand once its social value becomes clear.

As the cases elaborated in this chapter demonstrate, touring is crucial to the transformation and transduction of these types of values. Touring works as a form of circulation that comprises a basic element in the construction of the indie world by bringing the indie public into being in a particular way—in the form of a live audience. Before the performance, this public already exists in a different incarnation, which corresponds to the value of social production within a form of participation—circulation through social networks—which cannot be exchanged for anything.[57] In order for this social value to be transformed into value in the medium of money, the public must also be brought into being in the form of the live audience, to realize the different type of value, that of exchange (money for experience).

David Graeber distinguishes between exchange and circulation, arguing that while "exchange occurs when property of some sort passes from one person to another; circulation occurs when values or valued qualities are transferred" (2001:81). Yet Graeber also argues that performance is a particular type of circulation wherein the circulation of value and the realization of value occur simultaneously (ibid.:78). While Graeber was referring here to performance in the sense of a ritual or act realized in public, his formulation nicely ties performance in the sense of

[57] The recent surge of "pay-to-promote" now on Facebook, Twitter and other social media muddles this..

live music, as well as to Lee and LiPuma's use performance as a the self-reflexive mode through which worlds are enacted through the circulation (2002).

This would seem to be the case with all types of circulation, even if there is an element of transfer also involved. When sets of indie values defined primarily through circulation limited to the EuroAmerican world also begin to circulate through the participation of indie fans in Brazil and Chile, those values indeed transfer to the southern participants. A notion of "transferring" is especially apt in this case because Brazilian and Chilean participants are largely unable to influence the structuring and composure of northern indie circulation networks. As elaborated in the introduction, the integral relation between live performance and other forms of circulation is key to the formation of indie as a culture of circulation, but only within the past half-decade have some indie fans in Brazil and Chile been able to participate not only through media usage and their own social networks, but also as co-present audiences at live shows. Thus, by dint of their very participation in circulation, Chilean and Brazilian participants also realize these indie networks in places like Santiago and São Paulo. This occurs primarily in the form of the affective transformations that take place within participating individuals attending to online media. These fans are only sporadically able to participate in the in the form most ideologically valued within the indie sector –the live performance. And live performance also realizes capital value, for it is only through live performance that the social values enacted and amplified by performance are exchanged for value in the form of money.

Musicians on tour thus act as types of sorcerers who bear responsibility for transducing these various types of value with respect to each other and in relation to the material world. For one, touring musicians literally embody the value of social production as material bodies circulating along the paths generated by social production and by their very own movement.

They also realize the value of social production in material form when they perform: the musical material affects bodies primed to be affected materially and to incorporate this material, according to interpretive –symbolic rubrics generated through discourse and past musical experience, into individuals' subjective composure as beings belonging to a particular world.

But musicians on tour not only mediate the transformation of the value of circulation and the value of exchange. Through performance, through the gathering of the bodies of the musicians and the bodies of the listeners into proximate physical space in time, they realize the value of participation in the circuits of transnational indie culture. The value of participation is, of course, precisely what brands seek to harness. Brands want to be co-participants symbolically and affectively, which is why brands do participate in indie production financially. As the case of Warpaint's Multishow performance illustrates, the quality of the participation, or whether participation revolves around listening engagement with the music by highly interested parties, is irrelevant. As long as the musicians' live performances realize the value of participation, the brand (in theory) can acquire the value of participation and circulation as well.

This state of affairs raises some serious questions about the financial structures of music production, which are particularly fraught for the Brazilian and Chilean musicians who must compete with these ever-more arriving northern bands for resources and attention. The logic of value as participation is the only way for musicians to continue working as musicians, by realizing the transformation between circulation-participation-value and money-value. But this makes the capital relation doubly greedy—on the one hand it simultaneously banks on and participates in the process of creating the indie public by investing in (northern) bands' circulation to more and more places in the globe, through sponsoring shows or through the mechanism of editions of northern festivals in the south. This means that more and more bands

perform at brands' and festivals' behest without necessarily being able to provoke an affective-symbolic response and participation in listeners. Rather, participation, or "connectivity itself" is becoming a socio-structuring value" through the internal dynamic of modern capitalism (LiPuma and Lee 2005:405).

The Warpaint closed show in São Paulo illustrates this logic most clearly: the benefit Warpaint received from Multishow was the assistance in making their presence in South America possible. But their São Paulo closed show itself likely benefited them little in terms of bringing into being a dense affectivity by way of listeners' engagement with music and musicians previously encountered largely in online formats. If communication and circulation construct worlds, thus providing the base conditions for intense engagement with other matter (music) and beings (people) in the world, what types of worlds and relations within these worlds are created when the capital imperative harnesses the energy of circulation and communication and directs it to the creation of relations, such as affective encounters with branded content, that benefit, primarily, only the interests of capital, not necessarily the continuity of the worlds it populates?

The case of Fauna shows how a highly creative and active music scene in Santiago could only begin to function consistently when brands began to mediate its expansion into larger social circles. This brand-mediated expanded interest has been important for the development of local spaces, audiences, and musicians. This has also been true for musicians and space in São Paulo. More troubling, perhaps, is the brand relation in the Queremos case. It shows the extent to which finance capital is involved in structures felt to be democratic, authentic and unmediated by anything other than the desire for fans to hear their favorite bands and for musicians to connect with audiences through their music. That this democratic feeling is realized more than anything

else through individuals' financial investment raises further questions about the collusions and disjunctures between networked participation and circulation structures in relation to money, concepts of art, and the value of culture in relation to democratic ideals and market logics.

Chapter 2
Amiguismo:
Building Music Venues in Santiago through the Politics of Social Connection

> There are a lot of people working for the love of it [*por las ganas*]. But at some point love runs out.
>
> -Cristián Araya[vii]

> There are a lot of bands that don't want to just play music, they want the extras…. There are a lot of people who want to live off this.
>
> -Aldo Benincasa[viii]

Saturday, March 19th, 2011. I spend the afternoon at "La Zona," a giant old house in the working class Independencia neighborhood of Santiago. Over the past several weeks, two brothers—Iván and Álvaro Daguer—as well as their friend Eduardo "Salmón" Streeter have transformed the house from an abandoned structure, the interior piled with dust, the courtyard strewn with dead pigeons, into what they hope to become a joint music venue, café, rehearsal space, and all-and-all musical hangout spot for anyone interested in psychedelic rock, electro-acoustic experimentation, or otherwise trippy music and art. While still rickety and rundown, the place has undergone a transformation. Potted plants dot the corridors, photos adorn the walls, Iggy Pop and his long naked torso oversees the corner where the hallway to the kitchen meets the one opening onto the red, concrete porch where the brothers sell cheap beer from trashcans and the men (they are nearly always, all men), discuss music while taking in the second-story view of *Cerro Blanco* (White Hill). A BBC-produced documentary on *Krautrock* is being projected in a room empty save for a couple of people sitting on the floor. It's in English with no-subtitles; I can barely understand it, the volume too low on the speakers. A young guitarist named Tommy comes in and rigs the sound through an amplifier, which doesn't seem to alter the interest. People drift aimlessly between the documentary, the porch, and what's been designated as the main

room, the one that houses amps and instruments. Someone improvises on a banjo over a rhythm repeating incessantly on the electric keyboard, Álvaro starts the *parilla* (grill) outside. A table with vinyl records and CDs, both Chilean and foreign, is set up in the hallway, part of Iván's activity as the manager of Yellow Moon Records, a local distributor. The house has transformed, in other words, into a space for the congregation of people interested in engaging in and experimenting with certain types of music, and in relating to each other through this mutual interest.

This creaky old house and cultural project, built with sweat, money and sacrifice by the Daguer brothers and their friends, ceased to exist as such less than a year after it opened. Once the space got going, hosting regular events, the primary financial investor saw its potential for real profit-making, and decided to turn it into a more "normal" type of club which might attract all sorts of youth from the area. While the newer character of the space, to be sure, would emerge in relation many elements, including its location, the type of music performed, and other aesthetic aspects that would help define and circumscribe attendees, it also molded itself such that it could attract as many people as possible. The emphasis of the space turned from particular valued qualities of social interaction and musical engagement, to one open to a type of social practice construed by extant notions of nightlife and clubbing in Santiago, those which attempt to cater to the conception of a "public" as encompassing the whole of society and as defined by the values of free circulation (Gaonkar and Povinelli 2003; Larkin 2008; Warner 2002). The opening of the space specifically to this type of public would allow the owner to potentially reap as much profit as possible, owing to a larger pool of paying customers. But he only saw the potential in the space after Iván, Álvaro, Eduardo and other friends turned their ideals of playing experimental and psychedelic rock sounds into a functioning social and economic space.

This chapter explores the processes through which infrastructures for music making and musical engagement arise within the indie sector in Santiago. I draw here from Brian Larkin's (2008; 2013) pinpointing of infrastructures as the architectures upon which modern societies are built. Infrastructures enable the movement of "goods, people, or ideas, and allow for their exchange over space" (2013:328). Larkin is careful to note that infrastructures are not simply foundational objects that relate linearly to the objects they give support (ibid.: 329), but rather operate on differing levels simultaneously, and that identifying particular elements of a network as infrastructural is a "categorical act" (ibid.:30). I focus on the mutual constitution of two elements of infrastructure in Santiago—performance venues and what Julia Elyachar (Elyachar 2010) calls a "social infrastructure," an infrastructure that arises out of the social ties created by individuals. Social infrastructures give rise to musical performance venues, which themselves become anchors within a complex network of social, musical, geographic, media and economic practices that together comprise indie.

To describe the process of forming infrastructures, I borrow from an off-hand comment made by show producer and venue manager Josefina Parodi. While checking her e-mail, Josefina described her work as *gestionando conecciones*, or managing connections. Gestionando conecciones is a type of what Elyachar (2010) calls phatic labor, the cultivation of personal networks for themselves as practices of sociality, but which simultaneously serve as the grounds upon which resources can be moved and transferred, and upon which other types of infrastructures rely. Phatic labor is, in other words, "the importance of cultivating networks of personal connections to get things done" (Elyachar 2010:455). The notion of phatic labor corresponds to Ana María Ochoa's (2013) description of individuals' activities of musical production not as a means for constructing social identity or to spur political or cultural-cum-

economic recognition (Yúdice 2003), but rather for what she calls "the allure of art," the desire to engage with particular sounds and sonic properties for themselves. Ochoa notes that the desire for creativity and the allure to make music are themselves the central organizing principles of the social networks through which music emerges and circulates (2013:18). The phatic labor of managing connections highlights the way in which infrastructures are both the material conduits that enable cultural flows, as well as themselves objects of desire (Larkin 2008).

The managing of social connections such that resources can be obtained is encapsulated by what Santiago musician and venue owner Aldo Benincasa called *alianzas pequeñas*, or small alliances. Alianzas pequeñas may be considered the nodes within larger infrastructures of association constituted by the mutual construction of musical, social, spatial, and media domains. Alianzas pequeñas are dense, often publically visible and institutional instances of connections generated through phatic labor. Their institutional and explicit nature lends them a durability that helps them structure social connections and give them a vector through time. Their overtness, however, makes them primary fodder for complaints of *amiguismo* in Chile, a derision of the way social infrastructures are built through phatic labor, which are thus seen to lack the realness and professionalism of independent music production imagined abroad—the ones that have given rise to and support the increasing arrival of foreign indie bands to Santiago. Literally translating as "friendism," the accusation of amiguisimo reveals the contradiction in the way social connections build and are built around musical encounters and efforts to provide pathways for musical activity: from songwriting and rehearsal to founding spaces for musical presentation to networking among musicians and production personal who are also friends. Here the very notion of friendship crosses boundaries between the socially intimate, professional camaraderie, and the articulation of both within social networks configured by online social networking

platforms. Amiguismo thus describes the necessary social politics through which infrastructures for social and musical production are built, become the strata upon which further production can continue through time and space, and serve as the base material for producing economic gains. The latter occurs primarily when key individuals connect these networks to outside interests, like brands, which need the symbolic and affective weight generated by social connection to turn a profit (chapter 1).

I consider the tensions that arise as spaces for musical production, and their endurance in time and space, arise precisely through the mutual constitution of musical and social affinities, which in turn clash with their ability to expand to further networks and become economically sustainable within capitalist organization. I detail three different music venues in Santiago and the differential ways they manage the relation between type of music, type of person, public visibility, and management of connections. These spaces are Estudio Elefante, Bar Loreto, and Espacio Cellar, and I make reference to La Zona, which opened this chapter. Each space is different in the way it manages connections, but all are also common to several Santiago indie music sub-networks, and they are all familiar to the other venue owners and music participants. Musicians link these venues together by performing in all of them, helping constitute a world of indie through the labor of performance and through the phatic labor of appearing at each other's and friends' shows. The venues are thus key nodes in space that allow for the flourishing of different types of music-oriented sociality and musical engagement. These social spaces then become contested as places constituted by particular orientations to music generated through phatic labor, but also as commercial venues which must connect to larger networks of resources, namely paying patrons, for survival. As the venues vie to become economically sustainable, the types of social practices and modes of relating to music within them also change, often

undermining the ethos they originally sought to create and maintain. I close by relating the way in which in media representation of musical practices have become key not for gathering larger publics to pay musicians at live performances, but rather as techniques for legitimizing the value of musical practice for the branded events that have become the primary financiers of the music industry. The resources from such events do not easily flow back into music venues or social networks generated through phatic labor and musical engagement. This disconnection between financial resources that benefit from indie practices and the primary networks building indie practices contributes to the political dispute of amiguismo.

The Growth of Indie in Santiago in the 21st Century

To talk of independent music in Santiago is to invoke several smaller subsets of activity, roughly divided between dance-pop, harder or psychedelic rock, experimental, and more recently, a resurgence in a type of folk derived from the Nueva Canción movement of the late 1960s (Advis et al. 1998; Fairly 2002; Torres 2002; Torres 1980). These spheres are connected most overtly through the sharing of performance venues and through representation in online media, though many musicians also transit between several realms, and many are also aware of "what's happening" in other areas even if they don't think they're particularly good. All of these spheres have grown considerably over the last decade, accelerating so rapidly over just a few years that the panorama I encountered when returning for dissertation research in 2011 differed substantially from what I found in 2008 when I conducted Master's research on music blogs and performances in the city. But in 2008, there were already hints of what would come: at that time, several music blogs had recently been founded, such as **Pániko**, **POTQ**, **Disorder**, **NNM**, and **192**.

Like their long-standing predecessor, **Super45**, these blogs focused primarily on foreign indie music, as unpaid contributors sought to write about the foreign bands they were interested in and to participate, through their own online coverage, in the swirl of information about the burgeoning indie world so well-represented by online sites stationed abroad. At this time, too, some of these bloggers, like **Super45** co-founder Cristián Araya, were elaborating projects to bring the foreign bands they followed to perform in Chile as part of the bands' general activities of touring and performing to garner a name for themselves and a living (Garland 2009).[58] Performances and recordings of Santiago-based bands often fell by the way-side in terms of coverage on Chilean sites, as bloggers sought to be "modern" by keeping up with foreign music, while simultaneously feeling that Santiago bands were not yet developed enough to warrant coverage, or that such coverage was not needed because these bands were both few in number and close at hand (Garland 2009). While some contributors to these sites made a point of covering Santiago developments, **Super45's** long-running and coveted "best new band" contest being a case in point, many blog commenters exhibited what is referred to in Chile as *chaqueteo*, a dismissal and putting-down of local bands as non-modern, deficient, and bad-copies of northern phenomena.

By 2011, the amount of *chaqueteo* exhibited on these blogs had diminished considerably. One reason owes to the shift of online discussion from blog comments sections to Facebook and Twitter. Such media help keep discussion and promotion of bands within networks of social acquaintances, such that "talk" of bands spreads among the bands' friends and then friends of friends, rather than being broadcast to hundreds, thousands, or millions of listeners through traditional mass media. But another reason, as the growth of blogs covering it suggests, owes to

[58] As elaborated in chapter one, this activity was extremely fraught until the invention of Productora Fauna and a shift in music industry financing to branded promotion.

the general expansion of the indie sector, not just in blogs but in bands, spaces for performance, and new or newly successful independent labels like Quemasucabeza, Algo Records, Michita Rex, and Cazador.[59] Some artists who had been just starting out in 2006, like Gepe and Javiera Mena, by 2011 had gained substantial, if still small, followings within Chile, and had been touring Mexico and Spain. Other bands, like Astro and Dënver, which arose a few years later, similarly gained significant audiences in Chile, Mexico and Spain, owing to pseudo-viral YouTube videos and to the increasing coverage of Chilean independent music on non-Chilean online media like **Club Fonograma**, from the US, or the Spanish site **Jenesaispop**. The coverage owed, as well, to a common Chilean tactic of attempting to generate audiences, through touring, in the much larger market of Mexico in order to be able to earn more recognition all-around. And with the prestige of the Barcelona festival Primavera Sound within the EuroAmerican indie world, Spain has also become an important market for this Spanish-language indie rock and indie pop sound. Recently, brands have sponsored performances of this contingent of bands, usually through the mediation of one of the music blogs, which advertise the branded products in banners and ticket contests on their websites and Facebook and Twitter pages.

Despite this growth and change, many musicians, venue owners, bloggers, and label personnel complain of the difficulty of keeping their projects afloat for the complicated process of turning them into professional, remunerated entities. Musicians, in particular, complain of the dearth of performance venues in Santiago, a city of around 6 million people. A gamut of bars and smaller clubs occasionally host performances, but do not primarily serve as music venues, sometimes because the owners don't want to bother with the messiness of performance

[59] Cazador closed in 2012 due to financial hardship, despite boasting several very successful bands, including Protistas and Dënver.

equipment or prefer to pay DJs who can attract a larger crowd, while other bars may drive musicians away due to poor treatment.[60] Another handful of spaces host shows often enough, but are venues temporarily converted from other infrastructures, like the foyer and upstairs lounge area of the art cinema space Cine Arte Alameda, or the salsa club Papagayo's. Other spaces are established-sit down venues like the Salas SCD, which require membership in the Chilean Copyright Holder's Association.[61] Musicians and other indie participants normally cited between three and five spaces as regular venues for performance, and two of these, Estudio Elefante and Club Mist, closed down during my fieldwork period. La Zona, the rickety old house that kicked off this chapter, both opened and closed within a six-month span. The two remaining clubs, Bar Loreto and Espacio Cellar, have become the performance stalwarts for the varied sounds of Santiago and Chile's indie bands. They are large enough spaces to host bigger-name acts like Dënver, and have, unlike Cine Arte Alameda and Papagayo's, a permanent *back line* of amplifiers, PA equipment, monitors and microphones, all hooked up to a main soundboard, like a regular club. This extremely small offering of venues makes the possibility of keeping bands economically afloat very difficult, since bands need to play often to get paid while club owners need to vary their programming to keep their nights interesting for regulars and to attract new patrons.

One of the difficulties of performance also arises from municipal zoning and licensing. Two of the venues to be discussed in this chapter, Estudio Elefante and Bar Loreto, are located in the Bellas Artes/Lastarria and Bellavista districts, respectively. These districts sit adjacent to

[60] This was a reason given to me by musician and music venue owner Aldo Benincasa (Aldo Benincasa, interview, April 26th, 2011).

[61] The SCD is the "Sociedad Chilena del Derecho del Autor," or Chilean Author's Rights Association. The SCD owns several different performance venues in Santiago, or "salas," and whether members of the performing bands need to be members of the SCD seems to be one of the tricky elements of negotiating social connections and bureaucracy that will be alluded to within this chapter and developed fully in the context of Brazil's Fora do Eixo in chapter 4.

each other, pivoting around the Plaza Italia, the symbolic central point of Santiago.[62] Bellavista has for some time been a bohemian nightlife area best known for its sidewalks full of black-clad, beer-drinking university and high school students, vendors hawking pirated books and assorted knick-knacks, bands of *anarko*- and *skinner* punks loitering by the liquor stores and cheap *completo* and fries stands,[63] and of course, its late night dance clubs, especially of the pop and reggaetón varieties. Bellas Artes/Lastarria is so-named for the presence of the large Bellas Artes fine arts museum and the narrow, winding Lastarria street that cuts from Alameda Avenue, the main thoroughfare, to face Bellavista across the river. Ten years ago Lastarria was dotted with a couple of art house cinemas, used bookstores, and cafés, but maintained a rather desolate air in the evening hours, especially during the week.

At the turn of the 21st century, Bellavista, Bellas Artes/Lastarria were still considered rough, bohemian and low-class for Santiago's elite, and in some respects they still are. But these districts have transformed during the century's first decade, particularly over the last few years. They have lost some of their bohemian and *popular* character with the opening of backpacker hostels, tourist- and higher-ended shopping areas, and upper-scale restaurants and bars. But they have also become gathering and residential spots for hip urban youth, mostly from the middle and upper middle class and interested in transnational youth trends. In the Bellas Artes/Lastarria district in particular, young adults, many of them architects and designers, sport expensive designer shoes and sunglasses on their way to restaurants serving artisanal pizza and sushi, or to hip new bars like the The Clinic, associated with the satirical leftist magazine of the same name. Matus (2009) argues that these areas—Bellavista/Lastarria in particular—have not gentrified in

[62] The Plaza Italia is the roundabout marking the center of the city, separating downtown from uptown, and figures historically as the physical marker representing the separation of high and low classes, and the political ideologies and musical consumption habits often associated with them.
[63] A complete, or "complete," is a type of elaborate hotdog that is a favorite street and bar meal in Chile.

the classic sense, owing to various generations and varieties of artists, entrepreneurs and bohemian types that have long occupied the long-valuable real estate. But there's no denying the influx of hip young professionals from families that may have told them to avoid the area for its danger growing up. Moreover, in the past few years, the city itself has sought to revitalize these areas, creating the Gabriela Mistral Museum (GAM), an arts and performance complex whose back entrance opens onto Lastarria Street; building tile art into new sidewalks in Bellavista; and constructing a formal, permanent building for the long-standing artisanal market located at the entrance of the neighborhood when crossing from the Plaza Italia.

Given such urban development, it is perhaps ironic that the respective municipal districts, *comunas*, which house these neighborhoods—Bellavista is in the comuna of Providencia and Bellas Artes/Lastarria in that of Santiago— seem loath to grant new licenses, called *patentes*, for alcohol sales, sound amplification, and cabaret events. Many of my interlocutors surmised that officials were worried that these districts would transform into another Suecia. Suecia was a club district in upper Providencia which became the province of luxury design and art stores in the 1970s. These stores and patrons fled into the wealthier regions as pubs began to open in the 1980s, turning the area into a bohemian nightlife district through the '90s (Zambra 2013; Zambra 2011). By the mid-2000s, Suecia had become a central area of nightlife activity oriented around wild bars with cheap drinks and clubs playing reggaetón, cumbia and hip hop music, all of which are strongly associated in Chile with the working classes. In 2007, the comuna of Providencia ceased renewing licenses to these bars in an effort to quiet the district and lessen the drug trafficking and street violence with which Suecia had become associated in the press (Zambra 2011), and in particular in the minds of the elite.[64]

[64] In a grotesque close to this cycle, Suecia has now been "renovated" in to "New Suecia," the new financial center of Santiago. This has been symbolized and actualized with the building of the Costanera

The difficulty of gaining patentes frames the modes of operation of the venues discussed in this chapter: of the four, only Bar Loreto holds patentes for alcohol sales and amplification for live music, though it still lacks the cabaret license which would technically make it legal for patrons to dance to the music spun by DJs (Aldo Benincasa, interview, April 26th, 2011).[65] One effect of this problem is that music spaces, like La Zona and Espacio Cellar, tend to arise distanced from main areas of nightlife, making them less likely to attract attention from authorities. But this also raises the question of safety: robberies had taken place at La Zona and Cellar, while none had occurred at Elefante, located in prime Bellas Artes/Lastarria. On the other hand, Elefante was closed down due to police intervention, precisely for its central location but lack of permits. These broader civic topographies and institutional regulations help configure the character of the spaces themselves, informing the affective orientation to the venues' sounds and aesthetics, as well as the forms of social association that arise among participants. In other words, the particular types of affective and aesthetic effects of infrastructures are framed by the material properties of "the spaces of association in which these texts take on phenomenal lives, and the social practices that cluster around them… which tie the creation of built form to the rich sociality that forms create" (Larkin 2008:250). As such, while music helps generate affective atmospheres of particular spaces,[66] the characteristics of these spaces—their physical properties, social practices, and geographic and legal status within the city— become elements informing

---

Center, a business and commercial complex with a high rise tower that is now Latin America's tallest, along with the development of other business complexes and gourmet cafés and bars (cf Zambra 2013).

[65] This may have changed from the time I conducted fieldwork, as a federal regulations were amended in 2012 to do away with many cabaret exigencies, allowing bars and restaurants to more easily obtain a patente for the " performance of live music" if they already have necessary bar or restaurant licenses (Ley Nº 20.591; http://www.leychile.cl/Navegar/scripts/obtienearchivo?id=recursoslegales/10221.3/37241/1/HL20591.pdf)

[66] See chapters 1 and 3

the affective mode informing way in which the music resounding in the space becomes subjectively captured and felt socially as aesthetics.

Estudio Elefante: Space as a Value of Musical Presentation

The police did not descend upon the Estudio Elefante in May, 2011, because it was producing a ruckus. In fact, outside the studio, usually the only indication that an event is taking or is about to take place are the several bicycles locked around the metal rods of traffic signs on the short, narrow, dead-end residential street in which the studio sits tucked away. Like a speakeasy, to enter Elefante patrons must ring a buzzer on what appears to be a door to an uninhabited apartment, and someone, usually Elefante's manager Josefina Parodi, looks out of the peep hole, perhaps enquiring about the purposes of the visitor, before unlocking and opening the door. Like La Zona, the studio has been fashioned out of a largely abandoned space. Towards the back left of the large, high-ceilinged main room, an upstairs balcony-like area houses some old wooden boards and junk and is otherwise never used, due to safety concerns about the stairs and flooring. To the right of Elefante's door sits a makeshift bar, covered in stickers of bands and small record labels, to the left lie some armchairs and other seats, and immediately before it, a thick wooden pillar serves as a post for placing a table for sundry purposes. Estudio Elefante opened in 2009, when Rodrigo Salvatierra lent his personal musical equipment to the space (including a PA system, soundboard, and modest backline), such that it could be managed largely by Josefina, a long-time promoter of events in the small but effervescent independent underground. Unlike La Zona, focused on psychedelic rock and experimentalism, Estudio Elefante hosts a wide variety of the musical styles comprising the indie sector in Santiago.

On March 19th, 2011, at 9pm, an extremely early hour for most Santiago shows, Elefante is hosting the release party for the new single *Armar y Desarmar* by the artist Fakuta. The table by the wooden pillar houses CD copies of Fakuta's single, free with the modest entrance fee (CHP$2,500; US$5) until supplies last, as well as flutes of champagne for the toasting of the release, which will launch officially with the projection of the video on a large cloth screen hung in the center of the room. The indie music web magazines **Super45**, **Pániko** and **POTQ** have promoted the event with show announcement and details, with **Super45** and **Pániko** offering ticket giveaways. **Pániko**'s giveaway requires contestants to post a response on its Facebook page to the question, "what's more difficult to build than to take apart?" [*¿qué cosa es más fácil de armar que de desarmar?*], in reference to title of the Fakuta single, which translates to arm/build and disarm/take-apart. The Facebook event, created by Fakuta's label Michita Rex, counts 543 non-confirmed invites, fifty "maybes," and 158 confirmations of attendance (Fakuta Estrena), and serves as a repository of the various individual websites covering the event and offering their own invitations.

Even with perhaps half of the number of attendees as confirmed on Facebook, Elefante is packed. Several musicians who will not be performing tonight are present, including Jorge "Coco" Cabargas. Aside from his personal relationships with the co-founders of Fakuta's record label Michita Rex, who are themselves Fakuta, the stage name-turned nickname of Pamela Sepúlveda, and Dadalú, the stage and nickname of Daniela Saldías, Coco's presence at this Fakuta opening is drawn from the historical development of current networks of musical production in Santiago. As Fakuta, Pamela crafts an intricate yet minimalist type of electro-pop, but her activities as a musician arose first in experimental music networks; these were associated with Jacobino Discos, the first label to release current indie star Gepe, as well as musician and

promoter Ervo Pérez's experimental electronic music series known as La Productora Mutante. Before forming Fakuta as a solo project, Pamela performed at Productora Mutante events with her experimental electronica project El Banco Mundial. Many musical and personal relationships formed over a decade ago through such events have evolved into new musical projects, like Fakuta's, and new musical spaces, like Estudio Elefante, helping form larger networks of production in which social and musical connections, while expanded, remain deep and strong. Thus, despite the many changes in music production in Santiago, and despite the difficulty of maintaining their continuity, many people who have been participating for a decade or more continue to be active, forming new projects as musicians, producers, record labels, journalists and owners of clubs.

Fakuta's video single of Armar y Desarmar is projected to the receptive and attentive crowd. The video depicts a narrative of Fakuta's invitation of "bad girl" friends to her girly tea party, the narrative unfolding with English subtitles of the characters' Spanish dialogue, replete with easily lip-read Chilean slang expressions intentionally translated badly for comedic effect. The video ends in cheers and the champagne toast. I hear a voice ask, "who is Fakuta?" before the entire crowd winds down the narrow staircase to the basement for Fakuta's live performance, accompanied as usual by three back-up singers and musicians known as *The Laura Palmers*. The live performance, like the video, is attended to enthusiastically in the tiny, windowless basement room which is Elefante's main performance area. A large and very nice soundboard is set up at the bottom of the stairs, leaving a small and oblong space for spectators between the soundboard and the non-elevated stage. Tiny plastic stacking stools pile in the corners, which some people stand atop in order to glimpse the show. Others try to remain on the stairs but Josefina discourages them; it's too small and heightens the fire hazard. When the performance ends,

Josefina makes sure everyone files back upstairs and doesn't mill about; noise draws neighbor complaints and too much attention, especially as the night wears on. Those exiting Elefante are asked to do so quietly and to take flight from the street.

Josefina spoke of the Estudio Elefante's approach to musical performance not in terms of genre or aesthetics (what Aldo Benincasa will refer to later in the chapter as *line*), but around a politics of presentation, that is, a politics of spatial arrangement and social behavior towards the approach to and engagement with sound, giving the structuring of the space itself the impulse in directing a particular orientation to musical listening. During the formal interview I conducted with her, Josefina and I ended up discussing the different ways audiences would behave towards the same band depending on where it was playing— in one space attentive listening where "nothing moves, not even a fly," and in another "nothing but talking," the audience taking the performance more as a space for socialization than as an event oriented around and by music.[67] It was this "extra musical" aspect that the Estudio Elefante sought to eschew. "It was being able to have concerts without the rest of what comes attached with concerts in other places," Josefina related, such as beginning at 1 am, or trying to sell a fashion or a type of house band. The studio was about "having concerts in our way," and "just listening to well-presented music" (Josefina Parodi, interview, May 19th, 2011).

The structural elements of Elefante, given by its situatedness within the larger area of commercial space and socialization of Lastarria/Bellas Artes, which is populated by many of the people who might frequent Elefante, help to construe the venue as a densely social space, one known through networks of social practice, rather than as an open place available to anyone who might happen by. Josefina described the feel of Elefante as "familial," and I would agree. It served as a meeting space for discussions and planning around musical events or even debates on

[67] This mirrors the Metronomy versus Warpaint shows in São Paulo (chapter 1).

off-hours. Josefina attributed this feeling partially to the community that bands generate among themselves, though she didn't know why community among bands also became associated with the space in which they played. But she postulated that Elefante's illegality contributed to the environment— Elefante managers didn't chase after those who hadn't paid to get in, and they also couldn't attempt to "open the space more so that more people would come," owing to the club's position within a burgeoning cultural area the city sought to heavily regulate, lest it become another Suecia. This restriction on who could enter, especially in terms of size, helped Elefante generate a stronger community, making it, in Josefina's words, like a club" (Josefina Parodi, interview, May 19). The restriction thus helped engender the conduct of patrons towards listening in the attentive manner valued by Josefina and Rodrigo, which then helped limit the number of people interested in showing up.

Josefina and Rodrigo also needed to manage the size and extension of the space in social geographies in an especially careful manner owing to its illegality and its commercial nature. The studio promoted events exclusively through Facebook, helping keep knowledge of the event closely associated with social infrastructures—those generated by Elefante's own Facebook presence as a venue, as well as those of the performing bands, the performers friends' and others who would have a stake in going to the show *because* of the social relations that both brought them into contact with the show *and* rendered it a desirable show to attend on a particular night. In addition to the sole Facebook promotion, Josefina sought this balance through musical curation, booking both "bands that we wanted to hear and which no one was going to go to… but also bands that we knew would fill [the space]… a balance in the [agenda] to be able to get to the end of the month [financially]" (ibid.). Elefante thus sought to maintain an important but

subdued position within indie networks, keeping circulation close to particular social worlds but remaining flexible and expansive enough to stay afloat economically.

Of course, the Facebook invitations, and especially the indie-centric sites like **Super45** which cover events like the Fakuta release party, also allow non-participant onlookers (Warner 2002),[68] including the police, to accompany these shows, putting in check the desire for a small, almost private club space and the imperatives of commercial operation. When the police arrived, they claimed to have seen someone dancing to what was then recorded music playing over the house speakers, an accusation to charge the studio with violation of cabaret laws. Never mind the cases of beer behind the bar, which the studio tried to convince the officers was not for sale but for personal use within the space. Because the studio did not have permits for a business of any sort, it could try to make claims about its status as a private space, where private activity occurred, which would not be subject to this intervention. But the studio's promotion of its events on Facebook served as evidence that such claims were false. "Facebook ruined us," Josefina acceded, "the officer arrived with a folder of printed fliers, which he took from there" (Josefina Parodi, interview, May 19th, 2011).

The infrastructure and fate of Elefante illustrates how what were already precarious and contradictory lines between the socially intimate and the subjective on the one hand, and the socially strange and objective on the other (Warner 2002), have largely become completely blurred both online and off. It is precisely the desire to make these dense social activities financially viable that brings out the tension between the construction of intimate social worlds, where particular forms of social association and orientation towards musical performance and

[68] Here I draw from Warner's (2002) notion of "discursive publics," which come into being through mere attention to texts. Individuals being addressed may consider themselves either addressees of the text, reflexively identifying as the public to which the text is addressed, or as an "onlooker," able to accompany a world in which she does not reflexively include herself.

listening emerge, and the necessary disruption of these forms as social infrastructures seek, by obligation, connection with other infrastructures for the securing of resources. The blurring of this division partially leads to the confusion around what music is "real" and has true artistic merit, and what circulates "falsely" via the small alliances of amiguismo. Wider social and media recognition and real economic gains thus politicize phatic labor in a manner palpable to participants and antithetical to their values of sincere musical engagement and "doing it for the love of the music."

Bar Loreto: Defining Atmospheres through Socio-Musical *Patentes*

One of Fakuta's Laura Palmers singers, Danae Morales, is performing again on the same night after the Fakuta release party at Elefante. A member of the now defunct experimental band World Music, part of the Productora-Mutante-associated experimental electronica contingent, Danae will be performing with a newer group, Los Embajadores, at the Bar Loreto, located over the bridge on the edges of Bellavista. Because of Danae's participation in both shows,[69] everyone from Fakuta's band and half the Elefante crowd, the friends of Fakuta and her band, will be heading to Loreto after the early Fakuta show. Presenting the Estudio Elefante entrance ticket at Loreto, in fact, garners a discount—the ability to pay CHP$1,000 until midnight or CHP$2,000 until 1 am ($US 2.00 and $4.00 respectively), as opposed to the full price of $CHP2,000 before or $CHP3,000 after midnight ($US4.00 and $US6.00). Like the rest of the venues discussed in this chapter, no sign on the building announces Loreto's presence. Unlike the other clubs however, Loreto is mostly legal.[70] Moreover, Loreto formats its nights like most other popular

[69] Los Embajadores, moreover, forms part of the roster of acts on Fakuta and Dadalú's Michita Rex label.
[70] Loreto's lack of a cabaret patente is overlooked by the municipality due to good relations between Loreto's owners and authorities, and because Loreto keeps a low-profile.

music clubs in Santiago and in Chile,[71] featuring performing bands that take the stage between midnight and 1 am, sometimes by 11pm on weeknights and if two bands fill the bill. The late starting times reflect the fact that on average, most patrons arrive at the club around midnight, one reason clubs offer discounted tickets before this hour. Sometimes bands begin extremely late in the night, at two or three in the morning, partially because they are waiting for the space to fill up with more people. Many people attend these clubs not specifically to see live music, but to dance, and the clubs promote the night around both performing bands and the spinning DJs.[72] Tonight's event at Loreto is a "**Super45** Party," hosted by the website and featuring the ***Super45*** *Soundsystem*, featuring DJs associated with the site. The DJs for the night of the Los Embajadores show are **Super45's** co-founder and executive editor Crisitán Araya, and one of its directors, Micael Zalaquett. **Super45**, of course, has promoted this event on its website, Facebook and Twitter pages. Being a Saturday night, Loreto fills sufficiently; I am let in without having to pay thanks to the doorman, a musician I know who performs in bands related to those of Loreto's owners.

If La Zona represents a new space for gathering the experimental and psychedelic rock set, and tonight's Elefante event the indie faction grown out of experimentalism and into pop, Loreto circles the connections back to the boom of harder sounding independent rock that consolidated around the Algo Records label in the early 2000s. Algo Records itself grew out of the harder, stoner-rock activities of independent bands formed in the latter half of the '90s, like Yajaira and Hielo Negro.[73] The Algo Records-associated early-2000s wave of rock-oriented

[71] This format also holds for most venues in Valaparíso, São Paulo and Buenos Aires.
[72] As reviewed in the introduction, with reference to DJs at Beco 203, dance party nights are often hosted around both a theme and specific online music site whose contributors and founders have channeled their music coverage activities into DJ reputations.
[73] With the growth of *indie* in Santiago, in both foreign presence and local activity, these bands have begun reunion shows, and/or have members forming new projects partially around their status as

music helped open more spaces for the more folk and electro-dance centric musicians and bands that began proliferating around 2006. This latter wave had crested by March, 2011, the spray falling in dozens of new directions of musical composition, publication and presentation projects along with those continued by the 2000 contingent. One of these projects is Loreto. The club is owned and managed by Aldo Benincasa and Alvarito Guiso, both musicians in various bands associated with Algo Records and beyond, the center of which might be considered the stoner-rock band named, aptly, The Ganjas. Aldo plays drums for The Ganjas, which has incorporated individuals from various associated bands over the years, as well as the former **Super45** editor Luife Saavedra. While the multiple roles of such individuals might fuel accusations of amiguismo, they also serve as the glue that has made Loreto a profitable business.

Since its opening in 2009, Loreto has become one of the primary venues for the performance of not only the more rock oriented set but of the larger and varied world of indie writ large. It is also, along with Espacio Cellar, one of the more successful in terms of finance. Aldo elaborated several elements that likely contribute to this success, although it should be noted that his comments were not elaborated in response to a direct question, such as, "what makes a music venue in Santiago a success?" Rather, they emerged during a conversation about how Aldo manages Loreto, the conditions of patente granting in city comunas, listening publics and how they react to music and club spaces, and Aldo's own experience navigating music business as a musician, a venue entrepreneur, and recently the manager for the band Dënver.

Before opening Loreto, Aldo already had experience building and running a live music venue. In mid-2007 he turned a small, abandoned bar located on a side street in Suecia into a bar-

---

instigators of an original scene. This resembles the status northern bands of the '90s like Dinosaur Jr., which now boast cachet far exceeding that of their original peak years.

performance venue for the rocker set called Club Mist.[74] While Aldo could not obtain an official patente for music performance at Mist, he explained, however, that the bands playing, and the nature of the sounds those bands made, themselves formed a type of patente, a type of socio-spatial control mechanism functioning through the curation of musical sound. This contrasts markedly with Josefina's orientation towards Elefante, in which the space itself helped create the mode of attending to music and the type of social relations engendered within it. While Aldo would agree that musical spaces endure because of their social atmosphere, this is generated not by the space itself but by the type of music performed. In other words, the nature of the sonic character of a music venue is fundamental to its temporal longevity, a denser socio-musical configuration in space fomenting a venue's endurance in time.

Aldo called this characterization of space through music a *línea*, as in a *línea editorial*, the equivalent of editorial policy in English. Línea, however, literally translates to *line*, indicating the drawing of connections into a coherent shape over time.[75] The línea is formed socially and musically, arising from an effort to foment and "maintain what you like," as well as through what Aldo termed "pequeñas alianzas," or "small alliances" (Aldo Benincasa, interview, April 26th, 2011). Aldo explained:

> The editorial policy of a bar is always going to mark the línea of your bar, the people who go and what's going to happen during the night. That's how it is. If I have such and such music in my bar, from the band that plays and the background music playing, packaged music [*música envasada*], I know what people are going to go. That's how it is and there's nothing you can do…. It's not that I want to discriminate or anything, it's what I myself like, what I want or not. Above all if I want a business that lasts over time. The

[74] Mist sat tucked into a side street of this club district.
[75] Línea is also related to *lineamento*, or guidelines. I thank George Yúdice for pointing out this connection.

> thing is also what interests me. Because we have an indie línea, but it's broad but it has walls. It's not that broad. We play from indie electronica to indie rock to indie pop, but cover groups don't play, for example, obviously reggaetón doesn't play, or crappy [*desechada*] pop, trash pop, or things really for kids (interview, April 26th, 2011).

In Aldo's experience with both Mist and Loreto, he found that the bar builds itself, drawing from people, who are friends, doing what they like and interested in what their friends are doing, which they largely also like. "It's not like closing yourself off so only ten or twenty bands which are friends play. Because that is always going to get you to other bands" (Aldo Benincasa, interview, April 26th, 2011). Because of the social connections amongst musicians and their friends, what Elyachar (2010) calls "social infrastructures," the music space seems to build itself "naturally," around people with similar musical affinities. This creates a sense of musical authenticity and of social intimacy: "you can tell that people feel cozy, they see it like a club really. People come, we don't have promotion, we don't have a sign outside, it's face-to-face" (Aldo Benincasa, interview, April 26th, 2011). The experience of social intimacy arises as people find out about and arrive to the club through their social connections, which are often also musical—half of Estudio Elefante's audience went to Loreto because the two bands playing shared a musician as well as musical affinities.

The promotion of club events takes primarily through Facebook. This reinforces the salience of social connections in generating the club as a particular type of social space. The social media sites are thus key to the generation and maintenance of social infrastructures which help produce and give longevity to built spaces like Loreto and Elefante, which themselves serve as spaces for the creation of social infrastructures and help propel the phatic labor of social maintenance that also occurs through online activity. Activity developed on social media

platforms like Facebook and Twitter, in other words, become integrated into co-present spaces, as events occurring on social media both draw people to venues and extend and become the subject of conversations within them. The spaces of musical venues and social media sites are thus intertwined, generated across and cutting through each other. Together they configure spaces for musical performance, the face-to-face social encounters generated within and in relation to these spaces and the musical sounds elaborated within them. Online media bundle these practices into semi-coherent and recognizable social and sonic worlds by helping to draw together and maintain the aforementioned connections partially by making them explicit.

These spaces and musical styles are not without contention. To become sustainable, both performance and social media promotion need to allow for the participation of people not immediately involved in the production of the venues or the musical events occurring in them. This leads to tensions concerning the desired character and quality of these spaces, the social practices occurring in them and which form them, and the aesthetic judgment of the music. Aldo, for example, emphasized that he tries "to make the band the protagonist of the night, [so that] the people who go will have to wait [*aguantar*, for the band]…. It's what we offer, so ultimately the people know what they're going to… if they arrive at a certain hour there's going to be a band. And the band has a line, so they'll probably like it" (ibid.). While Aldo may manage Loreto with the intention of making bands the "motor" of the space and the night's "protagonists," the venue itself is an infrastructural element not just within the circumscribed networks of musicians, but also within wider nightlife practices and districts in the city. As a medium for the unfolding of nighttime activity, Loreto produces its own possibilities of interaction, including Aldo's desire for attention directed at the performing bands, but also interest solely in dancing or trying to pick people up.

By the same token, however, the performing bands, with their particular sounds, social connotations and indexical and symbolic invocations, which are moreover tied to modes of discourse about them and to the social networks through which both sound and discourse circulate, also help define and shape the types of activities to occur within a venue. That is, they don't control and dictate, but they condition in a certain sense, they create atmospheres. As material entities they "bring about a sensory apprehension of existence" (Larkin 2013:338). What arises then is a politics of the inhabitance and use of space in ways intended and desired by those creating them and those "consuming" them, a struggle over the semiotic character associated with the material qualities of the music and its relation to performance, audience, and space (Keane 2005; chapter 3). The point of difficulty emerges because so many of those "consuming" the space are also those creating the space— as performers, journalists, or other members of the indie milieu. A politics of who participates in which kinds of ways—ways perceived detrimental or salutary to the desired quality of the space — emerges as a key factor in the venue's endurance in time as both a particular type of social space and as a functioning economic entity.

The notion of alianzas pequeñas, small alliances, highlights this political dimension of generating and maintaining infrastructures. Alianzas pequeñas might be considered the nodes that arise through the phatic labor of gestionando conecciones. Small alliances are forged between musicians, venue spaces, media spaces, and curating individuals, often through institutional and financial incentives**. Super45** for example, promoted both shows at Estudio Elefante and Loreto, noting the ticket discount, and itself offering a ticket-giveaway to the Loreto show, while also publishing written pieces about both Fakuta's album release as well as the Embajadores show at Loreto. **Super45**, it should be remembered, was managing the night at

Loreto, with its director Micael Zalaquett and co-founder Cristián Araya (also the director of the radio channel Radio Zero), as DJs. **Super45** usually runs at least one night monthly at Loreto, and Aldo recounted that trust in the curatorial criteria of Cristián leads to new musical discoveries for him. "I trust in what he brings," Aldo said. "There are a lot of bands that I don't book directly, but rather there are producers who work with me that I know can bring someone I don't know, and they come and they end up forming part of the bar" (Aldo Benincasa, interview, April 26th, 2011). This, in fact, was the way in which Aldo came to know the band Dënver, eventually becoming their manager.

These small alliances, which form through the practice of gestionando conecciones, help to construct musical practices, musico-social spaces, and media of various types as part of the same world, as what participants recognize and name as the *indie scene*. The discounted ticket offered by Loreto for attendance at the Fakuta show illustrates how practices of phatic labor are both the politics of recognizing particular practices and sounds as being of the same world, as well as the politics of trying to expand that world in such a way as to garner outside resources for its sustenance. Here, a monetary incentive serves as an instrument to draw outside people, the public, so to speak, into the connection between Loreto and Estudio Elefante already drawn by the performance of Danae Morales at both venues in the same night.

The linkage between the two bars offered by the discount ties the activity of the two spaces into explicit connection as being of the same línea themselves, with the bands of the same línea as well. Because other musicians with whom Danae is playing, as well as her friends, are already eager to confirm this connection through their own presence at both spaces, the discount can be seen as an institutional attempt to draw what might otherwise be "onlookers" (Warner 2002) into the same línea that the musicians and bars have already established for themselves. It

is through these social and aesthetic practices—amiguismo—that allow for the existence of indie music production in Santiago, but the intense visibility of the sociality of circulation and its political dimension as alianzas pequeñas contribute to the charge that such production is false. In other words, alianzas pequeñas are overt manifestations of the politics of gestionando conecciones. They become glossed negatively as amiguismo.

Ultimately, the accusation of amiguismo delegitimizes musicians, spaces, or financial success by charging that production or increased circulation have been generated through the politics of social and institutional connections instead of being generated by the objective draw of the music itself, that is, by some mechanism of circulation free from the politics of the social. This is an ideal of modernity, which has been intimately associated with notions of free and unfettered circulation, an ideology itself made possible by the notion that infrastructures are inherently apolitical and thus allow for the smooth unfolding of progress (Larkin 2008:332). The creation of independent music spaces, sounds, and economy through intimate, largely visible and known social relationships in Santiago helps reinforce Chilean anxieties about a lack of modernity (Garland 2009), and animates complaints of things being *penca* [shitty]. Larger scale media representation of these practices contributes to this attitude, as it becomes difficult to be widely known within Chile until metropolitan sources validate local activity. Amiguismo thus might be seen as the negative valence given to the struggle for resources, money, and recognition in an environment scant on all of them, and in which the politics of the struggle are laid bare because they are simultaneously the processes of generating connections and continuing with activity itself.

Espacio Cellar: The Loss of Magic with the Gain of Money

The management of connections into small alliances, such that networks can condense into relatively coherent and stable entities and thus endure time, while simultaneously extending to larger areas to gain more resources, is a sensitive process for the way it might undermine the specific social dynamics cultivated across social connections and within performance spaces. This aspect was evident in the formation and transformation of the venue Espacio Cellar, a larger space operating on the typical club hourly schedule and format like Loreto, but located further afield, on the outskirts of the university district República, next to the edge of a highway and operating without any type of patente. While Cellar continues to function without permits, it has undergone infrastructural reforms to accommodate more people, such as installing actual (if very precarious) bathrooms, as opposed to the port-a-potty type structures it previously had. The change in infrastructure came along with a change in the type of public that would come. According to the co-founder and booking manager Pía Cárdenas, back in the early days, "people came who really liked the band. They liked what has happening, and now that Cellar has consolidated, of course, people come to Cellar because they know they're going to find a certain type of party of which they're a part [*que pertenece a uno*], a couple of bands are going to play and a couple of DJs, which have something in common. That we're never going to vary much one from the other, which are like, indie" (Pía Cárdenas, interview, May 13th, 2011).

The opening of the space to more people has meant that many people now going to Cellar are not only unfamiliar to Pía, but are "more normal, [while] before the people were crazier…. Before it was more fun, it had more of a vibe [*más onda*]." Pía reminisced from the time when Cellar was just beginning and she had "nothing to offer" the bands besides a space to perform, to have fun, and to forge connections with others, helping foment a space in which "everyone had something to do with somebody" (ibid.). The small alliances that emerged through the

management of these connections, as well as through specific institutional means for drawing in outsiders, have helped make the space more financially viable, but have also helped to undermine the "social club" atmosphere valued by those originally creating and performing in the space. In May 2011, for example, Cellar offered a discount for presenting the receipt for attending the CD launch, earlier in the same night, of the indie pop artist Pedropiedra at an old art cinema space called Cine Arte Normandie. Some attendees with which I spoke at Cellar that night had arrived there specifically because of the Pedropiedra discount, which seemed to draw them less through the financial incentive and more as a type of flyer informing them of the party and making Cellar the space in which to continue the night. Unsurprisingly, these individuals admitted to being unfamiliar with the performing band that night (Protistas), and similarly were there for the party, not for any interest in the musical happening. This illustrates the shifts that have occurred as Cellar has transitioned from an intimate space for social and artistic engagement to a more "public" space in which maintaining a certain atmosphere and certain types of musical presentation would become more difficult.

Pía felt that when Cellar was more exclusive the quality of the musical presentation was better, in that she didn't need to think about catering to a public. "We were more unknown, and we had a better offering of shows, I think" (Pía Cárdenas, interview, May 13th, 2011). Pregnant at the time I interviewed her, Pía conceded that despite these changes, she prefers the current dynamic, because she makes more money. This means that she has to be more selective in the programming, that she can no longer afford to be *buena onda* [nice; doing things to help out others], even though opening the space to more people has invited both "normal" people and other unwanted types of behavior: during our conversation we touched on several shows which I had attended and Pía commented on the nature of the public at many of them, noting that she

would not be inviting a particular band back because its audience was full of rowdy [*desordenados*] skaters. Another show had been full of drunks whom Pía's partner Luís had to fight before they would finally leave. Though she prefers to put up with such behavior for the financial benefit, she reflects, somewhat wistfully, "still, it had its magic when we were more *under*. It had its magic" (Pía Cárdenas, interview, May 13th, 2011).

This narrative of Espacio Cellar coalesces the configuration of music venues in Santiago both through their physical infrastructures and properties as well as their socio-musical ones. Cellar implemented physical reforms, less varied musical curation, and outside institutional connections to draw in a public from an expanded realm of social networks. While this helped make Cellar economically viable, it also undermined the musical practices and social atmosphere that arose "organically" when Pia and her partner began using the space (originally for their own theater rehearsals) for ludic social and musical activities.

Each of these spaces manifests the tension in Chile between the value of spaces in which a particular type of social relation can take place, one oriented around an ethics of listening and musical presentation, and the accusations of amiguisimo, that such activity is not real because those producing the spaces, playing the music, attending the events, and writing about them are "all the same." Even after describing the relative commercial expansion of Cellar, Pía voiced a common Chilean attitude towards Santiago and its cultural offerings, "still, here it's shitty [*penca*], everything's shitty, all the labels are shitty, nothing happens [*no pasa ná*]" (Pía Cárdenas, interview, May 13th, 2011). Many people within Santiago's independent circles, even after noting the big changes that have occurred over the last several years—the opening of more spaces like Loreto, Elefante, and Cellar, more labels like Cazador[76] and Michita Rex, or even the indie-centric radio station Horizonte—all lament the size of the market, often attributing it to

[76] Cazador closed in 2012 due to financial constraint.

Chile's small size, as a factor that limits production possibilities and the relative qualities of both spaces and sounds.

Yet as these venues show, the social-musical spaces built through musical affinity and phatic labor do have the potential to endure in time when not taken over as with La Zona, when able to navigate juridical infrastructures and social activity zoning like Elefante and Mist for their runs, or when able to adapt themselves to better earn revenue while still largely able to emphasize the type of space they originally created, as with Cellar and Loreto. Similarly, the musicians who construct and circulate through these venues, bringing their ties to social networks as elaborated through friendships and media promotion of various sorts, also build musical infrastructures that help the spaces and practices of sociality endure in time and space, even while transforming them.[77] As Elyachar notes, such "creation and maintenance of infrastructure is not itself directly productive of [economic] value and yet is essential to the capitalist system of production" (2010:255), and that if products of phatic labor are not linked to the market, they will "spoil and become worthless" (ibid.). This has been the fundamental problem with economic sustenance of independent musicians and producers in Chile. Notably, it clashes particularly with the post-punk, DIY ethos of production, which sought to eschew market relations and the drive for resources in favor of musical and social authenticity. In the contemporary situation, DIY is the default modus operandi of most everyone, revealing the extent to which the major recording industry helped provide a backbone infrastructure within which or from which to construct alternative practices, a point Sarah Thornton (1996) illustrates with '90s club cultures in the UK.

Blogging and Metrics: Connecting Networks through Media Representation

[77] These musical infrastructures will be elaborated in chapter 3.

One of the factors generating unease over the need to connect these social infrastructures to economic mechanisms is the way in which particular types of media recognition serve as the connecting arm between phatic labor and the economic resources that can help sustain musical production. This is illustrated by the rise of bloggers as important mediators between musicians and venues, on the one hand, and on the other, the brands that are beginning to insert themselves into indie musical worlds. Bloggers with semi-professional sites like **POTQ**, **Disorder**, **Super45** and **Pániko** have starting gaining more weight as cultural mediators, particularly now that they write more about Chilean music, rather than almost solely focusing on foreign bands (though foreign bands still make up a large chunk of coverage). But in my observation, Santiago bloggers' opinions have little to do with helping form an audience for Chilean bands; in fact, the publication of live show calendars in the city is rather haphazard for all of them.[78] Rather, blogs and bloggers have become the media presence to which brands look for "cool." They are media spaces and individual or institutional online personalities to which to brands attach their image by asking them to curate brand-sponsored live shows.

Music bloggers play a crucial role in creating the media visibility that bands need to become desirable for brand association. Bloggers like Andrés "Andy Panda" Panes, editor for the **POTQ** site, for example, have been able to leverage their online presence, together with personal connections to brand managers, to curate live, branded events. But in promoting corporate sponsored-events and receiving remittances for ads, these bloggers also move towards remunerated professional activity, while securing a space for themselves as cultural mediators. The co-founder and current manager of the blog **Disorder**, the journalist Camilo Salas, related that brands give him products to keep around his house as part of their sponsorship of his site (Camilo Salas, interview, May 14th, 2012). Thus while such blogs increasingly cover new

[78] Though part of this owes to the fact that the large majority of those managing the site are volunteers.

Chilean musicians and promote corporate-sponsored band events, they do not send many resources back to the immediate physical aspects of musical production, such as the need for gear, rehearsal space, or the basic human necessities of the musicians. Rather, blogs remunerated by brands contribute to the professionalization of the online media ecology, not the bolstering of musical creation itself.

This is reflected in the minimal expansion of concert-going audiences for Chilean musicians. At non-corporate performances at venues like those discussed in this chapter, part of the audience consists of a nucleus of actors directly or semi-directly involved with Santiago indie music production, who draw with them acquaintances established through social networks, as well as individuals drawn through institutional mechanisms from further afield, as has been discussed. At corporate events, the same core musicians and music producers, including bloggers, are invited to participate, along with business personnel associated with or courted by the brand, social network stragglers uninvited, in the exclusive production of *cool*. The aim of corporate music events is thus not to produce an intimate experience of musical exchange with a live listening audience, but rather to construct a private space for cultural and economic elites, in which music simply serves as symbolic and affective décor, as elaborated in Chapter 1.

According to Fakuta and her Michita Rex label co-founder Dadalú, the indie market in Chile is "stagnated" both because "everything moves through friendship" (amiguismo) (Daniela Saldías, interview, May 5th, 2011), and because many of the bloggers are less interested in the music than in being trendy [*onderos*] (Pamela Sepúlveda, May 5th, 2011). But lines between friendship and what might be considered public coverage in trendy blogs become blurred even for those participating. During our interview, Dadalú began relating that Michita Rex activities

are only covered in **Super45** because Fakuta and Dadalú are friends with the people running **Super45**. Fakuta interrupts, "but who do we know?

> Dadalú: Gab Pinto.
>
> Fakuta: Gab Pinto, but I met him exactly because he wanted to interview us (interview, May 5th, 2011).

What happens here is a politics of mediation that cannot be separated from friendship, but in which who can mediate the securing of resources becomes a contested political dimension.

Musicians, likewise, are learning how to connect their own interests to such brands in the language of current marketing, centered around big data and metrics of audience penetration. Aldo Benincasa related the process of negotiation between the band he manages, Dënver, and the energy drink brand Red Bull. After Aldo told Red Bull that Dënver's video single "Los Adolescentes" received 10,000 views its first 24 hours on YouTube, "it completely changed the conversation" (Aldo Benincasa, April 24th, 2011). Andrés Nusser, frontman for one of the most popular indie bands in Chile, Astro, had already become savvy about these terms of negotiating deals with brands. He noted, "you have to reflect numbers to move money [*incentivar plata*]," speaking precisely of both this mediated recognition and the importance of "treating the band like a small business" (Andrés Nusser, interview, September 30th, 2011). Andrés conceded that the branded events at which Astro had performed, which are similar to the Multishow Warpaint show described in chapter 1, were clearly not oriented towards musical performance, but rather designed as temporary, ludic spaces for professionals in "creative industries" like advertising to expand and tighten their own social infrastructures. While Andrés conceded that at such events few pay attention to the band, he still thought they were good to do, because out of one-thousand

attendees perhaps one hundred would pay attention and potentially help spread the word about the band.

All of these vignettes illustrate the "fracture between what the artist wants, how people experience a particular art form, and how it is interpreted for purposes of resource management" (Ochoa 2013:15). In this sense, the complaint of amiguismo can be connected to a lack of recognition in media networks outside of those constituted by social media and specialized press, precisely because wider recognition becomes a resource for further generating connections, and thus the ability to tap resources from other spheres. Andrés, for example, noted the importance representation in larger media outlets, in conjunction with social infrastructures—what he called the "channel of people"—for a musical project to become financially viable. With mass media recognition he said, "more people can pass things among themselves and talk amongst themselves and say, 'hey, have you heard this band, have you heard this other,' like the big trigger is if you come out in some press, so that when you open the internet it comes out, 'hey did you see Astro,'… because if not the time really stretches out… I can release a single and give it to ten people and wait for what?" (Andrés Nusser, interview, September 30th, 2011). Mass mediation thus provides content which can be passed or not passed around social networks.

At the time of my fieldwork, wider recognition of the indie world discussed in this chapter had already begun to emerge in Chile. It had been slowly snowballing after the February, 2011 publication in the major Spanish newspaper El País of a feature titled "Chile, the Pop Paradise, " which described the country as "one of the great powers of independent pop sung in Spanish" (López Palacios 2011). The report and subsequent pieces like it generated and continue to generate a flurry of articles by Chile's own national papers, first on the Spanish articles' reporting, then on the artists making up what the major Chilean paper El Mercurio called "a band

of almost unknown names, about which much has been said outside, but are hardly known in our own land" (De Mussy 2013). Among those musicians, journalists, and club owners that form part of this "band," the subject of this chapter, the fact that mainstream Chilean press deign to report on such activity only after it has been validated by a more prestigious European source exemplifies the problem of earning wider recognition when musical, social, media and spatial networks are co-constituted, making them difficult to "scale up" unless they can be connected with a higher order of political process.

This is why scholars have argued for media as "central to the production of emergent forms of value" (Larkin 2013:339; Lazzarato 2011; Shaviro 2010). On a practical level, media, especially mass media, expand the potential number of people which may engage them, helping forge audiences outside of social infrastructures. This contributes to a clearer separation between producer and public, as is the case with northern indie blogs which became big enough to attract enough brand investment to become read increasingly by people in the southern cone. These media allowed publics to form for bands which could then tour to these same places. If Callon (1998) is correct in arguing that economic ideologies act upon and configure economic processes of the world, the music economy as historically configured in the 20th century and currently, relies on the need to separate those producing from those consuming.

Conclusion

The central structuring role of friendship, phatic labor, and small alliances within an environment in which many actors—musicians, bloggers, venue owners, promoters—are attempting to professionalize, to turn their activities into a primary economic activity, supports the notion that the activity is not "real," because, as Pía Cárdenas also related in the early stage

of Cellar, so many people who regularly circulate at Santiago indie music events know each other. This brings forth the political dimension of managing connections within in an ideology centered on people just "doing things we like," with "people we like." In ideal spaces then, interpersonal politics should not figure in the aesthetic decisions of participants. It is clear in these cases that the phatic labor of managing social connections has built the infrastructures for performance and for media circulation, highlighting the fact that sociality and musical values both constitute each other and butt up against one another. This also contributes to the difficulty of expanding the consumption of these activities from a relatively tight circle of insiders to some set of anonymous onlookers who would help support these activities financially. The values of "doing what I like, with whom I like," thus clash with this need to expand these networks and to articulate them with other networks for the securing of resources. This expansion also generates the type of environment that the originators of musical venues sought to escape to begin with—an environment not just for "people we like" or "music we like" or "music presented how we like it," but one inclusive of networked onlookers, no matter who they may be. As these cultural spaces become more economically solvent, they lose the density of their social character, helping simultaneously diffract the social creation and recognition of the musical qualities engendered within.

Chapter 3

The Musical Infrastructures of Exchanging Musical Ideas: *Eugênia* and the Small Universe of the Casa do Mancha

> Pulsa Nova Música: Do you agree with those concepts which are given to rock and roll, like indie, underground, psychedelic? It seems redundant, but it's important.
> Pedro Bonifrate: It's important because of the mode of production and the social location, and because of how much both affect music.
> -Pulsa Nova Música interview with Pedro Bonifrate[ix]

> A friend came here and said: "this here is incredible, because this here is true. We see the irregular roof and we know it was you who did it and not an architect." And whatever detail that exists about the house is true.
> -Mancha Leonel, on his house and music venue The Casa do Mancha[x]

> The only thing that raises you to glory is alternative rock.
> -Filipe Giraknob[xi]

I saw the musician Pedro Bonifrate perform for the first time on August 3rd, 2011, at Varal Bar on João Moura street in Pinheiros, São Paulo. I had learned about the event, an edition of the series Folk This Town, from one of its organizers, Rodrigo Sommer. A graphic designer, Rodrigo frequently designs posters for shows and other musical and cultural events in São Paulo's indie worlds. Together with Adriano "Mitocondrias" Vannucchi and the journalist known as "Gonzo," Rodrigo initially ran Folk This Town five times a year, featuring artists broadly defined as "folk" from throughout Brazil. By my arrival, this self-described "city's chill party, where you can enjoy some music peacefully while having a beer and chatting with your friends" (Gonzo 2009), was popping up haphazardly and in itinerant spaces. Still, Rodrigo told me, this was the first Folk This Town where he'd been able to guarantee a *cachê* (performance fee), rather than only being able to offer the intake from the cover charge at the door. The cover tonight is just R$15, about US$8.50 at the time, both for Bonifrate, in town from Rio de Janeiro, as well as Coreto Plaza, one of the one-man shows performed by Pedro Moreira, a resident of the

house in the adjacent Perdizes neighborhood that also serves as the headquarters for Cloud Chapel Records, the boutique label launching Bonifrate's album, *Um Futuro Inteiro,* A Whole Future, tonight. A small table had been laid out with copies of *Um Futuro Inteiro* and a few other Cloud Chapel Records, though Pedro Bonifrate, who performs as Bonifrate, also makes this music available for streaming and donate-what-you-want purchase through his website. The person manning the table is Filipe Giraknob, the noise-effects guitarist for the band Supercordas, which Pedro also leads. Filipe springs up to take the stage alongside Pedro in between merch-table duties.

The crowd at Bonifrate's show at Varal Bar is very small but enthusiastic; I'm not sure anyone else at the performance, aside from myself, did not already know Pedro Bonifrate, Filipe Giraknob and Diogo Valentino, the other Supercordas member accompanying Pedro tonight. I did, however, know many of the individuals in attendance, after spending time at a recording studio, performance venue and house called the Casa do Mancha, or Mancha's House. The crew of cultural producers, musicians, DJs, and music lovers at the Bonifrate show treated the Casa do Mancha as a space for sincere and intense engagement with each other and with music—the music performed at the house as well as recordings, news and videos of music and musicians from throughout history and around the world. It was not a coincidence that so many of the individuals I frequently encountered at the Casa do Mancha formed the core audience at Bonifrate's Folk This Town show. These were the same individuals who would appear at Bonifrate's many shows in São Paulo throughout the year, as well as *like* Bonifrate's posts about shows on Facebook, share his videos, and spread his announcements of new music or performance events both in São Paulo and beyond. Many of these people became or had already become Bonifrate's personal friends.

Mancha Leonel himself, the "Mancha" of *Mancha's House*, served as drummer for two other Bonifrate performances in São Paulo within the week following the Folk This Town show. Bonifrate rehearsed at the Casa do Mancha during the week in preparation for the two shows with Mancha on the kit, the first at the Casa do Mancha itself, the following at the Stúdio SP, São Paulo's most well-known indie music venue. Bonifrate performed as the first of three acts making up an edition of *Cedo e Sentado*, or "Early and Seated," the Stúdio SP's earlier-evening free live music series hosted every Tuesday. While managed partially by a network called Fora do Eixo,[79] this edition of *Cedo e Sentado* has been curated by Agência Alavanca, a promotion agency specializing in independent Brazilian bands. Despite this curation and the broadly shared social context of each band,[80] the audience shifted considerably with each set, a visual and sonic incarnation of the overlapping yet partially separated spheres of indie music circulation in São Paulo, the social nature of the circulation manifesting in a shifting of audience tides within the same small, enclosed bay of independent production.

For Bonifrate's performance at the Stúdio SP, the majority of the waters stay at low-tide, with just a ripple towards the front of the stage. Around ten people, all Casa do Mancha regulars, position themselves in line before the stage, in a manner that would make for a clean analysis of the assertion of musical taste and social position (and social position via musical taste) in a different type of analysis. Everyone in the line has been singing along with just about every lyric. One person, Dani Hasse, has designed the cover art for Bonifrate's new LP. Like Rodrigo, Dani is frequently commissioned to design posters for musical events around the city, and sells them at shows and DIY art fairs. Another person in the line is Kátia Abreu, a journalist and former music producer who worked with Pedro's main band Supercordas for many years, and who was

[79] Fora do Eixo and its relation to Stúdio SP and Cedo e Sentado will be treated in Chapter 4.
[80] The other two bands were Pélico and Garotas Suecas.

a co-founder of Agência Alavanca. Yet another person in the line is Amauri Stamboroski Jr., aka, "Gonzo," who helped organize the Folk This Town show and whose review of *Um Futuro Inteiro* will come out in the +Soma culture magazine later in the month, his interview with Bonifrate later in the year. Pedro launches into *Eugênia*, the song that forms the thematic compass for the new album, appearing on it last. The song begins rather ephemerally, with long, low arrhythmic bass throbs in the piano, a shimmering effect made by guitar feedback and an electronic effects pedal like the chirping of digital insects, metal chimes, and finally, on the recording and when available for performance, a long drone in the tenor saxophone. In other words, not a song that usually gets anyone rockin', at least not at first. Yet as soon as the band begins seeping into *Eugênia* at the Stúdio SP, Gonzo throws his fist into the air and holds it there, head down as if weathering a strong musical wind. I watch perplexed, not understanding what Gonzo hears and why it seems so special.

This chapter details the processes by which musical-social aesthetics come into being, particularly in relation to place and to the way sounds themselves, as material developed in and thus connected to place, become historical agents in the on-going structuring of social relationships and musical values. I describe my own process of coming to understand, value and thoroughly enjoy the music of Bonifrate. This process formed part of my socialization into a particular corner of the independent music world in Brazil and was deeply facilitated by the Casa do Mancha. In particular, I detail my process of learning to listen to the Bonifrate song *Eugênia*, a process inextricable from my developing relationships with others attending Bonifrate shows and performing with him, and with the way the Casa do Mancha fostered these relationships by being felt as a space with dense social connectivity. I thus detail on a micro level the notion of indie as what Mancha regular and Folk This Town organizer Rodrigo Sommer called an *universo*

pequeno, or "small universe," predicated on social and musical affinity, a space for the gathering of people "we like," and a particular atmosphere of engagement felt as true and authentic to those participating. Importantly, this universe is created and managed around what Pedro Bonifrate called *trocando ideias musicais*, "exchanging musical ideas." This is a mode of intense focus on the qualities of musical sound and discovering the way different bands explore and elaborate these musical qualities, and thus relate to each other. Exchanging musical ideas thus highlights the way musical sound itself contributes the formation of social connections.

While in chapter 2 I emphasized the social infrastructures created by phatic labor and musical performance in the formation and maintenance of music venues, here I want to emphasize the agency of material sound itself in the structuring and endurance of these same social spaces. Music, particularly following the rise of recording and the development of the mass music industry based on recording and broadcast, has been approached as an immaterial manifestation requiring material repositories, such as wax cylinders or magnetic cassette tapes, to endure in time and move through space. But music is itself composed of matter with the capacity to affect bodies and spaces (Goodman 2012; Schrimshaw 2013), though it does so in differential ways according to the "semiotic ideologies" with which particular sounds become historically bundled and thus meaningful for social actors (Keane 2005). Here, I consider musical sound as "matter that enable the movement of other matter" (Larkin 2013:329), an infrastructure composed by the nexus of material sound waves and their poetics and affects. This nexus, moreover, arises from the practices of sociability which are themselves infrastructures integral to the functioning of other structures (Elyachar 2010), including the circulation and usage of media like print, radio, and record, through which musical sound and semiotic ideologies move, become sustained, transform, or break down.

Social infrastructures, musical infrastructures, media structures and spaces all mutually provide infrastructures of the other. But the differential history of each element lends a particular spin to the way it relates to and interacts with the others, affecting the overall character of the assemblage and the relative weight of each element within it. As I trace in this chapter, social infrastructures were constituted through interaction with transnational media infrastructures, helping constitute a musical infrastructure that would recursively come to shape social connections, occupations of spaces like the Casa do Mancha, and uses of social media. I trace how social relations among Pedro Bonifrate and members of his band arose by "exchanging musical ideas" through various media in Rio de Janeiro in the 1990s. Social connections were built through the exchange of media and the discussion of musical sound, which laid a foundation for the reception of particular types of sounds. These practices formed both an ethics of social interaction and a local musical groundwork for future bands like Bonifrate and Supercordas to figure in contemporary assemblages of sound, sociality, media, and spaces for musical gathering.

The practice of exchanging of musical ideas, a mode of focusing on musical sound as a social practice, carries over and manifests in the structuring of the Casa do Mancha as space for continuing and transforming both this ethos of social relation and the valuing, reproduction and production of musical qualities associated with the venue and the forms of sociality engendered there. I thus take the material qualities of music as primary elements that enable individuals to come together, to sit and exchange. This makes aesthetics a significant and important element in infrastructures of musical circulation and the endurance over time of built spaces like the Casa do Mancha. The building of such performance spaces through phatic labor, as discussed in

chapter 2, thus extends to musical performance and practices of listening which socially and musically capacitate within particular socio-musical worlds, or small universes.

I first describe Pedro Bonifrate and Filipe Giraknob's histories of engaging with alternative music, media, and each other. These histories both manifest in the sonic character of Pedro's music as well as exemplify the type of social relationship and approach to music valued by and incarnated at the Casa do Mancha. I then connect the social feeling at the Casa do Mancha and its relationship to this particular musical ethos to the personal biography of the owner Mancha Leonel, to the physical structure of the house itself, and to its situatedness within São Paulo nightlife and cultural funding regimes. Finally, I detail my own process of capacitation into these aesthetics, recounting my learning to listen to Bonifrate's song *Eugênia* precisely through the modes of sociality and types of musical values I learned spending time at the Casa do Mancha. I thus illustrate the way small universes arise as dense assemblages of sociality, place, and musical material, while drawing their connection to historical practices of sociality and media circulation as articulated by the infrastructural capacity of musical sound.

Music Talk at the Casa do Mancha, Musical Infrastructures, and Musical Sociality

Bonifrate performed at the Casa do Mancha in August, 2011, in the days between his Folk this Town and Stúdio SP shows. The musicians performing with Bonifrate at the house, Mancha and the two other members of the band Supercordas, Diogo Valentino and Filipe Giraknob, aesthetically hew to the Britpop tradition and the independent guitar rock of American and UK bands from the '90s. But these individuals also mix in Brazilian music history of various sorts, holding Caetano Veloso in high regard as a true *artist*, for his ability to mix aesthetic experimentalism with popular sentiment. They also, uncharacteristically for their age (late 20s,

early 30s), appreciate Roberto Carlos, the 1960s early rock musician turned radio crooner who specializes in sentimental ballads normally dismissed as *brega* (cheesy) by this generation. Filipe, in particular, finds Roberto Carlos to express a true romantic sentiment the contemporary world too often lacks. With these influences, Pedro's description of Supercordas' sound as *iê iê iê psicodélico* (psychedelic iê iê iê) makes complete sense: iê iê iê refers to 1960s Brazilian rock'nroll which both mimicked US rock'nroll and incorporated elements from Latin American romantic ballads, like Roberto Carlos (Ulhôa 1995), as well as found expression in the Tropicalist rock project of musicians such as Caetano Veloso (cf Dunn 2001). The "psychedelic" incorporates Supercordas members' influences from '90s, northern indie rock of the "shoegaze" and psychedelic varieties,[81] like Teenage Fanclub, The Flaming Lips or Olivia Tremor Control.

I began to find out about these influences and aesthetic preferences right just before the show at Casa do Mancha. The band sits around on the couches in the venue's covered patio area, talking with friends, musicians from other cities in town here to see them, as well as myself. All of us discuss the music we like, the music we listened to when younger and more recently, making asides about the relative position and quality of these bands within larger genre canons, about the way the bands have changed their sound, about their innovation or political importance for the musical and social movements of their time. This type of conversation about music before the Bonifrate show reigns at the Casa do Mancha in general: musicians, DJs, journalists, show promoters, and designers, all of whom participate in the production of independent music in various ways, wearing several hats so to speak, in long conversations about who has heard such and such record, what they think of it, gossip about various bands or stories of performances

[81] Shoegaze refers to rock music with heavy reliance on noisy guitar distortion through effects pedals; psychedelic also tends to involve heavy distortion and reverb, and to incorporate "strange" sound elements made by electroacoustic tinkering, pedals, or programmed sounds on electronic keyboards.

gone wrong or right. But most conversation concentrates on musical qualities and the social relations generated by shared interest in exchanging musical ideas.

My recorded interview with Pedro Bonifrate and Filipe Giraknob in Rio illustrates this type of talk, as well as details the particular aesthetic values that helped form the individual sensibilities of both musicians, which subsequently informed the sounds they make together as members of Supercordas, or, in the case of Filipe, a musical contributor to Pedro's solo project Bonifrate. The conversation, portions of which will be reproduced below, exemplifies the type of discourse about music and way of relating socially through discussion of and interest in sounds and shared histories of engagement with sound valued by the small universe of indie discused in this chapter and encountered at the Casa do Mancha. Yet Pedro and Filipe's ability to begin this type of discussion when they first met was also made possible by the ability of each to recognize the other as like-minded, a capacity that arose out of Pedro and Filipe's own individual histories of listening and engagement with the media and people through which independent sound circulated in Rio and Brazil.

For his part, Filipe grew up very poor in a marginal suburb of Rio de Janeiro called Baixada da Fluminense,[82] which he frequently describes as "the most horrible place on the planet." Dropping out of school before the age of ten, Filipe found punk rock and drugs as teenage pastime and escape. However, Filipe's mother ran several NGOs, one of which received a large grant from the French government, prompting the family to move to the very rich South Zone neighborhood of Copacabana. Filipe commonly recounts the shock of this move: "I left the most horrible place for the richest place. From one day to the next. And when I got there I didn't adapt" (Filipe Giraknob, interview, August 19th, 2011). But in his new neighborhood Filipe had

[82] In a reversal of the norm in the United States, suburbs of large cities in Latin America typically represent the poorest sector of the urban population.

access to a radio station featuring some programming dedicated to indie rock. He began to listen to it and met others who listened to "that type of music," particularly Rodrigo Lariú, the founder of the Midsummer Madness label. As noted in the introduction, Midsummer Madness was the first to edit *indie* rock in Brazil, and it continues to support Brazilian independent rock of various sorts, including editing the first of Supercordas' LPs, and helping with the production of its recent (2012) release (*A Mágica Deriva dos Elefantes*). Importantly, Lariú was also the programmer and announcer of College Radio, one of the shows dedicated to indie rock of the '90s on Radio Fluminense, broadcast from the adjacent city of Niterói. Filipe thus encountered the indie subgenre expression of rock when he moved to the South Zone where the interest in this type of music was more centralized and greater than in the periphery. "And from there," Filipe explained, "I started listening to that type of rock a lot. And I was a punk of that more classic type, the very English type… who has a mohawk and breaks things (laughs). And I started listening to Dinosaur Jr., Sonic Youth and those things. And I started thinking it was great, and I became sweeter" (Filipe Giraknob, interview, August 19th, 2011).

At this time, the mid-1990s, record shops in Brazil sometimes served as music rental stores, a practice that had carried over from the 1980s, when stores like Baratos Afins in São Paulo allowed patrons to rent records and make copies. Even the small, colonial costal city Paraty, where Pedro Bonifrate grew up, had a store from which he rented classic rock albums in his youth. In Rio during the 1990s, a record store in Ipanema called Spider and its record rental feature was fundamental for the musical education of many in Filipe's generation. According to Filipe, Spider

> was really important for forming the people here from the South Zone that like [rock]…. It was a store where you could rent a CD, you grabbed a CD, and took it home for two

> days, like a video store but for music. And [the owner] had an important contact with some American and English distributors. And so we had all the big releases at the same time [as in the north]. And that was fantastic. Like, a record was released and the next day we already had that record there and could rent it (Filipe Giraknob, interview, August 19th, 2011).

Filipe described how the cost of a CD rental was equivalent to the price of a bus ticket, such that he would walk one hour there and back to save money in order to rent more CDs. "And so I started getting a lot of things and learning a lot about music, mostly about indie rock" (ibid.). Other participants in '90s indie have noted the importance of similar places and of Spider itself in the musical building of social connections among people interested in alternative types of rock during the decade, and of facilitating the coalescence of local musical practices, because Spider also sold and made available demo tapes and vinyl records of independent Brazilian bands. As an online commenter, Fábio, reminisced, the function of renting CDs was particularly important as "a good way to hear new sounds, record cassettes, and meet other crazies [*malucos*]" (Leão 2013). As Fábio noted, Rodrigo Lariú's program on Radio Fluminense played new sounds coming out of American college radio at the time, and announced which had recently become available at Spider. The radio broadcasts, record store retail and rental, and face-to-face encounters among interested parties thus all fed into each other, mutually helping constitute a network of indie music circulation and social practice in Rio.

Growing up in the costal colonial city of Paraty, four hours by winding bus ride to the capital, Pedro's access to music was more limited to "the big things that came," such as Blur, Oasis and Radiohead (Pedro Bonifrate, interview, August 19th, 2011), bands that featured heavily on American and British radio and TV in the mid-to-late 1990s. This meant that Pedro's practice

of discovering more alternative music, like his peers in Chile, was initially more closely associated with the music journalism that sometimes covered such sounds in mainstream rock publications (though these publications were also important in the metropolises). Pedro described this as the "old and out of sync [*defasado*] system of reading something in a magazine about Mercury Rev or the Flaming Lips and saying, 'wow, that thing must be cool'…. The description of the sound interested you" (Pedro Bonifrate, interview, August 19th, 2011). This type of music writing has been important for drawing historical links between sounds across time, helping situate the bands themselves within certain ethical orientations to the world, and helping to situate listeners to a certain type of reception of sound. Pedro remembered reading about the American indie band The Flaming Lips in one of these magazines, which described "what they had to do with psychedelia from the '60s," such that when he saw the record at a shop in the South Zone of Rio he bought it and started liking it. Soon Pedro began to download songs from Napster; he remembered reading a piece on Welsh bands in the Brazilian mainstream rock and pop magazine Showbizz (or Bizz), "I read what they said about Super Furry Animals and thought, wow, that must be beautiful. And I remember they didn't have Super Furry Animals for sale in any shop…. So I downloaded it, and it was one of those downloads that takes a whole night to download thirty seconds, and I listened to thirty seconds of Super Furry Animals and said 'damn, my favorite band of all time.' And still today it's my favorite band of all time" (ibid.).

A conflux of people, media (recordings, radio, and print magazines), and, importantly, the sounds themselves helped form the particular disposition towards music, listening, and the sociality formed around the interest in and circulation of music that allow people to meet, subsequently providing a basis for the development of their social relationships. And the development of their social relationships in turn forms the basis for the development of musical

practices, which continue, extend and transform the historical relations of sound. In Filipe and Pedro's case, they were brought together through a larger social network formed around interest in various types of alternative sound. Filipe and Pedro met owing to a mutual friend named Régis Argüelles, currently an academic and himself a musician. Régis played in several independent rock bands in Rio in the 1990s, including Cigarettes, a band that has become an important referent in the history of Brazilian independent production, as one of the early bands edited by Rodrigo Lariú's Midsummer Madness label. Filipe described Régis as a great fan of music "for real."[83] He owned a store with another of Filipe's friends in the periphery, so though he was from the South Zone, "which is a nicer area, he knew people from the suburbs and he has a fabulous sense of humor. He's really an enchanting person. He gets a lot of music of the type [*linha*] that we like, psychedelic rock" (Filipe). Pedro, for his part, met Régis at the university, though still for musical reasons: "I met him because he was wearing a Spacemen 3 shirt.[84] And so I went to chat with him" (Pedro). Here Pedro and Filipe explained how both their mutual connection to Régis as well as their mutual musical interests brought them together:

> Filipe: That's how we met, here in Lapa,[85] at a time when Lapa was still really a place for samba. But also people who liked rock still went to samba a bit out of intrigue in the music itself, but also to escape from the fact that there was nothing to do, you know? Even though at that time I really liked samba and everything. But I didn't like being in the middle of samba… you like the music but being in the middle really sucks…. The

[83] Where "for real" in Filipe's usage slants more to an emphasis on "real music," while also simultaneously signifying that Régis is a real (true) fan.
[84] 1980s English indie band.
[85] A bohemian district of Rio known for bars and nightclubs, known in the 1990s and early 2000s for especially of samba. See Herschmann (2009).

people are horrible. I think samba is fabulous. I was wearing a Spiritualized shirt.[86] And [Régis] said 'oh hey there's that guy. Talk to them, you know.' He said that and then left.

Pedro: Ha ha that old fuck.

F: He left. He left me, Pedro and Diogo who is also the bassist for Supercordas. And they asked me like, if I thought that Air, that French band, had anything to do with Pink Floyd. And then I started talking crazily about that, what I thought about things. And we started talking a lot and they asked if I liked the Elefant 6 people.[87] And at the time I already was really interested in experimental music and I didn't play rock anymore. But when we talked about that it was like, 'ahh ahh I like it man I think they're awesome.' It was the last rock thing I had listened to before ceasing to listen to rock. And from there we became good friends [*ficou muito amigo*].…And even though I wasn't interested in rock at all anymore, I got interested in rock again because they gave me a CD with the songs Pedro wrote [*fazia*] and I listened to it and said, 'hey this is quite good,' different."

Pedro: It's funny how, in reality you have the same principle as Régis. When I met Régis

Filipe: He was crazy for [*pirando em*] post rock.[88]

[86] Spiritualized is an English psychedelic band formed in 1990.
[87] Elephant 6 is an American indie record label featuring lo-fi, psychedelic-oriented bands like Olivia Tremor Control and Neutral Milk Hotel.
[88] Post rock describes a wide range of practices of using traditional rock instrumentation and sounds but focusing on the experimental usage of their timbres and textures, moving away from chord-based song formats. Associated first with independent music production primarily of the 80s and 90s in the US and UK, "post-rock" musical features seem to be common in contemporary indie rock around the world.

Pedro: He was crazy for it, and so we started exchanging CDs of Mp3s. Like, 'hey here's an Mp3 and later give another back to me,' and so we went exchanging musical ideas like that. And the first things I exchanged with Régis, he only burned me things like German Krautrock, Popol Vox…. Only things like blriigh brain fry [*fritação*] you know, Residents, that kind of thing. I was like, damn! Crazy. I just burned him things like Elefant 6… Olivia Tremor Control, I don't know, several things from the north of Wales that he didn't know. And it was cool because the same flip [*pira*] as Filipe, he was like, 'damn, I came back to enjoy a psychedelic pop sound,' so it was like, I don't know, you needed a hick to come from Paraty to reignite the taste for pop, for the gang that was into experimental sounds.

Filipe: Olivia Tremor Control was the big thing [*parada*]. And when we said we liked Olivia Tremor Control it was like, 'damn you guys like them? I think they're awesome [*foda*] I think they're beautiful [*lindo*], I think that's the big thing.' Because it's like it's pop… it's Beatles but it's…

Pedro: Stockhausen.[89]

Filipe: But it's Stockhausen. Like everything that I liked at the time which was electroacoustic music. And I was like, shit, I can play with you guys but I haven't played guitar in a formal way for a looong time.

[89] 20th-century German composer known for electronic experimentalism, aleatory music, and "spatial" or "space" music.

Pedro: And we said awesome! That's exactly what we want.

Filipe: …. I was completely disinterred in rock, I was like, I like colors I don't like forms, forms don't matter anymore, what matters is the type of timbre and such, and I got really stuck in that and started delving [*comecei a viajar*], I said, 'no, rock is for squares [*gente careta*]'…. And then I met Pedrinho and I was completely buried in electroacoustic music but he said, 'retuurrn to the song'. He brought me back to listen to a song, and ah, I can interfere in some way with that electroacoustic sentiment within a song, which is no longer going to be just a song."

Pedro: And that enchanted us.

The evolution of the sound of Supercordas, as well as the type of approach to music that Pedro would make as his solo project Bonifrate, were here elaborated through the historical relations that arose out of mutual recognition of shared musical sounds. Musical sounds thus served as infrastructures for the building of social connections, generating new practices of musical creation (Supercordas and Bonifrate) that are tied historically to practices of musical circulation, listening, and sociality in the city of Rio de Janeiro. Infrastructures, argues Larkin (2013), are the grounds upon which other structures operate (329); but this does not mean that relations between structures are easily layered or identifiable. Larkin notes that while "electricity is the infrastructure of the computer, the computer is the infrastructure of electricity supply" (2013:329), because electrical transmission is regulated by computers. I take sonic materiality as just such an infrastructural element, which, recursively, allows sounds to circulate precisely

through individuals' desire to engage them and to engage with others through the medium of musical creation and listening interaction.

Here the notion of musical qualities as the base material out of which musical infrastructures are built encompasses both the material properties of musical sonority as well as what Webb Keane (2005) terms "semiotic ideology": "people's background assumptions about what signs are and how they function in the world" (191). Semiotic ideologies are necessary for people to be able to recognize particular signs as such (2005:190), and these signs manifest and become intelligible together with the material forms which embody them. This necessarily means that signs become associated with other qualities of the material forms in which they manifest, such that the significance and intelligibility of signs also comes "bundled" with the qualities of the material means of conveyance. But, Keane notes, "the work of selecting and stabilizing the relevant bundles of iconicity and indexicality, the semiotic ideology this involves, is a project that can in principle never be complete, or fully consolidated. As such semiotic ideology is necessarily historical" (2005:196).

When semiotic ideologies are familiar, their histories can be engaged with as material properties. In this instance, they can be grasped in the particular musical elements of Bonifrate's song *Eugênia*. My interview with Pedro and Filipe situated my ability to engage with *Eugênia* as part of a lineage of interaction based on interest in particular musical qualities and modes of exchanging musical ideas. Learning this semiotic ideology allowed me to listen to *Eugênia*, recognizing its connections to Pedro and Filipe's histories of listening, which were inseparable from their modes engaging with both media and with each other. Familiarity with the semiotic ideology also allowed me to hear musical qualities and them as valuable and meaningful elements. My coming to understand, appreciate, and thoroughly enjoy *Eugênia* also cannot be

separated from my simultaneous process of coming to understand, or at the least, participate in, a social group articulated by a social space and a set of histories of listening---both of particular musical sounds as well as particular ways of engaging those sounds and exchanging them as a social practice. I learned this by spending time at the Casa do Mancha.

Learning to Listen to *Eugênia*

The process of learning *Eugênia* took time. I spent many hours listening to the song so I could better understand why people like Gonzo reacted so strongly to it and valued it in the way they did. The song is extra-long, clocking in at ten minutes, thirty-one seconds, and the lyrics are slightly opaque, even for Pedro, who writes dense prose, alternating slang with nearly academic verbs, interspersing fragments of imagery from his own and city life, invoking images equally personal and historical. If I understand *Eugênia* well, it's truly an ingenious song. It treats the theme of intimate desire and projection, the longing for a certain ideal of a person, the invention that comes with that longing, and ultimately, the realization that the person him or herself is not the ideal, or that the ideal does not exist it all. It conveys the self-trickery in human relations and the final realization of the charade.

The first stanza, "It's truly cool to be/within any kind of bubble/a woman's purse/which always carries/a will to lose," is accompanied by very minimal instrumentation, the piano droning in the background, with an acoustic guitar picked lightly, almost like a rhythmic accompaniment by a ribbed wooden board. From here the tenor sax meanders in and out of what will eventually appear as the melodic motif, itself a refrain of the melody from an earlier song on the album *Um Futuro Inteiro* called *O Vôo da Margarida* (Daisy's Flight). With the next stanza, the body of sound continues to build, the guitar becoming more prominent, hinting a bit of

ostinato rhythm, an electric guitar joining to double the voice and sound chunks of the melodic motif. The stanza ends with the words "urgency to exist," which the sax immediately echoes with a forceful push, improvising around the deconstructed melody. Cymbals have crescendoed and continue tingling with an itchy presence to be heard. With the beginning of the next stanza, a clear ostinato rhythm emerges in the bass, underneath the first line "Love transmutes the real." In the middle of the second line, "Revolutionary while," the ostinato drops out and a pulse like a heart monitor sounds a small but long and strong tone in the middle of the sound, taken over again by the ostinato just time for "The pulse of songs," which is interrupted again by the heartbeat in the middle of "Almost inconsequential and true." The heartbeat drops out once again in favor of the ostinato in "What effect of potions," which ends the stanza and once again invokes the saxophone, ever stronger, more elaborated and at once wild.

The musical presence continues building stronger and stronger, with power chords in the guitar on certain words, like "*Eugênia*" and "esquece" (forget), with the heartbeat continuing to trade with the ostinato, and the lyrics "she wants of the world an immanence/ that flees from me when I wake." Finally, the song breaks into a straight, slow romantic rock ballad, complete with crisp and light vocal harmonies in the background, to frame the singular stanza, "But in those eyes of yours/I think I can endure an entire future." The final stanza returns to the same ethereal texture as the opening of the song, "It's cool to be/Within whatever kind of artifice/A woman's body/ Which always carries/The will to lose…," and here an effect like the flopping of a vinyl disc ascends into the air and out of the song, while the rest of the band, now with a straight rock texture and including a full drum kit, builds into a version of *O Vôo da Margarida*, jamming out with repeated themes and the improvisation of the sax, always seeming to return to haunt the lyricist or the listener.

Eugênia encompasses many musical and lyrical themes associated with DIY and indie, particularly the DIY and indie that informs Pedro's own personal history, as well as those of his bandmates. The use of strange effects reminiscent of Pedro's favorite band Super Furry Animals, the fuzzy droning and phantasmagorical saxophone invoking psychedelic guitar bands across the ages, Filipe's guitar performing electroacoustic effects associated with the experimentalism of Mercury Rev, or as Filipe might say, of Stockhausen. The presence in *Eugênia* of these particular sounds historically associated with DIY and indie rock, also associates these sounds to particular ethical approaches to the modes of musical production through which they circulate. The history of these sounds can thus be heard in the ways in which contemporary actors in Brazil build infrastructures for musical production.

The invocation of particular attitudes and imaginaries by these sounds through both their semiotic attachments (including those generated through record marketing material), as well as the ways in which they circulated in places like Rio and São Paulo, ties particular ways of doing things with music (discussing music, trading tapes, forming bands) to those historical sounds and to their contemporary presence in songs like *Eugênia*. The interest in creating music in the style of those same historical DIY sounds, then, becomes an element in the structuring of actions for the building up of particular musical spaces, milieus, or what Gudeman (2005) calls communities, networks of relationships constituted through shared interests (95). These networks then serve to delimit and give definition to semiotic ideologies, which themselves have arisen historically from the semiotic ideologies that allowed sounds to help structure social networks and social spaces like the Casa do Mancha. These networks and spaces thus guide the continuous but historically grounded formation of semiotic ideologies that allow new sounds to be aesthetically and socially intelligible, and press affective weight on listening participants.

If during the ’90s the media that helped form these ideologies were radio stations, records and magazines, all of which would come together in the space of record stores, fifteen years later key media would become websites and social media platforms coming together in performance venues like the Casa do Mancha. In live music venues, the connection between the act of listening and the sociality of listening becomes emphasized. Here, the allure of musical creation and listening is the base material upon which other infrastructures for musical circulation—the media of exchange and the spaces in which bands perform—are themselves built. The aesthetics of music, as the bringing together of social constructions of meaning together with the material sonority of musical sound,[90] are what lay down the groundwork for the circulation of sounds similar to and associated with these other sounds. In other words, musical infrastructures are created not or not just by ideological orientations towards those sounds’ symbolic and iconic relations, but as “particular forms of music or art… [which] enable modes of production” (Ochoa 2013:15). The Casa do Mancha in particular, facilitates the creation, maintenance, and evolution of these musico-social alliances. These alliances, in turn, are encouraged by the physical and social qualities of the space itself, and ethical-aesthetic orientation towards interaction with music valorized by the owners and regular attendees. These qualities, moreover, partially arise from the Casa do Mancha’s mode of insertion into São Paulo’s physical, social, and institutional geographies, particularly its nightlife areas, their conventions, and their municipal regulations.

Cariocas at Mancha’s House and Musical Sociality within the São Paulo Context

[90] Ethnomusicological work is rife with analyses of the way material qualities of sound are iconic, indexical and symbolic of larger social processes. For particularly illuminating examples of the processes of associating sound qualities to social practices and spaces, see Fox (2004), Meintjes (2003), and Samuels (2004).

Indie participants in São Paulo, like those in Santiago, lament the city's relative lack of performance spaces and the meager conditions of payment for most bands, citing club owners' preference to book DJs, who are often cheaper than bands and who satisfy social dancing practices, and who can also cater a variety of styles. But *Paulistanos*, residents of São Paulo, have no equivalent term for *amiguismo* (chapter 2); rather, they attribute financial difficulties to a combination of playing sound historically and contemporarily undervalued and under circulated in Brazil, together with criticism of a host of music institutions and music financing practices managed fully or partially by the state (chapter 4). These institutions, including the State of São Paulo-affiliated SESC venues, the state and municipal Funarte spaces,[91] and "incentive law" cultural event financing, represent a significant portion of financial resources for independent musicians of all sorts. The state and state-affiliated arts management has helped create a new class of cultural workers to deal with the heavy amounts of bureaucracy involved in managing funds (Gough 2014), and indie musicians and producers in São Paulo are often able to take advantage of these resources, "managing a politics of exchange through the friendship of institutionally well-placed people" (Ochoa 2013:16). However, many participants in indie, like Mancha, prefer an ideology of "opting out" of what they see as an overly political method for cultural funding, one which necessarily places music into local and national political logics in a manner people like Mancha wish not to participate.[92] Such individuals prefer to view their art as

[91] SESCs are private entities funded through the renunciation of state payroll taxes. They can be seen as spaces through which to enculturate the populace in the interest of ethical enlightenment and the formation of a modern citizen (Miller and Yúdice 2002). Funarte stands for *Fundação Nacional de Artes*, or National Arts Foundation. It is organized into state and municipal entities within São Paulo, accompanying performance spaces (cf http://www.sescsp.org.br/; http://www.funarte.gov.br/regional/sao-paulo/).

[92] This dynamic will be elaborated in Chapter 4.

apolitical, or at the least, not interpolated by local and national political regimes, nor the forms of mass representation associated with the lettered elite and with the popular masses.[93]

Similarly, Mancha and many regulars seek to eschew the dynamics of middle-class São Paulo nightlife practices. The city features several club regions, many of which cater to desires for elite and exclusive spaces, necessarily also implying several regimes of control, from parking to high cover charges to long lines to enter to extensive security. Even the more bohemian clubs on and near Rua Augusta closer to downtown have high drink prices and cover charges, lines for entrance snaking blocks on the weekends, and DJs playing more popular forms of music to which many Mancha regulars would prefer not be subjected, including the popular parties oriented around more well-known foreign indie, such as those at Beco 203 (chapter 1). Finally, the sound at such places is often disdained, with complaints about the technical quality of the equipment and the overall acoustic environment in a space purportedly designed, unlike the Casa do Mancha, to showcase music.

The location and physical structure of the Casa do Mancha embodies this desire for a different type of space, and in fact helps create the intimate sociality and approach to music with which the house is associated. The Casa is located inconspicuously towards the opening of a small one-way street which is only one block long, between Fradique Coutinho and Fidalga streets in the heart of Vila Madalena, a sub-district of the Pinheiros neighborhood. In the 1970s, Vila Madalena began transforming from a working class area filled with one-story houses to a

[93] This is similar to Martín-Barbero's 2001[1987]) notion of the "unrepresented popular," cultural expression which is socially accepted but has escaped political interpolation (28). While Martín Barbero formulates his notion around the idea of *lo popular*, the social classes whose cultural production and consumption has been considered bad taste and was historically unrepresented in elite media (Ramos 1989), in the case of indie in Brazil in relation to cultural funding, the situation is nearly reversed: the political context of the last decade, the PT (Workers Party) has sought to incorporate precisely "the unrepresented popular" through national channels of state support. This combines with a legacy of complete dominance of mass representational spaces by the elite (Schwarz 2004). Both these official elite and state forms of mediation are rejected by this particular indie network.

bohemian enclave and then a vibrant, if still comparatively bohemian, bar and boutique shop district (Oliveira 2002). Today the region hosts several large bars that fill to the brim on nights and weekends, where people gather to watch soccer matches, drink, and have a night out that doesn't involve a club, or to gather before clubbing begins. Much of this activity is expensive and decidedly mainstream in a manner associated with an upper-middle class, conservative, social type known as a *coxinha*.[94]

The Casa do Mancha, in contrast, stylistically brings together the older hip and hippie aspect of the neighborhood with the significant elements of working class business that remain. Sitting just one story, the façade comprises concrete covered in colorful spray-painted street art, which frames a portion made of corrugated aluminum, out of which sits a small door, the handle like that of a backyard tool shed. When people are in the house, the door is rarely locked. There is no sign, and there is no bell. It is always easy to spot first-time goers arriving (or trying to arrive) at the Casa do Mancha: they are confused about the Casa's exact whereabouts, and likewise do not know that entrance simply requires opening the door. Until January, 2012, visitors entered by stepping over the threshold into a shallow pool of large-grained gravel, flanked on either side by a concrete floor leading, on the left, to an area full of couches and chairs, and to the right, the bar. The gravel area is completely open to the sky.

Immediately inside the door on the left-hand side, on show days, stands or sits a person who asks, if he or she doesn't already know it, your name, to be written in magic marker at the top of your cardstock paper *comanda*, or purchase card.[95] For nearly a year, beginning in late

[94] Literally "little thigh," a *coxinha* is a common snack made out of chicken meat covered in breading, molded into a tear-drop shape and fried. Politically, *coxinhas* are disengaged, conservative reactionaries.
[95] A *comanda* is a card, now often electronic, used at restaurants and bars as a running tab kept by the patron. Patron purchases are marked on the card and the patron must pay the total, including a cover charge if there is one, before he or she leaves, or pay a hefty fine. In more established clubs, patrons must give their telephone number and present identification to receive a *comanda*.

2011, the person managing the door at the Casa was Filipe Giraknob, who moved to São Paulo from Rio for more work opportunities in music. Filipe would have to ask a friend to substitute for him for an hour or so on the days he performed at the Casa do Mancha with Supercordas, Bonifrate, or another band. It is not uncommon for a small group of friends to intermittently gather near the door to be able to converse with the person taking the *comanda* (and this was especially so in the case of the loquacious and opinionated Filipe); in fact, sometimes friends would show up even after the show had begun or finished simply to say hello to Filipe or socialize with the doorperson.

Even when the doorperson is new, the most typical pattern when entering the Casa do Mancha, for regulars, goes like this: step over the threshold. Receive the *comanda* or greet friends by the door and eventually return your attention to the doorperson for the *comanda*. Converse with friends nearby and greet more people as you make your way to the bar. Greet the bartender or bartenders, usually "Samurai" (Marcelo Cerri), Hugo Pupilo, Filipe Giraknob (after graduating from doorman to bartender), or perhaps even Tomaz Afs, one of the co-owners of the Casa do Mancha as a business enterprise. Converse with the bartenders for a bit and then order your drink. Continue conversing, with them or with other friends who have made their way to the bar, while you sip your Skol, Heineken or Stella Artois beer, or wait for the bartender to prepare one of the Casa's original, comparably low-priced drinks, typically featuring cachaça, rum, vodka and mixes of fresh blended or squeezed tropical fruits and other herbs (featuring pineapple juice, lime, ginger and mint). On full nights, even someone as relatively new to this corner of independent production in São Paulo, such as myself, might greet and chat with ten or twenty friends and acquaintances, spotting and saying hello, again, to regulars who've been seen around have probably been met before. These are musicians, artists, designers and show producers,

many of whom themselves participate in building independent music by setting up themed-DJ nights at other clubs and music spaces.

One of these other indie spaces is a club called Neu, in the Água Branca region northwest of downtown, a relatively short distance from Mancha's. Neu is owned and operated by two São Paulo indie stalwarts: Dago Donato, a DJ who performs internationally and is the manager of one of São Paulo's best-known indie bands, called Holger, and Gui Barrella, who edited indie records under his own label Peligro around the turn of the century. Dago and Gui ran early-2000s parties, also called Peligro, which showcased many artists currently widely recognized in São Paulo indie worlds, like CSS and Lulina. They eventually transformed these parties, originally held at other sites, into the formal club Neu, which continues to book emerging bands and artists from around Brazil and beyond. Thursdays, Neu seeks to maintain the early Peligro-type atmosphere. It is also the day of the week Gonzo co-hosts a monthly "throw-back" party oriented around '90s indie bands. Attendance at the Casa do Mancha is frequently the warm-up to later parties at places like Neu, and people like Dago, who have had a hand in the organization of São Paulo indie production for more than a decade or are themselves musicians, also frequent the Casa. In both Neu and the Casa do Mancha, music is constantly discussed: whether Caetano Veloso or Jorge Ben is Brazil's best artist, the treatment of a band at a particular venue, the absurdities of certain mass artists, new releases by bands both Brazilian and foreign. The music played on the soundtrack is a mix of these same sounds, often curated and managed by a friend of the house.

Officially, the Casa do Mancha opens at 6pm and the show begins at 8pm. In practice, regulars really show up closer to 8pm, knowing that the show won't begin until 8:30pm or 9:00pm, unless there are two bands on the bill. Shows take place on the weekend, usually Saturday and Sunday but sometimes Friday or even Thursday shows will take place. The Casa do

Mancha does not have permits to operate as a venue or club, such that Mancha and Tom are always careful to make sure the live sound ends by 10pm, and that the house clears out by 11pm, to minimize noise complaints by neighbors and keep the police at bay. Regulars, however, as personal friends of those working at the Casa do Mancha and often (by default) of the performing musicians as well, often stick around after the house officially closes. Often times these are musicians who use the Casa do Mancha during the day as a recording studio or rehearsal space; in addition to Bonifrate and Supercordas, three bands recorded at the Casa do Mancha during my fieldwork period: Holger, Stela Campos, and Some Community. With all the time these bands spend at the Casa do Mancha and therefore also with its workers, Mancha's house became their house as well. Even on days when no band performs, the Casa do Mancha often serves as a gathering spot for having a drink and socializing before going out to a show in another area. Sometimes the gathering never even leaves the house, everyone choosing a more intimate relation over a larger, sweatier, more expensive party. This is where stories are traded. This is where musical merit, history, and tastes are, if not decided, at least debated. This is the particular, small universe of indie to which Rodrigo Sommer once referred while at the Casa do Mancha. And the Casa do Mancha contributes to the production of this small universe through both its physical aspects as well as the social atmosphere cultivated there.

The feel of the Casa do Mancha arises partially from Mancha's own biography, the way he has brought relations developed within his family to articulate with others in São Paulo working on projects to make and produce music. As Mancha described, these projects were not developed intentionally with the idea of forming a public space for live music, but rather arose out of what Mancha described as a "natural" process, that is, from his own interest in gathering friends, playing music, and providing spaces for the unfolding of musical creation as a social

activity. Mancha grew up in the extreme interior of São Paulo state, in a small town close to the state border of rural Matto Grosso do Sul. His father was an extremely social and open person, such that Mancha's house served as a type of gathering place first for family friends, and later as the "general barracks" for Mancha and his siblings' groups of friends as well. Already a drummer as a teenager, Mancha would rehearse here with his band and listen to music, creating small parties among his friends. As was true then and is still true for much independent production even in São Paulo and beyond, "the people who want to listen to that and mobilize [*movimentar*] that are the people who have to do it. There is no public.... You gather ten friends and have a party for ten people who are the ten that created the party. That's what it is… it's not to get others to come [*chamar uma galera*]. We did it for ourselves" (Mancha Leonel, interview, Decebmer 9th, 2011).

When Mancha moved to São Paulo for college, he and two friends from other cities (Rio and Porto Alegre) who had also moved to the São Paulo West Zone (Pinheiros, Perdizes), combined their music production equipment to make a home studio, taking on small composition, recording and mastering projects. Mancha was frequently working as the sound engineer for performances at small bars and venues in the bohemian Augusta-Consolação region closer to downtown. This included working for the Folk This Town series run by Rodrigo, Gonzo and Adriano. After one such performance, the Folk producers helped Mancha move some of the backline and PA equipment into his new residence and remarked on the great potential of the space to produce just such intimate shows. Soon, Mancha started inviting people over on the weekends, to have a *churrasco* (barbecue), drink some beer, and *fazer um som*, literally, make a sound.

Fazer um som is a phrase commonly heard around the Casa do Mancha and uttered by the musicians who frequent it. As opposed to "play some music" or "make some music," *fazer um som* brings an air of casualness to the activity of sound making, at once drawing attention to the play with and in the sonic as a pleasurable activity elaborated by and for other people with whom one partakes in making sound, and by extension, in listening to others make sound. This is exactly the type of atmosphere fostered at the first gatherings at the Casa do Mancha, comprising some ten or fifteen people, friends, who would get together to make a sound and socialize. "And that was it" (Mancha Leonel, December 9th, 2011). This is also the type of atmosphere that continues to prevail at Mancha's house, even though it ceased to be Mancha's actual residence in early 2012. Mancha's explanation of the evolution of the house is pertinent here, for it expresses the way many regulars feel about the house, which impels them to spend so much time there. Mancha related that his house became the Casa do Mancha because these smaller, earlier, informal parties

> started becoming frequent. And kind of went gaining adepts…. I wouldn't know how to say why people started to like the things we were doing.[96] But if I were to risk a guess, I think it's because the thing is extremely honest and sincere, you know. Everyone comes in, sees what we're doing, understands, and I don't know, understands that shit, we're doing what we're able to do because we have to in a way that's cool for us, for who's playing, for who's coming. It's basically that. If as a consequence we're going to earn money or if we're going to, I don't know, become a trend or if people are going to talk about this in fifteen years, saying that it was the beginning of movement that later was unleashed and the recording industry, fuck that. We were never like, oh, ' let's do it in this way to achieve that,' it was always something to enjoy the process itself, to

[96] Mancha added here that he doesn't even want to know.

> understand all that process of artistic and musical creation and place that, to circulate what we're thinking outside…. And I think that ended up attracting through people, people were coming here for a completely carefree [*descompromissada*] party and in a little cute house to have a beer and listen to some tunes [*ouvir um som*, literally hear a sound] and that was really cool. It really contrasts with the hyper-planned out productions that the city has, you know…wherever you go, which is so awesome, beautiful, except you go in and automatically see that everything was thought out to conquer you. I think that makes a goddamn difference [*uma puta diferença*]. I don't know what the public is like in those places, but our public which comes here, in a certain sense, consumes what we do, appreciates what we do, likes what we do, becomes involved with what we produce, they're not stupid (Mancha Leonel, December 9th, 2011).

The Casa, of course, has been through several reforms, both physically and in terms of operation. The couch that normally sat in the living room during the day was moved permanently into the covered outside space sometime in 2011, helping transform the living room into a space forever reader for recording or performance. In early 2012, the sunken gravel area into which you stepped immediately upon entering was replaced with a wooden deck-like structure that smoothly connects the surrounding concrete floor on either side of it—on one side the bar, on the other the space with couches and chairs—as well as forms a level pathway into the area that serves as the performance space, the former living room. Around this time the portion of the living/performance room that served as the soundboard during shows and the permanent studio production space, enclosed by a chest-height wooden wall, was dismantled and moved into the room that once served as Mancha's bedroom. Now the latter room is for instrument storage and serves as the greenroom for performing bands. Drink prices for mixed drinks have increased a

few *reals*, though they are still very cheap compared to other bars and venues, especially for their quality. In early 2014, the Casa do Mancha converted from a cash-only space to a place with debit card services. These changes are continuous with the way Mancha and Tom have sought to make the Casa do Mancha financially stable, especially after Mancha decided to quit his full-time, outside job to dedicate himself to the project in 2012.

In addition to renting the space to bands for album recording and production, Mancha and Tom have sought to expand their activities *as* the Casa do Mancha into larger networks of musical production. This includes accepting partnerships with brands and marketing research companies and with other producers in the city catering to foreign bands, such as Beco 203's in-house booking agent. The Casa do Mancha team even sought to develop in an outside festival in 2012, but which so far has proven fruitless. One of the big issues with the festival was finding an adequate space—one bigger than the Casa do Mancha itself, but, as Tom said, "not so big that people we don't like come" (field notes, February 5th, 2012). This is the same attitude expressed by Mancha, both in tactics for the diffusion of events at the Casa do Mancha, and explicitly when asked about how to maintain control of the space as it became more and more talked about as a hip underground music venue in various larger media outlets.

Mancha promotes events exclusively through Facebook, though sometimes a larger outlet will pick up the event, such as the Folha Guide, an insert in the major paper *A Folha de São Paulo* listing the city's cultural events, printed on Fridays and updated Mondays online.[97] Bands, of course, may publicize their performances how they wish, though this is usually done by spreading the event created by the official Casa do Mancha Facebook page. The Casa do Mancha uses this Facebook page to create and publicize events for the weekend sometime earlier in the same week. For very well-known bands the Facebook invitations may be announced only

[97] http://guia.folha.uol.com.br/shows/ult10052u934657.shtml

Thursday or Friday, that is just day or two before the show or even on the day of. With special events like foreign bands stopping by the Casa do Mancha while performing at larger venues in the city, the event might be created just hours before it takes place or not at all, instead spread by word of mouth. The restriction on event promotion helps keep the spread of the event limited to the most immediate social infrastructures, with friends of Mancha, Tom, and the other Casa do Mancha workers often the first to know of an event, sometimes even before it is announced on Facebook.

This limiting of social infrastructure arises both from a desire on Mancha's part to create an environment full of "people we like," but also from the material properties of the house itself, which invite and facilitate social associations precisely because they elide the formalisms of many other aspects of São Paulo nightlife. First, the Casa do Mancha is literally a house, once an actual residence. It lacks security guards, until recently had no credit card capability, is acoustically subdued (in contrast to the deafening volumes of most São Paulo clubs), and spatially restricted, allowing for a maximum of about one hundred people, which packs the house tight. Even on completely full nights, it would be entirely feasible to meet and talk with every single person in the space. These qualities all facilitate the construction of social intimacies, which in turn manifest in the large contingent of regulars that frequent the space, lending continuity to the Casa and endowing it with such strong feelings of love and camaraderie. These qualities themselves can then become indexed to the music performed at the Casa, such as Bonifrate's in the many times he performed there in 2011-2012. This is the same type of experience noted by Ochoa (2013) in the production of Colombian champeta music as an aesthetic form intimately associated with parties, called *picós*, such that songs' "aesthetic recognition is not isolated (even if they are sold as part of CDs and constitute specific hits) but is

part of a listening assemblage that carries the mode of recognition of the song in multiple acoustic experiences. The circulation of the production cannot be thought of as separate from the experience of the party" (23). Bonifrate's music, among others, could not be separated from the spaces in which it was deployed, such as the Casa do Mancha, as well as the social infrastructures by which it moved.

Conclusion

Keane (2005) argues that because the qualities of the materials to which semiotic ideologies necessarily become bundled— signs must be expressed through matter— historical connections arise between meanings and the material world through which meanings operate and together with which they are experienced and understood (194). In the case of *indie,* as conveyed by my interlocutors in this chapter, the social infrastructure created by trading particular sounds became bundled with those sounds themselves, thus also bundling with and putting into practice the historical ideologies of indie of as social, intimate, and DIY as they were developed in the '80s and '90s in the north. These ideals and practices, including the sonic quality of the sounds produced in relation to them, help animate the desire to construct the Casa do Mancha as it is, and for individuals to engage in social relationships through sound in the "sincere" way described here. The Casa do Mancha itself also serves to rearticulate this historical relation of socio-musical intimacy, bringing historical modes of social relation together with particular sonic qualities of the performing musicians and reproduced records in current time.

My point is thus to highlight the historical role of musical sound itself as an infrastructure that allows for the building of practices of sociability, spaces for social interaction, and practices of media circulation. Infrastructures are "things and also the relation between things" (Larkin

2013:329). Here sound as matter enables the movement of other matter and forges historical relations between sound, media, space, and people. My emphasis on the relation between media of transmission and musical circulation is thus different from narratives of cultural transmission through media circulation: while media circulation and social networks mediated the sounds of '90s bands that Bonifrate would come to like, for example, it was the sonic material that drew him in, that matter resounding from records resonated with him in his body and contributed to the particularities of the sonic matter he would produce himself, such as the song *Eugênia*. Importantly, these sounds would also draw others, like myself, to listen individually, to share through social media, and to engage with live in the co-presence of others at performances. This material thus impelled the movement of people. Songs like *Eugênia* did not produce this movement on their own, of course; they required spaces like the Casa do Mancha, whose managers and regulars recognized the material, partially through their prior social relationships with Pedro, but also through their own historical engagement with sounds resembling those Pedro produced, allowing these producers to recognize and value Pedro's music and feel it as part of their own socio-musical worlds. Thus, the social relationships that would allow Pedro to circulate were themselves maintained because of the musical infrastructures historically formed through engagement with music like Pedro's music.

Like any of the Santiago venues cited in chapter 2, the Casa do Mancha has had to contend with opening its space to different types of acts in order to maintain itself financially. Who shows up to the Casa do Mancha, as Aldo insisted in chapter 2, is also partially determined by the performing band, and sometimes weighed against other events occurring on the same night. But this is precisely the point. The regulars at the Casa do Mancha attended certain shows owing to the way they could relate to each other through a mode of relating to sound. This is the

same way that Régis, Pedro, and Filipe met each other and became friends, through exchanging musical ideas with each other and utilizing various media at their disposal to do so: from magazines to CDs to the internet to face-to-face conversation with each other, and after forming a band, through musical performance. These individuals elaborated their sociality around particular sounds and a particular history of engagement with them, and carried these practices forward in present time in spaces like the Casa do Mancha, where they evolved and expanded to more associations with people interested in relating in the same ways, such as myself. It was for these reasons I learned to listen to Bonifrate's song *Eugênia*.

Of course, part of my coming to understand and enjoy *Eugênia* certainly derives from my curiosity and persistence, as an ethnomusicologist conducting field research, to understand the social and aesthetic world in which a small line of people, who gather regularly at the Casa do Mancha, would sing along with Bonifrate's songs, one pushing a fist in the air, at a performance at a completely different venue. As I came, through conversation and through listening, to understand the history of sonic engagement of individuals such as Pedro and Filipe, as well as to listen to the bands most valued by them, I myself developed the feelings of intimacy and connection in a group of friends interested in relating to music in what Mancha termed a "sincere way." It would not be hard to make the argument that these individuals are performing social distinction through musical consumption and spatial enclaving, proclaiming their tastes to be better informed than the vast majority of Brazilians around them who largely consume *sertanejo universitário*,[98] various forms of MPB, and funk.

[98] Literally "college country," a form of country-pop derived from sertanejo music practices in rural areas of São Paulo, Minas Gerais and Matto Grosso states (see Dent 2009). Sertanejo universitário is an extremely popular musical form among the middle class in Brazil's southeast, producing such national hits as Michel Teló's 2011 "Ai Se Eu Te Pego."

But what I have tried to emphasize in this chapter is the orientation towards sound that arrives through historical engagement with music; this necessarily includes certain ideologies, such as the EuroAmerican DIY ethos of the ’90s to which people like Rodrigo Lariú would find affinity, prompting him to start his own zine, radio show and record label. These semiotic ideologies cannot be unbundled from the sounds in which they come attached (cf Keane 2005), nor the media by which those sounds travel, nor the social practices of circulating and engaging these materials. And these sounds would become the infrastructural element that helped bring spaces like the Casa do Mancha into being, just as the Casa do Mancha would itself serve as an infrastructural element for the making of and continuation of these small universes of indie activity. Small universes are made through music and musical experience, the indexing of the qualities of social interaction to the material qualities of sound to their historic semiotic ideologies which have emerged through practices of media circulation partially formed through social infrastructures themselves. These sounds thus become linked historically as *material* to the building of friendships through musical recognition, the building of musical recognition through friendships, and the building, reinforcement and maintenance of both now through social media.

Chapter 4

Fora do Eixo:
Contested Infrastructures of Valuation, Representation, and Remuneration

> How is it that a network logic, that the internet represents, doesn't transform into a new economic logic within the age of information"
>
> -Bruno Torturra[xii]

> Each real that enters there multiplies itself into fifteen, twenty, twenty-five, because there are many people, many making that happen.
>
> -Pablo Capilé[xiii]

> Today there are more than 30,000 artists in Brazil that are able to live off their music from this circulation.
>
> -Pablo Capilé[xiv]

> … although the "globalists" operate within the dominant ideology of our time, they defend their positions as if they were being hunted down, or as if they were part of the heroic vanguard, aesthetic or libertarian… they line up with the authorities in the manner of one who is starting a revolution.
>
> -Roberto Schwarz[xv]

On December 14th, 2011, thirteen independent music festivals collectively dissociated from Abrafin, the Brazilian Independent Festival Association. The act took place during an Abrafin meeting at the national conference of Fora do Eixo, the network of semi-autonomous cultural-political collectives that, according to the dissociating members of Abrafin, had taken over the association and imposed its own modus operandi for political ends. "The fact that this Abrafin meeting is taking place within a Fora do Eixo Conference," the dissociating festivals wrote in their manifesto, "is irrefutable proof of this takeover" (in Bragatto 2011). Other festivals had independently left Abrafin earlier in the year, after Talles Lopes, a Fora do Eixo leader from the state of Minas Gerais, assumed the presidency in January, and even more Abrafin festivals joined the dissenters after the dissociation of "the 13" was formalized. Several months after the end of the Fora do Eixo conference, Abrafin ceased to exist completely, becoming instead the

Rede Brasil de Festivais, articulated predominantly by collectives within the Fora do Eixo network.

Abrafin was formed at the end of 2005 as a network of independent festivals, primarily of (rock) music, which rapidly transformed into a festival circuit for the circulation of new, independent rock bands throughout Brazil. The association had been founded by several already established independent music festivals as a place for the exchange of information, technology and experience around festival production, as well as for the creation of a network of artists from which the festival producers could draw (Gustavo Sá, interview, January 9th, 2012). For its part, Fora do Eixo, meaning "Outside the Axis," emerged at the turn of 2005-06 as a "circuit" of band exchanges among cultural collectives located in the cities of Cuiabá, Rio Branco, Uberlândia and Londrina, all of which lie in Brazil's "interior," that is, away from the coast or otherwise disconnected from the principal, southeastern "axes" of cultural and political power, centralized in the cities of São Paulo and Rio de Janeiro. Fora do Eixo initially sought to decenter the power of these axes and democratize the capacity for cultural production and political critique in the country as a whole. From 2006 to 2011, Fora do Eixo grew exponentially, from four founding collectives to nearly one-hundred, in addition to forming partnerships [*parcerias*] with other private and state institutions. Festivals produced by the multiplying Fora do Eixo collectives, meanwhile, became affiliates of Abrafin, soon outnumbering Abrafin member-festivals produced independently of Fora do Eixo. According to Gustavo Sá, founder of Brasília's Porão do Rock festival, an original Abrafin festival, "what Fora do Eixo did was a predatory action within Abrafin. It filled Abrafin with thousands of festivals… so that when we went to vote, to define things within Abrafin, they, with more votes, would win. All of them. And when we woke up to that it was too late" (Gustavo Sá, interview, January 9th, 2012). The dissolution of Abrafin at a

Fora do Eixo conference brought the association of the two entities to a poignant, if bitter, close, for Fora do Eixo and Abrafin were formally founded alongside each other at the Goiânia Noise music festival in 2006, and Abrafin's presidency was once held by Fora do Eixo's de-facto leader, Pablo Capilé.

This chapter details the emergence, growth and evolution of Fora do Eixo to examine the relationship between the production of aesthetic value, monetary value and structures of cultural mediation as a political struggle, not only in the wake of vast changes to technological capabilities of communication in the 21st-century, but also in relation to the Brazilian government's unique cultural policies oriented around these new capabilities. These policies link a formal political drive for democratic social inclusion through equal means of national artistic participation with the mode of mediating the public and the private characteristic of contemporary neoliberalism, in which private or semi-private resources serve as a major source of public cultural funding. Fora do Eixo, in particular, has enacted and articulated neoliberal principles of organizing labor as life in an extremely clear way (cf Lazzaratto 2012; 2004). I detail the expansion of the network through the labor of participants and the way in which it manages and accrues resources through a capital accumulation method called *card*, the deployment of which hinges on the politics of aesthetic valuation. Card is a complementary currency invented by Fora do Eixo to help redistribute resources throughout the network, making it stronger and better able to bring about the type of cultural democracy valued in the formal political arena of the Worker's Party (PT). However, an examination of Fora do Eixo's practices of valuation in cards, real currency, and media visibility highlights the nature of card as a technique for mediating aesthetic value produced by laboring musicians. This practice feeds into a larger system of resource accrual and allocation based upon Fora do Eixo's use of

representation in social media to position itself as a key cultural protagonist within the Brazilian political and arts funding environment.

Fora do Eixo's main claim with respect to music is that through its tactics of capturing resources and modes of redistributing them via card, it has constructed an alternate model for musical production, circulation and financing, one based on the inherent "do-it-together" logic of digital technologies, particularly those of internet-mediated social sharing. However, my own experiences working at the Fora do Eixo headquarters in São Paulo, attending Fora do Eixo events and talking with members of other Fora do Eixo collectives, and listening to the experiences of invidivudals working in independent music in Brazil and beyond, indicate that Fora do Eixo does not present a new mode of financing and producing music, but rather serves as an example of two global trends surrounding the organization of labor, its relation to representation in media and the use of culture as an expedient in late capitalism. Fora do Eixo does not use culture as a resource in the sense of performing a particular social, ethnic, or cultural identity, what Yúdice (2003) identifies as one of the ways by which culture becomes a form of governance. Rather, Fora do Eixo argues for itself as the solution precisely to the difficulties artists face in harnessing economic resources through their desire to engage with art and to construct and maintain social relations around mutual affinities for music and the artists who make it (Ochoa 2013). At the same time, Fora do Eixo asks musicians to invest their labor in the Fora do Eixo network infrastructure in order to build and strengthen the infrastructure itself, while simultaneously using the labor invested by bands to show to sponsors and the Brazilian government "how much" culture Fora do Eixo produces. Indeed, Fora do Eixo argues that it itself invests in Brazilian culture by building and maintaining its own infrastructure of circulation. So, while Fora do Eixo does indeed produce events, it uses the representation of this

production to gain resources, without then feeding these resources back into structures for bands, taking them instead for its own political aims.

This chapter is divided into two main thrusts. I first concentrate on the logic of card as a mechanism for resource accumulation, which is itself based the notion of musical aesthetics as able to speak their own value. Drawing on anthropological work examining the assignation of price as a measure of value, I show how the use of card reveals contradicting notions about the nature of aesthetic value within a system of musical production in which aesthetic values, media representation and modes of circulation are simultaneously produced together. I argue that Fora do Eixo exploits these contradictions to use musical labor as a vehicle for its own capital accumulation within a funding environment highly mediated by the state. I then detail Fora do Eixo's strategic deployment of social media and branded modes of representation to become a protagonist within this political milieu, which values the use of digital technologies to radicalize 20th-century modes of cultural organization and economic distribution. Rather than culture as a means for gaining resources, then, Fora do Eixo highlights the role of cultural infrastructures themselves as resources (Yúdice 2003). Yet unlike the social infrastructures discussed in chapters 2 and 3, Fora do Eixo acts as a rigidly articulated institutional body, and thus can better articulate itself with outside structures of finance. Because this financing derives primarily from the state, Fora do Eixo brings the act of aesthetic valuation as an economic enterprise into tense debates about the public good and the role of the arts in building a democratic society.

Fora do Eixo in Historical and Political Context

Both Abrafin and Fora do Eixo arose and became formalized as entities during a time when a new cultural and political atmosphere began forming in Brazil, roughly between 2004-

2006, the early years of the administration of President Luis Inácio "Lula" da Silva (2003-2010). This period was characterized by an ethos which celebrated new modes of production and participation offered by the internet and other digital technologies to rectify the historical exclusion of social classes from national cultural and political representation and participation (Carvalho and Cabral 2011). This, in turn, is nested within the mode of citizen participation in government decision-making fostered by Lula, who shifted the way everyday Brazilians conceived of their role in the political process (French and Fortes 2012) by encouraging them to become protagonists in national development and in the construction of their lives (Holston 2008; Rolnik 2011:240). This would be achieved by making the political everyday "in both its material and symbolic dimensions" (French and Fortes 2012:22), via participation in organizations that could exert pressure on congress (French and Fortes 2012:25; Rolnik 2011).

This vision was enacted by the Ministry of Culture (Minc), under the leadership of musical and cultural icon Gilberto Gil (2003-2008), and continued by his successor Juca Ferreira (2008-2010), through a radical approach to the cultural meaning and uses of digital technologies, and an assumption about their inherent capacities to bring about the national, participatory inclusion envisioned by the Lula administration. While Minc initiatives, like the adoption of open source software across the federal government and the ratification and encouraged use of Creative Commons licenses (Costa 2011:9), reflect a belief about the inherently democratic nature of digital platforms (Kreiss, Finn, and Turner 2010) the Minc also sought to create and support institutions that would provide the structural frameworks through which to access and exploit these new technologies, and thus foster the free exchange of information and culture, and ultimately, produce democracy (Freire, Foina, and Fonseca 2006; Rubim 2008). The most significant of these initiatives is the Cultura Viva program, the base of which, Pontos de Cultura

(Cultural Points), is still functioning (Pontos de Cultura n.d.). This program aids already extant organizations working in areas of historical social exclusion with financial resources and digital studios for the "strengthening of a culture of networks" (Costa 2011:5). Funding for the pontos comes from all levels of government and partnerships with private institutions are also encouraged (Pontos de Cultura n.d). Pontos, connected to each other and to outside organizations in the form of a network, serve as nodes for the articulation of the other arms that make up Cultura Viva, one of which is Digital Culture (Cultura Viva n.d.).

Spending on cultural projects also increased tremendously under Gil-Ferreira, both in terms of the ministry's budget, as well as through the administration of private-sector funds, broadly termed "incentive laws," in which private companies fund ministry-approved cultural projects in lieu of paying a particular tax, whether federal, state, or municipal (Rubim 2008:197). Petrobrás, the semi state-owned oil company, has become the largest investor in cultural programs in Brazil partially through such laws (Petrobrás Cultural n.d.), and has supported a significant number of Abrafin music festivals, some of which have been Fora do Eixo festivals. Fora do Eixo has also separately received direct Petrobrás benefits for the project as a whole (Cláudio Jorge, interview, February 14th, 2012). According to both the Abrafin dissociation manifesto, as well as to observers siding with Fora do Eixo's side of the story, a main point of contention between the entities has been the use and purpose of this type of public funding for festivals, a resource which necessarily implies some amount of "politicking" [*politicagem*] between festival producers and the bureaucratic process of allocating resources, a tricky subject in Brazil owing to rampant clientalism and frequent money laundering scandals by public officials from all sides of the political spectrum.

While Abrafin had become a prominent and exciting space for the country's independent rock/pop music production in the years following its founding, by 2008 it was also deflecting public criticism from musicians and others involved in music for having become a *panelinha*, or clique, where only producers and bands from within the association played the festivals, and worse, that despite the festivals' receiving public funding from Petrobrás, the bands received little or no *cachê* (performance fee) (Alves 2008). Not paying bands for performance, even when forms of state and private funding have been secured, has in fact been a central tenet of Fora do Eixo's philosophy of strengthening music through collective structures of production; this position is best illustrated by the use of cachê earned by Fora do Eixo bands—bands comprised of Fora do Eixo members. Cachê earned by Fora do Eixo bands from performances not organized by the network is used to finance general Fora do Eixo endeavors, rather than first serving any immediate band needs. [99] While recently Fora do Eixo has argued that it always pays cachê whenever financial conditions allow it to do so, the network's leader Pablo Capilé openly and publicly defended non-payment through at least 2010, when he was then simultaneously co-president of Abrafin, proclaiming to be "a defender within Abrafin that you shouldn't pay bands cachê. A festival is an exhibition" (Morais 2010). Perhaps owing to Pablo's Abrafin co-presidency and to the proliferation of Fora do Eixo festivals within the association, criticism of both entities, especially around the issue of public financing and payment of cachê, usually arose together, perhaps affirming the statement in the Abrafin dissociation manifesto that **"**the public, obviously, has been incapable of differentiating between Abrafin and Fora do Eixo" (Bragatto 2011).

[99] Bruno Kayapy, who participated in Fora do Eixo as a member of the Fora do Eixo band Macaco Bong, confirmed in 2013 that neither he nor any other members of the band ever received money for their Macaco Bong performances; all cachê went to the central Fora do Eixo *bank* (Bragatto 2013). As will be explained further in the chapter, Macaco Bong was key to the building of Fora do Eixo and to its public representation as a new and sucessful form of cultural organization.

By 2010, this emerging debate over the relationship between aesthetic value, structures of circulation and visibility, and forms of finance had become quite heated in online forums and face-to-face events alike.[100] At this time, when I first became familiar with Fora do Eixo, the network had not yet established a full collective in São Paulo, though it did have partners working in the city out of a recording studio in the Perdizes neighborhood, and had produced a Fora do Eixo festival in São Paulo earlier that year. The participants in independent music production I met in São Paulo, at that time, articulated the most stable criticisms of Fora do Eixo that had circulated at least since 2008, and which continued throughout my fieldwork in 2011 and 2012. While Abrafin was sometimes considered in the debate, Fora do Eixo took the bulk of the criticism. One complaint was that bands critical of Fora do Eixo or unwilling to accept its conditions of performance and (non) payment were subsequently shut-out of any further opportunities to perform at Fora do Eixo or Abrafin-affiliated festivals.

Another predominant criticism was that Fora do Eixo bands, to be blunt, "sucked." Evidence of the poor aesthetic quality was often argued through the observation that despite its half-decade of ardent work to bolster independent music in Brazil, the network had only managed to elevate one Fora do Eixo band, Macaco Bong, to national recognition.[101] Macaco

[100] The best written archive of this tension is the debate occurring on a post by the established Musician João Parahyba on the music blog **Scream & Yell**. Over just a few days, the post generated more than 500 comments by musicians and cultural producers both new and old, and gave way to two face-to-face debates in São Paulo the following month (http://screamyell.com.br/site/2010/04/13/carta-aos-musicos-e-artistas/). I first became informed about this polemic at the second of these debates, at Stúdio SP on May 31st, 2010. It was very poorly attended, perhaps owing to the previous debate or perhaps because, as I would come to find in my later fieldwork, many people were very tired of the same points espoused by Fora do Eixo, with little will to change. I experienced this myself after conducting fieldwork with Fora do Eixo formally in 2011 and 2012; it became clear to me after some time that debates had much less to do with developing ideas than of positioning certain figures as "those who debate, take action, and are planning the future" with respect to music, digital technologies and the occupation of the public sphere, among other issues.

[101] Vanguart is another band sometimes cited as having become (relatively) popular owing to Fora do Eixo, and like Macaco Bong is from Cuiabá. But the band's wider recognition came primarily after it

Bong is central to the Fora do Eixo story. As will be further detailed, Macaco Bong sought to become symobolically isomorphic with Fora do Eixo's philosophies of music production and to spread the philosophies and practices of Fora do Eixo along with its own name. Critics charged that both "organic" Fora do Eixo bands like Macaco Bong as well as others that partnered with Fora do Eixo were not given performance opportunities based on the aesthetic merits of their sound, but because they were part of a large clique that included festival producers and/or were willing to pay to play and endure poor housing and performance conditions, buying the line, as ingenuous young musicians willing to do anything to make it, that investing in performance at the festivals for no cachê or at an overall financial loss despite the festivals' public financing would help earn them an audience and thus service their careers.

The criticism surrounding aesthetic quality directly relates to the criticism of what two journalists called a "state indie" [*indie estatal*] music environment— where Abrafin and Fora do Eixo were using public funding to create a music scene that otherwise would not exist (Ney 2010; Pereira Jr. 2010a; 2010b), but which was succeeding in moving bands around Brazil *artificially* thanks to successful political mobilization for state financial support.[102] As journalist Álvaro Pereira Júnior, a proud critic of Fora do Eixo argued, the new structures of state funding for festivals were creating an environment in which "you don't need fans. You need the government" (Pereira Junior 2010a). To come full circle in what, as will become clear throughout this chapter, is often a circular debate, such government support was needed precisely because the bands were poor quality, and couldn't gather a public on their own. Moreover, because Fora do Eixo didn't pay cachê, producers in this vision were exploiting young new

---

moved to São Paulo and sought to publically distance itself from Fora do Eixo, largely over the issue of band non-payment.

[102] I return to the question of "true" and "false" modes of circulation in the conclusion.

bands to form a mafia-like platform for the capture of the new public funding for such initiatives. Abrafin's 2011 dissenting manifesto stated as much:

> Abrafin is an entity that gathers together [*congrega*] and binds [*aglutina*] independent festivals throughout the country. The reason for being of each of its affiliates is to convert itself into a platform for the new Brazilian musical expression…. To establish a sole and exclusionary group of artists which are always the same circulate artificially through all the festivals is to attack Abrafin's own reason for being…. Being a launch point in the effective construction of a sustainable independent middle market is one of Abrafin's pillars. This construction happens, necessarily, through the support of the progressive public sector. In this route, the use of public funds should be strategic and oriented towards the construction, in mid- and long-terms, of this same market. Unfortunately, what's been seen is an Abrafin which more and more views public resources as an ends and not a means…. Abrafin's political action is given by the transformative and progressive character of art and culture themselves. Abrafin should be at the service, only and exclusively, of its affiliates and the chain of production that surrounds it (Bragatto 2011).

Both Abrafin and Fora do Eixo have argued that building infrastructures for musical production and circulation, especially in a historical context in which resources have been scarce and audiences have been scant, requires state support to make production minimally financially viable. However, Abrafin, echoing criticisms even of itself over the years, here argues that Fora do Eixo has moved away from interest in supporting musical produciton to strengthening and reproducing its own institutional insterests and political powers. In between these two poles—state support as a spark to ignite a new industry, versus the appropriation of state funds for

political, not artistic ends— lies the central question of the relation between aesthetics, politics, and economy. At stake is the politics of negotiating the relationship between the valuation of aesthetics as an economic practice and the structures through which aesthetic objects circulate and accrue both social and material value. In other words, the debate surrounding Fora do Eixo shows that economy and infrastructure cannot be reduced to aesthetic questions or political questions, but rather, the production of both aesthetics and economy are both a type of politics. This is a politics based on the problem of how music should circulate and for what ends, the difference between labor as experience and labor as livihood, and means of creating and distributing resources.

The Impact of Fora do Eixo and Its Politics of Representation

Evaluating and understanding Fora do Eixo's functioning and impact in music has proven very difficult, both for myself as well as for many others who have participated in or observed Fora do Eixo over the years, whether musicians, journalists, political critics or academics. One of the difficulties arises from differences between how the network presents itself and how it effectively operates. For anyone with left-oriented politics, Fora do Eixo offers an extremely appealing rhetoric of radical social transformation based non-hiearchical, democratically-driven alternatives for dealing with major contemporary issues, from the organization of cultural production to ecological initiatives to the "hacking" of government agencies by social justice-oriented social movements of various stripes. Fora do Eixo even presents this vision in pseudo-academic and open source activist jargon, calling its structure "rhizomatic" and based on an "open source software code." In terms of actual functioning, however, the network is designed less as a network and more as a pyramid. This is evidenced

partially by the structuring of Fora do Eixo into various levels of hiearchicy, "testing" members'commitment to the network, and even social-psychological techniques to pressure members to conform to sanctioned behavior.

At the same time, the dozens of network collectives are also somewhat autonomous; many were cultural collectives before adhering to Fora do Eixo, and internal rifts have emerged as members with more "sway" (*lastro*) within the national organization have sought to preside over and manage affairs in other collectives or overide their concerns.[103] Moreover, significant differences in activity, understanding, and motives for action may appear between the main collectives and newer, smaller, more peripheral ones. For example, I met members of periphal collectives at the 2011 national conference who were extremely energized by the rheotoric of the national leaders and the possibilities of realizing their own desires to alter cultural production and social practices in their home cities by participating in Fora do Eixo. However, these members sometimes did not understand the discourse of network leaders, such as Pablo Capilé's frequent and strange use of semiotics-like jargon such as *simulacrum*, *resignify*, *memify*, and others, a use of langauge which will be later elaborated. From several accounts, smaller collectives in small cities tend to have less political sway; with less importance in the network comes less pressure to conform, thus ignorance of some of the tactics and internal dynamics in other collectives. The large number of collectives and their uneven articulation with each other, as well as the intention and purpose with which many of Fora do Eixo's members approach the

[103] In addition to comments made personally to me by Fora do Eixo members and former Fora do Eixo members, two former members publically elaborated these relation, Laís Bellini, Facebook, August 8th, 2013 (https://www.facebook.com/lcbellini/posts/702021409824865?stream_ref=10), and Alejandro Vargas, August 20th, 2013, https://docs.google.com/document/d/1LApd1iaK7XmKGlhp_aPWUa7kqHVZ9g6wJIqf4t3eM9E/edit?usp=sharing

local initiatives they enact, has resulted in a structure in which nearly two-thousand people ardently labor to bring about crucial social changes in which they beleive, while a handful of network leaders use this effort to build their own capacities for political articulation.

This political structure, of course, is the exact reason for the dissociation of Abrafin festivals and for the critics who have accused Fora do Eixo of exploiting bands. The internal structuring of Fora do Eixo and its political goals became clearer in August, 2013, when Fora do Eixo came under national media scrutiny after the appearance of leader Pablo Capilé and journalist Bruno Torturra on the live television interview-debate program called Roda Viva. The debate was centered around Fora do Eixo's Mídia NINJA project,[104] which came to national prominence for its role in the mass demonstrations relating to public transport and the allocation of public funding for Brazilian citizens, especially in relation to the state's spending on the upcoming mega-events of the World Cup (June and July 2014), and Summer Olympics (2016). Mídia NINJA broadcast these demonstrations via cell phone to Fora do Eixo's "Post-TV" online streaming page. After Pablo and Bruno Torturra appeared on Roda Viva to discuss Mídia NINJA and Fora do Eixo, a wave of denunciations from former members and former collaborators filled social media and traditional media alike. These denunciations, in turn, were rebutted always by passionate defenses by Fora do Eixo members. As has been customary, several of the former participants of Fora do Eixo collectives denouncing the network remained anonymous for fear of retribubtion by leaders and/or because they still have friends within the network.

This public airing of greivances, and the anonymity that sometimes accompanied it, confirmed my own experience with former Fora do Eixo members and with musicians who had worked with the network. While a majority of the non-Fora do Eixo musicians I interviewed

[104] Or NINJA Media. NINJA stands for Independent Narratives Journalism and Action (*Narrativas Independentes Jornalismo e Ação*).

during fieldwork had criticisms—whether mild or severe—of Fora do Eixo, very few gave permission for their comments to be attributed to them publically. Reasons for remaining anonymous revolved around "not wanting a fight [*encrenca*]," or having personally been treated okay, despite overall philosophical problems with the network. Part of this owes to the larger problem, stated earlier, about being shut-out of activities with Fora do Eixo after criticism or inadherence to Fora do Eixo conditions surrounding performance, transport, and payment at events. Notably, however, Bruno Kayapy, guitarist for the iconic Fora do Eixo band Macaco Bong, has now also chimed in publically with the criticism. By 2012, two of Macaco Bong's three original members had already abadoned the band in favor of working for larger Fora do Eixo network objectives. After a dispute about the distribution of a band DVD, Bruno publically criticized the network that had literally brought him up from the time he was fifteen years old, citing, among other offenses, the failure of any Fora do Eixo member to visit him in the hosptial as he fought a serious tumour in his intenstine, and the pressure he faced to keep this illness from public disclosure, in order not to "damage" the symbolic effect of Macaco Bong as a Fora do Eixo project (Bragatto 2013; Stamboroski Jr. and Poutmati 2013). Considering Macaco Bong's importance to building the image of Fora do Eixo as a viable new way of organizing musical production in the country—and Pablo Capilé's constant invocation of Macaco Bong to argue this same point— the significance of Bruno's fallout with the network and his public denunciations cannot be overstated. The public image of Fora do Eixo is crucial to its survival. Thus it emphasizes image, rhetoric, and ideology over intimate social relations, as seen in chapters 2 and 3, building infrastrucures institutionally rather than socially.

For those long involved with independent music production in Brazil, the sudden, public declarations brought a confirmation of prior suspicisions, observations, and experiences, as well

as new elements of intrigue. These included the reveleation of sexist and sexual coercision practices, especially a tactic used to gain influential people as allies called "seduce and coopt" [*catar e cooptar*], as well as the technique of psycho-emotional, group manipulation of members thinking of leaving the network or acting out of line, called "nightmare shock" [*choque pesadelo*]. For those unfamiliar with the network before its debut into the national political spotlight, Fora do Eixo's machine-like mobilization of self-defense may have made more sense than the accusations, which Fora do Eixo framed as a "lynching." Given the alignment of Fora do Eixo rhetoric with leftist politics, Fora do Eixo has easily been able to cast critics as conservative reactionaries, especially given the extremely rightward bent of much of Brazilian mass media, as well as the upper class resentment of the last decade-plus of national policies of social and economic inclusion set by the Worker's Party. By the same token, the right has very easily been able to cast Fora do Eixo as the product of a corrupt, money-laundering leftist state, one where policies for social change, especially those aimed at the poor, are crassly used for political gain. Fora do Eixo has often capitalized on this confusion— that, as Fora do Eixo says, the left thinks they're capitalists and the right thinks they're comunists— to argue for its out-of-the-box revolutionary nature.

Classifications aside, Fora do Eixo has become more and more involved with both social movement-style and formal politics over the last several years. It partially participated in and provided media coverage for various marches in 2011 and 2012,[105] and was a central force behind the ouster of president Dilma Rousseff's first minister of culture, Ana de Holanda, for setting a course to reverse many of the innovative cultural policies framed during the Gil-Ferreira era. In 2012, Fora do Eixo helped coalsece large political rallies around the municipal elections

[105] Marches about the legalization of marihuana, free speech, bike policy, and others.

in several cities. In São Paulo, it organized first a rally against conservative evangelical mayoral candidate Celso Russomano, followed by an event called "Existe Amor em SP," or Love Exists in São Paulo. The phrase was taken from the city's hit song of the moment, "Não Existe Amor em SP," by rapper-singer Criolo. Fora do Eixo's event of a similar title brought together popular bands from São Paulo's independent music sector, including Criolo himself, as well as various groups of social movements, in what was billed as an a-political act but which many regarded as support for progressive candidate Fernando Haddad, who later won the election in a small landslide.[106] Haddad even referred gratefully to the event in his inaguration speech.

All of this activity serves to justify concerns that Fora do Eixo performs progressive politics for more resources for itself than as committed activists to each promoted cause. Ideologically, this appears to be Fora do Eixo's institutional plan: Fora do Eixo members are so passionate and convinced about the revolutionary nature of their network they feel compelled to try to convince others to join the network as well, and take actions to "coopt" outside individuals and institutions in order to realize this transformation. As will become clear, these members, as well as the network as a whole, are socially and institutionally obligated to seek such expansion, for "doing" more, whether in the realm of music, social justice, or environmental activism, is the mechansim through which Fora do Eixo argues for its own importance and gains economic resources.

Fora do Eixo History

[106] Fora do Eixo allies, including former Minister of Culture Juca Ferreira, and digital network activist Rodrigo Savazoni, were subsequently appointed to posts within the Haddad cabinet, while Pablo Capilé now serves on the city's cultural advisory council.

The primary base of Fora do Eixo is the Casa Fora do Eixo São Paulo (Fora do Eixo São Paulo House), or CAFE-SP, inaugurated in 2011. A two-building, multi-story house in the lower-middle class Cambuci district south of the old downtown, the CAFE-SP serves as the residence of around twenty permanent members who share everything pertaining to the space, from food and rooms to money and even clothing. The CAFE-SP also hosts visting Fora do Eixo members from other collectives around the country, who participate in "immersions" at the CAFE, in which they learn how to better implement Fora do Eixo-developed modes for oragnizing their collectives and carrying out their projects. The *Casa* model has since been reproduced in at least six other cities (São Carlos, Porto Alegre, Belo Horizonte, Fortaleza, Belém and Brasília).[107]

While São Paulo currently serves as the headquarters for Fora do Eixo, the general structure and ideology of both individual Fora do Eixo collectives as well as Fora do Eixo as an institution, first emerged at the Espaço Cubo (or Cubo Mágico) collective, founded in 2003 in Cuiabá, a far-inland city closer to the Bolivian and Paraguayan borders than to the capital, much less the "axes" cities near the coast. Many of Fora do Eixo's current leaders, including Pablo Capilé, either founded or emerged from this collective.[108] Cubo was formed by a group of students at the Federal University of Matto Grosso who sought to engage youth in politics by

[107] These houses may be houses of particular cities, such as those in São Carlos and Porto Alegre, or state and regional houses, such the state of Minas Gerais (Belo Horizonte), and Northeast (Fortaleza) and Amazon (Belém). The house in Brasília is technically called the *Casa das Redes* (House of Networks), but is operated by key Fora do Eixo members.

[108] Other key Fora do Eixo members from Cuiabá include Marielle Ramires, Lenissa Lenza (Cubo founders), Dríade Aguiar, Thiago Dezan, Ney Hugo, and Ynaiã Benthroldo. Along with Bruno Kayapy, the latter two participants formed the original members of Macaco Bong. Ney Hugo left the band to work full-time to Fora do Eixo in 2012, and later in the year Kayapy had had a falling out with with Ynaiã as well, partially over the difficulty of rehearsing and progressing as a band amidst other Fora do Eixo duties. As already mentioned, in late 2013 Kayapy declared his disdain for the network publically (via Facebook and interviews in +Soma magazine and the rock blog Rock em Geral. See Bragatto 2013; Stamboroski Jr. and Potumati 2013).

involving them in cultural events. In 2001 they began producing an annual music festival, called Calango, which would later become one of the founding festivals of Abrafin. But the producers soon saw that to really engage youth they would need more constant forms of attracting them than an annual festival. They subsequently established Cubo as a means to engage youth through culture, and to change overall cultural production and political engagement in the city, shifting it away from Cuiabá's staple of cover bands to the valorization of original music [*música autoral*]. This, in turn, could only happen if there were infrastructures available for musical development and production (Capilé 2010), including both physical resources such as rehearsal and recording spaces, as well as practical knowledge on instrumental technique and the management of sound system equipment and programming technology.

Cubo members inaugurated Fora do Eixo's unique internal currency and accounting system, then called "Cubo Card," to make exchangeable the labor of bands and Cubo's communication, studio and production arms. This facilitated the building of structures for musical production and collaboration, and helped stimulate participation in municipal cultural policy. "It was really hard to make things happen," explained co-founder Pablo Capilé:

> The bands started saying that we weren't paying and they no longer wanted to go the culture forum, they didn't want to discuss public policy or to participate in workshops or talks. We needed to create an alternative that established an equilibrium. We weren't going to be able to pay in specie, but we could establish a communal exchange. A band started receiving card in exchange for the shows it did. It received 300 cards and it could have a rehearsal studio, a recording studio, PR. With that, bands started seeing that they were no longer spending money on certain things, because they could use card (Capilé 2010).

The use of card at Cubo affirms Andrew North's (2005) observation that alternative currencies strengthen social ties and encourage solidarity among members, helping "create local-scale, humane economies by rewarding those who build these localized networks, (…) making resources that might be privately owned or controlled available to all members" (North 2005:225). Card not only helped foster a tight circle of reciprocal social and service relations at Cubo but also aided in the collective shaping of aesthetic values. Macaco Bong guitarist Bruno Kayapy explained his participation at Cubo:

> We'd take the guys into the studio, show them and teach them everything, we'd give classes... The dude would rehearse, he'd record, but if he played a bad show, aaah everyone would be at the show and be like, 'that was crap man what was that? Improve that shit, it's a disgrace, it was bad right?' 'No it's true, yeah,' 'it's true it was terrible,' the whole gang [in] a plenary meeting (Bruno Kayapy, interview, March 8, 2012).

Card may also have contributed to the development of Fora do Eixo ideologies concerning the relation between art and labor. The original members of Macaco Bong, Bruno Kayapy, Ynaiã Benthrolodo, and Ney Hugo, all participated in Cubo as teenagers, working with Fora do Eixo's exchange system and adhering to the Fora do Eixo worldview expressed by the title of their debut album: *Artista Igual Pedreiro*, or Artists Same as Workers. In other words, artists are no more enlightened than anyone else, and therefore should participate in the creation of their own structures for artistic production, just the same as anyone else involved in the production chain, from communication to sound technician to stage builder to ticket-taker or bartender. The de-emphasis of the artist as *creator* in favor of one that views artists as equal elements in the process of constructing infrastructures of musical circulation has been constantly emphasized over Fora

do Eixo's history, and is often used as a means of defense against journalists, musicians, and others who criticize Fora do Eixo for exploiting musicians.[109]

Fora do Eixo's emphasis on "adding up" [*somar*] individuals into a collective form has also meant that the building of a larger circulation structure itself was more important than the monetary return of the artist's participation. Thus, just as at Cubo, where card served to keep people working together to build knowledge, Fora do Eixo as a network, members say, generates a "multiplier effect" where "one plus one equals three," because the redistribution of resources forms a structure through which more resources can be found and enjoyed by more people. For example, Fora do Eixo might set up a festival in which most bands are not paid; instead money is spread across the festival and the network as a whole, to provide free entry to audiences and to cover local transportation and food costs for the festival and other network events. A band does not initially earn money, but uses the festival as a platform to connect with potential fans, both face-to-face through performance, and through Fora do Eixo's online promotion of the festival. A band, moreover, may receive card in lieu of currency, which it can use in exchange for other Fora do Eixo services, such as help with booking more shows, career planning, or having a sound engineer.

Macaco Bong drummer Ynaiã Benthroldo explained this type of (what Fora do Eixo calls) "self-exploitation" during the band's early-career negotiation with festival producers, for whom Macaco Bong worked in exchange for performance space and the spreading of "social technologies"[110] from Cubo:

---

[109] This defense was employed at length, for example, in Facebook post by Lenissa Lenza in August 2013, when the network faced broad public scrutiny over its financial practices (https://www.facebook.com/lenissalenza/posts/571088132952117?stream_ref=10).

1. Technologies that inaugurate and modify social and political processes, as defined within Fora do Eixo concepts.

> If you bring me to play, I'll produce the stage for us, I'll work at the festival. And we got to know bands seeing shows, we didn't charge a fee, the guy [producer] would pay my travel, hospitality, and food and for some festivals we paid our travel… we'd pay to travel to play and to work at the guy's festival…and stay there a week constructing with the collective, creating a nucleus of production in the music studio of the group, we'd exchange with the bands, we'd have meetings, we'd take all of what we were doing in Cuiabá to that city (Ynaiã Benthroldo, interview, March 8, 2012).

During these early stages, new collectives were largely founded by bands first seeking to participate in band exchanges with other collectives, and then to perform at festivals established by fellow Fora do Eixo collectives or comprising Abrafin. Many festivals arose explicitly as Fora do Eixo initiatives to bring music to a particular city and create a node there. Musical production, circulation, and promotion, first through exchanges, then festivals, then tours, helped spread the political ideologies and practical working structures originally developed at Cubo. Musical production also played the primary role in founding Fora do Eixo collectives, suturing them together, and expanding and maintaining the network in material, symbolic, and financial terms. Fora do Eixo collectives now dot almost every Brazilian state.

In 2009 Fora do Eixo formalized the process of associating with the network when it wrote a Charter of Principles and By-Laws. Collectives must formally adopt the criteria laid out in these documents to become members of the network, usually after a trial period, in which they develop national Fora do Eixo campaigns. While official collectives, called Fora do Eixo "nodes" or "points" (*pontos*), develop their own local initiatives, they are also held to general Fora do Eixo programs, such as creating their own *card* currency and working to build new partnerships or nodes within the region (Regimento Interno Do Circuito Fora Do Eixo 2010).

Individual nodes also produce network-wide cultural events, such as the Fora do Eixo Nights local music events and the annual Grito Rock festival, and participate in network-wide media diffusion tactics. As previously noted, while Fora do Eixo rhetorically emphasizes collaboration, democracy, and "horizontality" in its structuring, both as a network and within each individual collective, it is organized into national, state, and regional networks, such that actions taken at each respective geographical level are coordinated and carried out by relevant collectives. Moreover, certain members act as leaders within Fora do Eixo sub-areas and for the network as a whole, while some individual collectives command more power within the network. This hierarchy is crucial to Fora do Eixo's ability to accrue resources through the labor of its several hundred participants at the bottom of the network ladder.

Card, Cachê, and the Logics of Aesthetic Valuation

By erecting this giant system for exchange, Fora do Eixo claims to have developed an alternative economic model in which musical circulation becomes "demonetized" and autonomous, where it feeds resources back into itself and thus becomes sustainable. Card mediates this process, and through mediating networked collaboration and exchange "multiplies" action to increase resources and grow the network. While paper cards do exist, card is generally used as a mode of accounting for the labor Fora do Eixo participants put into network activities, and is tracked and calculated as credit and debit in an online database. One card equals one Brazilian real, and one hour of work on any project is allotted twenty cards. Any labor performed by a participant in Fora do Eixo is tracked in cards, whether the action be creating a Facebook announcement, setting up a soundboard, or performing as a musician at a Fora do Eixo event. It may also be necessary to note that Fora do Eixo members do not receive payment in anything.

For purchases requiring real money, they use a collective cash box funded by a combination of members' credit cards, cachê earned by members who also form bands, cachê of other bands if they've performed at an event produced, but not controlled, by Fora do Eixo (such as the Stúdio SP's *Cedo e Sentado* shows, which will be later described),[111] contributions from members' families, private grants, private grants administered by the state, grants from municipal, state and national cultural boards, and grants from semi-state companies like Petrobrás.

According to Pablo Capilé and other Fora do Eixo leaders, card acts as the motor of redistributing resources—from monetary ones to the labor of participants— and allows Fora do Eixo to "multiply" its capacities to act in the world. This is correct, in the sense that by paying in card, and not reals, the labor and resources of network participants add into the Fora do Eixo structure without Fora do Eixo having to expend in legal tender. This allows Fora do Eixo to exist as a network of distributed collectives that can then produce musical and other events. Fora do Eixo's logic is that by redistributing these resources and thus providing a structure for circulation, it provides a platform for bands to become more broadly recognized. Bands, ostensibly, use these events as platforms for connecting with potential fans, and can trade the card they receive as payment for Fora do Eixo services, such as help with booking more shows, career planning, or having a sound engineer. Fora do Eixo thus argues that the spaces, structures and education for music production and performance provided by its collectives help to form

[111] Whether or not a band earns cachê at a Fora do Eixo event depends on its negotiation with the collective producing the event; bands that are "strategic" for Fora do Eixo, that is, bands with relatively large audiences, are paid cachê unless otherwise negotiated. One complaint about Fora do Eixo by many bands is that the agreed upon conditions for performance are not met; whether in terms of equipment, transportation, lodging, food, or cachê. The members of the non-organic Fora do Eixo band, Tigre Dente de Sabre, which has successfully worked with Fora do Eixo, noted that this type of mishap is common in Brazil, and resist condemning Fora do Eixo as a whole for problems encountered at individual collectives (Gui Calavera and Marcos Leite Til, interview, May 3rd, 2012).

both musicians as well as audiences to hear and value music, and that this organization of the independent sector thus elevates the overall quality of artistic production in the country.

Rarely made explicit in the explanation of card is the process by which this circulation acquires the so-called "multiplicatory" factor, though Pablo came close in his public appearance on the Roda Viva television debate program on August 5th, 2013:

> Today a Fora do Eixo house costs more or less around 25,000 reais (reals). Thirty people live in there. Each person costs more or less 900 reais. Each one that works on the Brazilian Festival Network like Gabriel Ruiz, when he assists [*dá suporte*] those 300 festivals if each one of those acts of support cost 500 reais, the guy that cost 900 reais a month, in the month of February where he's assisting those 300 festivals, he generated R$150,000…. So each real that enters there multiplies into fifteen, twenty, twenty-five, because there are a lot of people, a lot, making that happen (Roda Viva: Mídia Ninja 2013).

This is the economic system of exchange that Fora do Eixo claims as its unique, in fact revolutionary, contribution to cultural production, as well as its justification when it does not pay a fee—cachê— to bands performing at its events.

In recent years, Fora do Eixo has simultaneously taken two positions on cachê: that the lack of cachê owes to the overall lack of money in Brazilian independent cultural production, and non-payment of cachê directly to the band contributes to keeping resources distributed throughout the network, thus creating the structures for musical circulation based on exchange that will allow an artist to circulate Brazil, building a public for its music, selling merchandise, and otherwise making a name for itself such that it can reap monetary benefits in the future. Since these bands do not receive cachê in reals, but may do so in cards, Pablo counts these cards

in tallying overall cachê paid, arguing that Fora do Eixo is the entity that pays more cachê than any other in Brazil. By a similar logic, the labor of Fora do Eixo in producing music events, which includes not only the labor of transporting equipment and setting up shows, but also the labor of promoting these events online, all of this labor is counted as cards both spent by the network and invested by the network. Though Fora do Eixo's own card accounting for this type of labor thus marks equal amounts spent and invested, making input and output one and the same, Pablo tallies these investments as contributions to the Brazilian economy. Using the one card = one real conversion, Fora do Eixo claimed to invest R$75.4 million reals (US$44.3 million) worth of cards in Brazilian culture in 2011 (Congresso Fora do Eixo 2011). This type of policy has been frequently criticized throughout Fora do Eixo's history, such that the network has developed the aforementioned rationalizations, as well as sought to in fact pay more cachê (Vanguart, interview, March 26th, 2012).

Within Pablo's logic, the forfeiture of cachê for media visibility seems to be just. In the same interview just cited Pablo backed up his defense of non-payment by elaborating the example of the São Paulo band Cidadão Instigado, which had criticized Abrafin for being a mafia (Dias Pereira 2009), and which according to Capilé was accustomed to undeservingly high cachês paid by the wealthy SESC institutions.[112]

> Over in Cuiabá Cidadão Instigado doesn't even bring in thirty people. Those thirty people paying $20 makes $600. And then we triple that because of the added value, the band is aesthetically cool. So in addition to the box office, we're going to triple that up. That's R$1,800. But the dude asks me for R$4, 000 in cachê. So only from cachê we have a deficit of R$2,200, without counting the airfare. So if he's not able to balance that,

[112] As described in chapter 3, SESCs are private entities funded through the renunciation of state payroll taxes. They have been accused, like Fora do Eixo itself, of creating a "false" music scene by paying artists much more than they could earn through free market competition (Álvaro Pereira Junior 2010**a**).

> understand that the festival forms an audience and that for him to come back and have an audience he has to build that foundation [*lastro*], it becomes difficult to establish negotiations (Morais 2010).

Here the band has a pre-given aesthetic value determined by the "music itself," while the monetary value only derives from first establishing a relationship of recognition by a mass of individuals. After these relationships are established, the band will be able to draw more money because its value—derived from recognition—has increased. The festival will then be willing to pay more, since Cidadão Instigado will be able to draw more people to it, and the band, now recognized as worthy of exchanging money for the experience of listening, will also be able to extract money from individuals. In Pablo's logic, Cidadão Instigado's self-determination of its value in price is inaccurate: first because it has been paid a value higher than its *real* value thanks to the rich SESC institutions; second, because its real price derives from the combination of the number of people willing to recognize it as valuable and its inherent value as determined by its aesthetic quality.

Anthropologists and sociologists of money and price have argued for the social, moral, and political nature of money in mediating social relationships and value alike. Horacio Ortiz (2013) sums up this approach, in which "monetary valuation is never just technical, but is also moral, religious, and political, signaling the position of each individual in society according to specific imaginaries. Giving a price to something—including it in a scale of measure—means inscribing it in emotional, moral, and political relations (Guyer 2004; Fourcade 2011)" (66). These relations, moreover, are fundamentally connected to the act of social recognition. Joel Robbins has posited an "economy of recognition" for the Urapmin people he researched, who construct each other as human subjects through mutual recognition mediated by material

exchange (2009:52). In this system, economic progress is an expansion of relations of recognition. "Recognition is a key part of what is at issue in every material transaction" (2009:53). While this is the most salient aspect of the Urapmin's particular social-economic system, Robbins, drawing on Honneth, argues that economics in general contain this aspect of recognition: "material distribution is thus the only primary issue that can fire even Western people's moral imaginations" (Robbins 2009:56).

Following this work, I understand the debates about the payment of cachê as a struggle over the moral validity of the relationship between music and people as a complex infrastructure of circulation defined fundamentally, if not predominantly, by the human act of valuation itself. David Graeber (2001) argues that defining and mediating types of value are necessary elements of all societal construction. As both Daniel Miller (2001) and Ortiz (2013) have argued, through very different ethnographic work, within capitalist systems this process of valuation occurs as the negotiation and assignation of price. Miller, in particular, connects the recognition and reinforcement of social relationships through the act of assigning price in his study of gifting and provisioning in households in northern England. He found that careful consideration of the price of gifts and the provisioning of households with necessities allows for the externalization of relationships between gift givers and receivers, or between caregivers and their families, and this externalization is the mechanism through which social relationships are negotiated and recognized.

When Fora do Eixo detractors decry the network for not paying bands, in one sense it is because they feel they are not being recognized, they do not have value. Another way of saying this is that detractors see Fora do Eixo willing to expend real money on many things, but not on musicians. This case is exemplified by one of the most common examples put before me of Fora

do Eixo's morally vacant practices of event production: *Domingo na Casa* (Sunday at Home). Domingo na Casa is a weekly, afternoon event held on Sundays in the Casa Fora do Eixo São Paulo courtyard and "studio," a long, large, windowless room in the secondary building where Fora do Eixo holds debates and performances.[113] Featuring live bands from around 3pm until 10pm, with DJs playing in between, Domingo na Casa is free to enter and similarly offers free barbecue and beer. But most performing bands are not paid.[114] Throughout my time in São Paulo, detractors would bring up this fact—that Fora do Eixo offered free beer to the audience but would not pay the band— as evidence of Fora do Eixo's fundamental lack of respect for musicians, and a signal of the place Fora do Eixo actually assigned to musicians within the overall "productive chain" of music which Fora do Eixo stresses as its *forte*.

The criticism of non-payment of bands at Domingo na Casa prompted Fora do Eixo to install a new applicative at the events, called *Quanto Vale o Show?*, or How Much is the Show Worth?," often abbreviated "QTO Vale." Launched on February 22nd, 2012 with the first edition of Domingo na Casa in the new year, the idea of Quanto Vale o Show is functionally a passing around of a hat for donations from the audience, the entire sum of which is then given directly to the performing bands.[115] According to Fora do Eixo's head of music, Felipe Altenfelder, QTO Vale is an "incredible format for positioning the public as the protagonist of the scene" (comment on Pablo Capilé, Facebook, February 22nd, 2012). Fora do Eixo members celebrated the invention of QTO Vale in several regards, all of which placed responsibility for the economic health of the band and the Fora do Eixo circuit, or overall "scene," directly into the hands of

[113] And since there are now several Casas Fora do Eixo this event is held at each respective house as well.
[114] When bands are paid it because they are already highly sought after-bands, such as the performance of the popular São Paulo band Holger at the first edition of Doming na Casa.
[115] It has never been clear to me if the campaign is set up for each band or if the money is divided among bands afterwards. As far as I have been able to tell, just one QTO Vale donation box is set up at each event.

participating audience members, thus also inaugurating yet another "collaborative, democratic, and solidary" tool into the Fora do Eixo canon (Ísis Maria, comment on Pablo Capilé, Facebook, February 22nd, 2012). Participation through monetary donation would ostensibly help stimulate both bands and audiences, allowing "the public itself to strengthen and make possible the circulation of bands" (CAFE Sanca, Facebook, March, 18th, 2012). This would do away with a "mediator," placing the public as the ultimate judge of the bands' economic value, one presumably based upon its apparent value as indicated by aesthetics, as Pablo Capilé earlier argued. According to Fora do Eixo members, while QTO Vale would thus allow Fora do Eixo "to see who really values independent and original [*autoral*] music (ibid. Juca Culatra Roots), it would also allow Fora do Eixo itself to "see the real value of [its] work" (ibid., February 24th, 2012).

In the logic of QTO Vale o Show, aesthetic value is mediated through the assignation of price. However, the assignation of price in turn relies on the listening publics' recognition of the aesthetic quality of the music being played. This presents a contradiction, one Ortiz (2013) found to be at the heart of financial asset managers' practices for determining and assigning prices and then managing accounts. In financial theory, markets are efficient, such that "all the information concerning the objects being exchanged is already reflected in their price. This means that prices express a truth about the objects' value" (68). This theory contradicts financial practice, as financial investors have to conduct research on an asset, determining its price by integrating information into it. Once price has been determined, individual valuation becomes useless because it cannot be more accurate than market price. "The value of each asset was thereby considered to be both a definition of the individual gaze of the investor and the result of market efficiency" (Ortiz 2013:69). This same contradiction manifests in the logic of QTO Vale o Show,

where immediately apparent aesthetic value provides the information necessary for individual listeners to determine and then assign price, but at the same time, this price then conveys the inherent value of the music and the musicians performing it. Of course, "donate-what-you-want" schemes are common throughout amateur and other contexts of musical production characterized by low recognition, DIY ethics, and scant resources. But the implementation of QTO Vale arose to solve the criticism surrounding non-payment of cachê to bands within a circulation structure which only exists because of this very lack of payment. And the lack of payment is justified through the argument that recognition in its own right—that visibility—is where a band's value resides, and that such recognition will automatically be converted into monetary terms.

The self-evident nature of the aesthetic quality in this logic tells the listening public, as the entity that assigns price, what the band's price is and this is a measure of its worth within the market. This contradicts Fora do Eixo's justification for not paying bands to begin with, as the withholding of cachê is used to set up a structure for bands to circulate despite them not having a market, that is, circulation and performance themselves build recognition for the band, and thus build the market. In other words, Fora do Eixo has argued that there is no public for bands, therefore public funding needs to be redistributed to create structures through which a public can be formed, and thus that bands should not be paid cachê such that this structure can be maintained, allowing bands to form value for themselves through circulation. But Fora do Eixo simultaneously tells bands that their value is inherent in the aesthetics of their music, such that if they fail to generate market value, it's their own fault for not appealing to the public/market. The evolution of Fora do Eixo's symbolic and financial schema highlights the contradiction between the notion of aesthetics as inherent and pre-given, and the notion of aesthetics as that which arises from circulation. Fora do Eixo's own practices for expansion have been in fact

configured by this tension: it has both valued the bands wiling to labor to build the network and argued that the circulation resulting from the effort to build the network proves the bands' aesthetic value. But Fora do Eixo has also sought to legitimize itself by attaching its brand signifiers to bands that had already built an audience outside of the Fora do Eixo network. Fora do Eixo thus conflates the values of aesthetics, media visibility and price, but argues differentially for the relative value of each according to its political needs. Ultimately, Fora do Eixo has privileged associating the media recognition of already aesthetically-valued bands with itself, claiming this recognition as an affirmation of the functionality of its practices of circulation and logics of valuation.

Aesthetics, Value, and Public Representation

Fora do Eixo's interest in aesthetics arose precisely as a concern about the representation of the network in the public sphere. As Pablo Capilé recounted in 2012, during the early years Fora do Eixo considered participation in a collective to be a political act, such that bands deciding to pursue their careers individually by leaving their collectives for São Paulo, in order to attain greater recognition, were met with ostracization:

> A while back, when a band left [Fora do Eixo] we told him to go shove it up… when Vanguart signed with Universal, son of a bitch! You know. Because fuck you come out of Cuiabá man, from the Fora do Eixo Circuit which was fighting with that son of a bitch, you played at all the independent festivals positioning you and now, *now* you're going to sign with that fucking Universal?... Back then, in a certain way, Los Porongas going to São Paulo was a threat, it could unleash a chain of cool bands moving from their own cities to São Paulo, that was the danger within the consolidation being defended. Which

> was the glocal: 'don't leave your city to be able to act nationally.' Now it's not like that anymore (Pablo Capilé, Seminário de Música, January 18th, 2012).

Here Pablo highlights the tension arising from the attempt to build a network through political solidarity, but in which good aesthetic valuation was simultaneously viewed not just as the public face of the network, but as the ultimate form of political intervention into modes of building cultural infrastructures. This tension has been ever present: even as late as the 2011 national Fora do Eixo conference, which took place in December of that year, Fora do Eixo was debating whether its process of solidification should revolve around forms of artistic curation based on aesthetic quality, or whether such selectivity would undermine the goal to provide structures for bands to circulate *democratically*, a process the selection of quality by a limited amount of people would hinder.

Yet a closer analysis of Fora do Eixo's evolution shows that the attainment of greater media visibility itself became the driving factor in new practices of band circulation and network structuring. Through media visibility gained both from an expansion of the range of music production activities, as well as through association with "good" bands, Fora do Eixo sought to gain public legitimacy. During a week of meetings concerning Fora do Eixo's next steps in the area of music held in São Paulo in January, 2012, on the heels of the national conference, Pablo Capilé illustrated this transformation in a summary of what he called the "four stages" of the evolution of Fora do Eixo's action with regards to music:

> We began wanting the band from Acre to play in Cuiabá and the band from Cuiabá to play in Acre…. Two and half years later we started getting pressured, which was that, it's generating a lot of quantity but little quality. And how are we going to deal with that?... we're going to build an agency, we're going to call upon twenty cool bands. And we're

> going to show that those twenty cool bands are with us. To be able to face in some way the criticism that there was no quality (Pablo Capilé, Seminário de Música, January 18th, 2012).

This preoccupation with aesthetic quality as a means for larger representation cannot be separated from the practical mechanisms through which the network was built, as exemplified by the 2010 creation of The [band management] Agency, to which Pablo here referred. Fora do Eixo gathered a roster of eighteen bands, which were sent on tour in an effort to create a more continuous and even flow of band circulation. This also helped consolidate Fora do Eixo nodes in the country. "A lot of collectives came into the network upon receiving a tour," described Fora do Eixo music agent Felipe Altenfelder. "Many cities sought us out interested in that, and we were able to keep the group stimulated and working afterwards" (Felipe Altenfelder, interview, January 5th, 2012). Fora do Eixo often helped pay for these tours, in order to convince the bands that touring in Brazil was both possible and a good idea. Again, this also served as a communicational means for strengthening the network, owing to the inter-collective coordination the tours demanded, which also helped promote the tours. Felipe explained that

> because the tour was going to pass through all of the cities, there was a demand for us to be communicating everyday through our e-mail lists....We were succeeding in creating a wave a promotion in succession, because [when] a band was playing in São Carlos the city of Riberão was already picking up our coverage on our blog, and using it to promote its own, and the system began to show itself as much more efficient (Felipe Altenfelder, interview, January 5th, 2012).

The founding of new collectives and the incorporation of more producers into the Fora do Eixo network was thus established through the music and social encounters that festivals and tours offered and the communicational demands they put on the collectives.

But Fora do Eixo also structured these tours explicitly with bands they thought had already developed cultural capital on their own, outside of Fora do Eixo action, that is, bands with aesthetic quality, as Pablo described. This attitude marks a shift in Fora do Eixo strategy, from focusing on "doing-it-together" to build the network, and thereby privileging those most ready to work, to privileging, to put it broadly, representation of the network, as worked out by aesthetic quality of bands and media representation. Felipe recounted the importance of touring to continued representation of the bands and the network in terms of media visibility: "A tour keeps you on the agenda [*em pauta*] everyday, it's on Twitter everyday it's on Facebook everyday it's on the blogs everyday" (Felipe Altenfelder, interview, January 5th, 2012). According to the former Fora do Eixo member Laís Bellini, the purpose of all Fora do Eixo actions, such as festivals and tours, is to promote the network (Facebook, August 8th, 2013). This seemed apparent to me as well after analyzing Fora do Eixo's media practices in particular (Garland 2012).

As Felipe's explanation of the importance of a tour in producing a continued media presence suggests, actions are regarded as *real* when there are media representations of them; media representation allows activities to be seen and recognized by people other than those who are carrying them out. This is important for musicians seeking to garner more fans who might then help support them financially, but it is also central to Fora do Eixo's means of financial existence, for its media representation helps enact it as an entity with the force to *articulate* culture in Brazil. For this reason, perhaps, by 2012 Pablo Capilé stressed tactics within music

production that would emphasize media representation, rather the strict laboring of individuals to build the network. "It's fundamental," he stated, "that this year we don't allow any more space for political criteria in the insertion of bands in our priority agenda. The political criterion is political aesthetics. It's no longer that of inclusion. It's no longer that of labor" (Pablo Capilé, Seminário de Música, January 15th, 2012). Here Pablo seems to inaugurate a definitive shift from creating infrastructures through labor to building political capacities through media representation.

This preoccupation with enacting itself as *real* and gaining power through media representation led Fora do Eixo to move its headquarters from Cuiabá to São Paulo in early 2011. After arriving and setting up, the CAFE-SP embarked on a campaign to infiltrate the city. According to Dríade Aguiar, the national Fora do Eixo media coordinator, though Fora do Eixo had some contacts with journalists and cultural articulators, the immediate mission upon arriving in São Paulo was to carry out a year-long communications plan. Because São Paulo wasn't "their house," she said, "there wasn't a developed map of close actors, and so when we came here there was an intense process of coopting those new people. So it was meetings with bands every weekend, having the Sunday event open and free,[116] because from there everyone wold come and you could capture mailings[117]... which was a big gatherer for mailings in the house" (Dríade Aguiar, interview, May 15th, 2012). This technique was also developed on Twitter, in the hopes that *tweeting* to visitors of the house would help Fora do Eixo gather more followers. On my first visit to to the event to which Dríade referred, an edition of Domingo na Casa, I was asked to put my e-mail on the mailing list; my photo was taken, and then tweeted to me by a Casa Fora do Eixo account.

[116] Dríade is referring here to *Domingo na Casa*.
[117] E-mails to put onto the mailing list.

Felipe Altenfelder aptly described São Paulo as a cultural "amplifier" for Brazil; moving to São Paulo to forge partnerships with established music institutions and musicians would help strengthen Fora do Eixo's own abilities to produce music in the country to thus position itself to gain more resources through media representation of the events it produced. Fora do Eixo's move to São Paulo has often been criticized for its apparent contradiction: a network built on the goal of "democratizing" culture outside (*fora*) of Brazil's cultural and commercial centers moved its headquarters to the primary axis (*eixo*) of power in the country. More than that, Fora do Eixo's production in its birth city, Cuiabá, was completely abandoned by the network, so much so that the city's Calango music festival, the original Fora do Eixo festival, has not been realized there since 2010. Fora do Eixo has defended itself by insisting that while the concept of being outside the axis was once geographic, the network has since come to understand it as a state of mind and mode of working. As Pablo stated at the conference, with his characteristic mix of metaphor, academic jargon and youth vernacular, "to challenge São Paulo is to challenge the great simulacrum of Babylon, man" (Pq as Coisas 2011).[118] I take the invocation of Babylon as an analogy: ancient Rome was to new Christianity as São Paulo is to both new bands from Brazil's hinterlands as well as networked modes of production.

One of Fora do Eixo's larger goals then, is to "challenge the cultural imaginary" of Brazil, one it sought to do by moving to São Paulo and building alliances with artists who had already attained a high amount of national recognition and success by offering them more visibility and opportunity for live performance via the Fora do Eixo networked structure. Felipe

[118] Simulacra, in the Fora do Eixo vocabulary, refer to internal institutions like the bank, university, and culture party which are specific Fora do Eixo correlates with outside institutions strictly governed by the state or market. Simulacra interact with their parallel institutions only indirectly. For example, Fora do Eixo organizes its own internal bank with cash and cards, but also must deal with "real" banks to receive funding or pay necessary bills.

described the network's "negotiation with São Paulo": "You [artists] wanna play in Amapá,[119] you wanna play wherever, it's with us. We're here in São Paulo bringing all of Brazil to you" (Felipe Altenfelder, interview, January 5th, 2012). The CAFE-SP began producing the Tuesday night *Cedo e Sentado*, or "Early and Seated" event, an early-evening free live music series hosted at the Stúdio SP until the venue's close in April 2013. A music venue long-recognized for giving space to live performances of Brazilian bands, Stúdio SP was situated among the cluster of bars, clubs and other live music venues on bohemian Lower Augusta (Baixo Augusta), many of which have now fallen to the booming real estate market capitalizing on the revitalization of downtown.[120] The CAFE-SP also built partnerships with alternative music media like the Revista Noize magazine, and with artists-of-the-moment Criolo and Emicida, both rappers who earned accolades from the music press and became popular in the indie sector in 2011. The connections to these entities in São Paulo themselves provide avenues for Fora do Eixo to expand and strengthen itself, but they are also crucial to the specific media tactics Fora do Eixo's employs to gain public visibility and thus institutional legitimacy.

The Tactics and Social Imperatives of Fora do Eixo Media Promotion

The particular logics and structures of internet platforms for representation are paramount to the process of Fora do Eixo's network formation, maintenance, strategies, and ideology. The wall at the entrance to the CAFE-SP displays differently colored individual strips of paper taped with *hashtags*, the tagging tool developed on Twitter that allows users mark their *tweets* in reference to a specific theme. When other users mark their own tweets with a hashtag, it becomes a searchable reference to the topic, and can appear on Twitter's top trending list, making the

[119] A state in the far north, dominated by forest.
[120] Including the Stúdio SP, Vegas Club and Bar do Netão.

tagged tweets both searchable and more visible within the vast jumble of information on the service. Hashtags reference Fora do Eixo concepts, events and media campaigns, and collectively work as an icon for Fora do Eixo's ideological stance towards and practical use of digital software. The particular hashtags hanging at the CAFE-SP in late 2011 and early 2012, such as #OpenTechnology, #WorkIsLife, and #DangerousIdeas, also, of course, served as a reference to the five or six people who form the CAFÉ-SP Multimedia team. Glued to their laptops and clustered around a table traversed by extension cables and power chords, these members work to keep Fora do Eixo signs circulating on the internet by generating content— photos, videos, digital "posters" and short reports— that can be uploaded to Facebook and Twitter and tagged accordingly.

All members of Fora do Eixo then circulate this content on Twitter as well as on Facebook by *sharing*, *liking* and *commenting*, Facebook tools that, like hashtags, keep the content visible on the newsfeed of anyone who is "friends" with a Fora do Eixo member or project on Facebook. These actions, along with the online collaboration in general,[121] serve to cohere the network as an entity, and crucially, to help it gain what Fora do Eixo members might call "meme force," in terms of mediated recognition. This is a reference to the concept of "memes," images, video or words that quickly become popular through rapid reproduction on the internet. This vision and tactic even manifest in Fora do Eixo's unique linguistic code: Fora do Eixo has come to see challenging Brazil's cultural imaginary as a "memetic battle" [*disputa memética*], won by launching its own symbols into the world to multiply and gain greater visibility than its perceived competitors' through meme-like reproduction in social media and blogs, and the accompanying possibility for these symbols to rise in Google web searches. Other

[121] Internally, members coordinate through e-mail lists divided by geography or project, and work collectively on documents through online tools such as google docs.

examples include “pressing F5” [*botar F5*, browser refresh] to reference a shift in strategy for a particular action; to keep working at something is to “hit the [keyboard] key” [*bater na tecla*], and those who disagree with Fora do Eixo’s ideology of technology-mediated collaboration are often dismissed as “analog” [*analógica*], in other words, unable to shift their mode of cultural production and political action into accord with the new participatory realities of the 21st century. This preoccupation with digital technology even appears in Fora do Eixo imagery, such as a rendition of Fora do Eixo’s symbol— a circle whose upper left corner breaks and begins to extend up and outward—with illustrated wires and cables. Several residents of the CAFE-SP perennially bear a version of this logo in the form of a tattoo. Fora do Eixo processes of generating media visibility thus contradict the ideology of building horizontal infrastructures, and building aesthetic recognition for bands through the labor of circulation— both the labor of performing bands as well as the labor of building infrastructures through circulation.

Fora do Eixo-produced events are heavily and strategically promoted in social networks. This is possible because Fora do Eixo members use their personal social media accounts to disseminate network events and information, tagging the institutional pages of Fora do Eixo, individual Fora do Eixo collectives, Fora do Eixo projects, and individual members in the hopes that the swirl of aggregated information will capture attention. In fact, it is extremely rare to see Fora do Eixo members use Facebook and Twitter to post information unrelated to the network; rather, their “social activity” online is inseparable from their role and work in performing the network. That is to say, acts of posting, tagging and hashtagging events with Fora do Eixo signifiers are a type what Lee and LiPuma call a performative, “a creative type of indexical icon: a self-reflexive use of reference that, in creating a representation of an ongoing act, also enacts it” (Lee and LiPuma 2002:195). Co-present Fora do Eixo events such as tours or band

performances marked and disseminated online with Fora do Eixo signifiers imaginatively enact Fora do Eixo as a network.

Fora do Eixo promotion tactics are themselves institutionalized both explicitly and implicitly; that is, there are explicit mobilizations of media promotion as well as social and moral imperatives to participate, promote, and *dar uma força* (make an effort), and these may be made explicit as obligations of participation within the network. National media coordinator Dríade Aguiar, who began working at Espaço Cubo as a teenager,[122] explained the network's explicit media promotion tactics. One is that face-to-face events are always promoted on Twitter and/or Facebook, usually with a photo, and as I have observed, also with project-based and institutional hashtags. For any specific event, such as a show or other event in which Fora do Eixo is participating, at least five different promotion techniques are employed in a single day. This helps keep information circulating and reaching different people without exhausting potential viewers with endless repetitions, or boring those posting with repetitive action. Here, Gmail or Facebook chats and e-mails might supplement social media platform promotion. One important technique with Facebook is the so-called "wave of likes." Here, information posted by a Fora do Eixo member or page needs to achieve a certain number of "likes" from other Fora do Eixo members on Facebook.

> For example: we've launched open calls for the houses [to participate in workshops or even residencies], we've composed a specific photo for that [setting up the foto], we've re-done that photo [digital editions] and put it on the Fora do Eixo profile, for example. Then there's a wave of promoting that Facebook link so it reaches more than an X

[122] Before Fora do Eixo took over its management, Dríade also served as editor for the open-media site Overmundo.

number of likes…. There's a mobilization so that that happens (Dríade Aguiar, interview, May 15th, 2012).

According to Dríade, the strongest and most effective tactic is the *tuitaço*, or tweet bombing (literally "great big tweet action"). Here, dozens if not hundreds of Fora do Eixo members continually post on Twitter about a particular event during a particular time period, using particular hashtags or sets of hashtags. On February, 17th, 2012, for example, Fora do Eixo managed to elevate the hashtag #200Gritos to the top trending position on Twitter Brazil, by coordinating hundreds of tweets with the tag all day. The tag was a reference to Grito Rock, the name of Fora do Eixo's annual multi-city music and arts festival, which the network was promoting as occurring in 200 cities in 2012. The feat of the Grito Rock *tuitaço* was celebrated by Fora do Eixo on Facebook, such as Pablo Capilé's posting of a screenshot of the Twitter page, with the caption "GRITO ROCK in FIRST PLACE in TT [Trending Topics] BRAZIL. Today begins the biggest integrated arts festival in the WORLD! #200Gritos" (Pablo Capilé, Facebook, Febuary 17th, 2012). According to Dríade, this *tuitaço* technique is "extremely effective but it's also extremely heavy and violent. So we need to always think strategically whether it's really necessary or not" (Dríade Aguiar, interview, May 15th, 2012).

In my experience, these tactics are effective in generating visibility in certain modes, as with the elevation of the hashtag, but are not necessarily effective in mobilizing concrete action around these events. Despite the trending topics position of #200Gritos, for example, the edition of Grito Rock at the Stúdio SP in São Paulo was sparsely attended, save for the other bands performing and the residents of the CAFE-SP, many of whom did not usually turn out for regular performances in the cities, remaining instead at the Casa working on other Fora do Eixo projects. That there is often a disjuncture between such "violent" media promotion and their practical

effects is precisely the reason that Fora do Eixo seeks to partner with artists and institutions that have their own draw; but in some ways the practical effects of promotion in drawing people to an event are less important than promotion and visibility itself. As Dríade explained, even when Fora do Eixo promotion is not specifically laid out as a coordinated action, "there's a concern that it'll be seen" (Dríade Aguiar, interview, May 15th, 2012). The institution of Fora do Eixo becomes continuously partially enacted and presented through such promotion tactics. These work well because there are social, affective and moral imperatives for network members to promote and defend Fora do Eixo online.[123]

When criticisms arise, Fora do Eixo defends itself at all costs, even in what may seem to outside observers as absurd cases. In May 2011, for example, Felipe Altenfelder posted an explanation of why the experimental metal band, Elma, had been kicked off the ticket of their own show at the Stúdio SP (Felipe Altenfelder, Facebook, May 26th, 2011). Elma was to headline at *Cedo e Sentado*, which had recently become administered by the CAFE-SP. After the cancellation of the show, Elma's guitarist Bernardo Pacheco released through Facebook a very long explanation of all Elma had done to accommodate the sudden addition of the band Mombojó to Stúdio SP's line-up. Though Mombojó would not play *Cedo e Sentado*, but rather perform later in the night in its own, ticketed event, it refused to allow any band to perform before it due to past problems with equipment at the Stúdio SP. From Bernardo's retelling, it seems evident that Elma showed tremendous amount of flexibility and will to compromise, offering various "simple solutions to the invented problems" with equipment and scheduling

[123] André Azevedo da Fonseca especially emphasizes the moral and affective elements of these practices (deleted article "A Vida Fora do Eixo" and personal communication, August, 2013).

(Bernardo Pacheco, Facebook, May 25th, 2011), but ultimately did not finding an acceptable solution.[124]

While the discussion of this mishap on guitarist Bernardo's Facebook page revolved around questions of the technical capabilities and quality of the Stúdio SP, general band production practices in Brazil, and the intransigence of Mombojó and its producer, Fora do Eixo's Felipe Altenfelder set out to defend the network from any backlash, presenting on his own page a position in which both bands were blamed for failing to compromise (as well as admitting Fora do Eixo's error in not cancelling one of the shows earlier). The comments made by other Fora do Eixo members on his post showed not only complete belief and devotion to the story of their fellow member, despite protestations and clarifications from Bernardo, but sought to turn the story into a moral lesson about the nature of cooperation and the merit of the Fora do Eixo project. "It's only vanity and lack of collective spirit that makes you unable to understand that Fora do Eixo was just trying to balance…. Those who didn't collaborate, now are trying to distort. Horrible!," chided Cubo co-founder Lenissa Lenza, while her Cubo compatriot chimed, "When the desire to be visible [*aparecer*] gets bigger than the desire to build the debate gets old [*chato*]. Long live Fora do Eixo!" (comments on Felipe Altenfelder, Facebook, May 26th, 2011).

Here there is no separation between commenting and liking as institutionally-planned media mobilizations and members' individual desires to promote, engage and defend. Former Fora do Eixo member Laís Bellini emphasized the psychological and social pressure to constantly support Fora do Eixo online through what she called a "rain of *likes*" (*chuva de likes*),

[124] Elma did not accept the final offer to play a sound check-less show starting, at earliest, at midnight, citing the relatively young age of the audience and fans' need to get home on public transportation, which shuts down at midnight, and the Stúdio SP's acoustic character. While the Stúdio SP is not large, the 500-capacit venue is large enough, Bernardo argued, to require a sound check for his band. For refusing to play in such transformed and, for the band, fruitless conditions, Elma was effectively kicked off its own show.

and the need for members to themselves post in social media about the merits of the network (Laís Bellin, Facebook, August 8th, 2013). Laís wrote of her experience at the Casa Fora do Eixo São Paulo:

> I have lived moments in which a text critical of Fora do Eixo appeared, and Pablo would go room to room or we'd receive information via gtalk [the chat function of Gmail]: 'Hey write about how much you love living all of this, how much cool stuff we do,' and then, as yet another demand, in 15 minutes Facebook would have 300, 400, 500 texts with so much the same of *likes* and *shares*. It's good to remember that liking and sharing things that Pablo and some of the others there write on Faceook is a daily demand. But when you're there in it, it seems like you're defending the network's cause, because as much as you have criticisms, everyone's there for something bigger (Laís Bellini, Facebook, August 8th, 2013).

Such promotion and concern over representation helps publically validate Fora do Eixo as an entity that achieves the events it heavily promotes, and form part of the moral and affective imperative of participation that keeps Fora do Eixo members willing to work for the organization. As such, they rearticulate core Fora do Eixo labor ideologies, such as working in network form, not stopping work ever, working together, open source and "horizontal" working, or other purported Fora do Eixo values and practices. Social media participation helps showcase Fora do Eixo values and practices for those observing from without, and validates and reaffirms participation in the network for those within. This online activity thus becomes one of the primary forms of labor that gives rise to and maintains the collective, even if much of it is carried out by individuals who do not just comply with institutional demands to keep things visible as a practice of labor, but desire to do so through affect and a sense of morality.

In addition to solidifying network practices and values, this type of activity helps Fora do Eixo leaders gauge other members' loyalty to the cause, becoming a form of surveillance. In early 2012, for example, Pablo Capilé posted on Facebook, "3 in the morning, I bet there's a gang who works with culture that's hard at work. Am I right?" (post from March 1st, 2012). By the time I saw this post around 6am, it had received nearly fifty "likes" and eighteen comments, generating individual celebrations of the perseverance in working towards the networked cultural cause and developing the hashtag #bondedamadrugada, or #dawntrain. Laís Bellini characterized such demand to participate as a form of being "slaves to Facebook" (Laís Bellini, Facebook, August 8th, 2013). Other former Fora do Eixo members have emphasized the importance of showing this willingness to work as a vital part of Fora do Eixo's notion of the "process." In an August, 2013 interview, Bruno Kayapy, (Macaco Bong's guitarist), explained that

> To understand the Fora do Eixo process is to be ready for whatever demand, accept all conditions without question, from cleaning the floor, carrying amps, organizing events, playing, picking people up at the airport… The articulations, who works on the front are always the same people, the jobs don't change. Those who enter and leave are those who are lackeys for everything [*pau-pra-toda-obra*], understanding that you just have to do everything without question, or justify your mistake, accept being called incompetent and understand that as stimulation. If not, you don't understand the process, aside from which, if you question, you're being 'arrogant' before the laws of the process (in Bragatto 2013).

This intense relationship between the socialization of commitment to Fora do Eixo and its promotion in social media is the necessary fulcrum that links music production practices,

remuneration and the representation of Fora do Eixo activities online as a mode of gaining public legitimation as a cultural producer, which translates into resources from state and private entities.

Grito Rock and the Political Uses of Media Promotion

An analysis of Fora do Eixo's 2012 Grito Rock festival illustrates Fora do Eixo's tactics for visibility in relation to musical circulation and the representation of performing bands. As already illustrated, Fora do Eixo ran a twitter-bombing campaign with the hashtag #200Gritos in February, 2012, on the first official day of the festival. Fora do Eixo promotes the festival as occurring in hundreds of cities (200 in 2012; 300 in 2013;400 in 2014**)** and in ever-multiplying numbers of countries, as the "biggest collaborative festival on the planet" (Regulamento Grito Rock 2014). While Grito Rock is branded as collaborative, production of each festival is left to the sole responsibility of each local team, including financial production: "It's worth underlining that the economic administration of Grito is realized in a totally decentralized and autonomous way, that is, each collective or local producer is responsible for the financial management of the Festival in its respective city" (Regulamento Para Produtores 2014). Anyone may register to produce Grito Rock through TNB, *Toque no Brasil,* (Play in Brazil) a Fora do Eixo-run online platform for bands and producers to find each other. However, registration also requires the proof of a history with media clippings and texts about past events, as well as videos and photos for the "Grito Management Council" to analyze. I believe part of why Fora do Eixo wants to make sure festival producers outside the network have a strong history of production owes less to a preoccupation with quality production and more with Fora do Eixo's strategic consideration of what types of actions and partnerships will be advantageous to it. As Felipe Altenfelder

explained, Fora do Eixo is "a movement that has a lot of tactical clarity of the actions it develops" (Felipe Altenfelder, interview, January 5th, 2012).

Grito Rock production teams are also obliged to "participate in at least 03 (three) campaigns proposed by the Fora do Eixo network and partner networks" (Regulamento Grito Rock 2014),[125] and to use obligatory promotional materials, including written press-release materials and Grito Rock's "visual identity," which includes "official logos," fonts, colors and "applications of this year's brand" (Kit Do Comunicador 2014). While the design is described as "collaborative," the Fora do Eixo logos have specific and restricted parameters for how they may appear, and each festival producer "must approve through the Grito Rock e-mail list the main graphical piece of its festival. [The communication] kit contains instructions for the application of the brand and complementary logos that will facilitate this process" (ibid.). Fora do Eixo offers a presentation of previous Grito Rock editions with data "so that producers can show the size and greatness of the Festival to partners, artists, sponsors and others" (Inglês 2014). While the intricacies of production are completely independent, within the limits of Fora do Eixo branding goals, "upon realizing Grito Rock, the producer will be georeferenced as a 'Grito Rock Node [*Ponto*]' and will also be listed as a Partner in the relation of Fora do Eixo Nodes of Connection" (ibid.).

It is through this strategy that Fora do Eixo develops its metrics of production, citing ever-increasing numbers of festivals produced, countries where they occur, and number of shows performed within. In most cases, these shows are not attended *as* Grito Rock festivals, but rather as any other type of show produced in its respective location. My own experience of attending three Grito Rock editions within Brazil illustrated this: despite Fora do Eixo's Twitter-bombing

[125] Build your [merchandise] Table, House Culture Campaign [receiving and hosting musicians]… Post-TV, Grito.doc [mini promotional documentary about Grito Rock].

and Facebook promotion, attendees of the festivals who were not already members of Fora do Eixo or members of bands playing the festivals went to the festival owing to the draw of the artist booked, on their friends' suggestion, or simply because the show occurred at their habitual space for nighttime socialization. This is part of why Fora do Eixo always seeks to draw bigger-name acts to certain editions of the festival, such as the performance of the popular rapper Emicida at one of the Grito Rock São Carlos nights. While by my own estimates, around 700 people were in attendance, Fora do Eixo promoted the show as an agglomeration of 2,000 people, touting it as a success of Fora do Eixo itself, rather than evidence of Emicida's popularity. No one I talked to at the show had heard of Fora do Eixo.

All of this illustrates that Fora do Eixo views Grito Rock primarily as a strategy for its expansion as a network; in fact, in early 2012, during the planning of that year's Grito Rock festival, the regional music coordinator Gabriel Ruiz explicitly stated this ultimate purpose of the festival to me (field notes, January 17th, 2012). According to both Laís Bellini and Bruno Kayapy, not just Grito Rock but all Fora do Eixo events are means of "disseminating the 'beauty' of the network" (Laís Bellini, Facebook, August 8th, 2013); so much so that while Bruno worked to strengthen the network as a member of Fora do Eixo's main artistic project Macaco Bong, he had to be careful to "not emit any symbol related to [his] artistic work so that [he] wouldn't lose his credibility with the process" (Bragatto 2013). Fora do Eixo thus offers participation in a festival in which the support it gives is oriented primarily around branding the Fora do Eixo image. While Fora do Eixo extends no logistical or financial support for the production of each festival, it benefits from the proliferation of its brand image and name throughout the festivals. It also benefits from the ever-expanding numbers of festivals and their locations, as these metrics of production become the means for Fora do Eixo to argue for its

protagonism in "New Brazilian Music," winning funding from private entities as well as state-mediated funds (like from Petrobrás and the Vale mining company). In this schema, the representation of Fora do Eixo's actions, not necessarily the effects of the actions themselves,[126] serves as the *real* ground upon which the network's capacities to act are evaluated and rewarded with resources. In other words, Fora do Eixo uses media representation of its infinite actions to gain recognition from the state and from private entities as an institution worthy of funding. The irony, of course, is that Fora do Eixo's need not just to reproduce itself but to expand, and its concomitant need to gain more monetary and material resources, is precisely the logic of capital accumulation.

Conclusion

Fora do Eixo sought to create a new mode of circulating music and producing music that would solve the problems of production faced by an industry in which financial remuneration of musicians has become based on performance, through an intricate relation to recognition garnered primarily through social networks. Fora do Eixo has not succeeded in generating this model, owing to problems concerning the central question of recognition and circulation endemic to the new economic and organizational structure for musical production discussed throughout this dissertation. However, Fora do Eixo has been able to sell itself as the solution to these problems within the Brazilian political ideology of citizen-driven participation and engagement in political processes and decision making about the allocation of resources. Fora do Eixo argues its case through media representation of its protagonism through the techniques of branding and through presenting metrics of its cultural production. That is, Fora do Eixo argues

[126] By action I refer here to the affect of the events within a social environment; the affect of performed sounds, for example, on listeners (see chapter one discussion on Metronomy versus Warpaint).

for its force and effectiveness through the quantity of shows and festivals produced, number of bands circulated, and amount of *cards* spent. Card thus accounts for labor but functions in primarily symbolic terms, symbolizing Fora do Eixo's investment in culture but keeping material reinvestment within the Fora do Eixo institutional structure.

At stake here is the question of the apparatus of calculation, both in terms of the cognitive practice of calculation whereby money is made equivalent to an object (Maurer 2005; 2002), as well as the infrastructural mechanism that would link recognition as visibility to recognition as money, price or other form of resource. Here it is possible to bring together Bill Maurer's (2002) illustration that money is conceptualized as abstract and deracinated from the world, together with David Graeber's (2001) observation that money is thought to have value unto itself, such that it becomes a tool for those who possess it act upon the world Graeber.[127] Such is the tension manifest around Fora do Eixo's contradictory logics with regard to the payment of cachê. As the case of Quanto Vale o Show illustrates, the notion of aesthetics as speaking their own value serves as the justification for non-payment of cachê. But as illustrated in chapter 2 and, especially, chapter 3, aesthetic values arise and endure through social circulation—through the sharing of media and the listening to songs and the passing of them through social infrastructures built and constituted through both social relations and media formats.

According to David Graeber (2001:74), value is a way that actors see their own activity as a meaningful part of society. Here value is not created through the act of public recognition; rather, recognition proceeds out of, and only becomes possible because of, the value already present. This type of logic affirms that the aesthetic qualities of sound have value unto themselves, even so-called "sucky" (*ruim*) Fora do Eixo bands. The question then becomes a

[127] Indeed, as Holbraad (2005) has argued, money's characteristic of partibility and quantification— the ability to exchange a quantified portion of it while still keeping it— imbues it with a unique character as a "ground" for exchange.

matter of who recognizes these values, and whether those doing the recognizing are in a position—and have the desire—to consummate that recognition with a price they feel equals its value equating recognition with a transitive resource. As a form of argument, notes Maurer, such an act of performing mathematical equivalence is a "moral tool not just a practical one" (2002:318). Making commensurate objects or practices with money is a form of consummating the recognition of value with an entity that will allow that value, now attached to money, to connect to other values through monetary circulation.

Indeed, according to Holbraad (2005), at the moment of concrete exchange, money's uniquely quantitative character says nothing more about it than a qualitative statement; that is, money is theoretically transcendental until the moment of transaction, when it buys something in particular, such that at the moment of expenditure money is not "a digital criterion of value, but is rather integrated as a temporal entity in its own right… spending is not only the consumption of money in a determinate quantity, but also its consummation as an integral and uniquely qualitative entity" (Holbraad 2005:244). As shown by the discussion of the formation of aesthetic values at Espaço Cubo (as recounted by Macaco Bong members), in addition to the common valuation of bands circulating within Fora do Eixo by Fora do Eixo members, Fora do Eixo has formed modes recognizing the value of bands playing within it through the doling out of card. But in expending card instead of reals on such bands, it fails to consummate aesthetic value with a mechanism (real money) that will allow bands to strengthen their own capacities for life within larger networks of circulation, within a capitalist economic system. To survive on the value accrued within and by Fora do Eixo alone, bands must necessarily be members of a Fora do Eixo collective, the only place where the commensuration of their value with cards renders material benefits. With card, bands can only invest in themselves as bands through resources

held by Fora do Eixo. In this scheme, Fora do Eixo only strengthens independent music production writ large if all production becomes encompassed by the network and the network comes to hold all possible resources. Within this logic Fora do Eixo has no choice but to expand. This has prompted it to seek to symbolically attach itself to and indeed sometimes try to take over other structures of circulation, that is, other networks. It does this by attaching Fora do Eixo symbols to already visible public figures, and also calls on metrics of production as a representation and enactor of this expansion. These symbolic (brand) and metric representations serve as the grounds on which Fora do Eixo bases its petitioning of public and private institutions for funding, particularly within a political environment which values the type of rhetoric of digital-inclusion that Fora do Eixo espouses and appears to enact through its practices of social media usage.

Conclusion

In late October 2011, Bonifrate performs a private show at the Casa do Mancha. It is not announced on the Casa do Mancha's Facebook page; instead, attendees gain access by being on the list of a new branding project by the Levi's clothing company, Levi's Music América Latina. The project consists primarily of a website targeting indie music consumers in South America. The site features a Levi's'-curated radio stream and short articles written by music blogs from the region that Levi's invited to represent each country online. The project launches with live musical performances in several cities in South America. The Casa do Mancha has been transformed slightly for the São Paulo edition: barrels of free Heineken beer sit in front of the bar, while the couch area boasts a table of food, catered by Raquel Blaque, a friend of the Casa who appears there regularly to sell sandwiches out of a small cooler. Levi's has also set up a large wooden table in the gravel courtyard to display digital tablets loaded with the website, and has imported large armchairs upholstered with cut-up and then patched together denim. Printed pieces of paper with the Levi's brand logo have been taped on the walls, as well as printed editions of the poster for the new project, which was designed by Folk This Town producer and Casa do Mancha regular Rodrigo Sommer. Without knowing anything about the particularities of the São Paulo launch, Rodrigo coincidentally features a cropped photo of Pedro Bonifrate, guitar in hands, harmonica in mouth, standing before an amp, in the center of the campaign's promotional image.[128]

The crowd is a mix of Pedro's friends— Mancha regulars—and strange individuals who appear overdressed in fashionable, if still "edgy," clothes. From their movements it seems

[128] The photo was taken at Bonifrate's Stúdio SP performance, itself a Fora do Eixo-associated show, described in chapter 3.

obvious the latter have never been to the Casa do Mancha before.[129] They don't seem very interested in Bonifrate's performance, tonight playing solo at a piano instead of with an acoustic guitar. Though perhaps they are intrigued by the scene: the show consists of about fifteen Casa do Mancha regulars gathered around the piano—in the Levi's seats, standing, or sitting on the floor, all singing along with all of Bonifrate's songs. During the song *Cantiga da Fumaça (*Ballad of Smoke), the phrase "my whole gang of intrepid souls" provokes a particularly loud and impassioned belting of these same lines. The corporate launch party feels more like a well-funded private party for an intimate group of friends.

It is unlikely that Bonifrate's participation in this event gained him new musical fans. Likewise, since the show was not promoted, Bonifrate likely earned no wider media recognition than what he had before the show. But his participation did do two things: it paid for Pedro and Diogo's travel to São Paulo from Rio, [130] such that they could play another, promoted Bonifrate show at the Casa do Mancha the next day. It also allowed Pedro to perform in an extremely intimate setting for a group of friends who adore his music. Bonifrate was selected for this performance because the Levi's marketing staff sought specifically to host the event at the Casa do Mancha. Levi's radio programmer Edu Parez explained that Levi's was still largely considered working class within Brazil (Edu Parez, interview, November 30th, 2011); the brand thus sought to expand its association with the transnational, cosmopolitan sensibility it felt the Casa do Mancha represented. When approached about the project, Mancha, Filipe, and Pedro were already struggling to finance the musicians' trip from Rio. Levi's appeared, Mancha suggested Bonifrate, and the financial problem was solved. Rodrigo and Raquel, likewise,

[129] And when I talk with some of them they tell me so.
[130] Diogo Valentino, who would perform with Bonifrate the next night, was then still living in Rio de Janeiro.

received commissions for their design and catering services, while Mancha got some money for the house itself, and likely furthered his ability to host branded events with Levi's and similar entities in the future.

Levi's launches the website in Santiago, Bogotá, and Buenos Aires within a couple of weeks of the Bonifrate show. In these cities, where the Levi's brand is more established as hip and urban, the shows take place in larger music venues and feature well-known European indie rock bands. In Santiago, the site launches with the Danish indie band The Raveonettes, in a partnership with the local blog **POTQ**, which represents Chile on the Levi's Music site, and features on its own page a banner ad for the project, a portion of Rodrigo's design including Pedro Bonifrate's head. Not coincidentally, the founder of **POTQ**, Felipe Arriagada, is the brand manager for Levi's in Chile. Also invite-only, though with a few tickets given away through **POTQ**, the show is full of musicians and personnel working in the indie sector in Santiago. Even La Zona's Iván and Álvaro Daguer appear, though they are somewhat disdainful of the brand sponsorship and similarly weary of the venue—the Centro Cultural Amanda. But they have gotten tickets through their music-based social networks and are curious about the band nevertheless. A camera crew stands in Amanda's foyer asking for guests' opinions on the show and about their fashion choices. Bonifrate and his guitar silently, but anonymously grace Amanda's walls.

Even if Bonifrate didn't gain from this (non-) promotion in Chile, the brand sponsorship has contributed an important infusion of capital to two other entities: Fauna Producciones and The Raveonettes. Fauna has had no direct hand in producing this show, but it has benefited from the launch, booking The Raveonettes at its first-ever music festival, Primavera Fauna, which begins the following day. The band's booking agency has demanded a certain amount of money

for the long trip to Chile. Fauna, Levi's and the agency have thus negotiated to secure these two gigs in the country, guaranteeing a financially worthwhile trip for The Raveonettes while adding another name to the festival line-up for Fauna at a lower over-all cost. This type of contact with transnational booking agencies, other South American show producers, and brands has enabled Fauna to raise its capacity to book the big-name international performers which frequent popular northern music festivals. [131] The Primavera Fauna festival has grown from less than 5,000 attendees in 2011 to more than 10,000 in 2013, thanks in part to the leveraging of such connections.

These Levi's launch events are microcosms of the emerging processes of musical production, and the tensions that arise from them, explored in this dissertation. At the Bonifrate event, a *universo pequeno*, a small universe, was able to articulate itself with an outside funding agency to gain monetary resources not generated by the intimate feelings of camaraderie and enjoyment given by the aesthetic qualities of Bonifrate's music, where the aesthetic qualities themselves have arisen from historical associations of sounds and sociality, as well as by the social infrastructures and spaces through which Bonifrate's music has circulated. Other individuals and places, like Rodrigo, Raquel, and the Casa do Mancha itself, were also able to derive financial benefit from this articulation of their small universe to the larger universe of brand marketing.[132] Levi's, likewise, could not build the type of symbolic and social association

[131] In 2012 and 2013, the international line-ups included Devendra Banhart, M.I.A., Spiritualized, Pulp, Cut Copy, Dinosaur Jr. and Solange Knowles. Primavera Fauna alternates the international stage with Chilean and other acts from Latin America, and features a DJ area by a pool. Fauna has added sponsorships from Red Bull, Virgin Mobile, Jack Daniel's, Sketchers (shoes), Corona beer, Dentyne gum, and Chilean pisco liquor brand Alto del Carmen. It has likewise attracted Brazilian journalists and fans for its ticket prices, which are extremely low in Brazilian terms, and even significantly undercut those of Lollapalooza Chile.

[132] It should be noted that Rodrigo Sommer works for commercial entities as freelance graphic designer, thus he is not alien to marketing. However, he was likely tapped for the Levi's project because of his

of the brand it sought on its own. Instead, it sought these small, relatively autonomous *universos pequenos* to try to make itself meaningful as part of this same universe itself. Levi's could not, however, integrate with the ethos of the performance and the social relations created at the Casa do Mancha, because it did not form a fundamental element of the constitution of this particular small universe, and no one wanted it to. Rather, a group of people autonomously developing relationships to each other, to music, and to space enjoyed a performance because Mancha and Pedro were able to benefit from Levi's monetary investment (and the free beer and food), without having to alter, aside from some temporary decoration, the atmosphere created and maintained at the house. In Brazil, at least, it seems the Levi's project failed, for the website shut down only a few months after its launch, and as a secret, private event, the only remaining records of its existence are YouTube videos and photos of the performance in social media, none of which reference Levi's.

The Levi's launch event in Chile, meanwhile, highlights the almost necessary brand funding, in the current dynamics of the live music economy, for the ability of music producers to fund their productions. This is particularly true for Brazilian and Chilean producers seeking to bring foreign bands to the region, given the short touring routes, the long distances between cities in which bands can perform, and the equally long and often expensive flights from Europe and the US to the region.[133] While brand funding is an increasingly important feature of the live music industry, particularly the festival industry, even in the north, it appears to be especially necessary in places like Chile and Brazil, given the smaller numbers of fans for each band. The smaller numbers, in turn, reflect the historical production and dissemination of music constituted

---

work designing posters for indie shows, something he does for both money and pleasure as a musician and event organizer.

[133] Never mind that some booking agencies are clearly unfamiliar with the geography of Latin America: in early 2013 the New York band Grizzly Bear played a show in Buenos Aires, immediately followed by one in Mexico City, which was immediately followed by a show in São Paulo.

as indie in the region, and the ways the "new indie industry" has become associated with the mass, but still niche, image of the cosmopolitan, urban youth.

Each of the chapters in this dissertation thus illustrates the economic and social tensions emerging within a music industry landscape altered by new technologies of recording, production, dissemination, and communication. One of the main tensions hinges precisely on this difficulty of constituting publics for music outside of the social infrastructures through which musical practices and aesthetics emerge. Historically, listening publics provided an economic backbone of the industrial organization of popular music production. Their economic support came in the form of the purchase of recordings. Now that artist remuneration for paid digital downloads is very low, while listeners are more inclined to share tracks of music hosted online, live performance has become the primary means of remunerating musicians for their labor. But, as illustrated in chapters 2 and 3, social, musical, and representational infrastructures co-constitute each other, such that achieving a scale of media representation that would allow for a more distinct separation between the producers of music and its consumer-listeners becomes a central problem. Because it is now so difficult to create large enough recognition that fans, through the consumption of music-as-product or through frequent, geographically-distributed performances (tours), which would economically support production, individuals seek to connect their own networks to outside networks which can provide them with resources, whether these be brands, more fans, or state and state-affiliated actors.

In chapter 1, a tension manifest between the audience for a band that arose through the social circulation of music and information, and the audience defined by the type of person desirable for brand targeting. Sometimes these two audiences coalesced, as with the case of Popload Gigs, which were designed to gather precisely those listeners interested in particular

forms of indie music for their global cachê as well as their sound, and these listeners largely fit into the consumer category sought by Popload Gigs' sponsoring brands. In other cases, as with Fauna in Chile, these two spheres remained relatively separate until explicitly brought together as a financial strategy, which helped create, in turn, the Fauna brand. In chapter 2, the extremely negligible separation between those interested in music and those producing music rose as a significant problem in the ability for musicians and music producers to finance their activities and maintain their spaces for music production. Yet precisely this lack of separation created the deeply social and affective character of music spaces and practices, thus also helping construct aesthetic values. Those deep connections were the main factors through which the spaces emerged to begin with, but once the connections became explicit as modes of creating and gaining resources, they became suspicious as "false."

In chapter 4, this same lack of separation between artist, producer, and public became a heated space for debating the role of art in the public sphere and the practice of publically financing culture as a political expedient. This occurred once Fora do Eixo sought to systematize the production and circulation not only of bands but of social production itself. Fora do Eixo can be seen to have systematized the phatic labor of managing connections as elaborated in chapter 2. This turns actions carried out primarily for their social pleasure, which then forms the infrastructure through which resources may be gained from outside networks, into an imperative to manage connections not primarily for their ludic aspect but rather as a politically interested activity. While not debated with the same level of ire, this political aspect was precisely what prompted the accusation of amiguismo in Santiago: the small alliances crystallizations of the moment when action considered "purely" social becomes overtly political.

Each of these examples remit to the problem between the forging of socio-musical affective ties through the "allure of the arts" (Ochoa 2013), and the need, in a capitalist-industrialist model of music economy, for the producers of music to be separated from its consumers. This separation, moreover, has been fundamental to a particular notion of aesthetics—that artistic value is separate from relations of production and practices of sociability, an approach that idealizes the isolation of the artistic object from its context of circulation. At the same time, this notion of socially autonomous art is precisely what draws many of these individuals, particularly those detailed in chapters 2 and 3, into relation with each other. As Filipe once commented in reference to the Casa do Mancha, "*estamos fazendo arte, porra!*" or "we're making art, dammit!." The paradox here is that this orientation towards art is precisely that which allows for practices of sociability to be constructed around them. Thus the contradictions manifest in the musical spaces, social connections, and practices of musical exchange examined in these chapters: participants value *both* a "detached" approach to artistic production, where the aesthetic speaks its own value, *and* the social relationships at the heart of artistic engagement, which themselves configure aesthetic values. These individuals thus center spaces for musical production and relationships to each other around a particular type of sociability forged through musical engagement, seeking to build durable spaces for the gathering and interaction of "people we like." They simultaneously feel miffed by the difficulty of expanding these practices to a larger, anonymous audience that would bolster their activities financially, while lamenting the undermining of their control over aesthetic valuation when these networks successfully expand. Hence the charge, represented by the complaint of "amiguismo" in Santiago, that the social practices which so obviously construct these musical worlds are also the culprit for their of lack financial success.

Fora do Eixo solved this problem in its own, unique way, by branding itself as the entity that has resolved these contradictions. In many ways Fora do Eixo is no different from any other type of company that relies on the symbolic-affective value of brands, themselves created through attachment to products and events, like musical performances, produced through social infrastructures that form largely autonomously. However, Fora do Eixo operates rather differently from a traditional brand in a few key respects. First, the relationship between media promotion and band circulation is reversed in comparison to traditional types of promotion. Typically, as illustrated by the case of Metronomy in chapter 1, media circulation is fundamental for generating the "incorporeal transformations" in consuming-circulating individuals, prompting desires to see the bands live as well as laying the groundwork for aesthetic experiences. Brands attempt to attach themselves to these events to become associated with the social, aesthetic and affective elements already present. In the Fora do Eixo case, co-present music events like Grito Rock or Cedo e Sentado, are created primarily as vehicles for Fora do Eixo to promote its brand in media, not as events valued for musical and social experiences themselves.

Fora do Eixo thus exemplifies a more extreme form of branding than the case, for example, of Warpaint's Multishow gig detailed in chapter 1. This is because Multishow capitalized on a band with *cachet* within particular indie music networks, associating its brand with cool content and thus participating in the infrastructure of the circulation of this content in Brazil and Chile. Fora do Eixo's processes of event production and media representation, in contrast, seek to create the event and the sign of the event at the same time, using the sign as promotion of the network while emphasizing that the content of the event—the music—is not important, that what's important is the process of creating the infrastructure of circulation to begin with. Hence one emphasis of Fora do Eixo: that the art and the artist are not to be valued,

rather, their role in the process of production is to be valued. This vision of process over product, "remix" over authorship, and collaboration of doing-it-together, forms the core of Fora do Eixo's economic ideology, purportedly based on exchange [*trocas*] of all sorts: information, experience, resources, and technologies. This ideology then manifests in the form of card, which Fora do Eixo insists provides a means for "systematizing" these exchanges, serving as "a replacement for the traditional scheme of 'camaraderie' that happened when the exchanges were informal and unsystematic" (Poljokan et al. 2011:12). But card also articulates Fora do Eixo's contradictory logic of aesthetic valuation through money and media representation, as it accounts for Fora do Eixo labor but also effectively states that such labor is not valuable for real money. Labor deserving real money is that of bands producing aesthetically good content, and more importantly, highly visible in non-Fora do Eixo-run media.

All of these actors are struggling with the repercussions of a new media environment which helps collapse distinctions between producers and consumers and media and audiences, and concomitantly rearrange practices of valuation. The configuring of publics that mass media bring (Warner 2002) help reinforce the idea that media abstract particular phenomena from their contexts, and present them as if they lie outside of the politics of the social (Mazzarella 2004). Narratives of the inherently abstracting qualities of money, which have been common from Marx to Polanyi (Keane 2008; Holbraad 2005) mirror these media ideologies and also map onto approaches to meaning as arbitrary and disconnected from the material entities through which they are enacted and conveyed (Keane 2008; 2005). For example, Holbraad (2005) shows that every transaction of currency money is an exchange of particular material entities that are the bills or coins of money, *along with* local practices that situate the meaning of such materials in particular semiotic regimes, while Keane (2001) illustrates Dutch colonialists' difficulty in

conveying that money should be treated as purely symbolic, and as such, used symbolically not materially. The notions that money and signs have been abstracted from the messy world of objects and social politics is key to depictions of modernity (Keane 2008), just as is the value of creating infrastructures for socially and materially "free" circulation (Larkin 2013; 2008). These notions manifest in economic ideologies of price as a real indicator of economic value, one that arises through the clean math of free market circulation, which obeys its own internal logics devoid of human intervention or calculation (Maurer 2006; 2005; Ortiz 2013).

Many of the difficulties of the current music economy derive, then, from these ideologies of free circulation in the spheres of meaning, economy and infrastructure. They combine with the actual historical structure of the mass music industry, which relied on a conceptual separation of the social and artistic, such that they could be brought back together, mediated through the economy of broadcast and recording, and consumed by listeners as social practice. From the classic perspective of economy (ie Polanyi, in Maurer 2006), exchange not mediated through currency, such as gifts, are unencumbered social transactions,[134] while money is a neutral mechanism for exchange that flattens social relations and makes the incommensurate commensurable. According to Bill Maurer, this notion rests on the conceptualization of equivalence through the mechanism of zero, that which allows two sides of an equation to be equated. This concept serves as the metaphysical fulcrum that allows for the "separation of number from metaphor, and of fact from evidence" (2002:319), positioning facts as ontologically true independent bodies that exist prior to their employment as evidence for rhetorical arguments. Thus, abstract money and the seemingly natural act of quantification on which it relies is a metaphysical technique for producing a certain type of logic in the world, one in which

[134] This vision, contra work by Mauss (2006) and latter anthropologists of exchange, considers gift giving as neutral expressions of good will that does not incur debt/reciprocity obligations.

things are deracinated particulars that exist separately from the social relations surrounding them. I take this to be the same move that allows for the existence of the notion of aesthetic qualities as socially autonomous. This assumes that the ontological properties of the art in question, such as a song, convey all the information necessary for its valuation. Just like the financial workers studied by Ortiz (2013), who operate on the notion that an object's price is cleanly and directly determined by its inherent properties, even while financial workers themselves conduct research on the context of exchange in which the object is embedded in order to determine its price-value, the notion of aesthetic value within the struggles of this dissertation rests on a vision of its existence outside of and prior to its context of interpretation and circulation by social actors.

Now that infrastructures of musical creation and production are overtly and tightly homologous to the social infrastructures which produce them and through which they are produced, this ideology becomes more difficult to maintain. Modes of establishing good versus bad music, authentic versus fake music, valuable versus non-valuable, and mass versus niche become more difficult. If aesthetic judgment is a type of recognition, "'an appreciation of how the object adapts itself to the way we apprehend it, even though, at same time, remains indifferent to us'(Shaviro 2009:2)" (Ochoa 2013:18), aesthetic qualities become recognized precisely through the social infrastructures which produce them and through which they travel, necessarily also becoming associated with performance spaces like the Casa do Mancha, through the bundling of the qualities of each space in its material properties, the musical sounds in theirs, and the mode of social relation brought into being by both, and, likewise, which they help construct. It seems any resolution to the difficulties of the current music economy then, can only come about with a broader shift in the organization of economy as means for managing the resources of life.

Endnotes

[i] Mann (2011)**.**
[ii] Interview, February 15th, 2012.
[iii] Field notes, October 25th, 2011.
[iv] Interview, May 18th, 2012.
[v] Lazzarato (2004).
[vi] WeDemand BADBADNOTGOOD in NY (2012) 2013)
[vii] Interview, July 25th, 2008
[viii] Interview, April 26th, 2011.
[ix] Pulsa Nova Música (2013).
[x] In Varandas and Steinhoff (n.d.).
[xi] Field notes, October 13th, 2011
[xii] Roda Viva: Mídia Ninja 2013
[xiii] Roda Viva: Mídia Ninja 2013
[xiv] Roda Viva: Mídia Ninja 2013
[xv] Roberto Schwarz (2004).

Works Cited

Advis, Luis, Juan Pablo González, Fernando Carrasco, and Juan Antonio Sánchez, eds.
1998 Clásicos de La Música Popular Chilena, Volumen 2: 1960-1973, Raíz Folclórica. Cá. Santiago: Pontificia Universidad CatoÌ • lica de Chile ; Sociedad Chilena del Derecho de Auto.

Alves, Adriana
2008 Festivais Em Movimento. RollingStone. http://rollingstone.uol.com.br/edicao/24/festivais-em-movimento, accessed April 25, 2014.

Arvidsson, Adam
2007 Creative Class or Administrative Class? 8 On Advertising and the "Underground." Ephemera 7(1): 8–23.
2009 The Ethical Economy: Towards a Post-capitalist Theory of Value. Capital & Class(97): 13–29,179.

Avelar, Idelber
2001 Defeated Rallies, Mournful Anthems, and the Origins of Brazilian Heavy Metal. *In* Brazilian Popular Music and Globalization. Charles A. Perrone and Christopher Dunn, eds. Pp. 123–135. New York: Routledge.

Azerrad, Michael
2001 Our Band Could Be Your Life: Scenes from the American Indie Underground, 1981-1991. First Edition. Little, Brown.

Ballance, Laura, John Cook, Mac McCaughan, and & 1 more
2009 Our Noise: The Story of Merge Records, the Indie Label That Got Big and Stayed Small. Chapel Hill, N.C: Algonquin Books.

Bannister, Matthew
2006 "Loaded": Indie Guitar Rock, Canonism, White Masculinities. Popular Music 25(01): 77–95.

Béhague, Gerard
2006 Rap, Reggae, Rock, or Samba: The Local and the Global in Brazilian Popular Music (1985-95). Latin American Music Review 27(1): 79–90.

Botinada, A Historia Do Punk No Brasil
2011 . Toro Production Company. http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=22lSR-o4n98&feature=youtube_gdata_player, accessed May 19, 2014.

Bragatto, Marcos
2011 Racha Na Abrafin: Festivais "Não Se Sentiam Representados." Rock Em Geral.

http://www.rockemgeral.com.br/2011/12/14/abrafin-festivais-sairam-porque-nao-se-sentiam-representados/, accessed April 25, 2014.
2013 Enfim, Livre. Rock Em Geral. http://www.rockemgeral.com.br/2013/08/29/enfim-livre/, accessed April 21, 2014.

Capilé, Pablo
2010 Pablo Capilé: Articulador Do Circuito Fora Do Eixo. Interview by Sérgio Cohn. May 28. http://www.producaocultural.org.br/wp-content/uploads/livroremix/pablocapile.pdf, accessed March 15, 2010.

Carvalho, Aline, and Adilson Cabral
2011 Brazilian Digital Culture Forum: A New Way of Making Public Policies. *In* Barcelona, July 17-21. http://www.aaai.org/ocs/index.php/ICWSM/ICWSM11/paper/download/3835/4395.

Clough, Patricia Ticineto, Greg Goldberg, Rachel Schiff, Aaron Weeks, and Craig Willse
2007 Notes Towards a Theory of Affect-Itself. Ephemera 7(1): 60–77.

Costa, Eliane
2011 A Causa Coletiva: Políticas Públicas Culturais Para o Cenário Das Redes Sob a Perspectiva Da Ecologia Digital (A Experiência Brasileira). *In* Rio de Janeiro. http://cadernos.cenpec.org.br/index.php/cadernos/article/view/61, accessed March 1, 2012.

Crowd-funding
2011 . http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AFBTd-wOw7U&feature=youtube_gdata_player, accessed May 20, 2014.

Cruz, Francisco
1983 Música Popular No-Comercial En Chile /. Santiago, Chile: CENECA.

Cultura Viva
N.d. www.cultura.gov.br/culturaviva/cultura-viva/, accessed January 10, 2012.

Dean, Jodi
2009 Democracy and Other Neoliberal Fantasies: Communicative Capitalism and Left Politics. Durham: Duke University Press Books.

Dent, Alexander
2009 River of Tears: Country Music, Memory, and Modernity in Brazil. Durham: Duke University Press Books.

Dias, Marcia Tosta
2000 Os Donos da Voz: Indústria Fonográfica Brasileira e Mundialização da Cultura. 1a. ed edition. São Paulo, SP: Boitempo Editorial.

Dias Pereira, Leonardo
2009 Cidadão Independente. RollingStone. http://rollingstone.uol.com.br/edicao/36/cidadao-independente, accessed May 20, 2014.

Dunn, Christopher
2001 Brutality Garden: Tropicália and the Emergence of a Brazilian Counterculture. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.

Elyachar, Julia
2010 Phatic Labor, Infrastructure, and the Question of Empowerment in Cairo. American Ethnologist 37(3): 452–464.

Equipe Soma
2011 Melhores 2011 . Discos Daqui. Mais SOMA. http://www.soma.am/noticia/melhores-2011-discos-daqui, accessed May 1, 2014.

Escárate, Tito
1994 Frutos Del País: Historia Del Rock Chileno. Santiago, Chile.
1999 Canción Telepática: Rock En Chile. Lom Ediciones.

Fagundes, Renan Dissenha
2011 Show Próprio. O Estado de São Paulo, August 25. http://blogs.estadao.com.br/divirta-se/metronomy-joseph-mount/, accessed July 7, 2014.

Fairly, Jan
2002 Inti Illimani: Living a Life Through Making Music. *In* Singing the Difference: Violeta Parra and Chilean Song; a Symposium in Honour of Robert Pring-Mill. Jan Fairly, David Horn, and Robert Pring-Mill, eds. Pp. 61–143. Liverpool: Institute of Popular Music, University of Liverpool.

Feld, Steven
1984 Communication, Music, and Speech About Music. Yearbook for Traditional Music 16: 1–18.

Finnegan, Ruth H.
1989 The Hidden Musicians: Music Making in an English Town. Cambridge University Press.

Florida, Richard L.
2002 The Rise of the Creative Class : And How It's Transforming Work, Leisure, Community and Everyday Life. New York, NY: Basic Books.

Fonarow, Wendy
2006 Empire of Dirt: The Aesthetics and Rituals of British Indie Music. Wesleyan University Press.

Fox, Aaron A.
2004 Real Country: Music and Language in Working-class Culture. Duke University Press.

Freire, Alexandre, Ariel G Foina, and Felipe Fonseca
2006 O Impacto Da Sociedade Civil (des)Organizada: Cultura Digital, Os Articuladores e Software Livre No Projeto Dos Pontos de Cultura Do MinC. Brasília. http://www.egov.ufsc.br/portal/sites/default/files/anexos/6041-6033-1-PB.pdf, accessed March 1, 2012.

French, John, and Alexandre Fortes
2012 Nurturing Hope, Deepening Democracy, and Combating Inequalities in Brazil: Lula, the Workers' Party, and Dilma Rousseff's 2010 Election as President. Labor 9(1): 7 –28.

Fuenzalida, Valerio
1985 La Indústria Fonográfica Chilena. Santiago, Chile: CENECA.

Fuenzalida, Valerio, and Scottie Scott, eds.
1987 La Producción de Música Popular En Chile. Santiago, Chile: CENECA: CED.

Galaz, Cristián
2005 Nueva Ola En Chile. El Pop de Los 80. *In* En Busca de La Música Chilena: Crónica y Antología de Una Historia Sonora. 1. ed. José Miguel Varas and Juan Pablo González Rodríguez, eds. Pp. 400–402. Cuadernos Bicentenario, 4. Santiago de Chile: Comisión Bicentenario, Presidencia de la República.

Gaonkar, D. P., and Elizabeth A. Povinelli
2003 Technologies of Public Forms: Circulation, Transfiguration, Recognition. Public Culture 15(3): 385–398.

Garland, Shannon
2009 The New, the Hip and the Far Away: Indie Media and Live Performance in New York City and Santiago, Chile. Unpublished Master's, Columbia University.
2012 "The Space, the Gear, and Two Big Cans of Beer": Fora Do Eixo and the Debate over Circulation, Remuneration, and Aesthetics in the Brazilian Alternative Market. Journal of Popular Music Studies 24(4). Special Issue: Audio Work: Labor, Value, and the Making of Musical Aesthetics: 509–531.

Godoy, Álvaro
1981 Canto Que Ha Sido Valiente Siempre Será Canción Nueva. Revista La Bicicleta: 3–82.

Gonzo, Amauri
2009 Frank Jorge e The Waiters: Atrações "importadas" Para a Primeira Folk This Town

Elétrica! Folk This Town! http://folkthistown.wordpress.com/2009/09/21/frank-jorge-e-the-waiters-atracoes-%e2%80%9cimportadas%e2%80%9d-para-a-primeira-folk-this-town-eletrica/, accessed May 20, 2014.

Goodman, Steve
2012 Sonic Warfare: Sound, Affect, and the Ecology of Fear. Cambridge, Mass.: The MIT Press.

Gough, Daniel
2014 Music Producers in São Paulo's Cultural Policy Worlds.

Graeber, David
2001 Toward an Anthropological Theory of Value : the False Coin of Our Own Dreams /. 1st ed. New York :: Palgrave,.
2011a Debt : The First 5,000 Years. Brooklyn, N.Y.: Melville House.
2011b Value, Politics and Democracy in the United States. Current Sociology 59(2): 186–199.

Gudeman, Stephen
2005 Community and Economy: Economy's Base. *In* A Handbook of Economic Anthropology. James G. Carrier, ed. Pp. 94–108. Edward Elgar Publishing.

Harvey, David
2007 A Brief History of Neoliberalism. 1st, First Edition edition. Oxford; New York: Oxford University Press.

Herschmann, Micael
2009 Lapa, Cidade Da Musica. Rio de Janeiro: Mauad.

Hesmondhalgh, David
1997 Post-Punk's Attempt to Democratise the Music Industry: The Success and Failure of Rough Trade. Popular Music 16(3): 255–274.
1999 Indie: The Institutional Politics and Aesthetics of a Popular Music Genre. Cultural Studies 13(1): 34–61.

Hibbett, Ryan
2005 What Is Indie Rock? Popular Music & Society 28(1): 55–77.

Holbraad, Martin
2005 Expending Multiplicity: Money in Cuban Ifá Cults. The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute 11(2): 231–254.

Holston, James
2008 Insurgent Citizenship: Disjunctions of Democracy and Modernity in Brazil. Princeton University Press.

Inglês
2014 Grito Rock. http://gritorock.com.br/produtores/guia-do-produtor/ingles/, accessed May 20, 2014.

Introducing WeDemand
2013 . https://vimeo.com/69994765, accessed May 20, 2014.

Jonathan Mann, dir.
2011 Song A Day #775b: Who The Hell Is Arcade Fire? http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=X94GQZM4M48&feature=youtube_gdata_player, accessed May 12, 2014.

Keane, Webb
2001 Money Is No Object: Materiality, Desire, and Modernity in an Indonesian Society. *In* The Empire of Things: Regimes of Value and Material Culture. Fred R. Myers, ed. Pp. 65–90. Santa Fe, N.M: SAR Press.
2005 Sings Are Not the Garb of Meaning: On the Social Analysis of Material Things. *In* Materiality. Daniel Miller, ed. Pp. 182–205. Durham, N.C: Duke University Press Books.
2008 Market, Materiality and Moral Metalanguage. Anthropological Theory 8(1): 27–42.

Kit Do Comunicador
2014 Grito Rock. http://gritorock.com.br/kit-do-comunicador/, accessed May 20, 2014.

Kreiss, Daniel, Megan Finn, and Fred Turner
2010 The Limits of Peer Production: Some Reminders from Max Weber for the Network Society. New Media & Society 13: 243–259.

Kruse, Holly
2003 Site and Sound: Understanding Independent Music Scenes. New York: P. Lang.

Larkin, Brian
2008 Signal and Noise: Media, Infrastructure, and Urban Culture in Nigeria. Durham: Duke University Press Books.
2013 The Politics and Poetics of Infrastructure. Annual Review of Anthropology 42(1): 327–343.

Lazzarato, Maurizio
1996 Immaterial Labor. *In* Radical Thought in Italy: a Potential Politics. Paolo Virno and Michael Hardt, eds. Paul Colilli and Ed Emory, trans. Pp. 132–147. Theory Out of Bounds, v. 7. Minneapolis, Minn: University of Minnesota Press.
2004 From Capital-Labor to Capital-Life. Valerie Fournier, Akseli Virtanen, and Jussie Vahamaki, trans. Ephemera 43(3): 187–208.
2012 The Making of the Indebted Man: An Essay on the Neoliberal Condition. Los Angeles, Calif: Semiotext(e).

Leão, Tom
2013 Lojas Com Personalidade. Na Cova Do Leão. http://nacovadoleao.blogspot.com/2013/02/lojas-com-personalidade.html.

Lear, John, and Joseph Collins
1995 Working in Chile's Free Market. Latin American Perspectives 22(1): 10 –29.

Lee, Benjamin, and Edward LiPuma
2002 Cultures of Circulation: The Imaginations of Modernity. Public Culture 14(1): 191–213.

Leite de Moraes, Marcelo
2006 Madame Satã: O Templo Do Underground Dos Anos 80. Brasil: Lira Editora.

Lemos, Ronaldo, and Oona Castro
2008 Tecnobrega: O Pará Reinventando o Negócio da Música. Rio de Janeiro: Aeroplano Editora.

Lessig, Lawrence
2008 Remix: Making Art and Commerce Thrive in the Hybrid Economy. Penguin.

Leyshon, Andrew, Peter Webb, Shaun French, Nigel Thrift, and Louise Crewe
2005 On the Reproduction of the Musical Economy After the Internet. Media, Culture & Society 27(2): 177–209.

LiPuma, Edward, and Benjamin Lee
2005 Financial Derivatives and the Rise of Circulation. Economy and Society 34(3): 404–427.

López Palacios, Iñigo
2011 Chile, Nuevo Paraíso del Pop. El País, February 4. http://elpais.com/diario/2011/02/04/tentaciones/1296847374_850215.html, accessed May 20, 2014.

Lorentz, Braulio, and Rodrigo Ortega
N.d. O Fantástico Mundo de Lúcio Ribeiro. Pílula Pop. http://www.pilulapop.com.br/retro/ressonancia.php?id=1, accessed January 8, 2014.

Martín-Barbero, Jesus
2001 De Los Medios a Las Mediaciones: Comunicacion, Cultura y Hegemonia. 6th edition. Barcelona: Editorial Gustavo Gili.

Massumi, Brian
2002 Parables for the Virtual : Movement, Affect, Sensation /. Durham [N.C.] :: Duke University Press,.

Mattern, Mark
1997 Popular Music and Redemocratization in Santiago, Chile, 1973-1989. Studies in Latin American Popular Culture 16: 106–112.

Matus, Christián
2009 Cultura Urbana y Clases Medias Emergentes. *In* SCL: Espacios, Prácticas, y Cultura Urbana. Fernando Pérez Oyarzun and Manuel Tironi Rodó, eds. Pp. 86–99. Santiago, Chile: ARQ Ediciones.

Maurer, Bill
2002 Repressed Futures: Financial Derivatives' Theological Unconscious. Economy and Society 31(1): 15–36.
2005 Does Money Matter? Abstraction and Substitution in Alternative Financial Forms. *In* Materiality. Daniel Miller, ed. Pp. 140–164. Durham, N.C: Duke University Press Books.
2006 The Anthropology of Money. Annual Review of Anthropology 35(1): 15–36.

Mauss, Marcel
2006 The Gift: The Form and Reason for Exchange in Archaic Societies. Routledge.

Mazzarella, William
2004 Culture, Globalization, Mediation. Annual Review of Anthropology 33(1): 345–367.

McCann, Bryan
2004 Hello, Hello Brazil : Popular Music in the Making of Modern Brazil. Durham: Duke University Press.

Meintjes, Louise
2003 Sound of Africa: Making Music Zulu in a South African Studio. Duke University Press.

Mignolo, Walter D.
2000 Local Histories/Global Designs. illustrated edition. Princeton University Press.

Miller, Daniel
2001 Alienable Gifts and Inalienable Commodities. *In* The Empire of Things: Regimes of Value and Material Culture. Fred R. Myers, ed. Pp. 91–118. Santa Fe, N.M: SAR Press.

Miller, Toby, and George Yúdice
2002 Cultural Policy. SAGE.

Morais, Hugo
2010 Entrevistão: Pablo Capilé. O Inimigo. http://www.oinimigo.com/blog/mercado-mutante-independente/.

De Mussy, Martín
2013 Músia Nacional Sonando Afuera. El Mercurio, July 20: 14.

Ney, Thiago
2010 (In)dependente? Discussão Sobre Patrocínio Estatal a Eventos Independentes de Música Move de Petrobras a Festivais Tradicionais. Folha de São Paulo, May 19. http://www.agenciasebrae.com.br/noticia.kmf?canal=36&cod=10025961&indice=40, accessed April 16, 2012.

North, Peter
2005 Scaling Alternative Economic Practices? Some Lessons from Alternative Currencies. Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers 30(2): 221–233.

Novak, David
2013 Japanoise : Music at the Edge of Circulation. Durham, N.C: Duke University Press.

Oakes, Kaya
2009 Slanted and Enchanted: The Evolution of Indie Culture. 1 Original edition. New York: Holt Paperbacks.

Ochoa, Ana María
2013 Disencounters Between Music's Allure and the Expediency of Culture in Colombia. Latin American Research Review 48(special issue): 12–29,144–145,141.

Oliveira, Laerte Fernandes de
2002 Em Um Porão de São Paulo : O Lira Paulistana e a Produção Alternativa. 1a. ed. São Paulo: Annablume.

Ortiz, Horacio
2013 Financial Value: Economic, Moral, Political, Global. HAU: Journal of Ethnographic Theory 3(1): 64–79.

Pacini Hernández, Deborah, Héctor Fernandez L'hoeste, and Eric Zolov, eds.
2004 Mapping Rock Music Cultures Across the Americas. *In* Rockin' Las Americas: The Global Politics of Rock in Latin/o America Pp. 1–21. Pittsburg: The University of Pittsburg Press.

Pereira Jr., Álvaro
2010a Se o Governo Cismar, o Indie Acaba No Brasil. Folha de São Paulo, May 17.
2010b Indie Estatal Mata o "Do It Yourself." Folha de São Paulo, August 2.

Petrobrás Cultural
N.d. Petrobrás. hotsitespetrobras.com.br.

Pino-Ojeda, Walescka
2004 A Detour to the Past: Memory and Mourning in Chilean Post-Authoritarian Rock. *In* Rockin' Las Americas: The Global Politics of Rock in Latin/o America. Deborah Pacini Hernandez,, Fernandez L'hoeste, Hector, and Eric Zolov, eds. Pp. 290–311. Pittsburg: The University of Pittsburg Press.

Pizarro, Ramiro
2005 Los Prisioneros. Queremos Ser La Voz de Los Ochenta. *In* En Busca de La Música Chilena: Crónica y Antología de Una Historia Sonora. 1. ed. José Miguel Varas and Juan Pablo González Rodríguez, eds. Pp. 396–399. Cuadernos Bicentenario, 4. Santiago de Chile: Comisión Bicentenario, Presidencia de la República.

Poljokan, Bruno, Lenissa Lenza, Caio Eduardo Tendolini e Silva, Luiz Farias, and Débora Andrade
2011 The Brazilian System for the Solidarity Culture - Fora Do Eixo Card. *In* Lyon, France. http://sdocument.ish-lyon.cnrs.fr/cc-conf/conferences.ish-lyon.cnrs.fr/index.php/cc-conf/2011/paper/view/76/17.html, accessed April 16, 2012.

Pontos de Cultura
N.d. Cultura.gov.br. www.cultura.gov.br/culturaviva/ponto-de-cultura.

Povinelli, Elizabeth A.
2011 Economies of Abandonment: Social Belonging and Endurance in Late Liberalism. Durham N.C.: Duke University Press Books.

Pq as Coisas Do Fora Do Eixo Não Funcionam Em Pernambuco?
2011 . http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VvEPoUp3HBA&feature=youtube_gdata_player, accessed April 16, 2012.

Pratt, Mary Louise
2002 Modernity and Periphery: Toward a Global and Relational Analysis. *In* Beyond Dichotomies. Elisabeth Mudimbe-Boyi, ed. Pp. 21–47. New York: State University of New York Press.

Pulsa Nova Música
2013 Entrevista: Pedro Bonifrate. Pulsa Nova Música. http://www.pulsanovamusica.com.br/pulsa_entrevistas/entrevista-pedro-bonifrate/.

Queremos
2013 Queremos! Mais Shows. Queremos. Queremos! Blog. http://blog.queremos.com.br/2013/07/01/queremos-mais-shows/.

Queremos! Ariel PInk's Haunted Graffiti & The Pains Of Being Pure At Heart & Dorgas
2011 . http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=IFNQoG5Tc9k&feature=youtube_gdata_player,

accessed May 20, 2014.

Queremos! LCD Soundsystem
2011 . http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=sk_OtorMozI&feature=youtube_gdata_player, accessed May 20, 2014.

Queremos! Metronomy
2011 . http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=GwwdZku1hNE&feature=youtube_gdata_player, accessed May 20, 2014.

Ramos, Julio
1989 Desencuentros de La Modernidad En América Latina : Literatura y Política En El Siglo XIX. 1. ed. México: Fondo de Cultura Económica.

Regimento Interno Do Circuito Fora Do Eixo
2010 Portal Fora Do Eixo. http://foradoeixo.org.br/institucional/regimento-interno-do-circuito-fora-do-eixo, accessed April 11, 2012.

Regulamento Grito Rock 2014
N.d. http://tnb.art.br/regulamento-grito-rock-2014/, accessed July 7, 2014.

Regulamento Para Produtores
2014 Grito Rock. http://gritorock.com.br/produtores/regulamento-para-produtores/, accessed May 20, 2014.

Reily, Suzel Ana
2000 Introduction: Brazilian Musics, Brazilian Identities. British Journal of Ethnomusicology 9(1): 1–10.

Ribeiro, Lúcio
2010 "Cariocas Empolgados" Trazem Belle & Sebastian Ao Rio. Estadão, October 2. http://www.estadao.com.br/noticias/arteelazer,cariocas-empolgados-trazem-belle-e-sebastian-ao-rio,618419,0.htm, accessed May 20, 2014.

Richard, Nelly
1993 Cultural Peripheries: Latin America and Postmodernist De-Centering. Boundary 2 20(3): 156–161.

Rivera, Anny
1984 Transformaciones de La Industria Musical En Chile. Santiago, Chile: CENECA.

Robbins, Joel
2009 Rethinking Gifts and Commodities: Reciprocity, Recognition, and the Morality of Exchange. *In* Economics and Morality: Anthropological Approaches. Katherine E. Browne and B. Lynne Milgram, eds. Pp. 43–58. Lanham: AltaMira Press.

Roda Viva: Mídia Ninja
2013 . http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=vYgXth8QI8M&feature=youtube_gdata_player, accessed April 25, 2014.

Rolnik, Raquel
2011 Democracy on the Edge: Limits and Possibilities in the Implementation of an Urban Reform Agenda in Brazil. International Journal of Urban and Regional Research 35(2): 239–255.

Rubim, Antonio Albino
2008 Políticas Culturais Do Governo Lula / Gil: Desafios e Enfrentamentos. Intercom - Revista Brasileira de Ciências Da Comunicação 31(1): 183–204.

Salas, Fabio
2003 La Primavera Terrestre. Cartografias Del Rock Chileno y La Nueva Cancion Chilena. Santiago, Chile: Editorial Cuarto Propio.

Samuels, David W.
2004 Putting a Song on Top of It Expression and Identity on the San Carlos Apache Res. University of Arizona Press.

Schrimshaw, Will
2013 Non-cochlear Sound: On Affect and Exteriority. *In* Sound, Music, Affect: Theorizing Sonic Experience. Marie Thompson and Ian D. Biddle, eds. Pp. 27–43. New York: Bloomsbury Academic.

Schwarz, Roberto
2004 Brazilian Culture: Nationalism by Elimination. *In* The Latin American Cultural Studies Reader. Ana del Sarto, Alicia Ríos, and Abril Trigo, eds. Pp. 233–249. Durham, N.C: Duke University Press.

Shaviro, Steven
2010 Post Cinematic Affect. Winchester, UK; Washington, USA: 0 [zero] Books.

Simone, AbdouMaliq
2004 People as Infrastructure: Intersecting Fragments in Johannesburg. Public Culture 16(3): 407–429.
2006 Pirate Towns: Reworking Social and Symbolic Infrastructures in Johannesburg and Douala. Urban Studies 43(2): 357 –370.

Spencer, Amy
2005 DIY: The Rise of Lo-Fi Culture. 2nd Ed edition. London ; New York: Marion Boyars Publishers Ltd.

Stamboroski Jr., Amauri, and Mateus Poutmati
2013 Exclusivo . Bruno Kayapy Fala à Soma Sobre o Futuro Do Macaco Bong. Mais SOMA. http://www.soma.am/noticia/exclusivo--bruno-kayapy-fala-a-soma-sobre-o-futuro-do-macaco-bong, accessed May 20, 2014.

The Arcade Fire
2004 Funeral. Merge Records.
2007 Neon Bible. Merge Records.

Thornton, Sarah
1996 Club Cultures: Music, Media, and Subcultural Capital. Wesleyan University Press.

Thrift, Nigel
2005 Knowing Capitalism. 1 edition. London: SAGE Publications Ltd.

Torres, Rodrigo
1980 Perfil de La Creacion Musical En La Nueva Cancion Chilena Desde Sus Origines Hasta 1973. Santiago, Chile: CENECA.
2002 Singing the Difference: Violeta Parra and Chilean Song. *In* I Sing the Difference: Identity and Commitment in Latin American Song; a Symposium in Honour of Robert Pring-Mill. Jan Fairly, David Horn, and Robert Pring-Mill, eds. Pp. 39–59. Liverpool: Institute of Popular Music, University of Liverpool.

Turino, Thomas
1999 Signs of Imagination, Identity, and Experience: A Peircian Semiotic Theory for Music. Ethnomusicology 43(2): 221–255.

De Ulhôa Carvalho, Martha
1995 Tupi or Not Tupi MPB: Popular Music and Identity in Brazil. *In* The Brazilian Puzzle: Culture on the Borderlands of the Western World. David J. Hess, ed. Pp. 159–179. Columbia University Press.

Ulhôa, Martha Tupinambá de
2003 B Rockin' Liverpool: Significado e Competência Musical. Em Pauta 14(23): 43.

Varandas, Rafael, and Kiko Steinhoff
N.d. Meet the Maker: Mancha. Tudo Bem Tudo Bom.

Vaz, Gil Nuno
1988 História da Música Independente. Editora Brasiliense.

Vianna, Hermano
1999 The Mystery of Samba: Popular Music and National Identity in Brazil. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.

Vicente, Eduardo
2006 A Vez Dos Independentes(?): Um Olhar Sobre a Produção Musical Independente Do País. e-Compós: Revista Da Associação Nacional Dos Programas de Pós-Graduação Em Comunicação 2(19).

Wallis, Roger, and Krister Malm
1984 Big Sounds from Small Peoples : The Music Industry in Small Countries. London: Constable.

Warner, Michael
2002 Publics and Counterpublics. Public Culture 14(1): 49–90.

WeDemand BADBADNOTGOOD in NY (2012)
2013 . http://vimeo.com/59443926, accessed May 20, 2014.

Windish Agency
N.d. About. Windish Agency. http://www.windishagency.com/about.

Yúdice, George
2003 The Expediency of Culture: Uses of Culture in the Global Era. Duke University Press.

Zambra, Darío
2011 Remodelación Del Barrio Suecia Entra En Tierra Derecha. La Tercera, June 12: 52.
2013 Barrio Suecia Deja Atrás La Bohemia y Debuta Como Polo de Negocios. La Tercera, January 20: 50.